

Master thesis  
2005  
University of Lund  
Department of Economics

# Debt-financed migration and debt-bounded sexual exploitation: A study from an economic perspective

Supervisor  
Professor Fredrik Andersson

Author  
Daniel Gustafsson

## Abstract

This thesis deals exclusively with the problem of trafficking in women for the purpose of sexual exploitation. Initially, I present a microeconomic model that can be used to analyse the system of debt-financed migration and debt-bounded sexual exploitation. This is followed by an empirical survey of the organisational and operational features of the trafficking organisations. The theoretical and empirical outcome of this thesis prove that states committed to the fight against human trafficking should pursue policies that will make it harder for the trafficking organisations to exploit the illegal status of the victims, such as more lenient deportation policies. This will make it harder for the trafficking organisations to maintain the system of debt-financed migration and debt-bounded sexual exploitation and thereby take away the main financial incentive in the trafficking business.

I finally evaluate the ongoing counter trafficking activities and the available laws on the subject and conclude that the available conventions and national laws in many cases grant victims the right to protection and assistance, and further that some countries in recent years have adopted more lenient deportation policies. However, it is too soon to see the effect of this development on the behaviour of the victims as well as the trafficking organisations.

Keywords: Human trafficking, debt-financed migration, debt-bounded sexual exploitation, prostitution and sexual slavery.

1. Introduction .....	6
1.1 Problem statement .....	7
1.2 Method .....	8
1.2.1 Introduction .....	8
1.2.2 Studying trafficking in women and the challenges involved .....	8
1.2.3 The methodological disposition .....	9
1.3 Material .....	10
1.4 Definitions .....	10
1.4.1 Introduction .....	10
1.4.2 Organised criminal group as defined in the United Nations Convention against Transnational Organised Crime .....	10
1.4.3 To define trafficking in humans in general and trafficking in women for the purpose of sexual exploitation in particular .....	11
1.5 Limitations .....	13
2. Theory .....	14
2.1 Introduction .....	14
2.1.1 Fundamental assumptions of the model .....	14
2.1.3 The model .....	15
2.1.4 Time period zero: negotiating the debt contract .....	16
2.1.5 Time period one: the transfer .....	17
2.1.6 Time period two: Receiving the payoff .....	17
2.1.7 The correlation between wealth and skills .....	18
2.1.8 Migration without the assistance of a trafficker .....	19
2.1.9 Migration with the assistance of a trafficker .....	20
2.1.10 Implications of the model for the fight against trafficking in women for the purpose of sexual exploitation .....	22
2.1.11 Discussing a generalised model .....	22
3. An empirical review .....	23
3.1 Introduction .....	24
3.2 The supply side of the problem .....	24
3.2.1 Introduction .....	24
3.2.2 Economic factors .....	24
3.2.3 Social factors .....	25
3.2.4 Cultural factors .....	26
3.2.5 Political factors .....	26
3.2.6 Summary .....	26
3.3 The characteristics of the trafficking organisations .....	27
3.3.1 Introduction .....	27
3.3.2 Summary .....	28
3.4 The organisational features of the trafficking organisations .....	29
3.4.1 Introduction .....	29
3.4.2 Diversification of the trafficking organisations .....	29
3.4.3 Vertical differentiation .....	30
3.4.4 Horizontal differentiation .....	30
3.4.5 The division of labour .....	30
3.4.6 Conclusion 1 .....	32
3.5 The operational features of the trafficking organisations .....	32
3.5.1 Introduction .....	32
3.5.2 Recruitment of victims .....	32
3.5.3 Negotiating the debt-contract .....	33

3.5.4	Preparation of the victims and their travel documents .....	34
3.5.5	Transportation of the victims and routing .....	34
3.5.6	Conclusion 2.....	36
3.6	The post-arrival situation .....	36
3.6.1	Introduction .....	36
3.6.2	Debt-bondage and sexual exploitation .....	36
3.6.3	Means used to control the victims .....	38
3.6.4	Conclusion 3.....	38
3.7	The demand side of the problem .....	39
3.7.1	Introduction .....	39
3.7.2	The market for commercialised sex .....	39
3.7.3	The male demand for commercialised sex in general .....	40
3.7.4	Male demand for Cheap, compliant and submissive prostitutes .....	41
3.7.6	A short note on the political debate and the effect of legalisation of prostitution ..	45
3.7.7	Conclusion 4.....	47
4.	Evaluating the preventive measures .....	48
4.1	Introduction .....	48
4.2	The historical treatment of female trafficking victims .....	48
4.2.1	Introduction .....	48
4.2.2	Arrest and deportation .....	48
4.2.3	Summary .....	49
4.3	International conventions addressing human trafficking .....	49
4.3.1	Introduction .....	49
4.3.2	A general note on some important conventions .....	49
4.3.3	The UN Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons, Especially Women and Children (2000) .....	50
4.3.4	Summary .....	51
4.4	The United Nations .....	51
4.4.1	Introduction .....	51
4.4.2	The United Nations Office for Drug Control and Crime Prevention .....	51
4.4.3	The Office of the High Commissioner for Human Rights .....	52
4.4.5	Summary .....	52
4.5	The European Union .....	53
4.5.1	Introduction .....	53
4.5.2	The STOP Programme and the STOP II Programme .....	53
4.5.3	Summary .....	54
4.6	The United States of America .....	54
4.6.1	Introduction .....	54
4.6.2	The Trafficking Victims Protection Act.....	55
4.6.3	Summary .....	56
4.7	Laws, programmes and policies that address the demand .....	56
4.7.1	Introduction .....	56
4.7.2	The Swedish approach .....	56
4.7.3	Other initiatives taken against male demand for prostitution .....	57
4.7.4	Summary .....	58
4.8	Conclusions .....	58
4.8.1	Introduction .....	58
4.8.2	The theoretical outcome .....	58
4.8.3	The empirical outcome .....	58
4.8.4	The outcome of the evaluation of the preventive measures .....	60

4.8.5 Some personal critical reflections and suggestions of future research..... 62

# 1. Introduction

In December 2000, 148 countries attended a United Nations conference in Palermo, Italy. The conference opened the new *United Nations Convention Against Transnational Organised Crime* to states' signature. Of the participating 148 countries, 121 signed the new UN Convention and over 80 countries signed one of its supplementary protocols, *The Protocol to prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons, Especially Women and Children*. Further, one additional protocol called, *the Protocol Against the Smuggling of Migrants by Land, Sea and Air*, was also opened for states' signature (Raymond 2002, p. 491). Since then have over 40 countries ratified the new UN Convention and its two supplementary protocols on trafficking in persons and migrants, and thereby made them an instrument of international law (IOM, Bulletin N° 28 – December 2003).

The development and ratification of the UN convention, and the two supplementary protocols, reflects the growing will among nations to fight organised crime and eradicate the trafficking in women and children for the purpose of sexual exploitation.

This study deals exclusively with the problem of trafficking in women for the purpose of sexual exploitation.

In the following I will present a microeconomic model that can be used to analyse different aspects of the trafficking process as well as the actions of the different agents involved. The purpose hereby is to some extent bridge the theoretical and methodological insufficiencies that the analysis of organised crime and trafficking in women into prostitution and sexual slavery suffers from at present.

This will be followed by a review of the very limited high quality empirical evidence that is available on the subject at present. This will be carried out with a special focus on the operational, organisational and structural features of the criminal organisations and networks that are involved in the human trafficking business. I will end the empirical overview by relating the evidence regarding male demand for prostitution to the problem of female trafficking.

I will finally use the result from the theoretical and empirical analysis to evaluate the different policies, strategies and initiatives taken at the local, regional and global level to combat trafficking in women for the purpose of sexual exploitation. The need for such an evaluation is commonly recognised by academics as well as field experts on human trafficking (IOM Nov 2002, p. 48 and Salt 2000, p. 32).

Although the specific problem with trafficking in women is rather new to the scientific field of economics, I believe the discipline has much to offer. I therefore hope you will enjoy the following analysis and that my moderate attempt to offer some theoretical understanding of this problem will wake an interest among other students to deal with human trafficking within the line of their scientific work.

## 1.1 Problem statement

During the 1990's the international trafficking of men, women and children has become a major topic for academics, policymakers, non-governmental organisations as well as international organisations such as the United Nations. This has resulted in the development of several new national and international protocols, legislations and policies to prevent trafficking in humans. The most prominent and comprehensive initiative of this kind is the previously mentioned *United Nations Convention against Transnational Organised Crime* and its two supplementary protocols the *Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons, Especially Women and Children* and the *Protocol against the Smuggling of Migrants by Land, Sea and Air* (Raymond, 2002, p. 491-493).

The problem has also caught the interest of many scientists, especially within the academic field of criminology, gender and development and sociology.

Despite this increased interest and a rapidly growing literature on the subject our empirical and theoretical knowledge base can still be said to be very underdeveloped. Further, most of the studies that have actually been undertaken are not based on any extensive research. This is especially evident in the specific case of trafficking in women for the purpose of sexual exploitation and most research has not moved much beyond mapping the problem (Salt, 2000, p. 32 and Laczko and Gramegna 2003, p. 180).

The growing demand for information from single governments and international organisations has resulted in the rapid production of several studies and reports. However, the quality and reliability of the data presented in these studies can often be questioned (IOM Nov 2002, p. 5).

Hence, it can be said that the enormous attention the problem of human trafficking has received from many politicians, governments, the media and non-governmental organisations is running ahead of what is actually known from an empirical and theoretical perspective (Salt, 2000, p. 1). This insufficiency may lead to the policy measures designed to tackle the problem with human trafficking in reality having a very limited preventive effect or even some unwanted negative side effects that we are not yet aware of.

The first goal (or first step) of this thesis will therefore be to try to counter act some of the insufficiencies described above by creating a theoretical and empirical foundation that can be used for further analysis on the subject of human trafficking. The second goal (or second step) of this thesis is to use the result from this analysis and evaluate the latest initiatives, policies and strategies taken by single countries and international organisations to prevent trafficking in women for the purpose of sexual exploitation.

I hereby hope to be able to offer a critical analysis of the ongoing counter-trafficking work, identifying weak areas and suggest improvements. It is evident that this type of critical analysis is needed if we are to find better preventive policies and strategies and be able to act more rapidly and decisive against the organisations responsible for trafficking in women for the purpose of sexual exploitation.

## 1.2 Method

### 1.2.1 Introduction

Research on human trafficking offers many methodological difficulties. The first and perhaps most important reason for this is the lack of accurate statistical data on the number of trafficking victims. This can partly be explained by the concealed and illegal nature of the business of trafficking. This insufficiency is hard to overcome from a methodological point of view, but efforts have been made to provide statistics with higher reliability. Nevertheless, all reported statistics must be interpreted with great caution and any researcher committed to the subject must be careful not to draw to far-reaching conclusion based on the very limited and low quality data that are available at present.

The second reason is that the development of the scientific methodology when it comes to human trafficking is in its very beginning (Salt 2000, p. 32 and Heckmann 2003, and Laczko and Gramegna 2003, p 180). In the following I will present some of the major methodological challenges and difficulties that a researcher may encounter when studying trafficking in women. This will be followed by a description of the methodological approach that I have chosen to be able to carry out the analysis in this thesis.

### 1.2.2 Studying trafficking in women and the challenges involved

Any scientist studying trafficking in women will encounter problems that are unique to the subject and not to be found in any other areas of research.

The illegal character of trafficking in women and the connection to organised crime heavily limits the possibilities to collect first hand information and reliable data on the subject. The limited access to information about traffickers is especially prominent when it comes to the organisers and profiteers higher up in the hierarchy of the trafficking organisations. Researchers of organised crime may also feel discouraged by the willingness of the traffickers to use violence to protect their businesses. Further, it is not always easy to know whom to trust when it comes to identifying persons who can provide information. Hence, there is no obvious way to ensure that for example police officers, border guards and social workers are not on the payrolls of the trafficking organisations and perhaps even directly involved in the trafficking business or sex industry (IOM Nov 2002, p. 13). Due to this matter, some researcher have used more indirect or roundabout methods to collect information for their studies on the trafficking organisations. These methods include using the field first hand knowledge of expert NGOs and extrapolating information from other closely related statistical material (Gustafsson 2003, p. 7).

At present, most of the information about traffickers comes from interviews with victims. This is problematic since these victims usually only have very limited information about the trafficking process to give, that is, only information about the part themselves have been involved in. Further, women and children who are victims of trafficking will most likely not be able to give any precise description about where they were, how they travelled and who were in charge simply because they were not told or that they were lied to. In a very limited number of cases, some researchers have contacted the traffickers directly. However, they have tended to be traffickers operating in small-scale who only have information about their own limited stage of involvement or possible the stage before and after (IOM Nov 2002, p. 10).

Interviewing victims of trafficking also exhibits many difficulties and ethical considerations that may limit the access for the researcher. Many victims are unwilling to tell about their



experiences due to the stigmatisation and shame following from the work in the sex industry. Further, many traffickers and exploiters in the sex industry use threats of violence against the victims' families as a mean to control the victims and to keep them from deflecting (IOM 1995, p. 20 and IOM Nov 2002, p 35-35 and Raymond, Hughes and Gomez 2001, p. 64)). This limits the victims' willingness to participate in any research project as long as they are still in the receiving country. The victims may also fear that they will be convicted for illegal entry into the receiving country and may therefore be reluctant to tell about their experiences. There may also be substantial language difficulties that have to be solved since the victims usually come from many different countries and in many cases only speak their own native language. Naturally the victims are also traumatised by their experiences and may not be ready to talk to strangers about sensitive things like sexual exploitation. Therefore, interviewing victims demands great concern and awareness from the researcher and it is important to establish a long term relationship built on trust and respect before asking any sensitive questions (IOM Nov 2002, p.11).

Hence, researchers should be careful not to draw too far reaching conclusions based on information from single victims without confirming it via other sources.

### **1.2.3 The methodological disposition**

The methodological approach used in this thesis is very straight forward and I start out by presenting the available definitions on the subject. This is followed by the presentation of a microeconomic model that captures the actions of the agents in the different stages in the trafficking process. This model has been developed by Guido Friebel and Sergei Guriev and is presented in their article "*Human Trafficking and Illegal Migration*" (Friebel and Guriev 2002). The model serves to increase our understanding of the use and importance of debt-contracts to the entire trafficking business and can most preferably be described as a contract theoretical model. The theoretical chapter is followed by a presentation of the very latest empirical evidence available at present on the subject of human trafficking. I begin by presenting the factors behind the supply side of the problem with trafficking in women for the purpose of sexual exploitation. I will there after present some evidence regarding the characteristics of the trafficking organisations and their organisational and operational features. I will end the empirical survey by taking a closer look at the male demand for prostitution and relate the evidence to the problem of female trafficking. Through out the empirical overview I will return to the theoretical model and compare the empirical evidence to the assumption building up the model.

I will finally use the result from the theoretical and empirical analysis and evaluate the counter trafficking policies, initiatives and strategies undertaken by single governments and international organisations to fight trafficking in women for the purpose of sexual exploitation. I hereby hope to be able to offer a critical evaluation of the ongoing counter trafficking work and hopefully be able to suggest efficient improvements, as was the purpose with this thesis.

## 1.3 Material

The material used in this thesis has been obtained by using the academic literature search engines available at the University of Lund's library homepage ([www.lub.lu.se](http://www.lub.lu.se)). Further I have used more general search engines such as the ([www.google.com](http://www.google.com)). In addition to this I have found much rewarding material on the home pages of several relevant international organisations and non-governmental organisations, such as legal documents, conventions and presentations of counter trafficking initiatives.

The main part of the theoretical chapter is constituted by a microeconomic model developed by Gudio Friebel<sup>1</sup> and Sergei Guriev<sup>2</sup> and is presented in their article "Human Trafficking and Illegal Migration" (2002).

When it comes to explaining the empirical operational and organisational features of the trafficking organisations the work of Dr Andreas Schloenhardt, John Salt and Jeremy Stein has proven much useful<sup>3</sup>.

I would also like to specifically mention the research undertaken and published by the International Organisation for Migration. This material has been obtained via the organisation's homepage ([www.iom.int](http://www.iom.int)). This material is indeed very prominent and of high quality, and based on the extensive first hand field experience of the organisation.

It has been my motivation to as far as possible only use high quality material published by well known experts on the subject of human trafficking.

## 1.4 Definitions

### 1.4.1 Introduction

The task of agreeing on suitable definitions for organised crime and trafficking in women (humans) has led to much discussion between countries and other interested parties. The question of how to define trafficking in humans in general and especially how to define trafficking in women for the purpose of sexual exploitation has turned out to be quite a sensitive matter and is leading to much polarisation whenever the subject is discussed on the international agenda. The use of different definitions also makes the statistical data reported on the subject incomparable, which naturally makes any research on the subject much more difficult (Laczko and Gramenga 2003, p. 184).

### 1.4.2 Organised criminal group as defined in the United Nations Convention against Transnational Organised Crime

The New United Nations Convention against Transnational Organised Crime recognises the need for a multidimensional and transnational approach to fight organised crime. Naturally any convention making such claims must be based on clear and precise definitions in order to

---

<sup>1</sup> Stockholm School of Economics, Stockholm.

<sup>2</sup> New Economic School, Moscow.

<sup>3</sup> Dr Andreas Schloenhardt, PhD, Faculty of Law, The University of Adelaide, Australia.

John Salt and Jeremy Stein, Migration Research Unit, Department of Geography, University College London, UK.

be an efficient legal tool for states to use. Or as it is stated in Article 1 in the convention document:

*“The purpose of this Convention is to promote cooperation to prevent and combat transnational organised crime more effectively”.*

(Annex I, Article 1, United Nations Convention against Transnational Organised Crime)

Clearly, in order for the convention to promote efficient transnational cooperation all states must commit themselves to the use of the same definition of organised crime. However it should be noted that in the text of the convention document the term “organised criminal group” is being used instead of the term “organised crime”. It is therefore stated in Article 2 of the convention document that:

(a) *“Organised criminal group” shall mean a structured group of three or more persons, existing for a period of time and acting in concert with the aim of committing one or more serious crimes or offences established in accordance with this Convention, in order to obtain, directly or indirectly, a financial or other material benefit;”*

(b) *“Serious crime” shall mean conduct constituting an offence punishable by a maximum deprivation of liberty of at least four years or a more serious penalty;”*

(c) *“Structured group” shall mean a group that is not randomly formed for the immediate commission of an offence and that does not need to have formally defined roles for its members, continuity of its membership or a developed structure;”*

(Article 2, United Nations Convention against Transnational Organised Crime)

This definition of organised crime comprises not only large criminal organisations with a distinct internal structure, but also smaller criminal groups and more loosely and informal connected criminal networks. As we shall later see this definition may very well at least in theory fulfil many necessary aspects to be efficient and operational in the fight against the organised criminal networks and organisations responsible for human trafficking.

### **1.4.3 To define trafficking in humans in general and trafficking in women for the purpose of sexual exploitation in particular**

When studying the available governmental documents and research reports it is evident that many different definitions of trafficking are being used. This lack of consensus naturally constitutes a major obstacle to the advancement of the research and makes especially the available statistical data on the subject incomparable (Raymond 2002, p. 492). However, the United Nations Convention against Transnational Organised Crime seems to indicate that consensus, at least to some extent, now have been reached (Laczko and Gramegna 2003, p. 180). The first issue of importance when it comes to defining human trafficking is to clarify the distinction between “Trafficking” and “Smuggling”.

Hence, according to the *Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons, Especially Women and Children*, trafficking is defined as:

(a) *“Trafficking in Persons” shall mean the recruitment, transportation, transfer, harbouring or receipt of persons, by means or the threat or use of force or other forms of*

*coercion, of abduction, of fraud, of deception, of the abuse of power or of a position of vulnerability of the giving or receiving of payments or benefits to achieve the consent of a person having control over another person, for the purpose of exploitation. Exploitation shall include, at a minimum, the exploitation of the prostitution of others or other forms of sexual exploitation, forced labour or services, slavery or practices similar to slavery, servitude or the removal of organs;”*

(b) *“The consent of a victim of trafficking in persons to the intended exploitation set forth in subparagraph (a) of this article shall be irrelevant where any of the means set forth in subparagraph (a) have been used;”*

(c) *“The recruitment, transportation, transfer, harbouring or receipt of a child for the purpose of exploitation shall be considered “trafficking in persons” even if it does not involve any of the means set forth in subparagraph (a) or this article;”*

(d) *“ “Child” shall mean any person under eighteen years of age.”*

(Article 3, Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons, Especially Women and Children)

This definition of trafficking in person differs somewhat from the definition of smuggling of migrants as set out in the *Protocol against Smuggling of Migrants by Land, Sea or Air*. Accordingly, smuggling of migrants is defined as:

(a) *“ “Smuggling of migrants” shall mean the procurement, in order to obtain, directly or indirectly, a financial or other material benefit, of the illegal entry of a person into a State Party of which the person is not a national or a permanent resident;”*

(b) *“ “Illegal entry” shall mean crossing of borders without complying with the necessary requirements for legal entry into the receiving State;”*

(Article 3, Protocol against the Smuggling of Migrants by Land, Sea and Air)

Studying these two definitions, the distinction between trafficking in persons and smuggling of migrants at least in theory becomes clearer. Hence, the crime of trafficking is characterised by the use of coercion, abduction, fraud, deception and exploitation, whereas the crime of smuggling is characterised by the illegal entry of a person into a country. Even though the distinction may seem clear, critical voices have been heard that there will still room for misinterpretations and that some countries will continue to use their own definitions more suitable to their own political agenda. Further, the processes of trafficking persons and smuggling of migrants exhibit many similarities and will in many cases evidently overlap (Gijsbert van Liemt 2003, p.17 and Anderson and Davidson 2002, p. 10). Hence, what starts out as a smuggling process may very well end up in a trafficking process with all the necessary elements of coercion and exploitation. Especially many young women, who have surrendered themselves to the mercy of human smugglers in hope to migrate for a legitimate job have ended up being trafficked into prostitution and sexual slavery (IOM Nov 2002, p. 14).

