

LUND UNIVERSITY
MASTER OF SCIENCE IN DEVELOPMENT STUDIES
DEPARTMENT OF SOCIOLOGY



'THE APPLE MUST FALL FAR FROM THE TREE'

**A CASE STUDY OF AN EDUCATIONAL SCHOOL INTERVENTION IN LYARI:
AN URBAN SLUM IN PAKISTAN**

Author: Uzma Osman Bucha

Master's Thesis: SIMV98, 15 hp

Spring 2014

Supervisor: Abdulhadi Khalaf

ABSTRACT

Author: Uzma Osman Bucha

Title: 'The Apple Must Fall Far From the Tree'. A Case Study of an Educational School Intervention in Lyari: An Urban Slum in Pakistan

SIMMV98: Master Thesis in Development Studies, 15 credits

Supervisor: Abdulhadi Khalaf

Department of Sociology

Spring term 2014

Partly attributed to the distinguishing effects of poverty on education and effects of education on poverty, the poverty and education nexus is complex. Since poverty is a multidimensional phenomenon deprivation in education, especially in urban slums, is not caused by one factor alone, but is rather stitched to various other related factors such as family structure, a high conflict neighbourhood and quality of school. This thesis aims to study the Kiran School system as a context sensitive educational intervention that is interacting with the urban social context of Lyari, a slum and an area infamous for gang violence in the city of Karachi in Pakistan, in an effort to adapt to and change the social environment in which it is being implemented. This is achieved by conducting qualitative semi-structured life history interviews of mothers, teachers and few members of the school staff who are all locals of the Lyari community for a thick intensive analysis using theoretical concepts of habitus, doxa, institutions, social capital, nepantla and agency and empowerment. As a result, this thesis argues that social relations and networks that disadvantaged people engage with and relate to in their daily lives and mobilize in times of crises, reproduce inertial institutions. This inertia is perpetuated by: the family through patriarchy and intergenerational contract, the local schools by disseminating poor quality education and a violent/crime afflicted neighbourhood structured through patron-client relationships. Institutions come under stress only when a broker enters into this domain with an educational school intervention that challenges individuals to question taken for granted world views through bridging social capital that provides new forms of institutional fall back. This allows them to take greater control of their lives and has greater potential to transform existing institutions for social change amidst the urban social disadvantage.

Key words: inertial institutions, bridging social capital, intergenerational contract, patron-client relationships, broker

ABBREVIATIONS

(CCT) -Conditional Cash Transfers

(EFA) -Education for All

(ILO)-International Labour Organization

(MDG)-Millennium Development Goals

(MQM)-Mutahhida Qaumi Movement

(NGO)-Non Governmental Organizations

(OOSC)- Out-of-school children

(PAC)-Peoples' Aman Committee

(PFSSP)- Pakistan's The Punjab Female School Stipend Program

(PPP)-Pakistan Peoples' Party

(PRSP) -Poverty Reduction Strategy Papers

(UNESCO)-United Nations Educational, Science and Cultural Organization

(UNICEF)-United Nations International Children Emergency Fund

(UPE) -Universal Primary Education

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This thesis would be impossible without valuable contributions of many people who have over the course of my educational experience at Lund provided me with immense support. It would also not have been possible without cooperation from Sabina Khatri, the entrepreneur running the Kiran School in Karachi and all the parents who trusted me with their life stories.

I would like to extend my utmost gratitude to my supervisor Abdulhadi Khalaf who has been most kind and gracious in providing me with last minute support upon my arrival in Sweden. Without his patience and his supervisory craft in pushing me forward despite a very short deadline, this task would never have reached its completion.

I owe special gratitude to my friends Maria Waleed, Waleed Safdar, Jawairia Atta, Imad Din, Noreen Ara, and Farhan Malik for going out of their way to make my stay and my writing experience in Sweden as comfortable, trouble-free, and as inspiring as possible.

I would like to thank Jan Schulze for his help with the title page and Samira Elmi for proof reading my drafts and for her constant emotional and intellectual support in this endeavour.

I would also like to thank Osman Bucha, Aimen Bucha, Shaheryar Kazi, Shan Aman Rana, Saman Aziz, Natalie Hall Marcos, Tanja Dittfeld, and Sonia Johar for being a phone call and a message away- and for their continuous moral support.

This thesis would not be possible without the academic guidance of Britt Marie Rönn who has been a mentor and a guardian angel throughout my time at Lund University. In the same vein, I would like to thank Jeanette Nordström and Lina Mann for their administrative support.

Since I am a director's actor, without inspiration from lecturers like Olle Frödin, Lisa Eklund, Johan Sandberg, Abdulhadi Khalaf and Eda Forsakoglu, who not only brought their knowledge but their passion to class, I would never have been the student I became. The kind of insights I have gained from their wisdom is a gift I will cherish for years to come. If there is any value derived from this humble attempt at writing a thesis, I owe it to them.

I would lastly like to thank my family for bearing with me, especially my two daughters, Adeena and Khadeejah, for always believing in me and for being strong in my absence.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

1. INTRODUCTION	7
1.1. THE KIRAN SCHOOL	7
1.2. PURPOSE AND RESEARCH QUESTION	9
1.3. DELIMITATIONS	9
1.4. DISPOSITION	10
2. PREVIOUS RESEARCH	10
3. RESEARCH METHODS	12
3.1. RESEARCH DESIGN	12
3.2. DATA COLLECTION PROCESS	13
3.2.1. SEMI STRUCTRED INTERVIEWS	13
3.2.2. SAMPLE	14
3.2.3. ANALYZING INTERVIEW MATERIAL	15
3.3. POSITION	16
3.4. ETHICAL CONSIDERATIONS	16
4. THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK	17
4.1. POVERTY	17
4.2. SOCIALIZATION AS REPRODUCTION OF INTERTIATIC INSTITUTIONS	18
4.3. INSTITUTIONS	19
4.4. SOCIAL CAPITAL AND INSTITUTIONAL CHANGE	20
4.5. AGENCY AND EMPOWERMENT	21
5. BACKGROUND: PAKISTAN	22
5.1. A FRAGILE STATE	22
5.2. FRAGMENTED EDUCATION SYSTEM	23
5.3. URBAN KARACHI	24
5.3.1. VIOLENCE	24
5.3.2. URBAN SLUM: LYARI	24

6. ANALYSIS	25
6.1. INSTITUTIONAL INERTIA: THE SOCIAL ENVIRONMENT	25
6.1.1. FAMILY 'IS ABOUT LIFE FOR OTHERS'	25
6.1.2. SCHOOL 'DOES NOT HELP'	31
6.1.3. NEIGHBOURHOOD 'IS A DOWNWARD SPIRAL'	32
SUMMARY OF INSTITUTIONAL INERTIA	33
6.2. INSTITUTIONAL STRESS: NEPANTLA	34
6.2.1. FAMILY 'IS A LIFE FOR MYSELF'	35
6.2.2. SCHOOL 'CHANGES LIVES'	37
6.2.3. NEIGHBOURHOOD 'AS WE SOW SO SHALL WE REAP'	40
7. CONCLUSION: WE NEED A SCATTER GUN NOT A MAGIC BULLET	42
REFERENCES	45
APPENDIX I: INTERVIEW GUIDE	52
APPENDIX II: DETAILS ABOUT THE INTERVIEWEES	53

1. INTRODUCTION

In 2011, I heard about a school that was operating in Lyari, a slum¹ and an area infamous for gang violence in Karachi. It was being run by Sabina Khatri, an educational entrepreneur, and had been operational for four years. Despite several attempts on her life, she silently continued running the school. I was in the process of moving countries at that time, but I distinctly remember thinking, *'How can something like this work? Lyari is a no-go zone, there are reports of gang violence every day, that section is cordoned off, what is the possibility of running a school in such an area?'* When I interviewed Sabina first on a telephone, she laughed at my questions and said *'Lyari was a beautiful accident, I went out to change their world, they ended up changing mine'*. She decried a need to understand why violence exists in the first place, and why it becomes more sensational when linked to the socially marginalized. It made me think, there are so many myths about socially excluded and impoverished neighbourhoods that in the general scheme of things, we sometimes seem to forget to report how people actually live their 'normal' everyday lives navigating tough terrains in conflict zones. The struggles of individuals and families surviving under multiple disadvantages and limited opportunity arrangements in conditions such as those stipulated above, consequently garners the importance of generating contextualized knowledge aimed at making education effective in insecure informal urban communities for positive social change. In 2007, Sabina Khatri started the venture, 'The Kiran School'. According to Khatri, underprivileged toddlers are admitted to the preschool with the ambition described as under:

'There is a world outside Lyari that these children deserve to know about and see. My aim is to groom these kids (and their families) so that they get a chance to study and survive in prestigious private schools outside of this neighbourhood. Also, equally importantly, they are trained to be courageous and resilient in the face of the social conditions they live in, to take ownership of their lives and take on the responsibility of changing their community. (Khatri, 2014)

This thesis is a case study of The Kiran School as a context-sensitive informal educational intervention that is interacting with the urban social context of Lyari, in an effort to adapt to and change the social environment in which it is being implemented. In the following section a more detailed account of the school is presented before I introduce the purpose and the research question.

1.1. THE KIRAN SCHOOL

During the day, amidst heavy traffic, barking dogs, braying donkeys, street vendors yelling at the top of their lungs; laughing children walk to their school along a colourfully painted street in Lyari.

¹ Drawn from the Millennium Development Goals, Mugisha (2006) used a version of the United Nation's definition of slums. That is, to be considered a slum an urban resident must meet at least one of the following five criteria: lack of access to improved water, lack of access to improved sanitation, nondurable building materials, overcrowding of a residence, and insecurity of tenure.

