

Supplement (online)

Appendix A: Annotation Manual

1. Task overview

In this task, you will (i) read a number of dialogues between two or more people, and (ii) classify one selected statement from each dialogue as either relatively *dialogically expansive* or relatively *dialogically contractive*. The following is an example of the kind of dialogues you will examine. The statement in bold is the statement that you will classify. The statements always contain a first-person complement-taking predicate (CTP), in this case *I don't think*, accompanied by a complement clause within its scope (*it's a situation that would arise*).

- (1) B: Is it a realistic book
A: No I don't think so
B: Why not packed with detail
A: **Because *I don't think* it's a situation that would arise**

Detailed definitions, classification criteria, examples and instructions are provided below.

2. Information about the data

The texts you are about to read and annotate are taken from the London-Lund Corpus (LLC) of spoken British English, which is a language corpus compiled in the 1950s–1970s. LLC contains both dialogues and monologues, and the conversations presented here are spontaneous face-to-face conversations between educated adults. The settings for the conversations vary from informal conversations between colleagues to formal interviews between academics and prospective undergraduate students.

2. Category definitions

Dialogic expansion

Dialogic expansion is a strategy in interaction through which speakers encourage their conversational participants to provide possible alternative viewpoints on the topic being discussed, i.e. they open up the dialogic space. Speakers use this strategy to present their position as only one out of many possible positions and to invite dialogic alternatives to be expressed by their conversational participants.

Dialogic contraction

Dialogic contraction is a strategy in interaction through which speakers discourage the expression of possible alternative viewpoints on the topic being discussed, i.e. they close down the dialogic space. Speakers use this strategy to present something as 'true' and 'valid', and as something that should not be questioned, resisted or rejected by their conversational participants.

3. Classification criteria and examples

Dialogic expansion

Utterances are classified as relatively dialogically expansive if you answer 'yes' to the following two questions.

- Does Speaker A construe the statement in a way that encourages Speaker B to express a different opinion?
- Does Speaker A seem to be open to the possibility that Speaker B might have a different opinion?

In (2), (3) and (4), the utterances are classified as relatively dialogically expansive. Each example is followed by a number of linguistic cues that contribute to the classification of the utterance. Note that words with capital letters are words that receive an emphasis in spoken discourse.

- (2) B: What are Kate and John TALKING about?
 A: Well I think that Kate is perhaps trying to talk JOHN into going HOME.
Cues: discourse marker well, emphasis on I in I think, tentative adverb perhaps, speaker's personal opinion.
- (3) B: Where are the KIDS?
 A: I ASSUME they're playing in the GARDEN or something like THAT.
Cues: emphasis on assume, vague expression something like that, high degree of uncertainty, other scenarios can be true.
- (4) B: We also visited the Niagara FALLS on our way from TORONTO to BUFFALO.
 A: I'm sure it was BREATHTAKING wasn't IT?
Cues: tag question, seeking confirmation.

Dialogic contraction

Utterances are classified as relatively dialogically contractive if you answer 'yes' to the following two questions.

- Does Speaker A construe the statement in a way that discourages Speaker B from expressing a different opinion?
- Does Speaker A seem to be resistant to the possibility that Speaker B might have a different opinion?

In (5), (6) and (7), the utterances are classified as relatively dialogically contractive.

- (5) A: I believe that it was absolutely STUPID of her to ASSUME that she was going to get AWAY with this.
Cues: assertive epistemic adverb absolutely, loaded words, general confronting style.
- (6) B: What did you think of Mike's BEHAVIOUR yesterday?
 A: I didn't LIKE it in FACT I NEVER I think expected him to behave that POORLY.
Cues: emphasised adverbs in fact and never, negative evaluation.
- (7) A: It was not a GOOD idea to skip the ECONOMICS class yesterday I KNOW but I just couldn't get out of BED this early.
Cues: emphasised know, high degree of certainty, conjunction but.

Notes about other contextual cues

There are a number of factors that you should keep in mind when annotating the utterances, such as prosodic cues and the presence of other stance markers. First, studies have suggested that prosody plays an important role in determining the function of a CTP and the

complement clause within its scope. Prosody affects the function of CTPs differently depending on whether the CTP expresses certainty or uncertainty. If the CTP expresses certainty,

- an accent on the verb boosts the level of confidence. For instance, *I KNOW* is considerably more assertive than *I know*.

The prosodic function of CTPs that express uncertainty is relatively more complicated. For instance, Pichler (2009) and Dehé and Wichmann (2010b) have made the following observations.