## 1.5 Limitations

Naturally, the problem of human trafficking exhibits many different dimensions that can be analysed from an economic perspective. In the specific case of trafficking in women for the purpose of sexual exploitation most research has mainly concentrated on areas such as estimating the magnitude of the problem, identifying the trafficking routes between sending and receiving countries, documentation of the recruitment methods used by the traffickers, investigating the extent of the human rights abuses involved and to some extent reviewing the current legal responses (IOM Nov 2002, p. 7).

However, it is commonly recognized among the expert analysts in the area that the lack of data on the number of trafficking victims holds back further research. One reason for this is that the methodology used by researchers is still in its very beginning (Salt 2000, p. 38). Developing and presenting more accurate data on the subject would therefore evidently indeed be a welcomed and much needed achievement. However, any claims of such advancements require a research budget and connections with governmental authorities and NGOs far beyond the reach of my possibilities as a master student.

Although some statistics on the subject are available, I chose not to report these figures since they usually are very inexact and have been obtained by using many different definitions. Hence the statistics available at present do not allow any meaningful comparison over time or between countries.

Nevertheless I still hope that my analysis at least for an economic point of view will offer some new and important insights.

The very limited analyses on human trafficking and illegal migration undertaken from a specific economic perspective have mainly focused on developing theoretical models, such as the one presented later in this thesis. These models are built on assumptions and principles commonly accepted in the scientific field of economics. However, it seems to me as if most of the authors of these theoretical models fail to take into consideration the empirical evidence available on the subject of human trafficking in their analyses. Hence, after presenting their models many authors draw their conclusions without any profound empirical support.

I hope to overcome this weakness by presenting both an theoretical model as well as an extensive survey of the empirical evidence available at present and base my conclusions on the result of both.

## 2. Theory

### 2.1 Introduction

The specific analysis of crime is not new to the academic field of economics and its origin can be traced back to the groundbreaking work of Gary S Becker. His article, “*Crime and Punishment: An Economic Approach*”, was published in 1968 and can be considered as the first study of crime from an economic point of view<sup>4</sup>.

In his article Becker analyses criminal behaviour using only economic factors. His conclusion is that crime is the result of rational considerations of the perpetrator. Since then many other economic scientists have undertaken studies of crime and organised crime. This has resulted in the recognition of scientists from other fields, especially in the field of criminology. Today, the economic analysis of organised crime can be considered as very successful when it comes to explaining the objectives, organisational structures and operational procedures of these criminal organisations.

In the following I will present a microeconomic model on human trafficking that can be used to understand the specific parts in the trafficking process as well as to analyse and evaluate the effect of different preventive policies and strategies. This model will constitute the foundation for the further analysis in this thesis.

The model has been developed by Gudjo Friebel<sup>5</sup> and Sergei Guriev<sup>6</sup> and is presented in their article “Human Trafficking and Illegal Migration” (2002). This model is suitable to the more general case of trafficking in humans but can also be used to understand the different features of the specific case with trafficking in women into sexual slavery and prostitution. In the following I will first present the model in a very straightforward and general way and finally relate it to the empirics and reality of the problem of trafficking in women for the purpose of sexual exploitation.

#### 2.1.1 Fundamental assumptions of the model

Most economic research undertaken on the subject of human trafficking has focused on modelling the revenue functions of the trafficking organisations. However, as Friebel and Guriev argue, it can be very difficult to reveal the traffickers and to track down their profits and it can therefore be more effective to pursue policies that have a more indirect restraining effect on the profitability of the organised criminal networks and organisations responsible for trafficking in humans (Friebel and Guriev 2002, p. 2). Accordingly, states committed to the fight against trafficking should pursue policies that make it easier and less risky for the victims of trafficking to apply for a legal status. As shall be proven, such policies may have a very strong effect on reducing the expected profits of the organisations and networks involved. The reason for this is that these policies will serve to reduce the enforceability of the illegal debt contract between the trafficking organisations and networks and their victims, and thereby take away the economic incentive fundamental to the business of trafficking in women (Ibid p. 3).

---

<sup>4</sup> ”Becker, ”Crime and Punishment: An Economic Approach”. (1968) 3 Journal of Political Economy.

<sup>5</sup> Stockholm School of Economics, Stockholm.

<sup>6</sup> New Economic School, Moscow.

The model of Friebel and Guriev can therefore most preferably be explained as a contract-theoretical model. To begin with there is a sending country and a receiving country. The potential victims of the traffickers are the workers of the sending countries who wish to migrate to the receiving country in search for a higher paying job. In order to be able to migrate the workers must pay an upfront cost, however the initial endowment or wealth of many potential migrants is insufficient to cover this cost. This creates an opportunity for the traffickers to step in as an alternative provider of the funds needed to migrate. Hence, the migrant approaches the trafficker to explore his/her opportunities. Since many migrants have no collateral they have to enter a temporary debt contract with the trafficker and thereby commit their workforce to the sole use of the trafficker in the receiving country until the debt has been paid back. This is usually carried out through working in so-called sweatshops or as is the case for many women, through prostitution<sup>7</sup>.

It is crucial to the understanding of the model as well as to the problem of trafficking in women to realise that these debt-contracts violate the labour legislation of the receiving country and can thereby only be enforced in the illegal sector of the labour market. However, since the laws of the receiving country will not favour the trafficker the migrants have an incentive to default from the contract and try to obtain a legal status and a work within the legal sector of the labour market. Since successful defaulting on the debt-contract will lower the expected profit of the traffickers they may not find it economically worthwhile to continue trafficking humans. As previously mentioned this relationship has strong implications for the fight against trafficking in women and suggests that states should pursue policies that make it easier for the trafficking victims to receive legal status. Hence, by lowering the risk that the victims take to reveal themselves to state authorities, more victims will default on the illegal debt contracts and apply for a legal status. This in turn will lower the profits to be made by the traffickers and take away their financial incentive to engage in human trafficking (Friebel and Guriev 2002, p. 4).

### 2.1.3 The model

The model is built on the assumption that the traffickers and the workers (victims) seeking to migrate are both rational. Hence they are considered to have sufficient and accurate knowledge about their expected payoffs in the legal and illegal working sector in the receiving country as well as about the risk of the worker being deported home again.

Friebel and Guriev set out their model by considering a game between the trafficker,  $T$ , and the worker (victim),  $W$ . Both the trafficker and the worker live for two periods. The trafficker and the worker will maximize their payoffs over the two periods. This is denoted by  $U^T$  and  $U^W$ . The worker is, as explained earlier, constrained by his wealth and can therefore not pay the entire upfront cost of migration by him/her self. The trafficker, on the other hand, is considered to have complete access to credits and at zero cost.

The worker's productivity in the sending country is denoted by  $r$ . If the worker migrates to the receiving country he/she can either work in the illegal sector with a productivity of

$\tilde{R}$  or work in the legal sector with a productivity of  $R$ . Further, the workers initial endowment or wealth is denoted by  $a$  (Ibid p. 6).

The cost for migration, denoted by  $M$ , can be increased or decreased by governmental policies and actions such as stricter border controls.

---

<sup>7</sup> See for example Ko-lin Chin (1999), *Smuggled Chinese*, Temple University Press, Philadelphia.

#### 2.1.4 Time period zero: negotiating the debt contract

Friebel and Guriev begin by assuming that the market for traffickers is competitive and refer to the work of Kyle and Koslowski (2001) and Chin (1999) to support this view<sup>8</sup>. However, the question whether or not the illegal market for trafficking and especially prostitution exhibits a monopolistic or competitive behaviour is heavily debated among economists and criminologists. Further, it should be noted that there is evidence that extortion, violence and threats of violence are commonly used methods of organised crime to destroy competition and obtain more control over the illegal market of prostitution and drug trafficking (Schloenhardt 1999, p. 10). In conclusion, it is evident that the question of monopoly or competition in the trafficking business and market for prostitution needs to be further studied before any general statements can be made. (See the chapter on suggested future research)

We start out by studying the actions of the trafficker and the worker at the beginning of the first time period ( $t = 0$ ).

Initially, the worker approaches the trafficker with an offer. If successfully agreed upon the terms of the arrangement, the worker and the trafficker enter into a contract. This contract stipulates that the trafficker shall take the worker to a specific receiving country where he/she shall work in the illegal sector. As can be seen Friebel and Guriev assume that it is the worker that is the most active part in this initial stage and takes the first step to approach the trafficker. However, it can be questioned who is approaching whom with an offer. The research on this particular aspect of the trafficking problem is very scarce and little information is available on whether or not it is more common for the potential victims to approach the traffickers or vice versa (Salt and Stein 1997, p. 479). The empirical evidence of the business of trafficking in women suggests that both ways are possible. In some cases the trafficking organisations use adverts in the local newspapers which enables the victims to make the first contact. In other cases the victims were recruited in a more informal way by a relative, friend or an acquaintance with connections to the trafficking organisation (see the discussion in empirical chapter about the recruitment process). Evidently, no matter which recruitment practice being used, the outcome of the model is the same.

The worker must make two payments to the trafficker to receive the service he/she needs to be able to migrate. This involves the first period upfront payment  $P_1$ , and a second period second payment  $P_2$ .

Hence, in order to be able to migrate through the assistance of the trafficker, the worker must have a large enough initial endowment of wealth to be able to pay the upfront payment of  $P_1$ :

$$a - P_1 \geq 0$$

Since the worker does not own any collateral, the trafficker will only agree to take the worker to the receiving country if he can make sure that he will receive the second payment of  $P_2$ . Hence, the trafficker agrees to take the worker to the receiving country only if he in change gets the exclusive use of the product of the worker until  $P_2$  is repaid. This debt-contract is fundamental to this model as well as to the entire human trafficking industry. It also serves to give us an understanding of one of the root causes of the inhumanity characterising the entire trafficking business.

Naturally, this type of debt-contracts can only be enforced in the illegal sector of the receiving country and the traffickers are usually prepared to use a considerable amount of force to

---

<sup>8</sup> See Chin, Ko-lin (1999), *Smuggled Chinese*, Temple University Press, Philadelphia or Kyle, David and Koslowski, Rey (2001), *Global Human Smuggling*, The Johns Hopkins University Press, Baltimore and London.



assure payment. This is especially obvious in the specific case of trafficking in women into prostitution and sexual slavery. Therefore it is of no surprise that assisted victims have witnessed about the deliberate use of violence, rape, restrictions of movement and severe working conditions as a structural way to control the victims of trafficking and sexual slavery (IOM 1995, p. 19-20 and Sullivan and Jeffreys, 2001 p. 8).

Since the debt contract between the trafficker and the worker is inconsistent with the labour laws in the receiving country the worker can successfully deflect from it if he/she succeeds in applying for a job in the legal sector. That is, the trafficker cannot go to a legal court to seek help. Hence, through this transition the worker is protected from the vengeance of the trafficker. However, the trafficker always has the possibility to retaliate against the worker's family in order to create an incentive for other workers not to deflect from the debt contract through. Friebel and Guriev excludes this possibility in their model and also the possibility that the trafficker abuses his power in the illegal sector and collect more than  $P_2$  from the worker. This is a questionable standpoint when it comes to the reality of trafficking in women for the purpose of sexual exploitation. Hence, there is some empirical evidence suggesting that victims of trafficking are refraining from deflection in fear of retaliation against their families (IOM 1995, p. 20). Further it is also obvious that in many cases the trafficker extort more than  $P_2$ . Hence, in the case of trafficking in women into prostitution and sexual slavery it is evident that the debts are constantly being adjusted and increased and that the victims are forced to work as prostitutes long after they have generated enough income to cover the repayment of  $P_2$ . Further there is also substantial evidence that women are being re-trafficked or sold many times between or within countries (IOM Nov 2002, p. 31).

### **2.1.5 Time period one: the transfer**

In the end of the first time period ( $t = 1$ ), the trafficker chooses between accepting or rejecting the offer of the worker. If the trafficker and the worker cannot agree on the terms of the debt contract, the worker stays in the sending country.

If the trafficker on the other hand accepts the offer, the worker migrates and spends the beginning of the second time period ( $t = 2$ ) in the receiving country. There he/she is being employed in the illegal sector, but may try to deflect from the debt contract and apply for a legal status and a job in the legal sector. With a probability of  $\pi$ , the worker is unsuccessful in this attempt and is therefore being deported back to the sending country. With a probability of  $(1 - \pi)$ , he/she is successful and receives a legal status and a job in the legal sector, and is hereby protected from the retaliation of the trafficker.

In conclusion, any governmental action that serves to make it easier for the worker to obtain a legal status is represented by a decrease in  $\pi$ . Hence, such regularisation policies may effectively serve to reduce the expected profits of the traffickers and make it unprofitable to engage in human trafficking (Ibid p. 7).

### **2.1.6 Time period two: Receiving the payoff**

In the end of the second time period ( $t = 3$ ) the trafficker and the worker receive their payoffs. If the worker remains in the sending country he/she will receive a wage as given by his/her initial productivity, that is  $w = r$ , and his/hers total utility will equal:

$$U_S^W = a + r$$

If the worker through the help of the trafficker migrates to the receiving country he/she will begin to work in the illegal sector of the labour market as agreed upon in the debt contract.

The trafficker will keep the worker's earnings to ensure the payment of  $P_2$  and the worker will receive whatever is left over. Hence, the worker's payoff in the illegal sector in the receiving country is:

$$U_i^W = a - P_1 + \tilde{R} - P_2 \quad (1)$$

As stated earlier, the worker can try to receive a legal status. If the worker succeeds his/her productivity will increase from  $\tilde{R}$  to  $R$ . Further, the worker defleets from the debt contract and will therefore not pay  $P_2$ . However, the worker also faces the risk of being deported back to the sending country. Hence, the workers expected utility when applying for a legal status is<sup>9</sup>:

$$U_i^W = a - P_1 + (1 - \pi)R \quad (2)$$

If the worker decides to stay in the sending country the trafficker will receive the utility:

$$U_s^T = 0$$

If the worker decides to migrate through the help of the trafficker and stays in the illegal sector of the receiving country, the trafficker will receive the utility:

$$U_i^T = P_1 + P_2 - M \quad (3)$$

If the worker decides to apply for a legal status the trafficker will loose the opportunity to collect  $P_2$ . In this case the trafficker will receive the utility:

$$U_i^T = P_1 - M \quad (4)$$

Since Friebel and Guriev have assumed that the trafficking market is competitive, the utility in the situation where the worker stays in the illegal sector (given by condition (3)) and the utility in the situation where the worker apply for a legal status (given by condition (4)) cannot be larger than zero in equilibrium (Ibid).

### 2.1.7 The correlation between wealth and skills

Friebel and Guriev make the assumption that the initial wealth of the worker is positively correlated to his skills (productivity). However, in the illegal working sector of the receiving country there is not considered to be any skill premium. Or put in other words, the returns to skills in the illegal working sector of the receiving country are lower than the returns to skills in the legal working sector. That is,  $\tilde{R}$  will not depend on  $a$ . Further, the returns to skills in the legal working sector of the sending and receiving country respectively can be seen below.

---

<sup>9</sup> If the worker is sent back his/her utility is:  $U^w = a - P_1 + r$

If the worker is successful his/her utility is:  $U_i^w = a - P_1 + R$

$$r = \begin{cases} r^H, & \text{if } a \geq M \\ r^L, & \text{if } a < M \end{cases}, r^H > r^L$$

and

$$R = \begin{cases} R^H, & \text{if } a \geq M \\ R^L, & \text{if } a < M \end{cases}, R^H > R^L$$

As can be seen it is assumed that the wealth and the skills of the worker is perfectly correlated. Hence, if the worker has a wealth  $a$  that is greater than the cost of migration  $M$  ( $a \geq M$ ) he/she has high skills and if he/she has a wealth of  $a$  that is lower than  $M$  ( $a < M$ ) he/she has low skills. It should also be noted that workers that are high- (low-) skilled in the sending country are also high- (low-) skilled in the receiving country. Further, workers with high skills are rich enough to finance their own migration, while workers with low skills are constrained by their wealth and can therefore only migrate through the help of a trafficker (debt financed migration) (Ibid p. 9). This assumption is crucial to the result of our model.

Our last assumption is that only low skilled workers are interested in migrating to the illegal sector of the receiving country. This is given by the condition below.

$$r^L < \tilde{R} - M < r^H \tag{5}$$

However, it should be noted that high skilled workers, due to the setup of the model, cannot migrate to a receiving country and directly get a job in the legal sector. Hence, they first have to go to the illegal sector before they can try to get a legal status and a work in the legal sector. As stated before, this attempt will be successful with a probability of  $(1-\pi)$  and lead to deportation with a probability of  $\pi$ .

To clarify the result of our analysis we will first evaluate a situation where migration takes place without the presence of a trafficker and compare it to a situation with debt financed migration through the help of a trafficker.

### 2.1.8 Migration without the assistance of a trafficker

If there is no trafficker that can offer the worker debt financed migration, the worker naturally has to pay the entire cost of migration by him/her self. This means that the contract space changes to:  $P_1 = M$  and  $P_2 = 0$ . Clearly, this means that low-skilled worker with  $a < M$ , will not be able to migrate at all. High-skilled with  $a \geq M$  can afford to migrate but are not willing to migrate to the illegal sector of the receiving country, as given by condition (5) stated above. We can now investigate if the high-skilled workers are willing to migrate to the legal sector of the receiving country by comparing  $U_1^W$  with  $U_S^W$ . By doing so we hereby obtain Result 1.

**Result 1:** *When migration takes place without a trafficker the contract space changes to  $P_1 = M$  and  $P_2 = 0$ . In this situation there will only be migration to the legal sector of the receiving country. This migration will only take place if the following conditions are fulfilled:*

(i)  $a > M$

(ii)  $(1-\pi)R^H > r^H + M \tag{6}$

The left-hand side of (ii) states the expected wage of the high-skilled worker in the receiving country, and the right-hand side states the high-skilled worker's payoff if he/she stays in the sending country. As can be seen the expected wage in the legal sector changes as  $\pi$  changes. Hence, policies that serve to increase  $\pi$ , that is, increase the probability of deportation, will also make migration less attractive.

Friebel and Guriev point out that  $\pi$  only captures the probability of the worker being deported when applying for a legal status, and that it could be argued that the model also should contain a third policy parameter reflecting the fact that the worker also can be detected and deported while still working in the illegal sector. Although there is substantial empirical evidence that this risk is not insignificant and that many female victims of trafficking are being arrested and deported when the police raids bars, strip clubs and bordellos, this risk is being normalized to nil in our model (IOM Nov 2002, p. 31, 46, 51 and O'Neill 1999, p. 40).

### 2.1.9 Migration with the assistance of a trafficker

As previously stated, the worker has three alternatives when the assistance of a trafficker is available all leading to different payoffs. He/she can either remain in the sending country, or migrate to the illegal working sector of the receiving country or migrate and try to receive a legal status. Further, it is also fundamental that the trafficker acts in a rational way, which in this model means that the trafficker makes sure not to make losses, that is  $U^T \geq 0$ .

Knowing this and allowing for the inclusion of a trafficker in the model we can now state the equilibrium under the productivity assumptions stated above. This gives us the first proposition of our model.