These children, coming from diverse ethnic backgrounds, carry fluent conversations in English; have mashed potatoes for lunch and romp-about in an indoor playground. This is the atmosphere at the Kiran school, that not only engages the enrolled population of 100 children², but also adopts the entire set of families' to ensure that it is not only the children but their parents³ too who are involved in the process of changing mind-sets. Engaging the parents builds a conducive environment at home that matches with the school environment to create stability in the lives of these children. The children are inducted in this program only if one of the family members is gainfully employed. The parents are charged a nominal fee for attending the school. The school runs on an urban upper and middle class curriculum such that the graduates are able to later enmesh in prestigious schools funded by the entrepreneur's own private network of donors, thereby breaking barriers to educational segregation. Moreover, some families have also been helped to move into middle class neighbourhoods to break residential segregation barriers. Parents of these children, both mothers and fathers, are also groomed and taught English language, as an attempt to incorporate their mentorship in the lives of their children. Opportunities for gainful employment are provided in two ways: first by creating a cottage industry in the Lyari area- funded by donors- whose products are sold nationally and internationally through exhibitions and the returns are distributed equally amongst participating families. Second, by connecting the families to Khatri's personal networks for employment, as well as linking various Non-Governmental Organizations (NGO's) that are engaged in providing micro-credit and vocational training skills to people in underprivileged communities. According to Khatri, the Kiran School System works on a principle of participation from the community. All staff members; teachers, cleaners, van drivers, kitchen help and school managers; are hired locally to foster legitimacy of operations through ownership of community. This can preserve and self-perpetuate the institution in years to come. It is thus, a bottom-up, locally grounded school intervention that is keen on listening to the voices of its beneficiaries and is flexible to change according to their needs. The recipients are not benign beneficiaries, they are co-responsible for their own futures, and are encouraged to demand an education they think they need to make positive changes in their lives, such that it can be duly supplied. This school intervention assumes that alleviating the transmission of social disadvantage is not possible just by means of improving school enrolment and literacy. Rather it is assumed that increased educational, sociocultural and

² Currently, 25 pre-schoolers are enrolled at the Kiran School, the rest of the 85 students have graduated into private schools of good social standing outside Lyari. For details of the list of schools, see Ali, Rabia (2011) 'Kiran School Gives Children of Lyari a Chance to Advance' <http://tribune.com.pk/story/312466/for-a-better-future-kiran-school-gives-children-of-lyari-a-chance-to-advance/> retrieved on August 10, 2014.

³The target family is mostly a young couple with a first born. The idea is that young couples are more adaptable and are most likely to change life patterns for their new-borns. The timing is considered very important because the subsequent siblings will then be socialized more easily since they will have a role model.

psychological support to each member of the household could enhance chances of upward social mobility in a holistic manner for families suffering from poverty. The school intervention attempts to remain deeply embedded in the social context to constantly evolve and adapt to local needs and demands- both to allow the beneficiaries to escape from the social milieu that is keeping them trapped in the poverty cycle and to foster transformative changes within the community through empowerment and positive agentic action.

1.2. PURPOSE AND RESEARCH QUESTION

This thesis aims to study the Kiran School system as a context-sensitive informal educational intervention that is interacting with the urban social context of Lyari, in an effort to adapt to and change the social environment in which it is being implemented. It is an effort to bring social change by addressing the menace of poverty through a holistic education system that aims to empower both pupils and their families (empowering in the sense of questioning taken for granted understandings of social relations and in achieving greater control of their lives). The argument is that through a focus on social relations and networks that disadvantaged people engage with and relate to in their daily lives and mobilize in times of crises are crucial in determining individual and household well-being. This view is taken as a critical extension to the simplistic stance that disadvantage can be resolved through higher levels of income and ownership of tangible assets. Through this exploratory qualitative research, the general aim is to answer the question: *How can educational interventions alleviate the condition of poverty in an urban slum area of Pakistan?* The specific aim of this thesis is to evaluate the case of the educational intervention and bring to the fore the ideology behind its promulgation, the directive of implementation in urban context, and the changes that were brought about as a result of its implementation. Thus the voices of the beneficiaries will be incorporated to answer the following questions:

- 1. How did the educational intervention adapt to local institutional circumstances of the informal urban slum in Lyari?*
- 2. How, according to the beneficiaries, did the intervention affect the way they negotiated with their relational setting to bring changes in their lives?*

1.3. DELIMITATIONS

This study is delimited to the case of The Kiran School located in an urban slum called Lyari in Karachi, Pakistan. Semi-structured interviews will be conducted only with the mothers of the alumni of the Kiran School. Definition of poverty will be delimited to the voices of the interviewees who described their 'condition' as one of helplessness, disenfranchisement, having limited control of their lives and the inability to make informed choices due to lack of material and social resources. This

definition will be related to the wider epistemic discourse on poverty when discussing the theoretical framework. The institutions that will be studied include the school, family and neighbourhood. Within these institutions, only those factors will be highlighted that have a discernible impact on educational attainment. This research does not intend to directly link the outcomes of the studied efforts towards poverty alleviation. The general aim of this research is delimited only to highlight the connections between the ‘condition’ of poverty as described above, its reproduction through institutions, and its interaction with the school intervention and educational attainment.

1.4. DISPOSITION

In the next section, research in the field of education with its link to poverty and the influence of socially excluded and deprived urban areas, will be brought to the fore to provide a better understanding of the complexity of such a marriage between multidimensional factors affecting dissemination of education in situations requiring context sensitivity. The third section will discuss research methodology and the process of data collection and analysis. The fourth section will elaborate on the theoretical framework for the thesis, outlining key concepts of habitus and doxa, social capital and agency and empowerment. A detailed account of the Pakistani context will ensue in section five. In the sixth section, the theoretical framework will be employed to carry out the analysis. The last section will follow with a brief discussion of the findings thereby rounding up the thesis with concluding remarks.

2. PREVIOUS RESEARCH

Research in Pakistan on the link between poverty and education in slum areas is limited to a handful of studies. Partly attributed to the distinguishing effects of poverty on education and effects of education on poverty, the poverty and education nexus is complex. Moreover much research shows that deprivation in education is not caused by poverty alone but by other related factors such as gender, labour market, quality of learning and school facilities (see Dyer and Rose 2006; Banerjee and Duflo, 2011). In Pakistan, a study by Jamal (2005) showed that in urban areas the education of the head of the household is negatively related with poverty. Haq (2005) contends that the role of education is important in the labour market as those with higher education are more likely to get employment and have higher wages. This is further elaborated by Kurosaki and Khan (2006) whose findings reveal that wages and productivity in non-farm activities in Pakistan rise with education at an increasing rate as education rises. Studying urban poverty in Sargodha, Awan et al., (2010) advocated the need to focus on quality education to promote community development which could eventually enhance the control that poor people and their communities have over the services to

which they are entitled; provision of micro finance programmes, public works programmes and food transfer programmes to mitigate risk and enhance resilience of urban poor, and the need augment their social capital by assisting networks to engage with market and nonmarket institutions to strengthen their influence over policy. A survey in India revealed only over half of slum children are enrolled in schools with a high drop-out rate. A barrier to the demand side is that there is 'lateness' in getting to school because of the rural-urban migration and on the supply side there is lack of school capacity and requirement of documentation that keeps children out of school. Parents prefer free government schools over low-fee paying schools (Tsujita, 2009). In the same vein Lewis (2009), when taking into account family and background characteristics in Indian slums, found that parental perception of education, deficit in education and opportunity costs due to child labour were major constraints in retaining students in schools. In Bangladesh, a large proportion of children are 'silently excluded' from education, meaning that they attend infrequently, repeat years of schooling and have poor achievement in urban slums of Dhaka (Cameron, 2010). Upon completion of primary education, very few children from these slums make the transition to secondary schooling. Child labour, child marriages and cost of schools are major reasons for slum children not attending school (ibid.). In Brazil's favelas (shanty-towns) an impediment to education is the safety of the children going to school. Criminal activities' and shoot-outs have killed both students and their parents who have been on their way to pick up children. Teachers are hard to employ and retain under these circumstances (Voltolini, 2013). Commissioned by the International Labour Organization (ILO), a study of working-class youth in Rio de Janeiro's favelas found that educational attainment for low-income youth, both male and female, does not provide the same returns in terms of gains as it does for middle-income youth (Grieg, 2009).

The academic literature on American poverty has experienced a surge in the study of neighbourhood effects (Wilson 1987; Sampson, Morenoff, and Gannon-Rowley 2002; Durlauf, 2003) arguing that the residential concentration of poverty isolates the poor from the non-poor. It also isolates the corresponding resources i.e. networks, and role models, leading to the development of a different set of norms and beliefs in poor neighbourhoods and their ensuing negative outcomes. Various other researchers argue, specifically with regards to education, that high poverty neighbourhoods are related to lower education attainment or higher rates of dropping out (Ainsworth 2002; Small and Newman 2001). The literature on the developing world has yet to focus on any local contextual factors such as neighbourhoods in studies of poverty (Montgomery et al. 2003).

Conditional cash transfer (CCT) programmes targeted to poor households are rapidly becoming a key policy instrument used by developing countries to reduce poverty and increase human capital investments (Janvry and Sadoulet, 2006). Pakistan's Punjab Female School Stipend

Program (PFSSP), was such a part of a strategy to close a gender gap in education by making cash transfers to parents to decrease opportunity cost in sending girls to school. Results show that there is increased female enrolment, a delay in marriages, a possible long term effect positive on fertility decisions and increased labour market participation as an indirect positive impact on poverty (Chaudry and Parajuli, 2010). The Education Voucher Scheme launched by the Punjab Education Foundation in 2006 provides free education to eligible students from slum areas at primary and lower secondary levels (Salman 2010). Education vouchers ensure equality of opportunity in terms of access and also provide incentives for small private schools to increase enrolment and quality. The impact evaluation shows that there is an increase in access and positive educational performance, though the link to poverty reduction is missing (ibid). A report on the CCT's (Fizbein and Schady, 2009) concludes that though school enrolments increase, impact of cash transfer programs and its effect on poverty are mixed. Evidence also indicates that these programs suffer from an urban bias, and when implemented in the urban areas, they do not work as efficiently as in the rural areas (Bouillon and Tejerina, 2007).