- When first-person CTPs such as *I think* receive an accent on the verb, as in *I THINK*, then the speaker expresses a high degree of uncertainty and doubt.
- When the accent is on the first-person pronoun *I*, then the speaker contrasts his/her opinion to that of others’.
- When the accent is on the negative marker *don’t*, as in *I DON’T think*, then the first-person CTP is considered to function as a boosting device that expresses personal conviction and definiteness.¹

In addition, Cruttenden (1997) has made the following observations about how intonation affects our interpretation of (un)certainty.

- Fall-rise and rise intonations mark doubt and tentativeness (e.g. *I th\ink* and *I th/ink*).
- Falling intonation expresses completeness and definiteness (e.g. *I kn\ow*).

Another factor that determines the function of CTPs is the presence of other stance markers in the utterance. For example, CTPs often co-occur with epistemic adverbs. According to Simon-Vandenberghe and Aijmer (2007), adverbs expressing certainty

- mark a high degree of commitment (e.g. *certainly, indeed*),
- indicate the presence of clear evidence (e.g. *obviously, clearly*),
- or emphasise what is expected (e.g. *of course, naturally*).

However, adverbs also express uncertainty. According to Tseronis (2009), such adverbs

- express doubt (e.g. *probably, possibly, maybe, perhaps*),
- or refer to lack of evidence (e.g. *apparently, supposedly*).

4. Unit of analysis

The minimal analysable unit is the utterance, which typically consists of two clauses: the first-person CTP and the complement clause within its scope. The whole utterance with the two clauses needs to be considered when classifying the statement as either relatively dialogically expansive or relatively dialogically contractive, regardless of whether the complement clause follows, precedes or surrounds the CTP. Sometimes, the complement clause can be presented in the form of a pronominal clause, as in (8). In this example, the pronominal *so* refers back to the complement clause *this idea of Oscar going to the States is to try and backtrack the policy* in the preceding turn.

- (8) B: This idea of Oscar going to the States is to try and backtrack the policy
A: ***I think so yes***

¹ However, note that in general, *I don’t think* and other negative-raised expressions are felt to be weaker and more tentative than their positive counterparts (Israel, 2004).

In addition to the two clauses, an utterance can also contain various discourse markers. Often, these discourse markers either precede or follow the first-person CTP and the complement clause. These discourse markers should be taken into account when interpreting the statement. For instance, in (9) the utterance is preceded by the discourse marker *well*, and in (10), the utterance is followed by both the tag question *wouldn't it* and the epistemic adverb *really*.

(9) **Well** I don't think there's enough thought in Dylan Thomas's poetry for me

(10) I suppose it would go to the board of studies **wouldn't it really**

What is more, you should carefully consider the *whole* conversation when classifying the statements, rather than examining them in isolation. This means that you should take into account all known aspects of the conversational context (such as who are the speakers, what is their relationship, what is the topic of discussion, what is the overall sentiment of the discussion, etc.), as some of them may affect the classification of the statements.

5. Instructions

Based on the criteria stated above, classify each highlighted statement as either dialogically expansive or dialogically contractive.

Also, since the distinction between these two types of statements is not strictly 'either/or', mark the statements as relatively more or less dialogically expansive or contractive using a scale from 1 to 6.

The values of the scale correspond to the following responses:

- 1 – very contractive
- 2 – contractive
- 3 – rather contractive
- 4 – rather expansive
- 5 – expansive
- 6 – very expansive

6. Summary of annotation decisions made during two reconciliation sessions

Session 1

CTPs and their default functions:

- The default function of CTPs expressing uncertainty is dialogic expansion. If these expressions occur in neutral contexts, they are annotated as rather dialogically expansive. The default function of CTPs expressing certainty is dialogic contraction. If these expressions occur in neutral contexts, they are annotated as rather dialogically contractive.

CTPs in interrogative utterances:

- Requests for clarifications and interrogative and declarative questions are always annotated as relatively dialogically expansive.

CTPs in the past tense:

- It has been shown that past tense makes verbs more tentative, ‘remote’ and polite (Stubbs, 1986; Traugott, 1995; Van Bogaert, 2010). Therefore, the past tense form *I thought* is considered to be less imposing and more negotiable than the base form *I think*.

CTPs in concede-concur pairings:

- If the first part of the concede-concur pairing gives an impression of doubt and reluctance—for instance, through the use of other epistemic markers—then the utterance is annotated as relatively dialogically expansive. These cases are not considered to function as agreements but rather as weak acknowledgements, where the speaker distances him/herself from what is expressed in the complement clause.