#### Proposition 1

1. *The workers will migrate to the illegal sector of the receiving country if and only if:*

- (i) *The workers are low-skilled ( $a < M$ ) and*
- (ii)  $a \geq M - (\tilde{R} - (1 - \pi)R^L)$  (7)

*The contract holds that  $P_1 = a$ , and  $P_2 = M - a$ .*

2. *The workers will migrate to the legal sector of the receiving country if and only if:*

- (i) *The workers are high-skilled ( $a > M$ ) and*
- (ii) *condition (6) holds.*

*The contract holds that  $P_1 = M$ , and  $P_2 = 0$ .*

3. *No migration will take place otherwise.*

As given by assumption (5) it will be worthwhile for the low-skilled workers to migrate to the illegal sector of the receiving country. Further, this type of migration will be more likely to occur if the returns for low-skilled work in the illegal sector are relatively large in comparison to the returns in the legal sector, and if the risk of being deported when applying for a legal status is high. It is also important to notice that the debt contract will be incentive compatible if and only if  $P_2 \leq \tilde{R} - (1 - \pi)R^L$ . If this do not hold the worker will apply for a legal status

and default on the contract and the payment of  $P_2$  (compare (1) and (2)). Further, for the trafficker to brake even and be willing to engage in debt financed migration of low skilled worker, the participation constraint of  $U^T \geq 0$  must be full filled. This will be so only if  $a + \tilde{R} - (1 - \pi)R^L - M \geq 0$  which is equal to (7) stated in Proposition above.

Assumption (5) makes it evident that high-skilled workers are not interested in migrating to the illegal sector of the receiving country. Finally, assumption (6) indicates that high-skilled workers are more likely to migrate if the deportation probability is low and if there are large productivity differences between the legal sector in the sending and receiving country (Ibid p. 11).

To derive Proposition 2 we shall now picture a situation where both (6) and (7) hold and analyse the effect of a change in  $\pi$ .

### **Proposition 2**

Comparative statics: Policies that will soften the regulation, that is decrease  $\pi$ , will have the following effect of migration:

Illegal immigration with low-skilled workers to the illegal sector of the receiving country, through the assistance of a trafficker, will become less likely.

Legal immigration with high-skilled workers to the legal sector of the receiving country will become more likely.

Consider condition (7). If a government through a change in policy makes it less risky for a worker to apply for legal status (decrease in  $\pi$ ) this condition becomes less likely to hold. This means that when the risk of deportation decreases more and more workers will default of  $P_2$  and hereby making it not worthwhile for the trafficker to engage in human trafficking any more. However, on the contrary, by the same reasoning condition (8) becomes more likely to hold and more high-skilled workers will migrate to the legal sector of the receiving country. Further it should also be noted that the value of the pledge able income in the debt contract, as given by the term  $\tilde{R} - (1 - \pi)R^L$ , will decrease if the government pursues softer deportation policies (decrease in  $\pi$ ). This in turn will lower the accesses of low-skilled liquidity-constrained workers to the funds of the traffickers. In our model it simply means that these workers will not be able to migrate at all (Ibid p. 12)<sup>10</sup>.

Consider again condition (7). The observant reader may have identified a weakness in the model as it has been presented so far. Accordingly, condition (7) rests upon a rather static view of the trafficking process in that it can only simultaneously be satisfied for now workers or all workers and therefore excludes the possibility of a gradual change due to a change in the governmental policies. Hence, a change in  $\pi$ , if sufficiently large enough will immediately make it not worthwhile for the trafficking organisations to engage in human trafficking,

---

<sup>10</sup> This outcome may seem harsh and cynical. However, it should be noted that the model described above only serve to explain the trafficking process and not the conditions in the sending countries that makes children and women an easy pray of the traffickers. Never-the-less one could easily argue that liquidity constrained women, without the access to debt financed migration, will be forced into the local prostitution.

whereas an insufficiently large change will have no effect at all. This outcome seems somewhat too static and will most likely not reflect the reality of the trafficking business.

### **2.1.10 Implications of the model for the fight against trafficking in women for the purpose of sexual exploitation**

The outcome of the model has at least in theory strong implications for the fight against trafficking. Consider Proposition 1. Accordingly, migration of liquidity constrained workers, which we can consider most young female victims of trafficking to be, is more likely to take place if the returns for low-skilled work in the illegal sector are relatively large in comparison to the returns in the legal sector. Further, the greater the risk of deportation when applying for a legal status, the larger the expected profits and thereby also the larger the incentive of the trafficking organisations to engage in human trafficking will be.

Consider Proposition 2. Accordingly, if  $\pi$  decreases more workers will default on  $P_2$  and thereby lower the expected profits of the trafficking organisations. This in turn will reduce the economic incentive that constitutes the main driving force in the business of human trafficking. Based on these acknowledgements we can now stipulate what actions, according to our model, should be taken to effectively combat trafficking in women for the purpose of sexual exploitation.

Hence, as suggested by the outcome of the model, states and international organisations committed to the fight against trafficking should by every means possible facilitate the victims' possibilities to deflect from their exploitive working conditions and receive a protected and legal status within the state territory into which they have been trafficked. Further, states should, if politically possible, try to reduce the difference in returns for low-skilled workers between the illegal and the legal working sector in the receiving country. This is mainly done by opening up their legal working sectors to young low-skilled foreign women.

When analysing the current initiative taken to combat organised crime and trafficking in women for the purpose of sexual exploitation, as was the main purpose of this thesis, I will therefore investigate if the conditions identified above have been recognised.

More concretely, I will look for initiatives, policies, and actions that serve to reduce the risk that the victims of trafficking take when they reveal their existence to the authorities of the state. This is represented by a decrease of  $\pi$  in our model.

Such measures can be the establishment of special victim protection locations, witness protection programs and less restrictive deportation policies.

### **2.1.11 Discussing a generalised model**

So far we have only analysed the effect of changes in policies that serve to reduce the risk that the victims take when revealing themselves to the authorities, denoted with a decrease of  $\pi$  in our model. However, the governments of the receiving countries also have the possibility to pursue policies that will increase the cost of migration, denoted with  $M$  in the model. Further there are reasons to believe that such policies are frequently used. Hence, the increased migration into especially the European Union and the United States of America has not gone unchallenged and the governments of the receiving countries have found themselves under increased internal political pressure to reduce especially irregular migration (Gijsbert van Liemt, 2003, p. 9). As a consequence, the border controls have become stricter and the possibilities to legally migrate have been more restricted. However, the result of these actions seems not to have solved anything, but rather to have increased the magnitude of the problem.

That is, when borders become more difficult to legally cross the costs associated with illegal entry rises. This in turn increases the profits to be made in the human trafficking business. Hence, when immigration laws become more restricted, more and more people have to turn to trafficking organisations in order to be able to cross borders (Swedish Department for Global Development, 2003, p. 20).

As stated above, stricter border controls are associated with an increase in the cost of migration, which is denoted by  $M$  in the model. However, as the model is presented so far, an increase in  $M$  weakly counteracts trafficking. To truly be able to investigate the effect of a change in  $M$  we need to generalise the model. This involves dropping the assumption of perfect correlation between skills and wealth and introducing a continuum of workers. Doing so we will be able to investigate the effect of policies that serves to increase  $M$ , such as stricter border controls (Friebel and Guriev 2002, p. 12)..

Clearly, policies affecting the size of  $M$ , such as stricter border controls, are more likely an effect of an over all will to decrease illegal migration in general rather than specifically stopping female victims of trafficking destined for sexual slavery for entering the country. I have therefore chosen not to investigate the effect of a change in  $M$ , and instead concentrate on the effect of a change in  $\pi$ .

## 3. An empirical review

### 3.1 Introduction

As a first step in my empirical review I will begin with taking a deeper look at the supply side of the problem with trafficking in women for the purpose of sexual exploitation. That is, I will study the socio-economic factors and power structures that make young women in the sending countries an easy prey for the trafficking organisations.

As a second step I will present some of the very latest empirical research on the organisational features of the trafficking organisations. This involves the horizontal and vertical operational structures of the trafficking organisations as well as the different stages in the trafficking process, such as the recruiting of victims, transportation routes and the exploitation in the local sex industries of the receiving countries.

As a third step I will take a deeper look at the demand side of the problem with trafficking in women into prostitution and sexual slavery. That is, I will study the demand for commercialised sex in the receiving countries and its importance for the entire business of trafficking in women. This naturally involves studying the management of the market for prostitution and pornography in the receiving countries as well as the impact of legalisation of prostitution on the demand.

I believe that knowledge of all the different aspects described above is equally fundamental to be able to grasp the entire magnitude of the problem and to be able to find better preventive strategies.

### 3.2 The supply side of the problem

#### 3.2.1 Introduction

The problem of human trafficking in general and trafficking in women for the purpose of sexual exploitation in particular exhibits many underlying dimensions that have to be analysed both separately and combined in order to fully understand why trafficking in humans can take place. From an economic perspective it is rewarding to study the supply and demand for young female trafficking victims. I will therefore start my empirical analysis with a review of the main economical, social, cultural and political factors creating the supply of young female victims that can be identified in the literature on trafficking in women.

#### 3.2.2 Economic factors

It is commonly recognised among experts that young females in underdeveloped countries and countries in transition become victims of trafficking organisations mainly due to poverty and lack of economic opportunity (Swedish Ministry of Foreign Affairs, 2001, p. 8 and Sipaviciene 2002). However, the absolute level of poverty in the sending countries alone does not suffice to explain the economic conditions and incentives that drive many young women into the hands of the traffickers. Hence, one also has to take into consideration the



subordination of women in the political, economical and social life in many countries to fully understand the supply side of trafficking in women. Accordingly, many societies favour men and boys over women and girls in times of economic hardship. In development economics this is a commonly acknowledged fact and is referred to as the “*feminisation of poverty*”. In economic terms this means that societies and families generally tend to favour boys over girls when it comes to the allocation of their scarce resources. Hence, young girls are constantly being discriminated when it comes to family decisions about education and working opportunities (World Bank 2001).

In addition to this, the economic disadvantage of young women has further been strengthened by the political and economical transition that Eastern Europe has undergone during the 1990s. During this process women’s economic and social position has been undermined to a much further extent than that of men. The upraise of especially female unemployment and the dismantlement of the social security systems in the former Soviet Union countries have therefore left many women in economic despair. The unemployment figures for the Russian Federation, where women constitute 70 to 95 percent of the unemployed, clearly show this development ( The Foundation of Women’s Forum, 1998, p.11). Taken all together, it seems clear that lack of economic opportunity in underdeveloped countries and countries in transition is the main contribution factor behind the “*supply*” of young women willing to put their lives in the hands of traffickers in hope of escaping poverty.

However, economic despair and disadvantage alone do not entirely explain young women’s willingness to migrate through the assistance of a trafficker. We also have to consider other factors such as discriminative social standards and practises in the sending countries as well as medial images of the liberty and prosperity characterising the life in the receiving countries in order to fully understand the willingness of young females to migrate.

### **3.2.3 Social factors**

As stated above, poor economic conditions alone do not suffice to explain young women’s willingness to migrate through the assistance of a trafficker. In recent empirical studies discriminative social standards and practises have also been found to play an important role. Hence, oppressive patriarchal family traditions and social structures therefore also contribute to women’s vulnerability to the presence of trafficking organisations. Accordingly, girls and young women most often do not have the same opportunities as boys and men when it comes to schooling, decision making in the family, personal freedom of movement and sexual integrity. Further, the lack of gender equality between men and women also take other destructive forms and domestic violence and sexual exploitation within families force many women to leave their homes and provide for themselves (Swedish Department for Global Development, 2003, p. 17). In the absence of social and economic safety nets these individuals easily fall victims of trafficking.

Recent research also suggests that many employed women already face sexual exploitation and harassment prior to their departure. Accordingly, there is substantial evidence that women’s working conditions in the sending countries too are sexualised. Hence, when the competition for the legitimate working opportunities is hard, male employers can require sexual services from the women applicants as a part of the selective process or as a demand for keeping the job. Because of this, sexual harassment is so common in Russia that some job adverts openly state what they expect from the women (Global Survival Network, 1997; Hughes, 2002a). In conclusion, for women and girls who already face sexual exploitation and harassment in their homes and at their jobs, an offer to work as a dancer, stripper or even as a prostitute in an richer and more promising country may be seen as the only alternative to escape (The Foundation of Women’s Forum, 1998, p.11).

### **3.2.4 Cultural factors**

As stated above, many young women see migration through the assistance of a trafficker as the only way to escape from old patriarchal oppressive traditions within families and society. This willingness is further strengthened by the medial images of the western culture and consumption patterns that are being increasingly available even in the most remote areas in the sending countries. Accordingly, the medial picture of the rich, liberal and glamorous life that the young women of the western countries seem to enjoy, added with promises of the possibilities of earning money quickly have further increased the willingness to migrate. Further, the lack of faith in the future in developing countries and countries in transition has also contributed to young women's willingness to put their lives in the hands of the traffickers in search for a better life elsewhere (Swedish Department for Global Development, 2003, p. 18).

### **3.2.5 Political factors**

One of the major political explanatory factors behind the rapid increase of human trafficking during the 1990s is the political change in Central and Eastern Europe following the fall of the Berlin wall. The breakdown of the Soviet Union and the transformation of socialist economies into market economies have severely damaged the social security nets and reduced the working opportunities for especially young women (Swedish Ministry for Foreign Affairs, 2001, s. 10). Likewise, the Wars and conflicts in the Balkans, as well as the recession of the Asian economies in the late 1990s have further marginalized women's position in these regions. Taken together, this development serves to explain the increased willingness among young women to migrate to escape poverty and exploitation. Further, the political inequality between men and women usually present in these regions, and manifested through gender discrimination, sexual exploitation, lack of educational opportunities and limited resources available for young women have further exposed women to the exploitation of traffickers (The Foundation of Women's Forum 1999). In addition to this trafficking in women has proven to exhibit a very prominent ethnical dimension, suggesting that women and girls belonging to ethnical minorities are proportionally more often targeted by trafficking organisations. In conclusion, lack of respect for the well-being and humans' rights of specific minority groups within the sending countries seems to play an important role when it comes to explaining the supply of female trafficking victims for sexual exploitation (Swedish Ministry for Foreign Affairs, 2001, p. 9 and ILO 2000).

### **3.2.6 Summary**

From an economic perspective it is evident that the feminisation of poverty in underdeveloped countries and countries undergoing transition has further marginalized women's position. Due to this, together with the dismantlement of social security systems and alarmingly high female unemployment rates, it leads to the fact that woman increasingly have to surrender themselves to the mercy of traffickers in order to be able to migrate for employment elsewhere.

Further, discriminative social standards and practices, such as sexual exploitation and harassment within families and at working places have further contributed to women's subordination and willingness to migrate.

Cultural factors also seem to play an important role and especially the promising medial images of the western life and culture broadcasted in the sending countries further increases women's willingness to put their lives in the hands of the traffickers.

In addition to this, political factors play an important role in explaining the supply of young female victims of trafficking. Accordingly, the fall of the Soviet Union and the wars and conflicts in the Balkan have further strengthened women's submissive positions and thereby also the willingness to migrate.

Taken all together, these factors suggest that the supply of young women willing to migrate through the assistance of traffickers will continue to be substantial also in the indefinite future if not anything is being done to eradicate women's disadvantaged positions in the sending countries.

### 3.3 The characteristics of the trafficking organisations

#### 3.3.1 Introduction

Initially it can be stated that no single typical criminal organisation can be outlined when studying the empirical evidence on the subject. Hence, the trafficking organisations can range from small individual criminal enterprises to large international and very sophisticated trafficking networks and organisations (Finckenauer, 2001, p.173). The structure and size of the trafficking organisations will differ between countries and regions depending on factors such as entry barriers to the illegal market, border control and the numbers and size of the competitors (Schloenhardt, 2001, p. 339). Some traffickers therefore operate as single individuals, whereas others are functioning as a part of smaller and larger networks composed of individuals origin from the same region or perhaps from the same family. But there are also larger strictly organised and hierarchically structured national and trans-national criminal organisations involved in the business of human trafficking (The Budapest Group, 1999, p. 32).

Although not any single typical trafficking organisation can be outlined, the research on human trafficking dealing with the question seems to have broadly identified three different typical types of organisations. These types of organisations have been categorised into amateur traffickers, small groups of organised criminals and larger international trafficking networks (Schloenhardt, 1999, p. 14).

Amateur traffickers:

The amateur or small scale traffickers comprise individuals who only carry out single tasks in the trafficking process such as providing and operating vehicles for the crossing of borders. Some of these individuals are only occasionally engaging in trafficking and most often use their own boats and cars. These types of traffickers are most likely to be found in border areas and have also been found to cooperate with larger international trafficking organisations due to their knowledge of the local environment (Schloenhardt, 1999, p. 14, Bertone 2000, p. 7, IOM 1998 and Monzini 2001, p. 3).

Small groups of organised criminals:

In South Asia, small and medium-sized groups of locally organised criminals seem to dominate the trafficking business. The traffickers and recruiters are in many cases former female victims of trafficking. Further, many traffickers have links to their home villages and

are bounded together by family or community relationships (The Swedish Ministry for Foreign Affairs, 2001, p. 16).

These types of traffickers have usually specialised in leading victims from one country to another, via well-known and established trafficking routes. In comparison to amateur traffickers, these groups exhibit a higher level of sophistication and specialisation, and run their trafficking operations on a more permanent basis (Schloenhardt, 1999, p. 14, Bertone 2000, p. 7, IOM 1998 and Monzini 2001, p. 3).

Large international trafficking networks:

In Europe and Southeast Asia the trafficking business is believed to be dominated by large professional international trafficking networks (The Swedish Ministry for Foreign Affairs, 2001, p. 16). These networks are built up by large criminal organisations and their activities usually comprise every stage in the trafficking process. Hence, these organisations take part in both the recruiting of the victims, the production of falsified travel documents and passports, the illegal crossing of borders as well as the exploitation of the victims in the sex industries in the countries of destination. Due to this complex international structure, these international networks exhibit much flexibility and can respond much faster when governments change legislation or increase border controls and law enforcement (Schloenhardt, 1999, p. 14, Bertone 2000, p. 15, IOM 1998 and Monzini 2001, p. 4).

### 3.3.2 Summary

The structure and size of the trafficking organisations will differ between countries and regions. Some traffickers therefore operate as single individuals usually only caring out single tasks in the trafficking process, whereas others are functioning as a part of smaller and larger networks. There are also larger strictly organised and hierarchically structured national and trans-national criminal organisations whose activities cover every stage in the trafficking process. These organisations usually have a very flexible structure and can therefore respond very quickly to changing legislation and increase of border control.

Before continuing I would like to return to the United Nations Convention against Transnational Organised Crime. Accordingly, an organised criminal group is defined as:

(a) “*“Organised criminal group” shall mean a structured group of three or more persons, existing for a period of time and acting in concert with the aim of committing one or more serious crimes or offences established in accordance with this Convention, in order to obtain, directly or indirectly, a financial or other material benefit;*”

(b) “*“Serious crime” shall mean conduct constituting an offence punishable by a maximum deprivation of liberty of at least four years or a more serious penalty;*”

(c) “*“Structured group” shall mean a group that is not randomly formed for the immediate commission of an offence and that does not need to have formally defined roles for its members, continuity of its membership or a developed structure;*”

(Article 2, United Nations Convention against Transnational Organised Crime)

Clearly there are reasons to believe that the individuals belonging to the category of *amateur traffickers* in some instances will not meet the requirements stipulated in the definition

presented above. Especially in cases where the amateur traffickers are single independently working individuals who only occasionally engage in trafficking when the opportunity arises. In the case of the category of *small groups of organised criminals* and *large international trafficking networks* it is evident that both these two categories comprise criminal elements operating on an large enough scale and with the needed permanent basis as to fulfil the UN definition of an organised criminal group.

## 3.4 The organisational features of the trafficking organisations

### 3.4.1 Introduction

Dr Andreas Schloenhardt, John Salt and Jeremy Stein are responsible for some of the very latest research on the subject of human trafficking<sup>11</sup>. In their research they have focused on determining the organisational and operational features of the responsible organisations. Evidently, efficient internal organisation and operational procedures are fundamental for the trafficking organisations to be able to run their businesses as to reach maximum stability and profitability in an environment characterised by constant change. Accordingly, the organisational and operational procedures of these organisations depend on a variety of constantly changing factors. Among these can be mentioned the accessibility of and entry barriers to the illegal market for prostitution, the demand for prostitution, the number of competitors, geographical factors and the legal responses taken by different states to combat the illegal activities of the trafficking organisations (Schloenhardt, 2001, p. 339). In the following I will present the research of Dr Andreas Schloenhardt, John Salt and Jeremy Stein. It is commonly acknowledged that knowledge of the organisational and operational features of the trafficking organisations is fundamental to be able to find and implement efficient preventive policies and strategies to combat trafficking in women for the purpose of sexual exploitation (The Budapest Group, 1999, p. 28).