There is paucity in literature on the status of poverty and its link to education in urban slums of Pakistan (and more specifically Karachi). This case study aims to add local insights to the existing American literature on neighbourhood effects and to the epistemic discourse on multidimensional nature of poverty and deprivation. It also hopes to fill a gap in this under researched area through qualitative inquisitions to uncover what role education serves and how its dissemination is affected by the social institutional environment to which the socially marginalized and excluded urban slum dwellers are exposed. This is the first research study of its kind, conducted in the urban slum environment of Lyari, in the city of Karachi, focusing on the connections between poverty, education and a socially marginalized neighbourhood in the country context of Pakistan.

3. RESEARCH METHODS

3.1. RESEARCH DESIGN

The economist Binayak Sen once summarized the complementarity of methods in this way: 'numbers give one a feeling of facts; qualitative stories give one a feeling of truth' (Adato et al. 2007). Vulnerability, powerlessness, social stigma, discrimination, subordination and exploitation are crucial aspects of poverty that cannot be quantitatively measured (Spicker, 2007). Why poverty persists and how people can be lifted from it are questions that dominate developmental thinking, but if based on non- biased income poverty as a concept, and poverty line measures as a tool, it comes with the cost of being brutally reductionist since depth and cultural context is missing (Chambers, 2007). The

qualitative approach to this study was informed by the belief that objects and meanings are products of our ideas and that reality is socially constructed. Qualitative assessments enrich analysis, as they provide an understanding of processes triggered by certain interventions. In this study, this stance helped the researcher look into the respondents daily lives and thus make sense of how the respondents behave and act within their context before and after the school intervention. This is an opportunity that quantitative approaches hardly allow for (Creswell 2009: 37). Case studies, present thick-detailed context-specific knowledge based on history and experience through closeness to real-life situations, defining types of a social phenomenon, and uncovering different social meanings (Flyvberg, 2006). It can be seen as an *intensive analysis* where the ‘quality of theoretical reasoning’ is more important than its ‘representativeness’ (ibid.). If conducted over time through panel studies, it can provide richer insights through comparisons, highlighting not only the changed situation of the panel but also pointing to wider structural changes within society (Lindberg, 2012). Moreover it has the power to unveil results that instead of verifying, falsify the researcher’s preconceived notions, and cause predictive theories and universals to crumble (Flyvbjerg, 2006). This study is a configurative idiographic case study that provides descriptions of the adaptation of children and their families to an educational intervention that has an indirect effect on poverty alleviation through social change. It provides an in-depth intensive analysis of the context of an urban slum called Lyari in the city of Karachi and it carves out a space for academic research that may have been overlooked. The findings from this study are hoped to be useful in subsequent studies for theory-building and generalizations (George and Bennett, 2005).

3.2. DATA COLLECTION PROCESS

3.2.1. SEMI STRUCTURED INTERVIEWS

In March 2014, over a period of five days, fifteen semi-structured interviews were conducted. The first three of these interviews were conducted at respondents’ homes, while the rest were conducted in the Kiran school premise in Lyari. Interviewees were asked for consent in writing in advance, and conversations were recorded only after permission was granted. Every interview was preceded with an explanation of the research project, and the interviewees were assured of anonymity. In this paper, to fulfil the requirement for anonymity, names have been contracted to aliases (May, 2011:62). Each interview was approximately 60 minutes and was conducted in Urdu language. Interviews were later translated by the researcher who has proficiency in both Urdu and English languages for analysis. Each interview was first transcribed into Urdu and subsequently into English by the researcher herself to avoid any loss of meaning in translation between the two languages. Since the goal of the study was to voice the experiences of the mothers of the alumni of the Kiran School, the interview

followed a life history approach and questions were open-ended. During the interviews the conversation was allowed to take its course. Additional questions were asked where deemed appropriate in order to keep the ease and flow of the conversation going. In some interviews, the researcher had to take on a stance of 'engagement' and responded to information offered. This was done keeping in mind that the interview, like any other social situation, is an encounter that is limited to time and to a particular space. It is also an encounter constructed between the interviewer and the interviewee where both have to develop intersubjective understandings and self-conscious awareness of each other and what is required from the social situation they are in (May, 2011:141). This problem was overcome through building a 'rapport' such that the balance of power lay with the interviewee rather than the researcher. This was a tactic employed using Ann Oakley's concept of 'dynamic' interviewing, to induce a climate of two people 'deep' in conversation, thus the researcher disengaged from the 'masculine paradigm', allowed the interviewees complete control of the conversation and participated herself in the interview when prompted by the interviewee (May, 2011:148). Ethno methodological approaches criticize interviews for lacking validity since the social researcher is creating a link between a person's account of an action and the action itself, and very little is known about the reality that is 'external' to the interview (May, 2011:157). It can be argued that all interpretations are observer dependent and are affected by the meanings assigned to social encounters by researchers and are consequently applicable to all research methods, not just interviews. Thus by being self-aware and reflexive in such encounters, it was possible to alleviate this limitation to some extent. Conducting the semi-structured interview was time-consuming, especially when the interviews were conducted in the interviewees' homes. Since the respondents lived in joint families, there were frequent interruptions and privacy was a major concern. The interviewer was a 'guest' and was thus treated with immense warmth, courtesy and hospitality that entailed offering snacks and tea. To refuse these offerings was to be rude. Hence, in lieu of time constraints, after the third interview, the venue of the interview was changed to the school premise. Though the life history interviews produced rich material derived from a small sample size, the depth of information obtained was difficult and time consuming to transcribe, translate and to organize into cogent and relevant categories for analysis for the researcher.

3.2.2. SAMPLE

A sample size of 15 families was chosen from a sampling frame of 85 families' (of graduate students). The sample was based on a school list from which the researcher picked every fifth student. The parents of the students were then contacted for their availability. Only the mothers were interviewed since most of them were housewives and were available during the day. Although this

thesis could have benefitted much from interaction with the fathers of the alumni, as they worked long hours, and returned very late in the evening, it was not possible to interview the couple together. Being a lone female researcher in a locality where shoot-outs between gangs are common after dark, it was a safety hazard to act on the above ambition, and the researcher is painfully aware of the deficit it may have caused to the study. The children were away in school when the interviews were conducted, so their voices are incorporated through the voices of their mothers. After the 12th interview saturation was reached, hence it was deemed appropriate to include one teacher, the school driver and the school manager in the research and they were subsequently interviewed for their experiences with the school. All interviewees were Lyari locals and had children at The Kiran School. The interview guide was used merely as a prompt. The socio-economic background was used to understand individual characteristics of households the income dimension of the poverty experienced—the other questions were used as prompts to understand capability deprivation in the non-income dimension i.e. access to resources, area deprivation, material, physical and psychological barriers to advance break out of their condition of disempowerment (See Appendix 1 for interview guide).

3.2.3. ANALYZING INTERVIEW MATERIAL

While transcribing interviews certain consistent patterns and major themes emerged. The themes were then classified into major categories. Classifications entail breaking down of material into smaller cogent units for ease of analysis (Dey, 1993:41-45). The respondents made the breaking down of interview material easy for the researcher by talking about how the school impacted their lives. They described their situation and their view of themselves in the social context they were in prior to the intervention and how the school intervention brought about a change in their lives after its implementation. This classified the material collection into two broad themes, one of institutional inertia (before the school intervention) and one of institutional stress and transformation (after the implementation of the school intervention) guided by the theoretical framework (De Vas, 2001:251). Subsequently, through the voices of the interviewees, three main sites of inertia and change i.e. family, neighbourhood and school were revealed. The quotes selected for analysis are of two types. The first type was common among the range of interview material transcribed. And the second type was ones that were uncommon. Most quotes fall in the former category. The researcher went into the field with a theory on inefficient institutions and agency and empowerment. Once the interview material was transcribed and themes began to emerge, these two theories could not fulfil the ambition of providing the lens through which the findings could be explained. Thus a multi-conceptual

theoretical framework had to be conceived in order to provide a robust frame within which justice could be rendered to a cogent analysis.

3.3. POSITION

Feminist anthropology, standpoint theory and other constructivist approaches to knowledge and research have in common the idea that our interpretations of data or events will always be influenced to some degree by our own positionality and frames of reference, and that we should be able to make our values and assumptions explicit and even inquire into them as part of the research process (Petti, 2006). “To leave out the self as observer is to deny the very lenses that we use to interpret and understand the world” (Petti, 2006:77). The researcher is aware of her position as a female student of a foreign university who is an outsider carrying academic values into the field. She is also an insider by virtue of being Pakistani, speaking Urdu, and a Karachiite. In order to conform to the social codes of the context in which the researcher was entering, the researcher contacted Khatri before her encounter with the interviewees, to understand the acceptable dress, speech and behavioural cues that may have an impact on the interaction between the researcher and the interviewees. The researcher established herself as a student, a married woman and a mother of two children, wore simple ethnic clothes, spoke only in Urdu language in an attempt to create an impression of being one of ‘them’. The interviewees, through their interactions with Khatri and her networks, have developed an awareness of how to engage with people from all backgrounds. They understood that they were in an interview situation but did not seem conscious or cautious of the researcher. They agreed to being recorded, after a preliminary introduction by the researcher, and began to tell their life stories without any hesitation. The researcher did not have to probe, prompt or direct the interview.

To enhance the understanding of qualitative poverty experiences from each interview subject, borrowing the term ‘intersectionality’ from the feminist epistemology, this study will throughout its course consider ‘the relationships among multiple dimensions and modalities of social relationships and subject formations’ (McDowell, 2008) such as race, ethnicity, gender, sexuality, age, and social class. This understanding improves the validity of this research whilst affecting the reliability and replicability negatively, a fact that the researcher is aware of.