Session 2

CTPs with rise and fall-rise intonation:

- While the rise contour is almost exclusively used to indicate turn exchange, the same does not apply to fall-rise. Instead, the latter is often used for contrast and contradiction in which case it is limited to declaratives (e.g. *She's twenty-two, isn't she? – Twenty n\ine*). It is also used to indicate that a statement is only true under certain conditions. In such cases, it is often juxtaposed with the conjunction *but* (e.g. *I like J\ohn, but...*). Finally, it can be used with meanings related to self-justification and warning (e.g. *Be careful you don't f\all*) (Cruttenden, 1986: 109–110).

Appendix B (supplement): experimental trials

Context	Conversation
<i>Test items</i>	
<p>You and your friend Alice are thinking of going to the cinema. You are discussing which movies are worth seeing.</p>	<p>ALICE SAYS TO YOU: It's really hard to choose. But what about going to see the new Steven Spielberg movie? ** I think I heard that it got good reviews, but I'm not quite sure **.</p>
<p>You have written a final essay for your macroeconomics class at the university. You are meeting Professor Hudson to discuss your essay.</p>	<p>PROFESSOR HUDSON SAYS TO YOU: So I've reviewed your essay. Honestly, I wasn't very happy with it. ** In fact, I think your essay was clearly the weakest paper you've written in the course so far **.</p>
<i>Equals-Contraction-Accent on pronoun</i>	
<p>You have told your colleague Clare that British schools recently started to promote broader subjects for pupils, as opposed to individual, specialised subjects. Clare does not approve of the change.</p>	<p>CLARE SAYS TO YOU: This is a problem in schools. By the age of sixteen those who are going to become academics should have done their general reading. ** I think the schools are indeed wrong in trying to tackle those types of courses after the age of sixteen **.</p>
<p>You and your colleague Susan are talking about the new CEO of the pharmaceutical company in which you both work. Susan is not very happy with the way the employees are being treated now.</p>	<p>SUSAN SAYS TO YOU: She doesn't care about any of us. She has fought her way up through the hierarchy and established her policy. ** I think this is obviously going to change the atmosphere around here **.</p>
<p>You and your colleague Carol are talking about a history course for which you are both responsible. Carol is worried about what will happen if your boss Samantha found out that you have not followed her study plan properly.</p>	<p>CAROL SAYS TO YOU: We shouldn't let Samantha get anywhere near the slides we used for the course. If she finds out that we didn't even mention the Civil War in class... ** I think she will definitely be horrified **.</p>
<i>Equals-Contraction-Accent on verb</i>	
<p>You and your colleague Amy are discussing possible universities in Italy with whom you could collaborate on a project together.</p>	<p>AMY SAYS TO YOU: Pisa is once again seeing some progress under Professor De Leon. I guess that's a possibility. Or just possibly Siena. ** But I think Siena is clearly too small for us **.</p>
<p>There is an opening for one of the positions in the company where you work. Your colleague Sophie is not happy with how the position was advertised.</p>	<p>SOPHIE SAYS TO YOU: I don't like how they handled the whole thing. And the only applicant is simply not up to standard. I don't wish him ill at all, ** but I think the whole procedure is indeed unsatisfactory **.</p>
<p>You and your colleague Jennifer are talking about your boss Richard. You are discussing an important product that Richard failed to sell.</p>	<p>JENNIFER SAYS TO YOU: This was one of the things that I warned Richard about. Now as it turns out, I was right all along, and he had been mistaken. ** I think this is why he's clearly disappointed about all this **.</p>
<i>Equals-Contraction-No accent</i>	
<p>You and your colleague Sandra are talking about Ryan, who is an intern in the company</p>	<p>SANDRA SAYS TO YOU: Ryan is working as an intern here, but I think he's so involved in his</p>

where both of you work.

You and your colleague Valerie review applications for a new job with your newspaper. You are going through a CV of one of the candidates and the list of articles he has written in the past.

You and your friend Emily have recently been to a lecture by an American scientist. Emily is telling you about her impressions of it.

Equals-No contraction-Accent on pronoun

You and your colleague Kate are discussing the current situation at your workplace. Recently, the company changed directors and the former director Dan was replaced by a man called Jack.

You and your friend Heather have just attended a lecture. Heather is telling you about her impressions of it.

You and your colleague Olivia talk about an important deal that your company's management failed to sign. Olivia thinks that it is because the former manager Tom Ross no longer works in the company.

Equals-No contraction-Accent on verb

You are a lecturer at a local university. You and your colleague Amanda are talking about your colleague Keith and his strange habits.

You and your friend Paula are talking about your mutual acquaintance Bogdan. Paula is not quite sure where Bogdan comes from.

You and your friend Helen are talking about an orphanage where she used to work as a volunteer. Helen is telling you about a youngster who was charged with shoplifting and who turned up in court with an air gun.