### 3.4.2 Diversification of the trafficking organisations

The degree of integration and interdependence internally as well as between different organisations are important factors to determine when analysing the organisational features of the trafficking organisations. In the case of human trafficking, the responsible organisations have been found to show a diversified rather than a specialised pattern and strong connections have been found between trafficking in humans and trafficking in drugs. This may be a logical outcome since organisations usually engaged in drug trafficking already have well-tested and established trafficking routes to be used also for human trafficking (Schloenhardt, 1999, p.15 and Schloenhardt, 2001, p. 340). Especially Asian criminal organisations have been found to use the same routes for trafficking in humans and drugs (Skeldon, 2000, p. 12). Further, many organisations responsible for human trafficking also seem to run legitimate and legal businesses such as language schools, travel agencies and debt collection companies to conceal and facilitate their illegal activities and to launder their profits (Budapest Group, 1999, p. 27 and McInerny 2000, p. 7).

---

<sup>11</sup> Dr Andreas Schloenhardt, PhD, Faculty of Law, The University of Adelaide, Australia.  
John Salt and Jeremy Stein, Migration Research Unit, Department of Geography, University College London, UK.

The trafficking organisations also diversify between the different tasks in the trafficking process and separate units carry out different activities such as planning the operations, recruiting the victims and transporting the victims. These units may consist of one or more individuals who usually are much specialised, independent and have very little knowledge about other parts in the trafficking process or the individuals involved. The use of this kind of cellular organisational structure serves to minimise the risk and damage when detected by law enforcement authorities. Hence, the diversification ensures that the whole organisation will not fall or be effected if single individuals taking part in the trafficking process are being caught (Budapest Group 1999, p. 33).

### **3.4.3 Vertical differentiation**

The illegal nature of the business of human trafficking brings about some very specific problems for the trafficking organisations when it comes to the management of the staff. Accordingly, the members of the staff in the trafficking organisation signify a possible threat to the organisation since they possess knowledge about the organisation and ongoing trafficking operations that can be passed on to law enforcement agencies. Because of this, the organisations usually use threats and intimidations as well as financial incentives to ensure loyalty and prevent deflection (Schloenhardt 1999, p. 15). Further, Schloenhardt has found that the organisations usually have a very prominent vertical differentiated structure. Hence, as a way to protect the leaders of the trafficking organisation as well as ongoing criminal activities, the organisations differentiate between the different levels of the staff and make sure that each participant do not have more information than what he/she needs to be able to carry out the specific task appointed to him/her (Schloenhardt 2001, p. 340).

As stated above, the Secretariat of the Budapest Group confirms Schloenhardt's observations and states that the management and the working level of the trafficking organisations is deliberately held apart as a way to minimise the damage when detected by the law enforcement agencies (Budapest Group 1999, p. 31 and Salt and Stein 1997, p. 478).

### **3.4.4 Horizontal differentiation**

Schloenhardt has also found that the division of labour is fundamental for the larger trafficking organisations to be able to survive. Hence, larger criminal organisations engaged in human trafficking usually separate between the different tasks in the trafficking process and carefully choose the employees to ensure the qualifications and specialised skills needed in the different stages of the trafficking process (Schloenhardt 1999, p. 15).

The employees working on the lower "street" level in the trafficking process usually have little or any education and skills, since the tasks appointed to them usually do not require any specific knowledge or abilities (Ibid, p. 15). However, to be able to counteract law enforcement strategies and technologies the trafficking organisations also need employees with more specialised and advanced skills who are able to respond quickly to changes in the law enforcement and legislative measure by modifying the modes, means and routes in perhaps already ongoing or planned trafficking operations ( Schloenhardt 2001, p. 341).

### **3.4.5 The division of labour**

According to Schloenardt, the division of labour usually exhibits the following pattern. The top of the trafficking organisations is represented by highly competent and skilful *arrangers* and *financiers* who organise and monitor the trafficking operations and invest the money needed. Individuals operating at this level are usually not known to the lower levels of

employees and most certainly not to the trafficking victims (Schloenhardt 2003, p. 121-122 and Schloenhardt 1999, p. 15).

The next category is the *recruiters* who work as middlemen between the arrangers and the customers of the trafficking organisation such as bordello owners. The recruiters are in charge of finding, mobilising and organising the trafficking victims and to collect their payments and prepare their travel documents. Further, the recruiters are usually kept in unawareness about the precise trafficking route until the last minute and are usually not paid on a permanent basis but rather for every single job carried out (Schloenhardt 2003, p. 122, Schloenhardt 1999, p. 15 and Salt and Stein 1997, p. 477).

There are also the special so called *transporters* who are responsible for bringing the victims from the sending country to the receiving country. Well at place in the receiving country, the transporters bring the victims from the point of entry (airports, seaports etc) to the intended location usually in a bigger city. The transporters are usually very technically sophisticated and must be able to change their operations with short notice as a response to changing law enforcement and border control activities. Further, the transporters are usually kept unaware of the internal structure of the entire trafficking organisation and stay in contact with the organisation thorough intermediaries (Schloenhardt 2003, p. 122, Schloenhardt 1999, p. 15 and Slat and Stein 1997, p. 480).

The next identified important category taking part in the business of human trafficking are the *corrupt public officials* and *protectors*. The trafficking organisation has to rely on the service and protection of corrupted public officials in both sending and receiving countries to be able to carry out and run their business. Hence, by bribing governmental officials the trafficking organisation obtains travel documents for their victims and can establish safe trafficking routes along which border guards, law enforcement and immigration authorities turn a blind eye or even protect to the activities and crimes undertaken by the trafficking organisation (Schloenhardt 2003, p. 122, Schloenhardt 1999, p. 15, Human Rights Watch 2002, p. 26-27, Graycar 1999, p. 11, Swedish Department for Global Development 2003, p. 44).

In order for the trafficking organisation to be able to carry out its activities in the most profitable way and to minimise the risk of detection the organisation has to have an efficient information-gathering system. In some cases it has been found that this task is appointed to a special group of *informers* who collect and distribute information on border control activities, immigration and transit procedures, asylum systems and law enforcement activities (Schloenhardt 1999, p. 17, Schloenhardt 2003, p. 123 and Salt and Stein 1997, p. 478).

The trafficking organisation also uses special *guides* or *crew members* who are in charge of moving the victims between different transit points by operating the trafficking vessels such as cars, lorries and boats (Schloenhardt 1999, p. 17 and Schloenhardt 2003, p. 123).

There is also a special category of so called *enforcers* who are in charge of maintaining the order among the trafficking victims. The enforcers are also responsible for communication, financial transactions and providing food and water to the victims (Schloenhardt 1999, p. 17 and Schloenhardt 2003, p. 123).

The trafficking organisations also appoint different so called *debt-collectors* who are in charge of collecting the trafficking fees. The debt-collectors often use threats and violence to ensure payment.

The trafficking organisation also relies on special so called *money-launderers* who are experts on laundering the proceedings made in the trafficking business. This is usually done by disguising the proceedings of the trafficking operations from their origin through a string of bank account transactions.

Finally, the trafficking organisations use the service of *supporting personnel* and *specialists*. This category usually comprise local people at embarkation and transit points who have expert knowledge of the local environment and provides accommodation and other forms of

assistance that help the organisation to carry out the trafficking operations (Schloenhardt 1999, p. 17 and Schloenhardt 2003, p. 124).

### **3.4.6 Conclusion 1**

The trafficking organisations diversify the trafficking process and separate units carry out different tasks in the trafficking process. These units are usually much specialised and do not hold more information than what is absolutely necessary to be able to carry out the specific task appointed to them. Further, the trafficking organisations have been found to exhibit a very prominent vertical differentiated structure and the different levels of the staff are deliberately held a part. The lower levels of the staff are hereby kept in unawareness about the entire structure of the organisation and especially about the leading individuals. This kind of cellular structure and information minimising procedures serves to protect the leading arrangers and financiers of the trafficking organisations and to minimise the risk and damage sustained by the organisation and to ongoing trafficking operations if single elements or individuals are detected by law enforcement authorities.

It is therefore my conclusion that stricter law enforcement and penalties against the individuals taking part in the crime of trafficking in women, although indeed welcomed, will most likely not suffice to eradicate the entire problem of female trafficking. Hence, the very sophisticated and strategically thought out organisational structure of the trafficking organisations makes them extremely resistant to law enforcement strategies. This acknowledgement strengthen the assumptions made by Gudio Friebel and Sergei Guriev stating that the only way to effectively combat human trafficking is to pursue policies that will serve to reduce the enforceability of the debt contract between the victims and the trafficking organisations, and thereby take away the main economic incentive of the organisations to engage in female trafficking.

## **3.5 The operational features of the trafficking organisations**

### **3.5.1 Introduction**

Andreas Schloenhardt, John Salt and Jeremy Stein as well as many other individual researchers, organisations and governmental authorities have recognised the need for more knowledge about the operational features of the trafficking organisations if we are to find better and more efficient preventive strategies. This naturally involves studying the different stages in the trafficking process such as the recruiting of the victims, the transportation of victims along trafficking routes and the exploitation of the victims during the process of transportation and in the receiving country. In the following I will present the research available at present about the operational procedures used by the organisations engaged in trafficking in women for the purpose of sexual exploitation. Clearly, integrating this research into the development and implementation of counter trafficking legislation and strategies is fundamental if these efforts are to have any preventive effect.

### **3.5.2 Recruitment of victims**

The first stage in the trafficking process is the recruitment of victims. According to several research projects based on interviews with female trafficking victims the most common



practice seems to be recruitment in an informal way. For example, according to a study based on assisted female trafficking victims in Kosovo carried out by the International Organisation for Migration 80 percent of the women had been recruited by a relative, friend or an acquaintance (IOM 2002, p. 14). This figure is also confirmed at a more general base and according to the International Organisation for Migration's South Eastern Europe Trafficking Database some 494 out of the 826 included victims reported that they had been recruited in person by an acquaintance of a friend (Laczko and Gramegna 2003, p. 189). The same pattern has been found in a study carried out by the Human Rights Watch with thirty-six female victims of trafficking assisted in the post-conflict Bosnia and Herzegovina. The majority of these women described their recruiters as acquaintances from their home village, friends of their parents or friends from an orphanage (Human Rights Watch 2002, p. 15).

According to Schloenhardt, the trafficking organisations in many cases also advertise their services in the same ways as legitimate businesses do, through ads in the local newspaper. (Schloenhardt 2003, p. 127). This practise has been confirmed in many instances and according to a study carried out by the International Organisation for Migration, the daily Hungarian newspaper called "Expressz" publishes a dozen advertisements about jobs available in the west for local Hungarian women mainly as waitresses, hostesses and dancers (IOM 1995). According to another inspection of newspapers in Ukraine each paper was found to contain five to twenty suspicious advertisements (Levchenko 1999).

It has also been reported that the trafficking organisations use marriage agencies (mail-order-bride agencies) to recruit women. According to the International Organisation for Migration all marriage agencies offering women from the former Soviet Union are under the control of organised crime (Journal of International Affairs, Spring 2000). These agencies usually operate via the Internet (Hughes, 1996, p. 71-76).

In these ways of recruitment, deception is the key element. Hence, by giving false information, the recruiters mislead the victims and gain the trust needed to carry out and facilitate the transportation. The deception usually involves the true nature of the promised occupation, the true conditions of the travel and the post-arrival activities, the actual destination country and its immigration laws. More concretely, promises of marriage or work as a waitress, dancer or housekeeper in reality turn out to be occupation in the sex industry as a prostitute, stripper or pornography actress with a low or infinite salary (Gijsbert van Liemt 2003, p. 17).

In some cases it has also been found that the trafficking organisations use force such as abduction and kidnapping already in the initial stage of the recruitment process. According to the study carried out by the International Organisation for Migration quoted above just over eight percent of the women trafficked to Kosovo reported being forcibly abducted (IOM 2002, p. 14). However, this rate differs between countries and in another study carried out by the International Organisation for Migration with 125 female trafficking victims assisted in Albania eighteen percent reported being kidnapped by the trafficking organisations (IOM Nov 2002, p. 30).

Finally, there is also substantial evidence suggesting that the trafficking organisations deliberately target women belonging to the most disadvantaged groups in the society. These women usually have very limited resources and a low status position in the society. Further, they are usually poorly educated and belong to ethnic minority groups (for ex Roma Girls) (IOM Nov 2002, p. 31 and Swedish Ministry For Foreign Affairs 2001, p. 9).

### **3.5.3 Negotiating the debt-contract**

Before the travel begins, the terms of the contract regulating the financial relationship between the victim and the trafficking organisation, has to be determined. The trafficking organisation needs some kind of insurance that the cost associated with the travel of the victim will be covered and repaid. This can be arranged in different ways. Studies of trafficking in women have found that in some cases the victims do not pay the trafficking organisation any fees prior to the departure, which makes them indebted to the trafficking organisation after the arrival (IOM 1995, p. 19). In other cases the women manage to borrow money from friends and relatives to fully or partly cover the trafficking fee ( Raymond, Hughes and Gomez 2001, p.53).

The size of the debt varies considerably depending on the means of transportation and the distance travelled. Some routes may offer more difficult obstacles, such as stricter border controls and less corruptible officials, which evidently raise the cost associated with the travel. Further, the nationality of the victim is of great importance since victims of certain nationalities can travel further without a visa than victims of other nationalities, which again affect the cost for the trafficking organisation (Gijsbert van liemt 2003, p. 20).

### **3.5.4 Preparation of the victims and their travel documents**

According to Schloenhardt there is little information available at present about how the victims are prepared before leaving the country of departure. However, it has been found that in some cases the victims are given names and phone numbers to members of the trafficking organisation stationed in transit points and destination countries. In addition to this it has also been found that the trafficking organisations in some cases educate their victims prior to the departure in how to avoid border controls, how to respond to immigration officers or law enforcement agencies if questioned or detained during the process of transportation and how to apply for asylum (Schloenhardt 1999, p. 19 and Schloenhardt 2001, p. 342).

Detained victims have often been found to tell the same “travel stories” which indicates that these stories are made up and thought to the victims by the trafficking organisations prior to the departure. Such practises serve to lower the law enforcement risk for the trafficking organisations if victims are detained and questioned by making investigations that can damage and reveal the internal structure of the trafficking organisation more difficult to carry out (Budapest Group 1999, p. 16).

Finally, Schloenhardt, Salt and Stein all stress the importance of the production and supply of false travel and identity documents to be used in the trafficking process. Hence, the trafficking organisations need to provide their victims with high-quality travel documentation if they are to apply for visas, obtain exit permits, for transportation by air and to be able to pass through border controls without interruptions. Trafficking organisations have been found to show a variety of sophisticated means to obtain high-quality travel documents such as by photo-substitution in stolen passports or by obtaining ready made passports or material for making passports from corrupt passport-issuing officials (Schloenhardt 1999, p. 20 and Salt and Stein 1997, p. 481).

### **3.5.5 Transportation of the victims and routing**

The trafficking organisations choose the means of transportation and the trafficking routes in response to a variety of factors such as geographical position, distance between the sending and receiving country, the political situation and law enforcement efforts in different areas and the ease with which governmental officials can be corrupted (Budapest Group 1999, p.

35). These factors often change overtime and often within such short time periods as between the planning and realisation of different trafficking operations. Hence, the trafficking organisations rely on being able to successfully exploit weaknesses and monitor changes in legislation, coastal surveillance and border controls (Schloenhardt 2001, p. 343). Borders between different countries may for example temporally be closed or more heavily guarded, and thus forcing a change of routes through an entirely different transit country (Schloenhardt 1999, p. 20). Because of this the trafficking organisations have to have a very flexible organisation and be able to change the routes used for trafficking within short notice and often during ongoing operations (Budapest Group 1999, p. 35). Due to this, the routes used by the trafficking organisations may sometimes be very simple and straightforward and other times much more complex and circuitous. Likewise, can the time between the victims leave the sending country and arrive in the final receiving country vary between several months to several years (Salt and Stein 1997, p. 481).

The trafficking organisations have been found to use a variety of means of transportation and equipment to carry out their operations such as lorries, buses, small vessels, speed boats and communication technology such as walkie-talkies and C.B. radios (Council of Europe 1993, p. 10). The trafficking organisation transport their victims by air, land and sea and the means of transportation is often changed many times during the travel to the final destination. For example victims interviewed by the International Organisation for Migration revealed the use of many different means of transportation to Lithuania. Accordingly, these victims primarily left their sending country by air but their entry into Lithuania was primarily undertaken by crossing the green border on foot during night time (IOM 1997, p. 23-24).

According to Schloenhardt, transportation by land is the easiest way to move the victims between different countries and the methods used range from simply having the victims walk across unguarded borders to more sophisticated methods such as using trains and trucks. Trafficking by land is usually very profitable since many victims can be moved at the same time. Further, if the victims are able to cross unguarded borders at night time the need for costly bribery of border guards and falsified travel and identity documents decreases (Schloemhardt 1999, p. 21 and Schloenhardt 2001, p. 343).

Transportation by air is increasingly being used by the trafficking organisations due to an over all increasing international air traffic and poor transit and immigration policies in many countries. In comparison to trafficking by land this method does however have some disadvantages. Naturally, the numbers of victims that can be transported at the same time have to be limited and the victims have to be taught how to respond to inquiries made by officials at crossing points. Further, trafficking by air requires very sophisticated and authentic travel and identification documentation as well as very costly bribery of border and immigration officials and airport and airline staff (Schloemhardt 1999, p. 21 and Schloenhardt 2001, p. 343).

Transportation by sea offers the lowest risk of detection and allows the trafficking organisations to transport many victims at once. Further, like in the case of transportation by land the need for high quality travel and identification documentation and costly bribery is lower than in the case with transportation by air.

However, it should be noted that transportation by land and sea usually take place under very severe and inhumane conditions and sometimes result in a great number of accidents and even deaths during specifically dangerous passages (Schloemhardt 1999, p. 21 and Schloenhardt 2001, p. 343).

Finally it can also be stated that the process of transportation exhibits a very prominent cellular structure and many different agents are involved in transporting the victims and harbouring them during the journey. These agents usually only have information about their own immediate task and know nothing about the previous and next stage in the process of

transportation. Once again this arrangement is deliberately thought out and deployed as to protect the staff in the upper links of the trafficking organisations such as financiers and organisers (Salt and Stein 1997, p. 482).

### **3.5.6 Conclusion 2**

The trafficking organisations use both informal and formal ways to recruit their victims. These include recruitment by relatives, friends and acquaintances as well as advertising in local newspapers. In many cases the victims do not pay any trafficking fees prior to the departure, which makes them indebted to the trafficking organisations in the post-arrival situation. In some cases the victims are prepared prior to the departure, this practise serve to lower the law enforcement risk for the trafficking organisations if the victims are detained and questioned during the trafficking process. The trafficking organisations choose the means of transportation and the trafficking routes in response to factors such as geographical position, the level of border control and law enforcement. Since these factors can change with very short notice, the trafficking organisations usually have a very flexible organisation and can change the planned transportation route within short notice and during ongoing operations. The process of transportation is usually carried out by many different agents who only have information about the previous and next stage in the process of transportation. This system is deliberately used to protect the leading elements and individuals of the trafficking organisation. Hence, like in the case of the organisational features, the operational features of the trafficking organisations too are designed to make the organisations resistant to law enforcement. Once again this serves to strengthen the conclusion that governments should pursue policies that will have a restraining effect on the portability of the trafficking organisation in order to be able to effectively combat human trafficking.

## **3.6 The post-arrival situation**

### **3.6.1 Introduction**

The post-arrival situation can be characterised by debt-bondage, sexual slavery and the structural use of violence, threats and restriction of liberty and integrity to control the victims. In the following I will present these aspects, that are all part of the last stage in the trafficking process, which needs to be analysed, understood and incorporated into any efficient counter trafficking strategy.

### **3.6.2 Debt-bondage and sexual exploitation**

Upon the arrival in the receiving country, if not already done, the identity documentation of the victims is located, removed and returned to the trafficking organisation for further use or resale. Further, it has been found that the trafficking organisations also confiscate working permits, cash, contact addresses and return tickets which were given to the victims prior to the departure in order for them to fulfil transit and immigration requirements and to make them look like tourists. This is done to protect the trafficking organisation, to make the return of the victims impossible and to increase the dependency of the victims towards the trafficking organisation, which is fundamental for the trafficking organisations to be able to continue

controlling and exploiting the victims in the post-arrival situation. (Salt and Stein 1997, p. 483, Schloenhardt 1999, p. 22 and Schloenhardt 2001, p. 350).

Hence, the evidence available suggests that the contact between the trafficking organisation and the victims do not end after the arrival to the receiving country and that the trafficking organisation continues to exploit the victims through debt-bondage (Salt and Stein 1997, p. 483, Schloenhardt 2001, p. 350, Schloenhardt 1999, p. 222). As stated earlier, in many cases the female victims pay no trafficking fee (or only parts of it) prior to departure (IOM 1995, p. 19 and Raymond, Hughes and Gomez 2001, p.53).

Upon the arrival these victims are therefore told that they are indebted to the trafficking organisations and that the debt has to be repaid through work in the sex industry. Hence, victims that during the recruiting were promised non-sexual related work now find themselves trapped in debt-bounded situations and are forced to work as prostitutes, strippers and pornography actresses under extremely exploitive conditions.