3.4. ETHICAL CONSIDERATIONS

Throughout the interview process the researcher was reflexive and understood that interviews are self-reported accounts of one’s own understanding of oneself that may result in understating and overstating of facts. This possibility of a self-serving bias was taken into account and the researcher asked the same questions several times in different ways throughout the course of the interviews to cross check mismatching information. The researcher is aware and is cautious of these factors and

they have been taken into consideration to provide a balanced empirical account. Sabina Khatri, the entrepreneur running the school was introduced to the researcher through a personal contact. Khatri as the gate-keeper was the researcher's access to the research field. Given that Lyari is a high conflict zone, and newcomers into the community are viewed warily, it was important for Khatri that the researcher came through a trusted contact, because she considered herself responsible for the researcher's safety. It was for this reason only that the researcher used a personal contact to get to the gatekeeper. Once there, the interviewees were introduced to the researcher as someone legitimate, who was a student from a different city. Since they knew the researcher was writing for a University abroad, they were more trusting, and were keen on sharing their stories and actively described their lives and experiences in the school and the neighbourhood, so that their voices could be heard in a transnational space. The researcher was conscious that the interview subjects' accounts could be affected by an awareness of a relationship between the researcher and Khatri. The intent with which information was offered by the interviewees, could suffer in terms of reliability when undergoing interpretation.

4. THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK

This section will shed light on the main concepts that will combine to provide a framework against which the analysis of this case will be conducted. It will begin with a definition of poverty as inequality. And will subsequently incorporate concepts of *habitus*, *doxa*, *cultural* and *social capital* and how these concepts interact with *informal institutions* of the *family*, *school* and *neighbourhoods* in cultivating *agency* and *empowerment*.

4.1. POVERTY

According to Sen (1999) 'poverty' must be seen as the deprivation of basic capabilities rather than merely the lowness of incomes. Sen hypothesizes that all individuals are endowed with a certain set of capabilities. It is simply a matter of realizing these capabilities that will enable people to escape from poverty or from their state of 'un-freedom'. Freedom means having space to acquire capabilities and using them as one would want to. What people are "capable" of doing (achieving) is influenced by economic opportunities, political liberties and social powers; health conditions and education level; encouragement, motivation and initiatives (Sen 1999:87-91). The capability approach categorically recognizes that there will be variations among people in conversion of resources into functionings (taking part in community) and capabilities. These variations in conversion arise either due to personal or socio-environmental factors. In a similar vein the concept of poverty alleviation tethered to material and economic causation is challenged by Green and Hulme (2005:867) by

arguing that “it is not a state into which people fall from which they can be lifted if their incomes increase”. Rather, it is an ‘effect’ of ‘social relationships’ that are structurally produced through social class, dependency, social exclusion and lack of entitlement (Spicker, 2007:4-5).

Urban poverty is defined as a multidimensional phenomenon. It is generally associated with various deprivations which make the working, living and social environment of the poor extremely insecure (Odhiambo and Manda, 2003 cited in Mistruelli and Heffernan, 2012:12).

In the urban context, the experience of ‘urban poverty’ is highlighted as unique in several ways from its rural counterpart (UNESCO, 2007; Tsujita, 2009; Baker, 2008). Firstly, large city poverty is significantly worse due to crowding, pollution, violence, crime (De La Rocha, 2006). Welfare outcomes are poorer though standards of living may be higher than before (material possessions) but to make use of those possessions needs capabilities that create barriers to escaping poverty (Sen, 1999:88-89). Secondly, urban poor do not work in the formal labour market. Earnings in the urban informal sector have generally become increasingly low and irregular, as an increasing number of the urban poor have come to rely on this option (Zaidi, 2011; Awan et.al, 2010). Thirdly, urban areas are also characterized by a greater degree of commercialization than rural areas. Urban households require money in order to pay for housing, rent and to purchase basic necessities such as food, water and fuel. People without savings or salable capital assets are extremely vulnerable to changes in the demand for labour and the prices for basic goods (Tvedten and Nangulah, 1999). Fourthly, social diversity and fragmentation is typically also seen as a special aspect of urban poverty. Urban areas attract people with different ethnic, cultural and linguistic origins. Social diversity is likely to create new tensions and survival strategies. Lifestyles, kinship and neighbourhood support networks are seen as different from those in rural areas (Sen and Hoff, 2005). Finally the urban poor are particularly susceptible to health risks, resulting from the closeness of industrial and residential functions, competition for land, high population densities and overcrowded housing, and the inadequate pace at which clean water supply, sanitation and solid waste services are expanded. In addition, though health services often are more easily accessible in urban than in rural areas they are often more expensive (Haq, 2005). In sum, poverty is understood as capability inadequacy as an effect of social relationships and structural deficits; resulting in social marginalization of urban poor and reproduction of traditional institutions that are not complementary to the urban modern life.

4.2. SOCIALIZATION AS REPRODUCTION OF INTERTIATIC INSTITUTIONS

Bourdieu defines ‘habitus’ as “the durably installed generative principle of regulated improvisations [which produces] practices” (Bourdieu, 1977:78). Habitus is “our ways of acting, feeling, thinking and being” (Grenfell 2008: 52) formed through our past experience rather than intended learning. Established in our unconsciousness, habitus is given a meaning when a person objectifies the

surrounding social environment through his/her own individual subjectivity (Bourdieu 1990; Nash 1990: 434). According to Bourdieu the same habitus will produce different practices in different social environments, and the habitus can be changed by changed circumstances (Bourdieu, 1990: 116). Bourdieu believes that even though each habitus is different, perceptions of people living in similar conditions are based on common standpoints (ibid.). The habitus is linked to the ‘capital’ a person possesses to occupy a certain position in society which is used to compete and determine positions and control fate of others. There are four kinds of capital people may possess: economic capital (economic resources), cultural capital (legitimate knowledge), social capital (valued social relationships) and symbolic capital (honour and prestige) (Ritzer, 1996).

‘Doxa’ denotes “established beliefs, taken for granted knowledge and traditions”, occasionally adjusted to current needs justifying practical reasoning behind habitus (Grenfell, 2008: 120; Gaventa, 2003:2). When social (objective) structures and mental (subjective) perceptions are mostly reconciled, unquestionably accepting the social world, doxa misrecognizes existing power relationships, leading to their reproduction and reinforcement. This reproduction occurs in the habitus of social actors through their unconscious adherence to the unquestioned norms. By misrecognition we understand perceptions of power by those exposed to it who simply do not comprehend their dominated positions. On the contrary, they reconcile with their exclusion by seeing their destinies as unavoidable (Wacquant, 1998).

According to his critics, Bourdieu’s theory leaves no room for notions such as resistance. In their view, his world is far more reproductive than transformative. That said, it is ‘struggle’, not ‘reproduction’, that is the master metaphor at the core of Bourdieu’s thought (Wacquant, 1998). It corresponds with Foucault’s post-modern views on *power* that points to the ways in which ‘power is everywhere’; diffused and embodied in knowledge and ‘regimes of truth’, that makes us who we are (Gaventa, 2003). The struggle of agency is to resist structures that can be so embedded and hidden so as to sometimes be beyond human perception, causing them to discipline themselves without any wilful coercion from others (ibid.).

When cognitive mental maps and scripts are internalized through ‘habitus’ and ‘doxa’, practice becomes more structured through similar actions of various actors and ‘institutions’ begin to form. Institutions can be ‘formal’ and ‘informal’ and both have plausible ramifications on providing favourable or unfavourable preconditions for agency and empowerment as discussed below.

4.3. INSTITUTIONS

North (1990:3) defines *institutions* as “humanly devised constraints that shape human interaction”. They can be either ‘*formal*’ institutions such as official policies and laws, or they can be ‘*informal*’

institutions defined as the “socially shared rules . . . that are created, communicated, and enforced outside of officially sanctioned channels” (Helmke and Levitsky 2004, 727). According to Scott (2008):

“Institutions are social structures that have attained a high degree of resilience [and are] composed of cultural-cognitive, normative, and regulative elements that, together with associated activities and resources, provide stability and meaning to social life”. (p. 48)

‘Informal security regimes’ describe “institutional arrangements where people rely heavily upon community and family relationships to meet their security needs, to greatly varying degrees. According to Wood and Gough (2006:1699), these relationships are usually hierarchical and asymmetrical”. As a result, there is “problematic inclusion or adverse incorporation, whereby the disadvantaged and marginalized people trade some short-term security in return for longer-term vulnerability and dependence” (ibid.). The underlying power relations are then formed as ‘patron–client relations’ that are reinforced and become extremely resistant to civil society pressures. Measures to reform them along welfare state lines can prove to be daunting. Nonetheless, these relations afford some measure of informal security through a series of informal rights (ibid.).

The informal institution of the family as a welfare provider maintains its power through the *‘intergenerational contract’* which can be understood as “the expectations and obligations that bind the generations together” (Göransson, 2009:9) and through the *‘patriarchal bargain’* i.e. “strategies employed within a set of constraints in a male-dominated society” that is, within the family, not immutable but remains a site for struggle and transformation for both genders (Kandiyoti, 1988:275).

4.4. SOCIAL CAPITAL AND INSTITUTIONAL CHANGE

In sociology, the term social capital is used in order to ‘understand’ the networks and relationships between different individuals and groups (Kay and Johnston, 2007:17), whereas Bourdieu’s definition focuses on ‘benefits’ that are connected to being involved in a group. Bourdieu defines social capital as:

the aggregate of the actual or potential resources which are linked to possession of a durable network of more or less institutionalized relationships of mutual acquaintance and recognition (Bourdieu, 1989: 248).