Equals-No contraction-No accent

studies that I don't know how his internship is going. And he's just about to start working on his thesis. ** I think he doesn't have any time for the internship **.

VALERIE SAYS TO YOU: I can see that he spent two years working in Egypt. He was actually involved in the reporting on the Arab Spring. ** So I think one thing he wrote for the Daily Mail was certainly about that **.

EMILY SAYS TO YOU: That was an extremely abstruse lecture on a very difficult topic. Most people knew nothing about it. But he was a very charismatic speaker. ** I think they always are, these Americans **.

KATE SAYS TO YOU: I'm sure that Jack is in some ways a better man to work with than Dan was, and I'm certain he understands our system better. ** But I think he's not as experienced as Dan was **.

HEATHER SAYS TO YOU: There was nothing wrong with the content of the lecture. It was just his manner. It literally felt that to him it was utterly trivial. And it showed. ** I think the lecture was uninspiring **.

OLIVIA SAYS TO YOU: Had it been up to Tom Ross, then the deal would have been signed by now. He was very decisive. The present management, however, takes way too much time to decide on important matters. ** I think it's because Tom is no longer involved in it **.

AMANDA SAYS TO YOU: Keith is odd. Apparently he plays cricket with the undergraduates in the evenings. And he's around forty years old. Isn't this funny. ** And I think he's known around here for that **.

PAULA SAYS TO YOU: Bogdan has a Spanish mother and a Bosnian father, or was it Serbian. I've never been very good at geography. ** But I think he doesn't identify with his Balkan heritage very much **.

HELEN SAYS TO YOU: So he went to court with an air gun. And they didn't confiscate it. Plus he didn't even have a permit, because these days you need a permit to own an air gun. ** I think we're not doing enough to discipline our youth **.

Your friend Rose is telling you about two French coastal towns called Sete and Agde that she has recently visited.

ROSE SAYS TO YOU: Sete is one of these beautiful towns that has your typical Mediterranean seafood. There are cafes and restaurants on the quay, and the town rises steeply through cobbled roads up into the hills. And Agde is also a beautiful town. ** But I think it's a pity that such towns are crowded with tourists these days **.

You and your friend Chloe are talking about an old childhood friend Kyle and his current personal life.

CHLOE SAYS TO YOU: I heard that Kyle got married recently, and that they've already had two children. And luckily for them, they've managed to buy a flat in Central London. ** I think mortgage rules are tough for young families like Kyle's **.

You are a gymnastics coach at a local sports club. Your friend Linda, who works at the same club, is telling you about what she thinks of the head of the gymnastics unit.

LINDA SAYS TO YOU: She's a little bit idiosyncratic. She won't let me take the kids to the stadium to work on their stamina and speed. ** I think the kids need it, despite their young age **.

Disparates-Contraction-Accent on pronoun

You have applied for a graduate position in English literature and you are being interviewed by Professor Bell. You are talking about modern poets.

PROFESSOR BELL SAYS TO YOU: People often say that they find Dylan Thomas quite entertaining. I find Thomas to be a very thoughtful and unique poet, ** but I think there's nothing entertaining in his poetry **.

You are a student of marine biology. You and your supervisor Mrs. Thompson are going through your course plan for next term.

MRS. THOMPSON SAYS TO YOU: I don't recommend you to take molecular biology just yet. It is too complicated and you need to focus on the basic courses now. ** So I think this is definitely not the best course for you to take at this point **.

You are working in human resources in London. You and your boss Mrs. Chambers are discussing why there are not so many people taking part in the company's social gatherings.

MRS. CHAMBERS SAYS TO YOU: People don't seem to be interested in spending their Friday nights with the people they spend the whole week together with. There's so much more to do in the city. ** I think it's obviously because we live in London **.

Disparates-Contraction-Accent on verb

Your employer Mrs. Carter offers you a new position in the company that would require you to commute between two cities five times a week. You are talking about the prices of train tickets.

MRS. CARTER SAYS TO YOU: That would probably turn out cheaper than commuting three times a week as you did before, because there are season tickets, but you were not able to commute three days on a season ticket. ** But I think it will of course be exhausting **.

You are a student of psychology. You are complaining to your study administrator Mrs. Roberts about the lack of classrooms in the department.

MRS. ROBERTS SAYS TO YOU: The problem is that you don't have your own big lecture hall to have your lectures in, and that you have to go somewhere else for them. I know you've made quite a round trip in the Zoology Department. ** But I think the number of small seminar rooms is clearly enough for you **.