Hence, in the business of female trafficking, forcing the victims to serve in the local sexindustries of the receiving countries is the most common mean of exploitation and in some countries have the traditional “pimp” been replaced by a trafficking organisation (Budapest Group 1999, p. 27). An ever increasing degree of cooperation among different criminal organisations allows for economics of scale and for the trafficking organisations to control the entire trafficking process, from the recruiting of victims to the control of local sex markets (United Nations Office For Drug Control And Crime Prevention, Feb 1999, p. 6). Hence, in some cases the victims are put to work in establishments directly controlled by the trafficking organisation and the income generated are used to cover the debts owed to the trafficking organisation.

In other cases the female victims are sold by the trafficking organisations to local brothel owners when reaching the point of destination (IOM Nov 2002, p. 34 and Human Rights Watch 2002, p. 17). In these cases the women are usually taken to special “trading houses” in hotels and private apartments where they are forced to strip and parade in front of potential buyers (Amnesty International 2004).

The income generated by selling the victims to representatives of the local sex industry are used to cover the debt of the victim owed to the trafficking organisation. In this case the debt is simply transferred to the new owner and the victims find themselves in a debt-bounded situation all the same. The passport of the victims is handed over to the new owner to whom the victim is now indebted to. This arrangement allows the new owner to control the victim and restrict her liberty of movement outside the working area (IOM 2002, p. 34).

In many cases the system of debt bondage turns into a vicious circle and the bounded condition never seems to end because the more and more money are added to the debt for expenses such as lodging, food, cloths, drugs, condoms, healthcare, and medicine (Raymond, Hughes and Gomez 2001, p.53 and Journal of International Affairs 2000, p. 10).

Not surprisingly research by the International Organisation for Migration indicates that the female victims of trafficking can keep little of the money earned to themselves. (IOM 1998 and Levchenko 1999)

In some cases the victims are told how many clients they have to serve before their debt is fully repaid. However, in reality keeping track of the numbers of clients served, and relating the income generated to the size and reduction of the debt, is not easily done and may even deliberately be made more difficult by the brothel owner by confiscating the victim’s journals over how many clients served (Raymond, Hughes and Gomez 2001, p.53).

There is also substantial evidence suggesting that the victims are re-soled or re-trafficked between and within countries many times. Several explanations have been offered for this practise. It may occur because the customers of the bordellos constantly requires and desires

new faces. However, it could also be a deliberate strategy used by the traffickers to control the victims and protect the trafficking organisation by keeping the women disorientated. The practise of re-selling the victims usually means that the victim's debt increases each time and that the debt-bounded exploitation never ends (IOM Nov 2002, p. 31).

### **3.6.3 Means used to control the victims**

To be able to successfully carry out the transportation of the victims and to secure the repayment of the debts after the arrival in the receiving country, the trafficking organisations and brothel owners need to be able to control the victims. The most commonly used control strategies are deprivation of liberty, isolation, the use of threats and violence and exploitation of the fact that the victims lack a legal status in the receiving country (IOM 2002, p. 36 and Amnesty International 2004).

The deprivation of the victims liberty may start early in the trafficking process, when the victims passport or travel documentation are taken away. As stated above this may also be done after the victims have reached the receiving country. This serves to increase the dependency of the victims towards the trafficking organisations and enables the trafficking organisation to control the victim throughout the trafficking process. Hence, the trafficking organisations exploit the illegal status of the victims, who are threatened and told that if they do escape, they will be arrested for immigration and other offences (Amnesty International 2004, Ruggiero 1997, p. 240 and IOM Nov 2002, p. 36).

Victims who are forcibly recruited are also subject to extreme violence and abuse to have their spirit broken already during the transportation process. This practise, which usually is described as the "breaking process" and often includes beatings and rape, is used to instil fear in the victims and increase their dependency towards the organisation (Amnesty International 2004 and IOM Nov 2002, p. 36).

The deprivation of liberty, the use of violence and threats and the exploitation of the illegal status of the victims continue after the arrival in the destination country. The most commonly used control strategies once the victims have arrived in the receiving country are threats against the victim and against her family members left behind, and further making the victims believe that the lack of their legal status makes any appeal to outside assistance futile and will only lead to arrest and deportation. To increase the vulnerability, the victims' passports are continuously being confiscated by the trafficking organisation or brothel owner (Amnesty International 2004, IOM Nov 2002, p. 36 and Corrin 2000, p. 13).

The victims may also be subject to isolation and confinement in small unsanitary and overcrowded establishments, denied the freedom to refuse abusive clients and practise safe sex, deliberately being starved and forced to work long hours, denied medical assistance and constantly be subject to rape and other forms of inhuman and degrading treatment (Amnesty International 2004, IOM Nov 2002, p. 36, Laczko and Gramengna 2003, p. 189, Corrin 2000, p. 13, UN 2000, p. 14, UNICEF 2002, p. 96 and Human Rights Wash 2002, p. 17).

Further, it has been found that trafficking organisations and independent brothel owners deliberately use the psychological impact of the sexual exploitation to control the victims. Hence, the shame and humiliation following from the work in the sex industry effectively serves to silence the voices of the victims and by threatening to tell the victim's family back home about the true nature of her work the exploiter manages to effectively control the victims (Amnesty International 2004 and IOM Nov 2002, p. 36).

### **3.6.4 Conclusion 3**

The post-arrival situation is characterised by debt-bondage and sexual exploitation. Upon the arrival in the receiving country the victims are told that they are indebted to the trafficking organisation and that they have to repay the debt by working in sex clubs and brothels controlled by the organisation. In other cases the victims are sold to independently working brothel owners, in which case the debt is transferred to the new owner. To ensure re-payment of the debts, the trafficking organisation use deliberately thought out strategies designed to control the victim and increase her dependence on the organisation. These include not allowing the victim to keep her own identity documentation and threatening that escape will only lead to arrest and deportation. Further, the victims are also subject to structural violence from traffickers, owners and clients such as beatings and rape, forced to work long hours, starvation, and denial of medical assistance and to be able to practise safe sex.

Clearly by exploiting the illegal status of the victims the trafficking organisation and brothel owners manage to bind their victims in situations of sexual exploitation and extreme violence. Hence, it can be said that the empirical evidence support the conclusion that the only way to effectively combat female trafficking is to make it harder for the trafficking organisations to exploit the illegal status of the victims and thereby make it impossible to uphold the system of debt-bondage. Clearly, upholding this system is fundamental for the trafficking organisations and preventive policies that serve to increase the possibilities of the victims to deflect from their exploitive working condition without risking arrest and deportation will evidently eradicate the economic foundation of the entire female trafficking business. Once again I can therefore conclude that the assumptions made by Gudjo Friebel and Sergei Guriev indeed seem valid and supported by the empirical evidence.

## 3.7 The demand side of the problem

### 3.7.1 Introduction

Historically, research on trafficking in women for the purpose of sexual exploitation has failed to address the role of men as buyers of commercialised sex. Likewise, governments, UN agencies and nongovernmental organisations have historically acted as if the male demand for commercialised sex is so entrenched that policies designed to decrease the male demand for prostitution will have no effect in relation to the trafficking problem. Because of this little research has addressed the consumer demand as a root cause of female trafficking, prostitution and sexual slavery. In the following I will present some of the very few findings on the subject available at present (Raymond 2004, p. 1156 and The Foundation of Women's Forum 1998, p. 5).

### 3.7.2 The market for commercialised sex

Over the last two decades the sex industry has expanded in almost every country and has indeed become global, industrialised, highly capitalised and organised. It is at present impossible to find accurate statistics on the size and earnings of the global sex industry, the evidence available do however suggest that the business of commercialised sex is significant in many nations, regardless of their overall level of economic development (Anderson and Davidson 2002, p.27, IOM 2003, p. 11, Mameli 2002, p. 67 and Hughes p. 334). The modern global sex industry is extremely diverse and takes both legal and illegal forms and offer commercial sex to mainly male customers in a wide variety of settings. The products offered

covers a wide range of sexual services such as cheap street prostitution, militarised prostitution, luxurious brothels and escort services, night and strip clubs, massage parlours, pornography and internet service ( Hughes 2002, p. 130, Hughes p. 337, Manzini 2001, p. 1, Welds 2004, p. 8 and Gender Issues Jan 1, 2000).

Research further suggests that the market for commercialised sex is very complex and heterogeneous. To start with there is evidence suggesting that there is much price variation within the sex markets and that the service offered is generated towards costumers with very varying economic income and preferences (Anderson and Davidson 2002, p.27). Although some countries prohibit all aspects of commercialised sex, most countries allow it in some form. Further, in some countries the market for commercialised sex is well integrated into the mainstream legal economic activities such as tourism, entertainment, film and publishing industries usually organised by legal medium and large scale firms. The business of commercialised sex is also carried out in the illegal or informal economic sector usually controlled by criminal syndicates, small-scale and individual enterprises (Hughes 2002, p. 130, Raymond, Hughes and Gomez 2001, p. 32 and Anderson and Davidson 2002, p.27).

### **3.7.3 The male demand for commercialised sex in general**

Clearly, the promoters of the sex industry benefit enormously from the exploitation of female trafficking victims in their brothels, which allows them to maximise the profits and minimize the expenses (Manzini 2001, p. 1). Further, with no doubt, trafficking victims make up a large proportion of the women employed in the sex industries world wide. For example it has been estimated that 80 percent of the women in the brothels in the Netherlands are victims of trafficking (Budapest Group 1999, p. 11). The Balkan sex industry shows a similar figure and 90 percent of the non-national women present are victims of trafficking. Likewise, there were ten times more foreign women and children employed in the Greek sex industry trough out the 1990s than local women, most of who were victims of trafficking (IOM Nov 2002, p. 19, 32). Given this figure it is not surprising that many scholars and fieldworkers see the male demand for commercialised sex as the main cause of the expansion of the sex industry, without which it would not be profitable for the trafficking organisations to recruit and supply female victims for prostitution. Put in other words, a sex industry without male customers would immediately go broke and take away the main driving economic incentive fundamental to the entire female trafficking business (Raymond 2004, p. 1160 and Gender Issues Jan 1, 2000). However, other researchers take up a more restrictive standpoint and claim that the exact nature of the causality between male demand for prostitution, the market for commercialised sex and trafficking in women for the purpose of sexual exploitation is very complex and has yet to be determined. This would involve investigating to what extent customers of commercialised sex actually deliberately seek out women who are victims of trafficking or alternatively have no specific demand and buy sex with whoever is available (IOM Nov 2002, p. 47).

What existing research with clarity does tell us is that the general demand for prostitution almost exclusively comes from male customers, further it has been found that there is a substantial variations between countries and regions when it comes to male propensity to by sex. In some countries the majority of men appear not to by sex, whereas in other countries the proportion of sex buying men constitute well over one third and sometimes up to two-thirds of the male population (Anderson and Davidson 2002, p. 29). For example, a study carried out in Thailand by the U.S Agency for International Development reported that 75 percent of the male population was sex buyers and that 50 percent had their first sexual intercourse with a prostituted woman. Similar figures have been confirmed in Cambodia and 60 to 70 percent of the Cambodian men have bought women for commercialised sex.



Likewise, according to Saewoomtuh, a South Korean NGO that is providing service to military base prostitutes, 84 percent of the male U.S military personnel stationed in South Korea admitted to buying sex from prostitutes (Hughes, Eleanor and Ellerman, p. 15). According to the Swedish Ministry of Industry 12,5 percent of the Swedish men use women and children in prostitution. The corresponding figures for Italy, Germany and the United Kingdom amount to 17, 18 and 10 percent respectively (Raymond 2004, p. 1166).

Further, available research confirms that some occupational groups, for example, military, police, seafarers and truckers are more frequent sex buyers than others. Likewise have those men who travel for business or leisure been found to be more prone to buy sex. Existing research based on interviews and surveys with male sex buyers further reveals that they usually explain their sexual consumption habits with references to the desire for a particular kind of sexual experience, the desire for a particular kind of sexual partner and/or the desire for being able to control when and how to have sex (Anderson and Davidson 2002, p. 29).

Modern research on the subject of male demand for prostitution further concludes that there is a strong link between the social construction of masculine identity and the desire to buy sex. Accordingly, by buying women and children in prostitution men can confirm and reinforce their masculine identity (IOM Dec 2003, p. 17). This practise would also help to explain why men are more prone to buy sex in situations where they feel that their masculinity is at risk. This could be when men work in exploitive environments under conditions which they do not control and in situations where the social premium placed on the masculine identity is suddenly raised, such as during periods of armed conflict (Anderson and Davidson 2002, p. 29).

Further, modern research also suggests that there is a link between the social diminishing and devaluation of women and the male demand for prostitution. Hence, in situations where society devalues femininity, the more important it is for men to confirm their masculinity by distancing themselves from everything that can be interpreted as typical feminine. However, it is important to notice that male demand for prostitution also thrive in societies where gender equality is broadly political accepted as something very desirable. This suggests that male demand for prostitution is not only about gender and power, but also a mean to confirm class and race privilege and identity (Anderson and Davidson 2002, p. 30). This evidently brings us closer to being able to find a positive relationship between male demand for prostitution and trafficking in women for the purpose of sexual exploitation.

#### **3.7.4 Male demand for Cheap, compliant and submissive prostitutes**

Clearly there are market segments where female victims of trafficking are more likely to be found. Naturally, this is often in establishments where prostitution is provided as cheap as possible and where the prostitutes are strictly controlled and subject to violence and abuse from clients and owners. Hence, it is possible to identify specific consumer preferences that are more likely to be met by trafficking victims. For example, as stated above, some categories of customers who are more prone to buy sex such as soldiers, seafarers, tourists and businesspeople have also been found to be more likely to buy sex in settings where it is as cheap as possible.

Further the business of commercialised sex has been found to exhibit large price differences between countries and within regions, which clearly makes men travel in order to buy sex as cheap as possible. For example has a prominent sex market developed in certain towns in Northwest Russia to serve the demand from Finnish customers and German men have been found to frequently travel across the Czech border to find cheap sex. When it comes to the production of pornography a similar pattern seems to have emerged and during the last ten years many American and European pornography producers have moved to places such as

Budapest to use cheap and available women coming from Eastern and Central Europe as actresses. Due to this, Budapest has become the biggest European center for pornography production. In the same time Budapest is a major destination and transit city for female victims trafficked from Ukraine, Moldova, Russia, Romania, and Yugoslavia (Hughes 2002, p. 131).

This suggests that the price is an important factor behind the determination of male sexual consumption habits and that the level of demand may rise when prostitution is supplied more cheaply (perhaps suggesting that the price elasticity of demand for prostitution is elastic?) (Anderson and Davidson 2002, p. 31). Not surprisingly, the women serving in market segments developed to supply cheap prostitution and other commercial sexual services are most often also subject to forced labour and severe exploitation. Further, it is clear that this market segment to a further degree is controlled by criminal elements that are responsible for trafficking in women, most likely due to the fact that the business is taking place in environments that are hard to monitor and control (such as unregistered brothels and night clubs, small bars and truck stops on highways).

However, it is important to notice that the male demand for cheap, compliant and submissive prostitutes do not necessarily have to be met by female trafficking victims and that many women who do not qualify as victims of trafficking also serve in the market segment (although they still may be subject to abuse and exploitation by customers and third parties). Further, it is in many cases also possible to find female victims of trafficking serving side by side with women who do not qualify as trafficking victims within the same establishment providing commercialised sex. Clearly in these cases the customers will not necessarily be able to differ between these two categories of prostituted women (Anderson and Davidson 2002, p. 31). Nevertheless, I believe that there are reasons to suspect that male demand for cheap prostitution to a further extent provokes trafficking in women than perhaps demand for more costly and luxurious prostitution does.

### **3.7.5 Male demand for prostitution based on racial and national stereotyping of women and sexual racism**

The demand for cheap and submissive prostitutes can also overlap with the demand for prostitutes based on racial and national stereotyping. Evidently, racist and sexist stereotypes are indeed deliberately used to market the women in the sex industry. Hence, men who buy sex may deliberately seek out women with a specific racial/ethnic and national belonging whom they believe to be exotic and will exhibit a specific desirable sexual stereotypical behaviour (submissive, compliant etc). Consequently, research based on men's writings on the internet regarding their experiences of commercialised sex reveals that they frequently mention the race/ethnicity and nationality of the women encountered. (Raymond, Hughes and Gomez 2001, p. 41 and Hughes p. 337). Further, in most countries in the world, foreign women and women belonging to ethnic minority groups are over-represented in the sex industry. For example, the amount of foreign women serving in the national sex industries of Sweden, Denmark and Germany have been estimated to 26, 33 and 50 percent respectively (Randers-Person and Jessen 2001). Some of these women will most likely be victims of trafficking.

However, the presence of foreign women in the sex industries of single nations does not necessarily in itself prove the existence of a specific demand for women of a different race or nationality. Hence, recent research suggests that clients rather prefer to be sexually serviced by women sharing their own national and racial identity. For example, research based on interviews with male Thai and Danish sex buyers clearly display a preference for prostitutes of their own nationality who were perceived as better equipped to meet their specific demand.

In these cases the foreign women were rather seen as a “poor mans’s substitute “ for more desirable, but more costly, local prostitutes (IOM Dec 2003, p. 21-22). These acknowledgements serves to strengthen the suggestion made above that male demand for especially cheap prostitution to a further degree provokes female trafficking.

However, there are also server studies that confirm that male customers actually specifically do value women of a different racial, ethnic or national identity to their own. For example, research based on interviews with white male sex tourist travelling to Southeast Asia, Latin American and Caribbean countries reveal attitudes regarding race and sexuality that simultaneously sexualise women of other races and ethnicity and de-sexualise white western women (Anderson and Davidson 2002, p. 32). Some researchers even go so far as to talk about the “prostitution of entire societies”, hereby meaning that the development of the large scale sex industry in Asia and the practise male sex tourism in the region has led to the fact that the images of Thai women for example invariably make western men associate to prostitution (Biemann 2002 and Taylor and Jamieson 267, 272 and Pettman 1997, p. 97).

In this context it is also suitable to mention the research conducted on the subject and practise of military prostitution.

This research has traditionally mainly been focused on the sex industry that has developed around foreign American military bases in Asia. However, the development of the sex industry in Kosovo, as a consequence of the presence of international peacekeeping forces, has also been subject to much debate and investigation during the later years (Amnesty International 2004, DPKO Policy paper 2004, p.1 and Hughes, Chon and Ellerman).

The perhaps most well cited authors in this area are Katharine Moon and Cynthia Enloe, who both have conducted their research on the subject of American military prostitution in Asia. Both Moon and Enloe analyse the development of military prostitution mainly on a overall macro level and they both see the development of military prostitution as a consequence of the political power relation between the hosting country (Japan, Philippines, Thailand, South Korea), its people, the government of the USA, the American defence command and the visiting soldiers. Moon’s studies clearly show that the personal integrity and safety of the Korean women have been sacrificed in order to keep a good relationship between the USA and South Korea. Hence, by connecting the concept of race, gender and foreign affairs, Moon proves that the practise of military prostitution constitute an important part in a deliberate strategy that has served to maintain the military defence alliance between South Korea and the USA (Moon 1997). Like Moon, Enloe has toned down the biological explanatory factors and has instead chosen to analyse the military prostitution in South Korea as a very important and deliberate part in the South Korean national security strategy. Accordingly, she finds it important to analyse single American soldiers’ and South Korean prostitutes’ experiences in relation to the international political system, in which prostitution is an important part in an organised and institutionalised strategy used by nations to maintain, re-enforce and manifest the military masculine ideology on which modern defence forces rely (see Enloe, 1983, 1990a, 1990b, 1991, 1992, 1993 and 1998). The following quotation from one of her publications illustrates her approach.

“A military base isn’t simply an institution for servicing bombers, fighters, aircraft carriers, or a launch-pad for aggressive forays into surrounding territories. A military base is also a package of presumptions about male soldier’s sexual needs, the local society’s sexual needs, and about the local society’s resources for satisfying those needs. Massage parlors are as integral to Subic Bay, the mammoth U.S. naval base in the Philippines, as its dry docks”.

(Enloe 1990a, p. 200)

Hence, according to Enloe, the institutionalisation of the military demand for prostitution has to be seen and analysed in a larger context where the power relations between different states are manifested by the visiting soldiers' way of treating the local women. The prostituted women become actors on the international political arena and their availability becomes a measure of the hosting nation's attitude towards the visiting soldiers.

Several studies have also found a link between ideologies of masculinity, racism and nationalism, which encourage men to engage in violent and exploitive sexual practices with women whom are believed to belong to inferior nations or racial/ethnic groups. This would serve to explain the sexual exploitation of colonised women and/or enemy women taking place in periods of colonial expansion and of armed conflicts. Further, in countries that have a past as colonial rulers it is very common to find continuing sexual interest in women belonging to former colonies based on myths and fantasies about their sexuality (Anderson and Davidson 2002, p. 33 and Third World Quarterly March 1997).