Social capital is inherent both in different associations a person engages with, and when a person is involved in different activities. What typifies social capital is that an individual has to invest in it, in order to be able to get some benefits. When homogeneity and identity within a group is strong ‘bonding social capital’ tends to be exclusionary, therefore making it possible to exclude individuals that do not belong to this group (Kay and Johnston, 2007:17-18). Conversely, ‘bridging social capital’ is more inclusionary, because this kind of social capital connects people from different

groups and can be useful when trying to overcome social differences between people and also in the shaping of wider identities (Kay and Johnston, 2007:24). Burt's concept of structural holes is an important notion to be introduced here, where structural holes are gaps between two different networks (Burt, 1997: 255). Burt points out that a 'broker' between two otherwise not connected groups can yield benefits because the broker is entitled to information from both groups (Burt, 1997: 257-258). Knowing the values of another group is considered more beneficial than when a person is not aware of this, because it provides new information and enables a person to think outside his/her own box (Burt, 2004:355; Portes, 1998:53).

'Nepantla' which is considered a space of renovation, is a concept derived from Chicana pedagogy (Elenes, 2013), which will be used in this thesis to describe an institution that is under stress, and is undergoing changes. It is an indigenous concept that refers to an in-between space where a person can become aware of something from two different angles, what is referred to as the 'third eye' that is capable of looking both inward and outward. Nepantla, "is the place where different perspectives come into conflict and where one questions the basic ideas, tenets, and identities inherited" from ones family, education, and culture that can render the conventional labeling obsolete. It is a zone where one can reflect critically on normative belief systems, especially as they relate to class, gender, sexuality, nationality, ethnicity, and race. Nepantla is "an unstable, unpredictable, precarious" (Elenes, 2013:135) and an uncomfortable space of transition. In nepantla what has the potential to be established is the ability to construct bridges that "span liminal (threshold) spaces between worlds" (ibid.) and it is in these in-between spaces where transformation occurs. In sum, nepantla as an in- between space of transformation can serve as a point of departure for critical engagement in social justice and education.

4.5. AGENCY AND EMPOWERMENT

The independent capability or ability to act on one's will is defined as agency. This ability is affected by the cognitive belief structure which one has formed through one's experiences. These include perceptions held by the society and the individuals of the structures and circumstances of the environment they are in and the position they are born into. Disagreement on the extent of one's agency often becomes a reason for conflict between parties (Barker, 2005).

Empowerment is the "process of change through which those who have been denied the capacity to exercise choice gain this capacity" (Kabeer 1999 cited in Kabeer 2012:217-218). Meaningful choices can only be made if alternatives are available such that there is a possibility of having chosen otherwise. The concern here is compliance with, or at least failure to protest against, norms and values that assigns individuals an inferior status in relation to others in society. Such

compliance can be interpreted in several ways. It may reflect an absolute recognition of these norms and values, the belief that they represent a reasonable, even valued, way of organising social relationships. It may also reflect the material costs associated with protest. Where women and men are economically dependent on those with power and authority over them, and attempts to question status quo can destabilize the equilibrium of their primary source of survival and security in their living environment. There may also be social costs if strong pressures exist within society to conform to given norms and values such that transgression may risk harassment and ostracism (Kabeer, 2012:217-218).

This theoretical framework will be employed to analyse the material transcribed from the interviews. The respondents are socialized into roles, through their interactions with the institutions in the social environment into which they are born, which becomes their 'habitus'. Once 'doxa' is formed it reinforces patterns of 'bonded social capital' reproducing similar norms and values through sanctions and rewards. When a broker enters this contextual setting and creates new forms of bridging social capital, the 'doxa' goes into a state of 'nepantla' altering the 'habitus' under new circumstances. This is the site of activation from where one begins to feel 'empowered' and capable of exercising 'agency' in the presence of the enabling and capability enhancing school intervention.

Having defined and outlined the theoretical scaffolding of the thesis, the next section will describe the background of Pakistan as the context against which the case of Kiran School is to be studied.

5. BACKGROUND: PAKISTAN

5.1. A FRAGILE STATE

Since its inception in 1947, Pakistan has been facing the problem of dominant elites i.e. feudal, business, military and religious elite, such that all governments that gained power through military or civilian rule, have served to advancing and reproducing their interests (Ahmed, 2009; Forrest, 2010). This has resulted in a severe neglect of investments in basic social services such as education and health and the state has failed to transfer benefits of economic growth to the major portion of the society (Husain, 1999) creating social inequalities. Pakistan is a fragile state rife with internal conflicts that seriously threatens its peace and security and is not an attractive site for economic investments (Masud et al, 2013:65). The dominant religion of the country is Islam (Zia, 2010:265). Developing a secular state has indeed been a challenge since the country's inception; religion has been constitutionalized, parallel Sharia (Islamic) courts have been established and Madrassah (religious) schools run side by side to the formal education system (ibid.). Though the country has a

legal code, at an informal level, it is regulated by customary and traditional laws and customs (Zia & Bari 199:3). Welfare arrangements in Pakistan are mostly of an informal nature (Kabeer et. al., 2010:10). The state, as mentioned before has served its citizens poorly in protection of citizenship rights, wealth redistribution, health care, education and employment (Yasmeen et.al, 2011).

5.2. FRAGMENTED EDUCATION SYSTEM

In a survey of education conducted by the Government of Pakistan, the findings revealed existence of different types of schools divided by the medium of instruction, type of subjects taught, level of education (primary or secondary) location (urban-rural areas) and above all, whether they cater to the rich, the middle classes or the poor (Rahman, 2010). These unequal fragmented institutions create different worldviews that increases reasons for conflict in a society and makes it prone to violence. An unjust, unequal, class-oriented education system alienates people from each other and the state. Around 71 percent of all educational institutions in Pakistan are in the *public sector* and 29 percent in the *private sector* (AEPAM, 2009). The *non-profit sector* is an important player in Pakistan, running a large number of educational institutions, some of which are known as low-cost schools. Many of these schools draw their resources from local communities, with models that are replicable on a larger scale. *Non-formal schooling* has played an important role in providing education to the poorest children and adults, especially in rural areas. *Madrassahs* (religious schools) also provide education, though their main emphasis of education is on Islamic teachings, a majority of the *madrassahs* also provide formal education (Bano n.d.), are included in the formal education system, and are accounted for in the school census data (AEPAM, 2009).

At the time of its independence, Pakistan had a poorly educated population and very few schools and universities. The Committee of the Primary and Secondary education 1947 considered it essential that a national system of education be based on the strong foundations of free and compulsory primary education (Khan, 2010:148). The constitution (1973 Article 25A) decreed education as right of every child without differentiation of race, sex, region and religion and reiterated its promise of free and compulsory provision at all levels (*ibid.*). Notwithstanding, current statistics suggest that Pakistan will not be able to meet its targets on education for the Millennium Development Goals (MDGs) by 2015, and will not achieve the goal of universal primary education as stated in the Dakar Declaration 2000, to which Pakistan is a signatory (Khan, 2010). This is despite several major governmental efforts towards public-private partnerships, collaborations with non-government organizations and donor interventions over the last decade including: the Education Sector Reforms Action Plan 2001–2004, the National Education for All (EFA) Plan 2000–2015, and provincial education reform programmes (Khan, 2010; Ali and Tahir, 2009). According to UNESCO,

Pakistan has the highest proportion of out-of-school children⁴ (OOSC) in South Asia, with slightly over 5.4 million primary-school-age children and 6.9 million lower-secondary-school-age children that were out of school in 2011 (UIS, 2012). The Pakistan Education Task Force reported in 2011 that roughly one in 10 of the world's primary-school-age children who are not in school live in Pakistan, thereby placing Pakistan second in the global ranking of OOSC. It is also estimated that, of these children, about three million will never enter school (UNICEF, 2013). Why is it then, despite commitment from the Government of Pakistan to address this urgent need, millions of children are still out of school?

5.3. URBAN KARACHI

5.3.1. VIOLENCE

Karachi is Pakistan's largest city and commercial capital. The city sprawls across 3,530 square kilometres, having a population of more than 18 million people. Adding to this, it boasts the highest literacy rates in the country- up to 90 percent in central Karachi- and also employs the largest population in the manufacturing, retail, and services sectors (Hasan and Mohib n.d.). But the city's cosmopolitanism and economic growth are constantly undermined by violent disruptions. In recent years, ethno-political, sectarian, militant, and criminal violence have claimed thousands of lives and repeatedly paralyzed the city's economic activities. These disruptions on urban economic activities affect the national economy and threaten to destabilize Pakistan for both economic and political reasons since the city contributes more than 25 percent to the gross domestic product (Yusuf, 2012).

5.3.2. URBAN SLUM: LYARI

Karachi's largest and most powerful criminal gangs operate out of Lyari, a slum settlement with a population of over 1 million (Chisti, 2014; Yusuf, 2012). Historically Lyari has been under the political stronghold of Pakistan Peoples Party (PPP), one of the leading political parties of Pakistan, and a hub of drug smuggling, weapons trafficking, extortion, kidnapping, and gang warfare (Khan, 2012). By 2008 Lyari's warring gangs had been brought under the control of Rehman Dakait, a notorious gangster who formed the People's Amn Committee (PAC) to sustain a durable ceasefire in the slum (ibid.). Dakait's death in August 2008 led to a war of succession; during which Uzair Baloch took over the PAC with the backing of PPP minister Zulfiqar Mirza (Yusuf, 2012). Originally, PPP's involvement with the PAC was premised on gaining access to the vast funds generated by the committee's criminal activities. According to Karachi-based journalists, the PAC

⁴ Some reasons cited for why children, mainly those from disadvantaged backgrounds, do not have access to schools including poverty are: distance to schools, non-availability of schools, low quality teaching, ignorance and lack of awareness. It is also true that schools fail to retain children, resulting in high dropout rates (ibid).

emerged as a de facto armed wing of the PPP during the violence of 2010-11 and was used to counter the dominance of the Urdu-speaking political party Muttahida Quami Movement (MQM) (Chisti, 2014). Some of the most brutal incidents of abduction, torture, target killings, and corpse dumping have been blamed on the PAC (Yusuf, 2012). Notably, most Lyari residents, and thus members of the PAC, are ethnically Baloch. Their increasing involvement in the city's political-criminal nexus has added yet another ethnic dimension to Karachi's urban violence (ibid.).