You are thinking of studying English

PROFESSOR WARREN SAYS TO YOU: We

literature. You are talking to Professor Warren to learn more about the programme.

also have linguistics components in what we do here: the history of the English language, Old English, Middle English... ** I think Old English is certainly the most difficult part about English literature **.

Disparates-Contraction-No accent

You wonder whether you should become a schoolteacher or a university lecturer. Your former supervisor Professor Adams is warning you about the high rate of unemployment among schoolteachers.

PROFESSOR ADAMS SAYS TO YOU: They've actually been talking about unemployment for teachers within the next two or three years. But at the end of the day governments take care of schoolteachers, ** but I think they obviously don't care about university lecturers **.

You are a student representative. You are having a meeting with Mrs. Coleman, the departmental administrator. You are discussing some problems in the department library, including the fact that there are not enough books in the library for the students to borrow.

MRS. COLEMAN SAYS TO YOU: Some of the books are absolutely at the heart of your education. And if the library doesn't function properly, then you're not given the opportunities that you ought to have. ** But I think students should never expect to get all the books from the library **.

You are being interviewed for a position as a staff manager. The director of the company, Mrs. Evans, is filling you in on the current situation of IT support in the company.

MRS. EVANS SAYS TO YOU: The IT support system has had some problems lately. Other members of staff are complaining about the long waiting times on urgent matters. So we badly need more IT technicians. ** But I think people will always find a reason to complain **.

Disparates-No contraction-Accent on pronoun

You are a student of film history and you are having a chat with Professor Bennett. You are talking about movie endings.

PROFESSOR BENNETT SAYS TO YOU: There's not enough thought in most movie endings for me. I'm looking for something that I can recognise and understand. For example, like in "Braveheart", when William Wallace is dying. ** I think we don't get to see movie endings like this one anymore **.

You have just had an interview for a PhD position in Classical Languages. Unfortunately, the interview did not go very well and Mrs. Crouch, the interviewer, has bad news for you.

MRS. CROUCH SAYS TO YOU: I don't think you're ready to take in the amount of work that is going to be thrown at you. My suggestion to you would be to spend another year in solid preparation and then reapply. ** I think you'll find the position difficult to cope with otherwise **.

You are a young lecturer in Cultural Anthropology. You are having a discussion with Mrs. Norton, the Director of Studies, about the poor condition of the lecture rooms in the department.

MRS. NORTON SAYS TO YOU: We need proper lecture halls to teach our students well. Unfortunately, the poor condition of our rooms has a bad influence on everybody's well-being. ** I think the low morale in our department is mostly caused by our environment **.

Disparates-No contraction-Accent on verb

You are looking for a job. Mrs. Smith is offering you a position as a secretary in her company, which in her opinion is a much better choice than becoming a schoolteacher.

MRS. SMITH SAYS TO YOU: Being a secretary certainly gives you more flexibility than having a teaching job. Also, the salary will be higher. ** I think it's getting more and more difficult to live on

a teacher's salary **.

You are helping to organise an international conference as a volunteer. You and the chief organiser of the conference, Mrs. Martin, are discussing the rooms where the presentations could be held.

MRS. MARTIN SAYS TO YOU: We might have to hold the theme sessions somewhere else, because Lowell Hall is a bit small for the presentations. ** I think Lowell is not suitable for such big events **.

You are a nurse at a local hospital. You are complaining to the head surgeon Mrs. Harris about the bad condition of the building where many of the wards are situated.

MRS. HARRIS SAYS TO YOU: I'm aware of the poor condition of the ward and I have informed the management about it. The problem is that we are swamped with patients at the moment. ** So I think renovating it now in the summer will only make things worse **.

Disparates-No contraction-No accent

You have just finished writing the final draft of your Master's thesis. You are having a meeting with your supervisor Mrs. Jones to discuss it.

MRS. JONES SAYS TO YOU: In general, I'm not particularly happy with the paper. I'm expecting a lot more from you at this point than what I can see from this manuscript. ** I think you didn't put enough time into doing a proper literature review **.

You are thinking of applying for a position as an assistant in a research group that investigates animal behaviour. Professor Phelps is telling you about the requirements.

PROFESSOR PHELPS SAYS TO YOU: There are some requirements for the position, such as being prepared to work with wild animals. ** Also, I think people have to have basic knowledge of chemistry when dealing with animals **.

You are a student at a university. You are having a meeting with your student counsellor Mrs. Rodgers and you are discussing your relationship with your tutors.

MRS. RODGERS SAYS TO YOU: Another thing that I wanted to talk to you about is your relationship with your tutors. You know that you're supposed to go to your departmental tutor if you have problems. ** Although I think students will rather go to their academic tutors than their departmental ones **.