This usually overlaps with nationalistic ideas regarding masculinity. These ideas are usually very sexualised and connected to the militaristic manliness ideal. This ideal is very hierarchal to its nature and based on different views regarding superior and inferior individuals based on race and gender. In addition to this, the manliness standards are being reinforced and manifested by constantly reminding the soldiers what manliness is not. Hence, to be a "man" is not to be a "woman" or to exhibit any qualities that can be interpreted or perceived as feminine. Manliness is thus defined by depreciate qualifications that are perceived as typical feminine, which are not seen as desirable in the military system. Given these thoughts, military prostitution is thus to be understood as a way for soldiers to confirm their manliness by buying, dominating and sexually penetrating a prostituted woman of another race/ethnicity or nationality (Ethnic and racial studies 1998, p. 1-22).

The following quotation from one of Moon's publications based on an interview with an army officer clearly illustrates this.

"What the soldiers have read and heard before ever arriving in a foreign country influence prostitution a lot. For example, stories about Korean and Thai women being beautiful, subservient- they're tall tales, glamorised....U.S. men would fall in lust with Korean women. They were property, things slaves...Racism, sexism- it's all there. The men don't see the women as human beings- they're disgusting, things to be thrown away...They speak of the women in the diminutive. "

(Moon 1997, p. 33-34)

This quotation clearly confirms the hypotheses of military prostitution (as well as the general male demand for prostitution) as a way to single out, reinforce and manifest the ideology of masculinity and manliness based on race/ethnicity, nationality and gender.

However, this ideology does not necessarily automatically have to provoke trafficking in women. Hence, in order for ideologies and discourses that specifically sexualise women of certain racial/ethnic or national identities to translate into female trafficking the women belonging to such identities also have to be subject to significant economical, social, political and cultural migratory pressure (please see chapter 3.2 The supply side of the problem). Further it is important to recognise that the relationship between male demand for prostituted women of a particular racial/ethnic or national identity and trafficking in women, partly also is mediated by the receiving country's immigration policy towards the countries that the women of such identities originate from as well as by the political and economical restrictions to free movement that such women are subject to. This in turn generates dependency of the women on third parties to be able to migrate, which in turn creates an incentive for the

trafficking organisations to step in as a provider of debt-financed migration. Further, the trafficking pattern will also partly be determined by the social organisation of and legal control over the sex industry in the receiving country (Anderson and Davidson 2002, p. 33-34). In context it is therefore important to take a closer look at the political debate on the subject of prostitution and carefully analyse the effect of the legalisation of prostitution on the demand and the trafficking pattern.

### **3.7.6 A short note on the political debate and the effect of legalisation of prostitution**

The UN *Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons, Especially Women and Children*, supplementing the *United Nations Convention against Transnational Organised Crime* is the first UN instrument that addresses the demand for commercial sex in relation to the prevention of female trafficking (Raymond 2004, p. 1157). As stated in Art. 9.5, the protocol encourages countries to strengthen their legislation and other measures that can discourage the demand that fosters all forms of exploitation of women and children (The UN Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons, Especially Women and Children Art. 9. 5).

Sweden has chosen an even more direct approach and entirely criminalized male demand for prostitution. The Swedish law that prohibits the purchase of sexual services is unique in the world and a part of the larger Swedish legal framework, *Violence Against Women Government Bill* (Ekberg 2004).

The recognition of the connection between the male demand for prostitution and trafficking in women and children has been welcomed by many parties, although not by all. Both the UN *Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons, Especially Women and Children* and the Swedish *Violence Against Women Government Bill* have been preceded by a very polarised political debate regarding the proper way to address the subject of prostitution and trafficking in women and children.

Accordingly some governments and NGOs have regarded legalisation of prostitution as an effective way to decrease the presence of trafficking victims in their sex industries. This view has further been strengthened by liberal notions that prostitution should not be considered as something wrong if chosen out of the free will by the women engaging in it. However, this approach has proven highly counterproductive.

Over the last ten years the Netherlands has legalised pimping and prostitution. The country also decriminalised its brothels in the year 2000. The intention was that this would regulate the expansion of the sex industry and decrease the number of trafficking victims coming into the country. Contrary to this claim, the sex industry in the Netherlands has expanded 25 percent during the last ten years and now accounts for five percent of the Netherlands's economy (Daley 2001, p. 4). The government in the Netherlands further claimed that legalising prostitution would decrease the child prostitution in the country. In reality, however, child prostitution in the Netherlands has increased rapidly during the 1990s. Child-Rights organisations working in the country has estimated that the number of children in prostitution in the Netherlands have gone from 4.000 children in 1996 to 15.000 in 2001, and further that at least 5.000 of the children in prostitution are from other countries and are therefore most likely victims of trafficking (Tiggeloven 2001).

In January 2002 Germany fully decriminalised its prostitution. Prostitution was previously only legal in certain areas called eros or tolerance zones. When Germany took its first step towards legalisation it was estimated that 75 percent of the women in the sex industry were from countries in South America. The fall of the Soviet Union has altered this figure and some years later brothel owners reported that 90 percent of the women in the German sex industry were from eastern Europe (Altink 1993, p. 33).

The same pattern of expanded sex industry after legalisation has been confirmed in the State of Victoria, Australia. In 1989 there were 40 legal brothels in Victoria, ten years later there were 94 brothels along with 84 escort services. The development in New South Wales points in the same direction. The state decriminalised prostitution in 1995, since then have the number of brothels tripled and grown in size. Likewise has the number of brothels in Sydney increased since the legalisation and amounted to 400-500 in the year 1999. Contrary to what motivated the legalisation, the real growth of prostitution in the states that have legalised prostitution has been in the illegal sector. These illegal brothels have mainly specialised in Asian women, most whom have been delivered by trafficking organisations working in the region (Sullivan and Jeffreys 2001).

Given this development it is especially interesting to analyse the development on the Swedish market for prostitution since the coming into being of the groundbreaking legislation prohibiting the purchase of sexual services in 1999. This bill declares that prostitution is not a desirable social phenomenon and an obstacle to gender equality. It has lifted all penalties against the women in the prostitution and has instead penalised the recruiters, pimps, brothel owners and most importantly the buyers. As stated above, this bill is unique in the world and the first piece of legislation to address the demand for prostitution by targeting men and boys who buy sex. The legislation also includes resources for women in the sex industry to enable them to find an alternative meaningful occupation. According to the working group within the Stockholm police department dealing specifically with prostitution, the street prostitution has declined substantially since the coming into force of the *Violence Against Women Government Bill*. In addition to this, they report that 70-80 percent of the male customers previously buying sex have disappeared and that they have no indications that the hidden prostitution in clubs, escort agencies and brothels has increased. Further the police states that the new legislation has had a positive effect on the trafficking situation in Sweden in comparison with Norway and Finland. This result is especially interesting since these countries are very similar in many aspects, politically, economically and socially. However, it should be noted that Sweden is by no means spared from the problem with trafficking in women and at least 200-500 women have been estimated to be trafficked into Sweden every year (Bjorling 2001 and Ekberg 2004, p. 1194).

In the case of the Netherlands it could be argued that the country has had a liberal attitude towards prostitution long before the event of legalisation and the increased inflow of trafficking victims would have taken place regardless of the legalisation. However, the sheer magnitude of the women being trafficked into the Netherlands compared to other countries in the region that have a similar liberal attitude towards commercialised sex, but have refrained from legalisation, indicates that legalisation result in an inflow of more victims of trafficking. In the case of Australia, this pattern is even more prominent. Clearly, in the states that have chosen to legalise prostitution the numbers of trafficking victims, both children and adults are much higher than in states that have chosen not to legalise.

There are several explanations available for this development. As stated before, the price is an important factor behind the determination of male sexual consumption habits and that the level of demand may rise more rapidly when prostitution is supplied more cheaply. One economic explanation could possibly be that the price elasticity of demand for prostitution is elastic and that legalisation increases the competition on the market for prostitution and therefore lowers the prices. Clearly an elastic demand would in this case render in an increased demand for prostitution larger than is given by the relative reduction in price. Evidently, the empirical data on the subject available at present is insufficient to allow a meaningful investigation of this particular question. Further, economic explanations alone will most likely not suffice to explain the impact of legalisation on the demand. Organisations working to promote women's rights have explained the increased demand following the

legalisation of prostitution in a slightly different way. They mean that legalisation boosts the motivation of men to buy women and children in prostitution in a much wider and more permissible range of socially and politically acceptable settings. Hence, with the advent of legalisation in countries that have previously criminalized its sex industries, many men who would previously not risk buying women and children for sex now see prostitution as acceptable. When legal barriers are removed so too are the social and ethical barriers to treating women as sexual commodities. Legalisation therefore sends the message to new generations of men and boys that women are sexual objects who can be bought for the sexual gratification of men (Barry, 1979, see also chapter 4.7.1 The Swedish approach).

### **3.7.7 Conclusion 4**

Clearly male demand for commercialised sex constitute one of the main driving incentive in the business of female trafficking, without which it would not be profitable for the trafficking organisations to engage in trafficking in women for the purpose of sexual exploitation. However, the subject of male demand for prostitution in relation to trafficking in women for the purpose of sexual exploitation clearly has to be further studied before any far reaching conclusions can be made. Nevertheless, victims of trafficking are indeed present in the global sex industry and the promoters of the sex trade benefit enormously from the exploitation of these vulnerable women and children, which allows them to maximise the profits and minimise the expenses. Further there are indications that victims of trafficking are more likely to serve the demand for cheap and submissive prostitutes, a market segment in which female trafficking victims clearly are over represented. There is also some evidence suggesting that male demand for prostitution is based on sexual stereotypes of women belonging to different racial/ethnic and national identities. Further, that the demand for prostitution is driven by discourses and ideologies regarding militarism, nationalism and masculinity, which encourage men to engage in exploitive sexual practices with women whom are believed to belong to inferior national or racial/ethnic groups. However, this pattern of behaviour alone does not necessarily suffice to explain trafficking in women of certain racial/ethnic or national belonging. Hence, in order for trafficking in women belonging to such identities to take place, these women will most likely also have to be subject to significant economical, social, political and cultural migratory pressure. It is therefore my strongest belief that future research must investigate both the supply and the demand side factors and the degree of correspondence between them, in order to fully be able to explain the causality between male demand for prostitution and trafficking in women.

However, regarding the evidence concerning the effect of legalisation of prostitution on the demand and the response from the organisations responsible for trafficking in women, the evidence more unequivocally points in a similar direction. Clearly, countries such as Germany, the Netherlands and the states in Australia that have legalised its prostitution have been more highly targeted by trafficking organisations and have been subject to a more rapid increase of their legal and illegal sex industries. In the case of Sweden, the means taken to decrease the demand for prostitution by prohibiting the purchase of sexual services seems to have discouraged the trafficking organisations to target the country in the same degree as the neighbouring non-prohibiting countries of Finland and Norway. This suggest that the degree and nature of the male demand for prostitution at least to some extent determines the actions of the trafficking organisations and that preventive measures indeed can be effective. In the following evaluation of the ongoing counter-trafficking work I will therefore specifically look for policies designed to decrease male demand for prostitution.

## 4. Evaluating the preventive measures

### 4.1 Introduction

Combating trafficking in women and children for the purpose of sexual exploitation is indeed a very prominent subject on the international political agenda. In this final chapter I will analyse the counter trafficking legislation, initiatives and policies undertaken by the United Nations, the European Union and its member countries, the USA and single countries. I will specifically investigate to what extent that counter trafficking measures identified earlier in this thesis have been recognised.

Hence, as given by the outcome of the theoretical model as well as the empirical survey and conclusion one, two three and four, I will look for signs that the different parties committed to the fight against female trafficking have recognised the need to pursue policies that will serve to deprive the trafficking organisations of their profits. As stated earlier, this is most preferably done by helping the victims to deflect from their exploitive working conditions and to receive a legal and protected status in the country into which they have been trafficked. This will make it more difficult for the trafficking organisations to exploit the illegal status of the victims and can encourage the victims to default on their debts owed to the trafficking organisations and hereby take away the main financial incentive in the business of female trafficking. Further I will look for initiatives taken to decrease the male demand for prostitution.

### 4.2 The historical treatment of female trafficking victims

#### 4.2.1 Introduction

Before beginning I would like to make a short note on the historical/traditional response to female trafficking and the treatment that the victims have been subject to from governmental authorities. The evidence on the subject unequivocally points in a similar direction and the most common governmental treatment of encountered victims of trafficking has been arrest on either prostitution and/or immigration charges and deportation (IOM Nov 2002, p. 51).

#### 4.2.2 Arrest and deportation

For example, in 1991 the Frankfurt police raided six brothels and arrested 125 foreign women serving as prostitutes. The following quotation shows how these victims of trafficking were treated.

“The were to told to pack their things together and leave with the police immediately, many still in their working cloths [...]. Though the police did interview each women individually on the rings which had brought them to Germany, it is doubtful how much useful information would be elicited in a single sitting, after such a traumatic experience for the women, and before their imminent deportation. Should information leading to a prosecution have come up



even in the following weeks, the witnesses would already have been deported” (Davies 1994, p. 56).

This pattern of arrest and deportation is confirmed in many other cases and of 1,500 trafficked women detected by the German police in 1997, 95 percent were deported (IOM Nov 2002, p. 51).

Further, in Bosnia and Herzegovina, detected women and girls trafficked into prostitution are constantly prosecuted for document fraud, prostitution and illegal residence (Human Rights Wash 2002, p. 19).

Likewise, according to the *Alien and Nationality Law of Liberia*, aliens who are prostitutes or who have been engaged in prostitution are to be seen as prohibited immigrants who are to be deported. Similar deportation rules are applied in many other countries such as Zambia, Uganda, Tanzania, Swaziland, Sri Lanka, Mauritius, Malta, Ethiopia and Zimbabwe (Smith and Mattar 2004, p. 169).

The situation in Israel is similar and victims found in possession of false identity documents when brothels get raided are immediately taken to prison. The charges against them are dropped if they are deported, but if they want to file a complaint against their trafficker or brothel owner they have to remain in prison until the trial is held (Gender Issues, Jan 2000).

#### **4.2.3 Summary**

The arrest and deportation of victims seems to be a rule rather than an exception. I can therefore conclude that governments historically seem not to have recognised the connection between more lenient deportation policies and the decrease of the profitability of the trafficking organisations.

### **4.3 International conventions addressing human trafficking**

#### **4.3.1 Introduction**

In the following I will present the international conventions that directly address trafficking in women for the purpose of sexual exploitation. Although the UN did not more comprehensively address trafficking in humans until 1949 the UN has a long tradition of fighting slavery, starting with the *International Slavery Convention of 1926*. This Convention has been followed by several conventions addressing trafficking in women and children more directly. The most comprehensive initiative of this kind is the *UN Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons, Especially Women and Children* (2000).

Before analysing this protocol in detail I would like to address some other important conventions and protocols.

#### **4.3.2 A general note on some important conventions**

As stated above the first perhaps more comprehensive convention dealing with human trafficking was the *Convention for the Suppression of the Traffic in Persons and of the Exploitation of the Prostitution of Others* (1949). This convention recommends governments to punish individuals responsible for procurement and enticement of another person for prostitution. Countries are called upon to adopt preventive measures such as monitoring

employment agencies and to provide temporary assistance for victims of trafficking. (The Convention for the Suppression of the Traffic in Persons and of the Exploitation of the Prostitution of Others, 1949).

The next convention addressing the subject of human trafficking is the *Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women* (1979). Article 6 of this convention addresses female trafficking directly and requires states to suppress trafficking in women and exploitation of women in prostitution (The Convention of the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women (1979))<sup>12</sup>.

The *Fourth World Conference on Women*, held in Beijing in 1995 led to the development of the Beijing Platform for Action. This platform does not only address trafficking in women for the purpose of prostitution, but also trafficking in women for domestic labour. Accordingly, both sending and receiving countries as well as international organisations are required to take appropriate measures to eradicate factors leading to trafficking in women and children for the purpose of sexual exploitation. These include strengthening the trafficking legislation and to provide better protection of the rights of women and girls affected<sup>13</sup>.

The *Fourth World Conference on Women* was followed up in 2000 by the *Special Session on the UN General Assembly on Beijing +5*. This session led to some new counter trafficking recommendations. Once again countries were encouraged to try to eradicate factors leading to trafficking, provide assistance and protection to victims, further to cooperate internationally to prevent and punish human trafficking and to reduce the risk of women to become victims of trafficking<sup>14</sup>.

#### **4.3.3 The UN Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons, Especially Women and Children (2000)**

The *UN Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons, Especially women and Children* is the most comprehensive international attempt to address and combat human trafficking (Raymond 2002, p. 491). The protocol indeed represents a change of attitude towards female victims of trafficking and the treatment they are to receive. Accordingly victims of trafficking are no longer to be seen as criminals but as victims of crime.

Further, the protocol states that the consent of the victim is irrelevant and that all victims are to be protected, not only those who could prove that they were forced. Hence, the burden of proof is shifted for the victim to the responsible trafficker. Further, the protocol confirms that much trafficking is taking place to supply women for prostitution and that the subject of prostitution and female trafficking is not to be held apart (Article 3a and 3b, Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons, Especially Women and Children). Although, the protocol does not advocate criminalisation of prostitution as a way to prevent trafficking (Smith and Mattar 2004, p. 159).

The protocol does however address the demand for trafficked women and children and encourage countries to take measures to decrease the demand leading to all forms of exploitation of women and children. (Article 9.5, Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons, Especially Women and Children).

Finally, the protocol recognises that the crime of human trafficking is carried out in a global and cross border context and the fight against it must be based on international cooperation (Article 10, Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons, Especially Women and Children).

---

<sup>12</sup> [www.un.org/womenwatch/daw/cedaw/](http://www.un.org/womenwatch/daw/cedaw/)

<sup>13</sup> [www.un.org/womenwatch/daw/beijing/platform/declar.htm](http://www.un.org/womenwatch/daw/beijing/platform/declar.htm)

<sup>14</sup> [www.un.org/womenwatch/confer/beijing/](http://www.un.org/womenwatch/confer/beijing/)

Clearly, all the conventions and conferences presented above, especially the *Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons, Especially Women and Children*, address trafficking in women and girls for the purpose of sexual exploitation in some way and stress the importance of providing the victims with assistance and protection.

There are also some indications that the status of the trafficking victims recently actually has improved in some of the receiving countries such as the USA, Austria, Belgium, Canada, Italy, the Netherlands, Spain, the Czech Republic, Hungary, Lithuania and Australia. Accordingly, these countries all have started to grant the victims of trafficking some form of residency status. This is done in direct compliance with the *UN Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons, Especially women and Children*, according to which countries are to grant trafficking victims appropriate residency status in order to make it possible for them to testify against their trafficker, and further to protect them from retribution in the case of deportation (Smith and Mattar 2004, p. 161).

#### **4.3.4 Summary**

Clearly, although victims still most commonly are arrested and deported, there seems to be a general and international consensus that female victims of trafficking are to be assisted and protected. Further, there is evidence suggesting that some partaking and signatory countries actually do have developed and implemented more lenient deportation policies. However, to what extent this has changed and affected the behaviour and actions of the trafficking victims and the trafficking organisations operating in these countries have yet to be determined. I believe however that this change and development signifies a movement in the right direction and if continuously carried out can lead to the desirable outcome suggested by the theoretical model and empirical survey presented in this thesis.

## **4.4 The United Nations**

### **4.4.1 Introduction**

In addition to the conventions and protocols presented above, several United Nations agencies are involved in the fight against female trafficking and run or coordinate counter trafficking projects in close relationship with their perhaps other more traditional areas of responsibility. In the following I will present the counter trafficking work undertaken by the *United Nations Office for Drug Control and Crime Prevention (ODCCP)*, the *Office of the High Commissioner for Human Rights (OHCHR)* and the *United Nations Development Programme (UNDP)*.

### **4.4.2 The United Nations Office for Drug Control and Crime Prevention**

The ODCCP's normal areas of responsibility are drug control and crime prevention. In 1999 the ODCCP launched the *Global Programme against Trafficking in Human Beings*. The purpose hereby was to assist the UN member states in their fight against human trafficking. In accordance with the *Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons, Especially Women and Children*, the main objective of this programme is to promote the development of an effective criminal justice-related response to human trafficking. The programme thus aims to advise of drafting and revising of the member countries legislation,

advice, assist and strengthen the member countries anti-trafficking offices and units and to train their law enforcement officials. The aim of programme is further to strengthen victims and witness support and to promote awareness-rising (UNODC, New York Office, 4 March 2004, p. 1 and)<sup>15</sup>.