6. ANALYSIS

The first part of this section will begin with setting the stage for what the social environment of Lyari was like when the intervening school came to the area. The second part of this section will analyse how existing inertial institutions came under stress and how some of them transformed through their interactions with the school. This scrutiny is divided under two main headings into aforementioned categories. Both categories will be further broken down to study the impact of institutional inertia and institutional stress and transformation through the family, school and neighbourhood.

6.1. INSTITUTIONAL INERTIA: THE SOCIAL ENVIRONMENT

6.1.1. FAMILY 'IS ABOUT LIFE FOR OTHERS'

In Lyari, the architectural landscape that meets the eye is that of interconnected vertical buildings, 5-6 storeys tall, divided into several floors of size 33-40 m². Mostly a kitchen is shared. It is separated only in case of a joint extended family. One of the interviewees describes this situation in the following way:

In my own family we were eight sisters and three brothers. I currently live in my husband's extended family. His uncle's family lives with us too. There are nine adults and four children in our house. I have two rooms for my own family of six but soon my brother in law will marry and his wife will move in, so I will have to empty one room. It is hard to live like this. We know our expenses will increase once we move out. So we have to be careful in making that decision. We have taken a loan for an apartment. Managing budgets is hard with large families. (Parent 1)

Living together in a joint system is a strategic decision for most family members. According to the respondents, first, because of rapidly growing populations in the slum housing has become scarce. Second, because of high demand in the area, cost of rent is expensive and is a major part of monthly expenses. Third, since all members of the family pool their incomes, it is an economic advantage to live in a joint family system. There are disadvantages too, as are described below:

19 people live in this house [...] we are cramped and unhappy [...] there's a lot of interference and distractions [...] there is no space for more people but guests keep pouring in [...] we cannot live according to our own rules[...] our life is not our own till we are in a joint family. (Parent 12)

Living in overcrowded spaces means there is a lot of external noise and pressure to conform such that one's own voice is systematically stifled and suffocated. The family can be viewed as an informal institution that is reproduced through socially shared rules (Helme and Levitsky, 2004:727). These rules are created, communicated and shared outside of officially sanctioned channels (ibid.), yet they have their own set of sanctions and rewards that are responsible for socializing new and old members alike, in order to perpetuate and preserve its collective interests through individuals. This social structure has attained a high degree of resilience through cultural-cognitive, normative and regulative elements and provides stability and meaning to the life of social actors within this context, thereby decreasing transaction costs (Scott, 2008:48). The above account shows that individual agency is dominated in the family and members are found living unquestioningly according to someone else's rules, being subordinated to hierarchical relationships where status is always defined in relation to someone else: old/young; male/female; employed/unemployed; married/unmarried widow-divorced/married; childless/with child etc. Privacy appears to be a rarity in this collective unit and is constantly subject to scrutiny and open discussion. Children and individuals growing up in this environment are easily distracted by guests who 'show up'; hospitality is propriety and leisure has value. Discipline and respect for time and routines is absent and is as such, installed as part of what Bourdieu defines as the habitus, which is formed through past experiences rather than intended learning (Nash 1990:434):

Drinking, tobacco chewing, using foul language was common in the joint family [...] this is the environment I was living in and my children were growing up in [...] what could I do? (Parent 9)

The above estimate displays that the family, as a key socializing agent, can set bad examples for the young ones and pass on undesirable social values, that make it difficult for family members to be motivated towards achievement and success. Bourdieu's 'Doxa' denotes taken for granted knowledge and established beliefs justifying practical reasoning behind habitus (Grenfell: 2008:120). The persistence of certain actions is indicative of their acceptance. This acceptance comes from an understanding a person has about him/herself, the social environment that he/she is embedded in and what is expected of him/her as an individual within it. When social and mental perceptions are reconciled, unquestioningly accepting the social world, doxa misrecognizes existing power relationships, leading to their reproduction and reinforcement (Waquant, 1998:220). The family thus, becomes the site of internalizing disabling scripts that are symptomatic of individual traits such as hopelessness, indecisiveness, a sense of futility, and lack of energy to pursue any concerted efforts towards ameliorating the existing life situation. In the following account an interviewee discusses her plight when she and her husband decided to 'act out' by taking their own decision without consulting the elders of the family:

We were married and had one child when we ran away from my husband's home [...] my mother in law controlled all decisions [...] he was taken back from my aunt's place and beaten badly by his family [...] then he was locked in a room for a week. (Parent 11)

Parents expect complete loyalty and allegiance in exchange for their care. An investment in their children is not unconditional; it is expected for a return. Families' are social insurance programs. As Göransson (2009:9) points out, the institution of the family is a social contract between generations, where a person is morally bound to conform to certain expectations and obligations. This is the intergenerational contract and a bargain that individuals, under the care of their families, make with their situation. In this informal urban regime divorced from formal state rules, the family still serves the education and health function, and additionally takes care of its young and elderly. This results in problematic or adverse incorporation whereby members trade some short-term security in return for longer-term vulnerability and dependence (Wood and Gough, 2006:1699). Conformity is positively rewarded through support and rebellion is sanctioned through violence and abuse.

My father-in-law decided one day that we would move to the village and that was it, the entire family relocated. It was very hard for me to adjust. I had job in the city, I was earning while my husband was unemployed, now he had more of a reason to be unemployed because in the village there are no jobs. I lost my income. And now we were completely dependent. When I said I would move back to Karachi, I was beaten and locked up without food for days. (Parent 5)

The father-in-law has the iron hand and is usually responsible for making decisions on behalf of all family members irrespective of how it adversely affects some members of the family. In case where the father in law is no longer alive, the mother in law becomes a power holder and a key decision maker. The family uses violence and 'shaming' tactics to keep the young members docile and compliant. If they still rebel, they are spurned and are not offered protection and care as punishment. This is an essential part of the intergenerational contract i.e. 'respecting' the elders in the family and an unchallenged acceptance of their decisions. Since the family is a 'private' domain, there is no interference from formal authorities. Neighbours and community members all have a stake in upholding the institution hence there is no support on the premise that interference from 'outsiders' in private matters is disrespectful. Thus, familial oppression that is entrenched in social norms becomes a part of the habitus and remains unchallenged through the doxa. According to Waquant (1998:220) 'misrecognition' is understood as perceptions of power by those exposed to it who do not 'comprehend' their dominated positions. The empirical accounts demonstrate that though they are aware and comprehend their dominated positions fully, practical rationality and personal responsibility of the respondents is vanquished due to familial constraints and the futility of success of their actions. Thus, they choose to live in a disabled state of 'unfreedom' (Sen, 1999:87-91) and conflict avoidance because they reconcile with their exclusion by seeing their destinies as unavoidable (Waquant, 1998:220). Also because this form of agency is simple and it works. In this

state of unfreedom these individuals are able to maintain a façade of having the freedom to live their lives ‘free’ of negative consequences that harm their capabilities and functionings through alienation from the family, especially since there are no avenues of escape and to struggle means to fail in the absence of a support system. Dejection too, thus, as mentioned before, becomes a part of their habitus. These feelings become deeply entrenched through the life course and experiences with other institutions such as the school and the labour market. The choice to remain a part of the family is a strategic one. One could say the respondents’ are rationally making irrational choices to survive. Knowledge of having meaningful alternatives gives power (Kabeer 1999) and when that knowledge is not being disseminated there is no potential for the doxa to change.

My mother and father never went to school. I have studied till fifth grade and my husband has done matric (10th grade). I dropped out after the 5th grade. I don’t know why I did not want to study, though my father was very keen on us getting an education. At that time, it seemed pointless. (Parent 1)

My grandmother decided how much the girls could study in the family. As soon as a girl reached puberty she was pulled out of school. My mother hid the fact that I had reached puberty at 12 so I could study more. When my grandmother found out when I was 14, I was forbidden to go to school [...] the boys were allowed to study more but they did not see much use for it. (Parent 12)

A common thread that ran across the interviews was that education was of little value in the family. Most of the respondents’ families had migrated from villages of interior Sindh (a province in Pakistan). These families are institutional carriers of traditional values that are redundant in the urban context, and are harmful, even detrimental to an individual’s agency, that is, according to Barker (2005) one’s independent capability or ability to act on one’s will. Lack of education, rigid gender roles and status of men and women, as well as attitude towards work are all inculcated within the family domain, though these strategies for survival may have worked in the traditional setting, and seems rational for the survival of the family, it is irrational for their progress in the urban setting. That said, the quality of education being imparted is perceived as having no value for vocational scope and thus results in school drop-outs. The oldest, most traditional members of the family are the most powerful decision makers whose prescriptions are based on their own habitus that have become outdated in the new circumstances, yet their status and legitimacy is unquestioned. Girls are pulled out of school and are married early. Mothers do not encourage their daughters to continue schooling because making investments in education comes at an economic cost and also because they lose a helping hand in serving the large families. They thus, pass on their own hopelessness to their female off-springs. The ultimate goal of the family is to create new families and this builds bonded social capital recreating homogeneity and identity within this social group (Kay and Johnston, 2007:24). Women play a major role in upholding patriarchal values where they transmit rigid gender roles within the family; the girls as homemakers and care givers and men as breadwinners. There are no

alternative 'ways of being' other than those of the role models the individuals have in the family. In the accounts that follow, the interviewees describe the circumstances of their marriage:

I was 14 when my marriage was arranged and I got married. My husband was 10 years older and he was unemployed. His father was supporting us. I didn't have to get married. But the idea of getting new clothes and wearing jewelry excited me. (Parent 1)

Marriage is a game. Daughters are married to ease the burden and responsibility of the family [...] after my father died my family got me married because they did not want people to think the girls of our house had the freedom to decide not to get married. It was more about reputation than about my happiness. (Parent 7)

All the verbal and physical abuse my mother-in-law and my husband subjugated me to was happening to her daughters and his sisters too [...] is this why girls are married? [...] we are told that is our home and that is where we must live no matter what. (Parent 11)