As a part of this project, ODCCP has assisted the Czech Republic and Poland to carry out legal and institutional reforms and to provide assistance to victims and witnesses in order to empower them and to make them cooperate with law enforcement officials (UNODC, New York Office, 4 March 2004, p. 2)<sup>16</sup>.

#### **4.4.3 The Office of the High Commissioner for Human Rights**

The OHCHR has since 1998 been engaged in counter trafficking work, specifically targeting women and children.

In 1999 the OHCHR established a counter trafficking programme. The goal of this programme was to make sure that human rights were integrated into the regional and national counter trafficking work. The purpose of the programme is not for the OHCHR to undertake large projects of its own, but rather to support the work of others. In Bosnia and Herzegovina, OHCHR supports a project established to provide assistance to victims of trafficking and to strengthen the law enforcement on human trafficking in response to the growing problem of human trafficking in the area. As a part of this project, the OHCHR has developed guidelines for how to deal with victims of trafficking. OHCHR also works in close cooperation with the International Organisation of Migration to establish mechanisms and procedures for identification and protection of victims (OHCHR Dec 2001, p. 3-4).

#### **4.4.4 The United Nations Development Programme**

Apart from the UNDP's traditional focus on poverty reduction and gender equality, the agency also coordinates the *Inter-Agency Working Group to Combat Trafficking and Children in the Mekong Sub-region*. The Mekong Sub-region covers the Yunnan province in China, Thailand, Vietnam, Cambodia and Burma. This project was established in 1999 in order to support local initiatives to assist women and children who already have been trafficked or are belonging to groups that are vulnerable to recruitment attempts from trafficking organisations. The aim of the project is further to strengthen and improve the individual capacity of the partaking countries as well as the cooperation them in between and to make the law enforcement to work more efficiently<sup>17</sup>.

#### **4.4.5 Summary**

The ODCCP's counter trafficking activities has focused on advising on drafting and revising of the member countries legislation, and strengthening the member countries anti-trafficking offices and units. As a part of this work ODCCP has promoted more efficient victims and witness support. More specifically, ODCCP has assisted the Czech Republic and Poland to carry out legal and institutional reforms and to provide assistance to victims and witnesses.

The OHCHR has supported projects in Bosnia and Herzegovina established to provide assistance to victims of trafficking, further the OHCHR has cooperated with the International Organisation for Migration to establish mechanisms and procedures for identification and protection of victims.

---

<sup>15</sup> [www.unodc.org/unodc/eu/trafficking\\_human\\_beings.html](http://www.unodc.org/unodc/eu/trafficking_human_beings.html)

<sup>16</sup> [www.unodc.org/unodc/eu/trafficking\\_human\\_beings.html](http://www.unodc.org/unodc/eu/trafficking_human_beings.html)

<sup>17</sup> [un.orh/TraffickingProject/Aius/aius.htm](http://un.orh/TraffickingProject/Aius/aius.htm)

Finally, the UNDP coordinates the *Inter-Agency Working Group to Combat Trafficking and Children in the Mekong Sub-region*. The goal of this project is to support local initiatives to assist victims of trafficking and to prevent further recruitment attempts by the trafficking organisations operating in the region.

Clearly, combating trafficking in women and children for the purpose of sexual exploitation is being increasingly prioritised by several United Nations agencies. As can be seen the United Nations agencies presented above support and cooperate with local initiatives and governments to provide victims of trafficking assistance and protection. These efforts can indeed make victims of trafficking more prone to deflect from their exploitive working conditions and thus decrease the profitability of the trafficking organisations. However, this desirable outcome will most likely depend on the will of the individual governments taking part in the cooperation, to recognise the need to treat victims of trafficking as victims in need of protection and assistance and not as illegal immigrants who are to be arrested and deported. Clearly in this case, the work undertaken by the ODCCP, OHCHR and UNDP is important and may lead to a change in attitudes to female victims of trafficking and sexual exploitation that may make it harder for the trafficking organisation to operate in the countries involved.

## 4.5 The European Union

### 4.5.1 Introduction

The European Union engaged in combating human trafficking for the first time in 1996 when the *Communication on the subject of trafficking in women for the purpose of sexual exploitation* was announced by the European Commission (Communication from the Commission to the Council and the European Parliament on Trafficking in women for the purpose of sexual exploitation, COM (96) 567 final, 20.11.1996). The goal hereby was to develop a comprehensive and multidisciplinary approach to tackle the problem of especially female trafficking.

The *Communication on the subject of trafficking in women for the purpose of sexual exploitation* initiated in 1996 was followed up in 1997 by the *Joint Action of February 1997 to combat trafficking in human beings and sexual exploitation of children*. The purpose hereby, was to encourage the member states of the European Union to review their human trafficking legislation, promote judicial cooperation and to ensure appropriate protection and assistance to victims and their families.

### 4.5.2 The STOP Programme and the STOP II Programme

The Council of Ministers launched the STOP Programme in 1996. The goal of this programme was to encourage, support and reinforce the work of and cooperation between the different parties in the member states engaged in the fight against human trafficking and sexual exploitation of women and children. The project has specifically been aimed to train and educate judges, public prosecutors, police departments, civil servants and public officials specifically concerned with immigration, border controls, trafficking and sexual exploitation. In addition to this, special efforts have been made to develop methods to assist victims of trafficking and to prevent sexual exploitation of children<sup>18</sup>. The STOP Programme was ended

---

<sup>18</sup> [http://europa.eu.int/comm./justice\\_home/news/8mars\\_en.htm](http://europa.eu.int/comm./justice_home/news/8mars_en.htm).

on the 31 December 2000, but the initiative continued with a two years extension called the STOP II Programme adopted on 28 June 2001. The STOP II Programme specifically focuses on the candidate countries and underlines the importance of cooperation with third countries and international organisations<sup>19</sup>.

### 4.5.3 Summary

As can be seen the European Union has taken several initiatives to combat human trafficking and assist and protect the victims involved. Especially the *Joint Action of February 1997 to combat trafficking in human beings and sexual exploitation of children*, indicates that the European Union has recognised the need to provide legal protection to victims of trafficking instead of arresting and deporting them. Further, as a part of the STOP Programmes, the European Union has tried to develop efficient victim assistance policies. In addition to this, as stated before, several of the member countries have adopted more lenient deportation policies that grant victims of trafficking some form of temporary residence status. This signifies a step in the right direction and can make victims more prone to deflect from their exploitive working conditions.

## 4.6 The United States of America

### 4.6.1 Introduction

The USA has been very active during the latest years in combating human trafficking. A part in this strategy has been to promote and support the actions by members of civil society, such as rescue attempts and organising safe shelter. Several organisations have been involved in this, such as the International Catholic Migration Commission, the International Human Rights Center La Strada and the Shared Hope International (Long 2004, p. 20 and Weldes 2004, p. 13)<sup>20</sup>.

The Congress also passed the ground breaking law called the *Trafficking Victims Protection Act* in 2000, which grants protection and rights to victims of trafficking. In addition to this the United States Department of Health and Human Services has created a tool kit for health care and social service provider and law enforcement officials who are currently providing service to victims of trafficking, or who could potentially come into contact with victims of trafficking<sup>21</sup>. Further the U.S. Department of State has created a fact sheet on how to best provide shelter to victims of trafficking<sup>22</sup>.

However, in the same time the United States has failed to ratify several of the major international conventions dealing with human trafficking, including the *Convention on the Rights of the Child* and the *Convention on the elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women*. Further, victims of trafficking have traditionally met very little understanding

---

<sup>19</sup> [www.europa.eu.int/comm/justice\\_home/project/stop\\_en.htm](http://www.europa.eu.int/comm/justice_home/project/stop_en.htm).

<sup>20</sup> <http://www.icmc.net/docs/en/programs/balkanprg6>  
<http://www.lastrada.kiev.ua/about.cgi?ing=en&Id=31>  
<http://www.sharedhope.org/about.htm>

<sup>21</sup> This Tool Kit can be accessed at: [http://www.acf.hhs.gov/trafficking/campaign\\_kits/index.html](http://www.acf.hhs.gov/trafficking/campaign_kits/index.html)

<sup>22</sup> This fact sheet can be accessed at: <http://www.acf.hhs.gov/g/tip/rls/30069.htm>

form the authorities and have most often been subject to detention in jails and deportation (O’Neill 1999, p. 39 and Weldes 2004, p. 15).

#### **4.6.2 The Trafficking Victims Protection Act**

The Trafficking Victims Protection Act (TVPA) represents the perhaps most comprehensive national legal modern attempts to address and combat human trafficking.

The goal of the TVPA is to provide protection and assistance to victims of severe forms of trafficking, and further to make funds derived from the sale of assets seized from the traffickers available for different victims’ assistance programs (Miko 2001, p. 17).

The TVPA defines the crime of human trafficking as:

- A. The recruitment, harbouring, transportation, provision, or obtaining of a person for the purpose of a commercial sex act where such an act is induced by force, fraud, or coercion, or in which the person induced to perform such act has not attained 18 years of age, **or**
- B. The recruitment, harbouring, transportation, provision, or obtaining of a person for labour or services, through the use of force, fraud, or coercion for the purpose of subjection to involuntary servitude, peonage, debt bondage, or slavery.

(TVPA, PL 106-386, § 103, 22 USC 7102)

To be able to receive assistance the victims have to be certified by the U.S Department of Health and Human Services (HHS). If the victims are found to qualify as victims of trafficking according to the definition presented above, they can receive the same Federally-funded services and benefits given to refugees. However, the victims must also be willing to take part in the investigation and prosecution of their trafficker and have completed an application for a so called T visa or alternatively have received Continued Presence status from the U.S. Department of Homeland Security. Victims under the age of 18 are immediately entitled to assistance once it has been proofed that they are victims of trafficking. Clearing this process, the victims can receive the assistance needed to ensure the safety and protection of their lives. The assistance can include housing or shelter, food, income, employment, English language training, health care, witness protection and special assistance for victims of torture (Victim Assistance Fact Sheet)<sup>23</sup>.

The T visa grants the victims temporary residence in the U.S, and the TVPA authorizes up to 5,000 T visas per year. Further, victims who have been in the U.S continuously for three years since the admission of their T visa can, if they have proven good moral character and not resisted to assist in investigations and prosecutions, and who risk retribution or harm if they are removed form the U.S, receive a permanent residence status (Miko 2004, p. 17 and Trafficking Victims Protection ACT of 2000, Fact SHeet)<sup>24</sup>.

The T visa can be said to signify a shift in the immigration law policy, traditionally treating victims of trafficking as illegal immigrants and therefore to be detained and deported (see above).

However, the TVPA has also been criticised to use a too narrow or restrictive definition of whom to be seen as a victim of trafficking and that many deserving victims will fall short. Hence, at present the protection is limited to victims of “severe forms of trafficking”, further, the victims have to prove that they have been trafficked into the U.S and that they will meet the retribution of the trafficker if they are returned to their home country. In addition to this, the victim must also be willing to assist in the investigation, identification and

<sup>23</sup> [www.acf.hhs.gov/trafficking/about/victim\\_assist.html](http://www.acf.hhs.gov/trafficking/about/victim_assist.html)

<sup>24</sup> [www.acf.hhs.gov/trafficking/about/TVPA\\_200.pdf](http://www.acf.hhs.gov/trafficking/about/TVPA_200.pdf)

prosecution of the trafficker. Clearly, these are points where the TVPA differs from the UN Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons, Especially Women and Children, which can make international cooperation more difficult (Miko 2004, p. 20).

### **4.6.3 Summary**

The United States of America has taken several initiatives to combat human trafficking. Especially the TVPA represents a very comprehensive attempt to grant victims of severe forms of trafficking a legal and protected status. Further, the victims who have received a T visa are also given the possibility to legally work in the U.S. and can after three years apply for a permanent residence status. Clearly this policy corresponds directly with what the theoretical model presented in this thesis advocates as good counter trafficking policy. Hence, by giving victims of trafficking a protected and legal status, as well as the possibility to legally work and earn money, more victims can be encouraged to defect from their trafficker or brothel owner and thus undermine the entire system of debt-financed migration and debt-bounded sexual slavery that constitutes the foundation in the business of human trafficking.

## **4.7 Laws, programmes and policies that address the demand**

### **4.7.1 Introduction**

Clearly male demand for commercialised sex constitute one of the main driving incentives in the business of female trafficking, without which it would not be profitable for the trafficking organisations to engage in trafficking in women for the purpose of sexual exploitation. Although, the exact nature of the causality between male demand for prostitution and trafficking in women and children for the purpose of sexual exploitation has yet to be determined. Nevertheless, the evidence regarding the effect of the legalisation of prostitution on the demand for prostitution, the expansion of the sex industry and the behaviour of the trafficking organisation suggest that the male demand for prostitution and trafficking in women and children into prostitution and sexual slavery indeed is correlated. Hence, laws, policies and programmes that are designed to decrease men's use of women and children in prostitution can therefore also have a strong preventive effect on the business of female trafficking. In the following I will present some of the initiatives taken in different countries to address and decrease men's demand for prostitution.

### **4.7.2 The Swedish approach**

The Swedish law that prohibits the purchase of sexual services is unique in the world and a part of the larger Swedish legal framework, *Violence Against Women Government Bill*. Accordingly, "a person who obtains casual sexual relations in exchange for payment shall be sentenced unless the act is punishable under the Swedish Penal Code-for the purchase of sexual services to a fine or imprisonment for at most six months" (Act Prohibiting the Purchase of Sexual Services 1998:408). The law came into force on January 1, 1999, and is the first legal attempt by a country to decrease men's demand for prostitution and simultaneously combat trafficking in human beings. The principle behind this reasoning is simple, when male customers of commercialised sex risk punishment, the number of sex buying men will decrease. This will make the market for prostitution less profitable and make



the trafficking organisations target other more lucrative countries (Ekberg 2004, p. 1187). As stated earlier, the effect of the *Violence Against Women Government Bill* has indeed been significant and has led to a substantial drop in the number of women in street prostitution, further the number of buyers has decreased by 75 to 80 percent. Further the police states that the new legislation has had a positive effect on the trafficking situation in Sweden in comparison with Norway and Finland (Bjorling 2001, see also chapter 3.8.6 A short note on the political debate and the effect of legalisation of prostitution).

According to the Swedish National Criminal Investigation Department (NCID), Europol and individual national police forces of other European countries have received evidence stating that the Swedish market for prostitution is no longer attractive for trafficking organisations. Hence, according to conversations between traffickers and pimps recorded for crime investigating purposes and from testimonies given by victims of trafficking, it has been revealed that pimps and traffickers experience many difficulties in running their businesses and attracting buyers in Sweden. Potential customers of prostitution express fear of being arrested and prosecuted and will therefore only buy sex if they can be promised absolute discretion. Further, the victims of trafficking serving as prostitutes must be escorted to the customers. This means that the number of customers that each victim can serve within a certain amount of time decreases and thus lowers the revenue for pimps and traffickers. Finally, due to the criminalization of the market for prostitution, traffickers and pimps need to act as to minimize the risk for detection and are therefore forced to operate in a smaller scale, using many different locations. Clearly these are all aspects that serve to increase the cost of running the business and therefore automatically lower the profits. Hence, in the NCID report of 2004, it is concluded that the *Violence Against Women Government Bill* clearly has deterred trafficking organisations from targeting Sweden (Ekberg 2004, p. 1201 and NCID 2004, p. 35).

#### **4.7.3 Other initiatives taken against male demand for prostitution**

The United Nations has also been active in addressing the male demand for prostitution. For example has the United Nations Inter-Agency Standing Committee (IASC) devised codes of conducts for their personnel deployed to relieve humanitarian crises (Raymond 2004, p. 1178). Accordingly, the IASC code of conduct states that, “Sexual exploitation and abuse by humanitarian workers constitute acts of gross misconduct and are therefore grounds for terminations”, further that “Exchange of money, employment, goods, or degrading or exploitative behaviour is prohibited” (IASC 2002, p. 1-2).

The Organisation for Security and Cooperation in Europe (OSCE) has also launched a code of conduct for its staff sent on missions, called “Prohibiting the Promotion or Facilitation of Prostitution and Trafficking in Persons”. Accordingly, members of the OSCE staff are prohibited from visiting establishments providing commercial sex<sup>25</sup>.

There are also national laws in place that specifically prohibit the purchase of sexual services from victims of trafficking. For example, the Philippines Anti-Trafficking in Persons Act of 2003, criminalize the act to “maintain or hire a person to engage in prostitution or pornography” (Philippines Anti-Trafficking in Persons Act of 2003, Republic Act 9208). Further, in the case of the Philippines, the Coalition Against Trafficking in Women has carried out a three year project to prevent trafficking in women and children by discouraging the demand for prostitution. The goal of the project is to change the sexual attitudes of boys and young men that provoke female trafficking by educating them about the harm of

---

<sup>25</sup> [http://www.osce.org/documents/odhr/2002/08/2115\\_en.pdf](http://www.osce.org/documents/odhr/2002/08/2115_en.pdf)

prostitution and trafficking and the role and responsibility of men as potential buyers of commercialised sex (Raymond 2004, p. 1179 and [www.catw.org](http://www.catw.org)).

#### **4.7.4 Summary**

The Swedish *Violence Against Women Government Bill* has proven successful and made the trafficking organisations target other non prohibiting European countries instead. Clearly, this suggests that governments should harmonize their legislation to avoid that trafficking organisations exploit legal differences between countries.

Further both the UN and the OSCE has developed codes of conduct specifically prohibiting the purchase of sexual services during international missions. Evidently, these are all needed and much welcomed initiatives that can have a very strong preventive effect on the business of trafficking in women and girls for the purpose of sexual exploitation.

## **4.8 Conclusions**

### **4.8.1 Introduction**

I will now present my overall conclusions based on the outcome of the theoretical model, the empirical survey and the evaluation of the counter trafficking laws, programmes and policies available at present. I will begin in short terms by reproducing the outcome of the theoretical model, this will be followed by an presentation of the conclusions derived from the empirical survey. I will then finally present the result of the evaluation of the counter trafficking initiatives, as was the purpose of this thesis.

### **4.8.2 The theoretical outcome**

The outcome of the theoretical model presented in this thesis clearly indicates that trafficking takes place because the trafficking organisations can offer the opportunity of debt-financed migration to women and girls who want to migrate but are constrained by their financial and legal possibilities to travel across borders. The models also prove that the system of debt-financed migration and debt-bounded sexual exploitation can more easily be upheld and more profitable be used, the greater the risk of deportation is for victims of human trafficking when applying for a legal status. Hence, as suggested by the outcome of the model, states committed to the fight against trafficking should pursue policies that can facilitate the victims' possibilities to deflect from their trafficker or brothel owner and receive a protected and legal status within the state territory into which they have been trafficked. These could include more lenient deportation policies, granting victims temporary or permanent residency status and the possibility to legally work in the country into which they have been trafficked. This will serve to reduce the enforceability of the debt-contract and thereby take away one of the main financial incentive in the business of trafficking in women and girls for the purpose of human trafficking.

### **4.8.3 The empirical outcome**

By analysing the organisation and operational features of the trafficking organisations I have come to the following conclusion:

The trafficking organisations deliberately diversify the trafficking process and separate units carry out different tasks. These units are usually very specialised and kept on a strictly “need to know basis”. Hence, each individual taking part in the process does not possess more information than what is absolutely necessary to carry out the specific task appointed to him. Further, the trafficking organisations usually exhibit a very prominent differentiated vertical structure and the lower levels of the staff are kept in unawareness about the entire structure of the organisation and especially about the leading individuals. This kind of structure and procedures serves to protect the organisation and to make it more resistant to law enforcement activities.

In some cases the trafficking organisation prepares the victims prior to the departure, this is done to lower the risk for the organisation if the victims are detained and questioned during the trafficking process. The trafficking organisations usually also have a very flexible organisation and can change the planned transportation route within short notice and during ongoing operations as a response to changes in the level of border control and law enforcement. The process of transportation is usually carried out by many different agents who only have information about their own and perhaps the previous and next stage in the trafficking process.

Taken all together, this conclusion serves to strengthen the outcome of the theoretical model. Hence, the trafficking organisations exhibit an organisational structure and use operational procedure that makes them very resistant to law enforcement. It can therefore be more efficient to pursue preventive measure that will have a more indirect restraining effect on the profitability of the trafficking organisations, such as more lenient deportation policies.

By analysing the post-arrival situation I have come to the following conclusion:

The post-arrival situation is characterised by debt-bondage and sexual exploitation. To ensure re-payment of the debts the trafficking organisations use different methods to control the victims and restrict their liberty. These include confiscation of travel and identification documents, threats and violence such as beatings and rape, and most importantly, exploiting the illegal status of the victims. Clearly the empirical evidence available regarding the post-arrival situation confirms that the system of debt financed migration and the following debt bounded exploitation rest upon the possibility of traffickers and brothel owners to exploit the illegal status of the victims in the receiving country. Once again I can therefore conclude that measures such as more lenient deportation policies, granting victims of trafficking a temporary or permanent residence status and perhaps the possibility to legally work can have a significant restraining effect on the business of trafficking in women and girls for the purpose of sexual exploitation.

By analysing the demand side of the problem I have come to the following conclusion:

Clearly, men’s demand for commercialised sex constitute one of the main driving incentive in the business of trafficking in women and children into prostitution and sexual slavery and the promoters of the sex industry benefits enormously from “employing” victims of trafficking. However, the evidence available at present does not suffice to reveal the exact nature of the causality between male demand for prostitution and trafficking in women and girls. Nevertheless, there is some evidence suggesting that victims are more likely to serve the demand for cheap and submissive prostitutes and demand based on sexual stereotypes of women belonging to different racial/ethnic and national identities.

However, the evidence on the effect of legalisation of prostitution on the actions of the trafficking organisations more clearly points in one direction and countries that have legalised their prostitution have evidently been more targeted by trafficking organisations.

In Sweden, the criminalisation of the purchase of sexual services, has deterred trafficking organisations from targeting the country in the same degree as the neighbouring non-prohibiting countries. This single case indicates that policies and laws that decrease men's demand for prostitution and make it more difficult for the promoters of the sex industry to run their businesses can also have a restraining effect on the actions of trafficking organisations responsible for trafficking women into prostitution and sexual slavery.

#### **4.8.4 The outcome of the evaluation of the preventive measures**

By analysing the international conventions addressing human trafficking I have come to the following conclusion:

Historically, female victims of trafficking and sexual exploitation have meet little understanding and therefore subsequently been arrested and deported when encountered by governmental authorities and officials. As has been concluded in this thesis, this is a most undesirable pattern of behaviour and has served to make the system of trafficking and debt-bounded sexual exploitation easier to maintain.

However, when analysing the international conventions addressing human trafficking I have found evidence suggesting that there seems to be an international legal and political consensus that victims of trafficking are to be assisted and protected, and not arrested and deported. For example, the *Convention for the Suppression of the Traffic in Persons and of the Exploitation of the Prostitution of Others* (1949) clearly states that countries are to provide victims of trafficking temporary assistance. Likewise, the Beijing Platform for Action, developed at the *Fourth World Conference on Women* (1995), requires states and international organisations to take appropriate measures to protect trafficked women and girls. In addition to this, the *Special Session on the UN General Assembly on Beijing +5* led to recommendations that further encourage countries to provide assistance and protection to victims of trafficking. Finally, the *UN Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons, Especially Women and Children* (2000) clearly states that victims of trafficking are no longer to be seen as criminals but as victims of crime who are to be protected regardless of the consent of the victims. There are also indications that the treatment of victims actually has improved during the last years and several countries have started to grant encountered victims some form of residency status. Evidently, this is a most welcomed change and stands in direct line with the theoretical and empirical outcome and conclusions of this thesis.

However it is important to notice that this change in attitude and treatment of victims of trafficking is first and foremost a result of an increasing will to protect the human rights of the victims and not due to an increased understanding of the economic incentives and the system of debt-financed migration fundamental to the business of human trafficking. Hence, I have not found any evidence suggesting that states and other parties have taken into consideration the economic principles that the trafficking business rests upon when developing international and national conventions, laws and practices to deal with trafficking in women and children for the purposes of sexual exploitation. Although, the result can indeed be the same.

Finally, it is important to keep in mind that the effect of this change has yet to be determined and so fare there is no proof suggesting that countries that have taken on more lenient deportation policies have seen a drop in the inflow of trafficking victims.

By analysing the actions of the United Nations I have come to the following conclusion:

Several UN agencies, such as the United Nations Office for Drug Control and Crime Prevention, the Office of the High Commissioner for Human Rights and the United Nations Development Programme, take part in counter trafficking activities and promote more efficient assistance and protection of victims. Clearly, these are efforts that can make victims more prone to deflect from their exploitive working conditions and thus undermine the system of debt-bounded migration and sexual exploitation. However, this outcome is also depending on that the governments of the receiving countries stop treating victims as illegal migrants.

By analysing the actions of the European Union and the United States of America, I have come to the following conclusion:

The European Union has taken several initiatives to assist and protect victims of trafficking and has recognised the importance of not arresting and deporting encountered victims. Accordingly, several member countries have adopted more lenient deportation policies and grant victims some form of temporary residence status.

The USA has gone even further and the Trafficking Victims Protection Act is the most far reaching and comprehensive legal initiative taken to grant victims of trafficking a legal and protected status. Hence, if encountered victims qualify as trafficking victims they can apply for a so called T visa and will then be entitled to housing or shelter, food, income, employment, English language training, health care and witness protection. The T visa is valid for three years and the victim can then receive a permanent residency status. Clearly, this corresponds directly with what the theoretical model of this thesis advocates as good counter trafficking policy.

However, once again I can only conclude that it is too soon to see the effect of these policies on the behaviour of the trafficking organisations.

By analysing the laws, programmes and policies that address the demand for commercialised sex I have come to the following conclusion:

The *Swedish Violence Against Women Government Bill*, has indeed proven to have a restrictive effect on the number of sex buying men as well as on the actions of the trafficking organisations. Hence, the prohibition of the purchase of sexual services has made it more difficult to attract customers and has also increased the cost of running businesses of commercialised sex in Sweden. This have made trafficking organisations to target other non-prohibiting countries instead, which clearly indicates the need of an harmonized legislation in the region. This development stands in stark contrast to the development in countries that have chosen to legalise their prostitution. Clearly, these countries have seen an significant increase of their legal and illegal sex industries and have also been more targeted by trafficking organisations.

From an economic perspective, one possible explanation for this development could be that the price elasticity of demand for prostitution is elastic and that legalisation increases the competition on the market for prostitution and therefore lowers the prices. Hence, an elastic demand would in this case render in an increased demand for prostitution larger than is given by the relative reduction in price and therefore bring about an expansion of the sex industry. Further, following the same reasoning as in the case of Sweden, legalising prostitution will make the market for prostitution more profitable by lower the cost associated with running the businesses providing prostitution and make it more easy to advertise and attract customers. However, the available evidence do not suffice at present to verify these hypotheses.

Nevertheless I believe it is safe to conclude that laws, policies and initiatives that serve to reduce men's use of women and children in prostitution indeed restrict the actions of the trafficking organisations.

#### **4.8.5 Some personal critical reflections and suggestions of future research**

Clearly, there are conventions, legislation and practices in place that grants victims of trafficking and sexual exploitation assistance, protection, a legal status and in some cases even the possibility to legally work in the receiving country into which they have been trafficked. These are all much welcomed initiatives that can serve to make it harder for the trafficking organisations to exploit the illegal status of the trafficking victims and maintain the system of debt-financed migration and debt-bounded sexual exploitation.

However, it is my strongest belief that this desirable outcome will not be a reality if not the responsible parties manage to deliver the information of the more lenient deportation policies and the right to protection and assistance to the victims themselves. Hence, in order for the policies described above to result in the outcome described by the theoretical model of this thesis, the women and the girls subject to the sexual exploitation must somehow be informed about their rights in order to encourage them to deflect from their exploitive working conditions and reveal their existence to the authorities. This is a condition that the creators of the model used in this thesis have foreseen. Evidently, several possibilities are available such as information campaigns targeting women and girls at risk in the sending countries, such campaigns are already undertaken with the purpose of warning potential victims of the risk of trafficking. These campaigns could easily be extended also to include information on how to deflect from traffickers and brothel owners and seek help from the authorities. Further, posters could be put up and information brochures be handed out at checkpoints, border crossings, airports, train stations and in areas where commercial sex usually takes place. These are all practices that to some extent are already in place, but could indeed easily be extended and more supported. Finally, some sending countries have used the media to reach out to potential victims of trafficking, once again this is a practice that can be used also in the receiving countries to reach out to already trafficked and exploited victims. The best practise has yet to be determined and I would like to suggest future research to cover this question.

Further, it could also be stated that more lenient deportation policies can lead to that the trafficking organisations and brothel owners keep stricter control of their victims and therefore even worsen the situation for and exploitation of the victims. Once again I can only conclude that it is too soon to see the effect of these policies and I therefore suggest future research to return to this question.

Finally, the effect of legalisation of prostitution on the economic conditions of the market for prostitution arises many questions that need to be answered. For example, does legalisation increase the competition and lower the prices? If so, does this lead to fewer but larger and better organised actors or to smaller and perhaps more specialised actors?

It is therefore my conclusion and over all belief that research on trafficking and prostitution in the future also must be undertaken from an economic perspective if we truly are to be able to reveal all the mechanisms leading to trafficking in women and children and be able to find efficient counter trafficking measures.

I would finally like to thank the reader for showing an interest in my analysis and I hope you have enjoyed reading my thesis.

# References

## Books:

- Barry (1979) *Female Sexual Slavery*, New York: Routledge
- Chin, Ko-lin (1999), *Smuggled Chinese*, Temple University Press, Philadelphia.
- Davies (1994), *Migrant Smuggling and Trafficking in Persons*, New York Oxford University Press
- Enloe (1990) *Bananas, Beaches and Bases: Making Feminist Sense of International Politics*, Berkeley, University of California Press.
- Enloe (1990) *Bananas, Bases and Patriarchy* in “*Women, Militarism, and War: Essays in History, Politics, and Social Theory*” eds. Jean Bethke Elshtain and Sheila Tobias, Totowa, N.J Rowman and Littlefield.
- Enloe (1998) *Beyond Rambo: Women and the Varieties of Militarised Masculinity in Women and the Military System*, ed. Eva Isaksson, New York, St Martin’s Press.
- Enloe (1983) *Does Khaki Become You? The Militarisation of Women’s Lives*, Boston, South End Press.
- Enloe (1991) *A Feminist Perspective on Foreign Military Bases* in *The Sun Never Sets: Confronting the Network of Foreign U.S. military Bases*, eds. Joseph Gerson and Bruce Birchard, Boston, South End Press.
- Enloe (1993) *The Morning After: Sexual Politics at the End of the Cold War*, Berkeley, University of California Press.
- Enloe (1992) *It Takes Two* in “*Let the God Times Roll: The Sale of Women’s Sexual Labour Around U.S. Bases in the Philippines, Okinawa and the southern part of Korea*”, eds. Strudevant and Stoltzfus, New York, New York Press.
- Finkenauer, J. O. (2001) *Russian Transnational Organized Crime and Human Trafficking*, in Kyle, D. and Koslowski, R. (eds.) (2001) *Global Human Smuggling: contemporary perspectives*, Baltimore: The Johns Hopkins University Press
- Kyle, D. and Koslowski, R. (eds.) (2001) *Global Human Smuggling: contemporary perspectives*, Baltimore: The Johns Hopkins University Press
- Moon (1997) *Sex Among Allies: Military Prostitution in U.S.-Korea Relations*, New York, Columbia University Press.
- World Bank (2001) *Engendering Development*, New York, Oxford University Press.

## Articles:

- Altink (1993) *Stolen Lives. Trading Women into Sex and Slavery*. London: Scarlet Press.
- Biemann, U. (2002), *Remotely sensed: a topography of the global sex trade*, Feminist review 70/2002.
- Amnesty International (2004) *Kosovo: Facts and figures on trafficking of women and girls for forced prostitution in Kosovo*.
- Anderson. B and Davidson. J (2002) *Trafficking –a demand led problem? A multi-country study*.
- Apap. J, Cullen. P and Medved. F (2002), *Counteracting Human Trafficking: Protection the Victims of Trafficking*,

Bertone, A. M. (2000) *Sexual Trafficking in Women: International Political Economy and the Politics of Sex*, Gender Issues 18, 1 (2000).

Becker, G. S. (1968) *Crime and Punishment: An Economic Approach*, 3 (1968) Journal of Political Economy.

Bjorling, S. (2001) *Gatuprostitutionen minskar I Stockholm*, Dagens Nyheter 010216

Corrin, C. (2000) *Local Particularities- International Generalities: Traffic in Women in Central and South Eastern Europe*.

Daley, S. (2001) *New Rights for Dutch Prostitutes, but No Gain*. New York Times, August 12/2001.

Ekberg, G. (2004) *The Swedish Law That Prohibits the Purchase of Sexual Services, Best Practices for Prevention of Prostitution and Trafficking in Human Beings*, Violence Against Women, Vol. 10, No. 10, October 2004.

Ethnic and Racial Studies (March 1998) *Masculinity and Nationalism: gender and Sexuality in the Making of Nations*.

Friebel, G. and Guriev, S. (2002) *Human Trafficking and Illegal Migration*.

Gijsberst van Liemt (2003) *Human Trafficking in Europe: an Economic Perspective*.

Global Survival Network (1997) *Crime and Servitude: An Expose in the Traffic in Women for Prostitution from the Newly Independent States*.

Gustafsson (2003) *Economic theory and organised crime, a study of trafficking in women for the purpose of sexual exploitation*, Bachelor Thesis, University of Lund, Department of Economics.

Graycar, A. (1999) *Trafficking in Human beings*.

Gender Issues, January 1, 2000, *Sexual Trafficking in Women: International Political Economy and the Politics of Sex*.

Human Rights Watch (2002) *Hopes Betrayed: Trafficking of Women and Girls to Post-Conflict Bosnia and Herzegovina for Forces Prostitution*.

Hughes, Donna M, Chon Katherine Y and Ellerman Derek P (forthcoming), *Modern-Day Comfort Women: The U.S. Military, Transnational Crime, and the Trafficking of Women*.

Hughes, D. M.

-(1996) *Sex tours via the Internet*. In Agenda: A Journal about Women and Gender.No 28

-(2002) *The Use of New Communications and Information Technologies for Sexual Exploitation of Women and Children*, Hastings Women's Law Journal Vol 13:1 (2002).

-*The Sex industry and Internet Industry: Partners in the Globalizing of Sexual Exploitation*



-(2002a) *Trafficking for Sexual Exploitation: The Case of the Russian Federation*

Heckmann, F. (2003) *Methodological Problems in the Study of Illegal Migration*.

International Organisation for Migration

- *Trafficking in Migrants Bulletin*, N 28 December 2003.

-(2003) *Is Trafficking in Human Beings Demand Driven? A Multi-Country Pilot Study*, IOM Migration Research Series No. 15

-(Nov 2002) *Journeys of Jeopardy: A Review of Research on Trafficking in Women and Children in Europe*, IOM Migration Research Series no. 11

- (2002) *Return and Reintegration Project, Situation Report-February 2000 to September 2002*, IOM Kosovo.

-(1995) *Trafficking and Prostitution: The Growing Exploitation of Migrant Women from Central and Eastern Europe*, Migration Information Programme.

-(1998) International Organization for Migration, *Information Campaign Against Trafficking in Women from Ukraine-Research Report*, IOM Geneva Switzerland.

International Labour Organisation (2000) *Trafficking in children and women: A regional overview*.

Inter-Agency Standing Committee (2002) *Task-force on protection from sexual exploitation and abuse in humanitarian crises. Plan of Action*.

Journal of International Affairs, Spring 2000, *The Natasha Trade: The Transnational Shadow Market of Trafficking in Women*.

Long, L. D. (2004) *Anthropological perspectives on trafficking of women for sexual exploitation*, International Migration 42 (1) 2004.

Levchenko, K. (1999) *Combat of Trafficking in Women and Forced Prostitution-Ukraine-Country Report*, Ludwig Boltzmann Institute of Human Rights, Vienna

Laczko, F. and Gramegna, M. A. (2003) *Developing Better Indicators of Human Trafficking*, Brown Journal of World Affairs

Miko, F.T. (2004) *Trafficking in Women and Children: The U.S. and International Response*, Congressional Research Service Report for Congress.

Mameli, P. A. (2002), *Stopping the Illegal trafficking of human beings: How transnational police work can stem the flow of forced prostitution*, Crime, Law and Social Change, 38 (1) 2002, Kluwer Academic Publishers, The Netherlands.

Monzini, P. (2001) *Trafficking in Women and Girls and the Involvement of Organised Crime, with reference to the situation in Central and Eastern Europe*.

McInerney, T. (2000) *People smuggling- an inhuman trade*.

National Criminal Investigation Department (2004) *Trafficking in human beings for sexual purposes: Situation report No. 6, January 1-December 31, 2003*, Stockholm.

- O'Neill Richard, Amy (1999) *International Trafficking in Women to the United States: A Contemporary Manifestation of Slavery and Organized Crime*, Center for the Study of Intelligence.
- Pettman, J. J. (1997) *Body politics: International Sex Tourism*, *Third World Quarterly* 18 (1) 1997.
- Raymond, J. G. (2004) *Prostitution on Demand, Legalizing the Buyers as Sexual consumers*, *Violence Against Women*, Vol. 10, No. 10, October 2004.
- Raymond, J. G. (2002) *The New UN Trafficking Protocol*, *Women's Studies International Forum*, Vol. 25, No 5, Elsevier Science Ltd, USA.
- Raymond, J. G., Hughes, D.M. and Gomez, C. J. (2001) *Sex Trafficking of Women in the United States, International and Domestic Trends, Coalition Against Trafficking in Women*.
- Ruggiero, V. (1997) *Trafficking in Human Beings: Slaves in Contemporary Europe*, *International Journal of the Sociology of Law* 25/1997.
- Sullivan, M. and Jeffrey, S. (2001) *Legalising prostitution is not the Answer: The example of Victoria, Australia*, *Coalition Against Trafficking in Women (Australia)*.
- Stoecker, S. W. (2000) *The Rise in Human Trafficking and the Role of Organized Crime*.
- Sipaviciene, A. (2002) *Du kommer att säljas som en docka*, *NIKK magasin* 1/2002.
- Salt, J. (2000) *Trafficking and Human Smuggling: A European Perspective*, *International Migration*, Special Issue 2000/1, ISSN 0020-7985.
- Smith, L. and Mattar, M. (2004) *Creating International Consensus on Combating Trafficking in Persons: U.S. Policy, the Role of the UN, and Global Responses and Challenges*.
- Schloenhardt, A.
- (1999) *Organised Crime and The Business of Migrant Trafficking*,
  - (2001) *Trafficking in Migrants: Illegal Migration and Organized Crime in Australia and the Asia Pacific Region*, *International Journal of the Sociology of Law* 29/2001.
  - (2003) *Migrant Smuggling: illegal Migration and Organized Crime in Australia and the Asia Pacific Region*. The Hague/New York: Kluwer Law International.
- Swedish Ministry of Foreign Affairs, Department for Asia and the Pacific (2001) *Trafficking in Women and Children in Asia and Europe, A background presentation of the problems involved and the initiatives taken*. XBS Grafisk service.
- Swedish Department for Global Development (2003), *Poverty and Trafficking in Human Beings: A strategy for combating trafficking in human beings through Swedish international development cooperation*. Edita Västra Aros, Sweden.
- Salt, J. and Stein, J. (1997) *Migration as a Business: The Case of Trafficking*, *International Migration* Vol. 35 (4) 1997, Blackwell publishers Ltd, Oxford, UK.

- Skeldon, R. (2000) *Trafficking: perspective from Asia*, International Migration 32/2000.
- Secretariat of the Budapest Group (1999) *The Relationship between Organised Crime and the Trafficking in Aliens*.
- Taylor, I. and Jamieson, R. (1999) *Sex trafficking and the mainstream of market culture*, Crime, Law and Social Change 32/1999, Kluwer Academic Publishers, the Netherlands.
- Tiggeloven, C. (2001) *Child Prostitution in the Netherlands*.
- Third World Quarterly (March 1997) *Body Politics: International Sex Tourism*.
- The Foundation of Women's Forum (1998) *Trafficking in Women for the Purpose of Sexual Exploitation, Mapping the Situation and Existing Organisations Working in Belarus, Russia, the Baltic and the Nordic States*.
- The Foundation of Women's Forum (1999) *Crossing Borders Against Trafficking in Women and Girls*.
- United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime (2004) *Global Programme against trafficking in human Beings*, UNODC, New York Office.
- United Nations Office For Drug Control and Crime Prevention (1999) *Global Programme against trafficking in human Beings-An outline for action-*.
- UNICEF (2002) *Trafficking in Human Beings in Southeastern Europe*.
- Weldes, J. (2004) *Gender and Global Policing: Neoliberal Globalizing and the Transnational Sex Industry*.
- Conventions, legal documents and communications:
- The United Nations Convention Against Transnational Crime (2000)
- The Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons, Especially Women and Children (2000)
- The Protocol Against the Smuggling of Migrants by Land, Sea and Air (2000)
- The Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women (1979)
- The Convention for the Suppression of the Traffic in Persons and of the Exploitation of the Prostitution of Others (1949)
- The International Slavery Convention of 1926 (1926)
- Communication from the Commission to the Council and the European Parliament on Trafficking in women for the purpose of sexual exploitation, COM (96) 567 final, 20.11.1996
- The Trafficking Victims Protection Act (2000)