There is a trend for early marriages in the community. In most cases, the marriages are arranged by the elders and there is no opposition to their choice by the young women for whom marriage is taken for granted and is an important event. Reputation in Lyari is important. If girls start refusing marriage it sets an example for other girls to follow suit, since the community is well-knit, 'talk' and 'gossip' serve as social control. Once a woman is married she is a part of another family. Divorce is a social taboo and it is solely a woman's responsibility to uphold her marriage. As mentioned before, violence and abuse is a part of their doxa. Families accept this and expect that this is how their daughters will be treated and treat other people's daughters in the same way. It is a vicious cycle where no one is questioning their own actions. Most of the interviewees said '*this is how we had to live, there was no other choice*'. Where women and men are economically dependent on those with power and authority over them, attempts to question status-quo can undermine their primary source of survival and security in their living environment. There are social costs and strong pressures within the community that motivate conformance to existing norms and values over transgression which risks harassment and ostracism (Kabeer, 2012:217-218). It is important to understand that it is not only women but men too who are oppressed under the family structure. Most commonly if a son is not employed the parents get him married so that under the duress of responsibility he would start to work. Interestingly, it is the family itself that first installed a lack of work ethic in his habitus, and he too is unquestioningly pushed into an arranged marriage without having an understanding of what a relationship entails. This anger and frustration seeps into the conjugal relationship where young couples feel alienated from each other and do not understand how to communicate with each other. This situation is described in the following way by an:

My husband has always been an angry man. He seemed to be filled with dark thoughts. I felt we were very distant. And sometimes I was scared of him. We did not talk, laugh, or share our thoughts. He did not give me any importance. And he wouldn't waste a minute to insult me in the presence of other people. I felt no love for him. My life was confined to the house. I was allowed to go out only with my husband or when chaperoned by my mother in law and my husband's sister. I was not allowed to talk to men outside the family. (Parent 1)

‘Control’ is a word often repeated through the course of the interviews. The newly married couple does not have knowledge of how to control their fertility and neither is it advised by their significant others. First, the couple has to make adjustments to each other as strangers (for the woman, to an entire new family). To add to that frustration, in the absence of knowledge of contraception, the couple starts to expect a child very soon and that complicates the situation further by isolating the couple from each other. Second, the mother in law has a vested interest in the activities of the couple. She has a new role, that of a mother-in-law and that gives her a new subject to exert her power on and extend her control to:

I was always told children are our real wealth. It does not matter if we don't have money. This is what I was told by my parents, my in-laws, and it is the norm in our community. It is a well-known fact. So taking precautions was an option neither I nor my husband had any information about. My mother had 12 children and my mother in law 5, the trend was to have at least three children. (Parent 1)

My mother in law has a good heart but she has a foul mouth. She is mean and uses bad language that is humiliating. She exercises no decorum. Her word was the last word. And what she says was always right. She would incite my husband against me. She would complain about me. And my husband would get angry with me. It was psychological torture, to have to deal with his mother, her controlling attitude and her name calling. She gets all of my husband's salary and all of his respect. I have to live with it (Parent 5)

In studying the institution of the family in the context of Lyari there are several interesting things to notice about the complexity of diffused and embodied power (Gaventa, 2003:2) and the status of relationships within it. The wife's status is lower than her husband. A wife's status is lower than the daughter. The daughter's status is lower than the son, but higher than the daughter in law. The mother in law is also more powerful than the daughter in law. The husband controls the wife more than the daughter. The son is trapped in between allegiance to his mother (who controls him) and his wife (who is the mother of his children and a partner). He has to choose one over the other till a critical juncture from where he is able to balance these two relationships. Women cannot control their husbands nor have their love (as can be seen from the circumstances of their marriage and the level of interference from the family) so they give their love to their sons and control them and thus their wives. They have unequal subordinated positions with their husbands and hierarchically dominant positions with their sons. This is described by Kandiyoti (1988:275) as the patriarchal bargain entailing strategies employed by women and men within a set of constraints in a male-dominated society. The mother in law has a vested interest in not letting the young couple develop a ‘love’ relationship.

I was not allowed to eat alone with my husband. A chaperone has to be present. I could not go out alone with him too, the conditions were the same. It was absurd, the situation. I argued, but it was no good. (Parent 9)

Moreover, each family in the community has a stake in upholding the sanctity of this institution. A breakdown in the family, even for rational reasons, is stigmatized and is cause of shame, mostly for the woman as her inability to preserve the one role she was entrusted with irrespective how much abuse or torture she suffers, because that is her 'kismet' or fate. Women, including mothers and mother in laws, collectively condemn the victim, because they feel if they themselves have endured it, so must all other women. It also gives them a sense of achievement at the seeming success of their own marriages whilst others fail. They do not wish for other women to have escape options while they have had none. Divorcees and widows are subject to a lot of 'social talk'. It is a loss in status for the woman, not the man, who gets away with anything, because the women allow him to. First being a woman, then being a divorcee or widow, means a low status in the family and community. This is a state of disabled individual agency on account of forces that are considered 'beyond control' (Gaventa, 2003:2) as described by the following account:

My unemployed husband re-married and brought the new wife into our home whose expenses I was running [...] I supported him and his new wife under my roof because my family wouldn't let me divorce him [...] I needed him they said and I had to obey' (Parent 4)

Some respondents' talked about how idiosyncratic shocks affected their family life. In the quote immediately below, the interviewee's husband, being the eldest in the family gained the role of the breadwinner in the occasion of the death of his father, and now, besides looking after his own family, had to look after the larger household too. That puts a lot of pressure on the male breadwinner. The intergenerational contract binds him to his duties, and he must now become the social insurance for the rest of his family.

When my father in law died my husband who was the eldest son, inherited the responsibility of the entire family. It was so sudden. It puts him under a lot of pressure and builds frustrations sometimes. (Parent 1)

My husband's died in a bomb blast. It was so sudden. He left the home in the morning never to return. I had two children, one a mere infant. I lost everything in one day. That kind of loss is hard to make up for especially without any support' (Parent 6)

In the quote above, when a woman becomes a single parent and a breadwinner it puts double pressure on her. Her habitus that has internalized the role of a caretaker must now take on the role of the breadwinner in the absence of any insurance against such a shock as the death of her husband. She is able to reconcile with this situation because her habitus alters in accordance to changed circumstances (Bourdieu, 1990:116). In the next section, the description of inertial institutions will now extend to the local school environment in Lyari as purported by the interviewees.

6.1.2. SCHOOL 'DOES NOT HELP'

The schools in Lyari are of three types; public schools, low-cost private schools and informal madrassahs (religious schools), all imparting education in the neighbourhood. As mentioned before,

families place low value on education to begin with. When the children are sent to school, the quality of schooling and the attitude of the teachers, discourage school attendance and results in drop-outs. The school is placed, in the narrative of the interviews, as an uncondusive environment for intellectual and personal growth:

The teacher at my older daughter's local school asked her to come to his home. He said he would 'personally' give her tips to pass the final exam. Her friend came to ask if she would come along as she was on her way to the teacher's house. I told her my daughter will not go and that she too must work hard rather than look for short cuts. This is what the schools are like in our neighbourhood. It is neither safe nor worth the effort to send children to school. (Parent 2)

My husband said he quit school. He would cheat to pass his exams. His teachers would hardly show up for class. They would yell, scream and beat him. He did not feel he was learning anything useful. He could earn by apprenticeship instead. That experience had more value. (Parent 10)

Apprenticeship starts at an early age and has an economic gain for the individual both in terms of income and gaining experience. There is no individual motivation for attending school neither is there any parental encouragement for the same. Network brokerage is about the advantage of exposure to variation in opinion and behaviour provided by building connections across structural holes, which are gaps between two different networks (Burt, 1997:225). In a closed network of bonded social capital, where everyone an individual knows, knows everyone else, there are no structural holes to broker. Hence, the interviewees feel these are structural deficits, or 'holes' that must be filled via bridging gaps between networks by a legitimate broker before they can embark on a flight to a better future.

6.1.3. NEIGHBOURHOOD 'IS A DOWNWARD SPIRAL'

The manner in which roles are enacted is a demonstration of how young men and women make choices depending on their social positions. The weight of the prevailing norms and belief systems can be felt in the existing informal institutional regime of the neighbourhood as another avenue for practice of habitus besides the family. Agency is not always positive it can also be cultivated through perverse forms of socialization as is described below:

Im scared of my children falling prey to the bad habits of older boys in the neighbourhood. Children are given cigarettes, expensive phones, a motorbike, and a gun. They are instructed to take these things and make their futures. (Parent 1)

Two lads would sit in one street for two hours, and would change shifts and were getting paid Rs.500 for just that, sitting and keeping an eye on people. If a person works for one whole day as contracted labour doing hard physical work in Lyari, he makes Rs. 200-300 maximum. This was a profitable enterprise to be engaged in [...] then they were given guns [...] if there was someone constructing a house, these lads would show up and ask for a cut in the construction, like Rs. 10,000. Even small shopkeepers were being asked for cuts [...] they shoot on will and kill on whim. [...] people are scared. (Parent 11).

They sell drugs and are drinking openly throughout the day. Young children get attracted to these lads as potential role models. They copy their behaviour [...] girls get attracted to their wealth and marry them, when they are killed in shoot-outs, they become widows. (Parent 8)

My husband was working for a chemical company [...] his department shut down and was rendered jobless. He wasn't able to get a job till many years later when we had our first child. He got a job in fisheries at the port. So we had income when it was fishing season and then the rest of the months we were dependent on the pooled household income [...] outside Lyari, because of the reputation of this neighbourhood, no one wants to hire people from Lyari. (Parent 1)

These quotes describe the social milieu of the neighbourhood of Lyari. When children are socialized into a benign acceptance of violence it becomes an acceptable domain of exercising power. Belonging to a particular group then could also become not only a source of an identity but also of a status, power and economic advantage. This is covert power that is hidden (Gaventa, 2003:2) but has potential for activation through socialized individuals. Subordinated subjects must constantly manipulate events in order to turn them into opportunities. But in the absence of 'tales of better times' and positive role models, it is easy to fall prey to bad company. Most jobs in the locality are those of carpenters, contractual drivers for heavy and low-tension vehicles, painters, tailors etc. The work is part-time, based on daily wages that fluctuate according to demand, sometimes it is seasonal, and is mostly uncertain and of an informal nature. Since there are no legal rights associated with informal work, unemployment without benefits in the absence of relocation services and skills training to re-engage unemployed young men, they can easily fall prey to patron-client relationships within the urban informal regime that has superior economic gains (Wood and Gough, 2006:1699). There is also an attitude of present-time orientation, that is, 'living right here right now'. Future gains are in the future and the future is uncertain. Windfall gains and instant advances in socio-economic status are preferred over tenacious hard work. Young women are widowed at an early age, are ostracized for 'acting out' and stigmatized thus exacerbating the 'condition' of poverty through powerlessness and helplessness on account of lack of access to formal rights. Outside this neighbourhood, chances of gaining employment succumb to its tainted reputation, thus blocking opportunity. Again, we notice that in case on unemployment the household provides support, thus making it a plausible form of social insurance against hard times.

SUMMARY OF INSTITUTIONAL INERTIA

In summing up the findings from the material, one discovers that a lot of the factors identified as 'disempowering' are intertwined. Linkages can be established between large households, early apprenticeship of young boys, low educational value and early marriages of girls. Surviving in the informal urban economy requires an income that is pooled by the working members. Early marriages decrease the load of non-earning female members of the family, and they are encouraged to endure any treatment they receive in their marital relationships because the family is unable to take on their

burden in case they return. Thus divorce becomes a social taboo and is stigmatized. Fertility is not controlled because the more 'sons' a family has the more breadwinners they benefit from, the negative exigency of this 'natal policy' is birth of girls, that is easily corrected through their early marriages, perpetuating a vicious cycle. Lack of economic reasoning when having large families is an indication of how entrenched the habitus is and how hard it is to break the doxa (Waquant, 1998). There is no realization of the fact that the larger the household, the greater the inability to make investments on each child. Families create a radius of trust and are important sources of bonded social capital (Kay and Johnston, 2007:17-18). Internalized norms and values and a lack of role models taken together, affect an individual's agency (Barker, 2005, Kabeer, 2012:217-218). A woman in the role of a mother in law is a tyrant and in the role of the mother is a care-giver. In her former role, she sees another woman in her terrain as a threat, even though it is in her latter role that she is passing on the importance of marriage to an unemployed son. A son's marriage is an important moment in a mother in law's life; she may either lose or begin to have power and control. If that control is threatened and she fears losing her son; who she has painfully raised, is her social insurance, and the only man she can ever control through her love and care; she has a vested interest in practicing a variation of tactics to keep this from happening through the patriarchal bargain (Kandiyoti, 1988:275). The mental maps that are internalized by family members can only be re-organized through role models. Role models that are legitimate in their eyes since they have also internalized that nothing positive can happen to them without someone asking for something in return. Disabling power structures within the family are constantly being reproduced rather than challenged, questioned and re-written on account of bonded social capital (Kay and Johnston, 2007:17-18) and the intergenerational contract (Göransson 2009:9). Since transition to newer paradigms is not simple, individuals bank on their self-interest to insure themselves against alienation that could render them completely powerless in new situations. The role of education is thus to re-socialize individuals into new relational settings by enhancing their skill-set and their internalized realities to develop an understanding of how to deal with changing circumstances and cultivating the agency to act on those changes in an empowering way.

6.2. INSTITUTIONAL STRESS: NEPANTLA

From the previous section we can conclude that disempowerment is understood as the negative outcome of being dominated under power structures that are taken for granted. Disempowerment can become a way of life that keeps reproducing itself through social environments that do not create optimal preconditions for cultivating agency that bring to question existing power relations within society. This cultivation requires 'brokerage' and 'bridging' structural holes (Portes 1888:53). This

section, through the voices of the interviewees, will describe the school intervention and how it understood and adapted itself to the social milieu to bring change to the condition of institutional inertia by putting it under stress for possible transformation. This is expressed in the following quote:

We are not poor in that we do not get two square meals or we do not have a roof over our heads. It is hard to manage bills and budgets. But the real poverty we face is the lack of ability to be able to think for ourselves. The lack of reason. To be trapped in a mind-set without knowing or asking ourselves why? Why are we this way? Why are we doing what we are doing? That is real poverty!
(Parent 1)

It is detected here that the interviewees are developing a ‘third-eye’ and are capable of looking both inward and outward (Elenes, 2013:135). They are questioning the basic ideas, tenets, and identities they have inherited from their family, education, and the urban slum neighbourhood and are contesting conventional labeling.

6.2.1. FAMILY ‘IS A LIFE FOR MYSELF’

One of the foremost changes highlighted was the shift from joint to nuclear family units. As mentioned in the previous section, this was a site of acute struggle and those members ‘acting-out’ faced many social and economic challenges. That said, the interviewees’ generally expressed relief and happiness in their independent set-up. It is important to note that the school intervention has been operational for seven years. So this change has occurred over a period of time. The account below describes the situation:

I had to save money. I pushed my husband. I could not live with the interference any longer. My children’s education was suffering. My husband understood my concerns. He said ‘let’s do it!’[..] it was hard at first [..] the expenses increased [..] we stuck to our decision and managed [..] im so relieved to have my independence. My husband is a totally different person in this new setting.
(Parent 11)

After a few meetings Sabina had with the fathers, my husband’s attitude towards me and the children changed. He got out of his tough hard shell and began to pay attention to me and listen to me. He also started to laugh and play more with the children. He started taking an active interest in all our lives. And he told me categorically, that I could do whatever I wanted and go wherever I wanted. I no longer had to tell anyone anything. Not even his mother. He would stand by me he said. It is overwhelming. This is the same man who I could not even talk to. Now we have discussions, conversations, as equals, we are partners, there is so much fun, laughter and friendship between us as a family. I no longer feel alienated. (Parent 1)

There is an improvement in the conjugal relationship once the husbands and the wives are counselled on their roles in a relationship by Khatri, who is also training to become a psychologist. She is able to understand the negativity and frustrations of individuals growing up in this disabling social environment: ‘A happy couple will raise a happy child’ she said, ‘when I enrol a child in school, I automatically enrol the parents, it is a condition they must agree to, that is where I begin’. Developing trust of one’s partner, not as someone to control or yield power over, but as someone whose freedoms one protects, is an initial response to patriarchy. It is important for men to stand up for their wives, since they are the voice of their spouses in this context. When a man takes

responsibility for the well-being of his wife he is fighting for her rights from other women who have cast her in a lower status. When both men and women understand which relationships hold them back and they cut the umbilical cord is when they part ways with path dependency of the 'patriarchal bargain'. Thus patriarchal family structures are site for struggle for both the genders towards developing an active agency. To say only women suffer this structure is to be simplistic and reductionist.

I miscarried my first child and subsequently had four more. One of them is special. I was so innocent. And I suffered so much during my pregnancies which were one after the other. I did not feel healthy. Why didn't anyone guide me? Why was there no one to make me understand that children are a responsibility and that they need a good upbringing? When I gained information and knowledge and I took a decision to stop having more children. (Parent 1)

From the above account, we see that with relevant knowledge, the structural holes are slowly being plugged by the broker (Khatri). Through workshops with doctors and group/personal counselling sessions with the parents she is able to break through their doxa and alter the habitus. This is nepantla, the site for renewed struggles (Elenes, 2013), where one questions old scripts, discards them, negotiates with his/her situation and bridges oneself to a paradigm. Below are some descriptions of the reaction these individuals get when they decide to become agents:

Our relatives say 'look here come the angrez (western) children and their angrez mother, they do not speak Balochi, they have forgotten their roots [...] I ignore 'talk'. I know how hard it was for my children to adjust to school when they only spoke Balochi and not Urdu. It affected their performance because Urdu is the medium of instruction in schools. My mother in law prompts me to make my children speak Balochi and wear Balochi clothes at gatherings. I refuse. I tell her they will speak the language they want to speak and will wear whatever they want to wear. My children come first. Everyone else is secondary. I have to prioritize for their future. (Parent 3)

My mother in law has a problem with me attending school meetings and staying out for too long without her permission. She complains I do not attend weddings, or funerals, child births or other social events with her. She accuses me of caring only about the school and my children. I neglect my household chores and for that she really gives me a hard time [...] these social events add no value to my life instead it wastes my time [...] so people talk, they call me pompous, in my own world, having an attitude, but I park these comments out of the reach of my emotions. (Parent 1)

The descriptions above suggest that these individuals have gained confidence and have altered their habitus to respect productive and progressive attitudes instead of regressive ones. They have started to think about how they can 'better utilize' opportunities and incorporate that into their time for future gains. This 'future-time orientation' is another change from the 'right here right now' orientation. They are making their own decisions irrespective of negative sanctions and value their independent thinking. Their capabilities are improving and they beginning to live a life they value for themselves. The following account is presented as an exhibit:

I got a divorce. I learnt how to drive. I took a loan through a network the school connected me to and bought a van. I transport the local children to their schools for a fee. I am also a part of the school's integrated projects (cottage industry). Ive made upto Rs.70,000 working with that enterprise. I've used the money to pay off most of my loan. All my children are in school and I intend to keep it that way. I won't stop now. I must keep going. My entire family has disowned me, but I

don't care, the Kiran School is my new family. I will keep going because I am now my own saviour.
(Parent 4)

A new support system gives strength to this woman's decisions. She is able to convert her various skills into productive assets that she can make use of. She is able to see opportunity, she knows how to cash in on it, and she is now independently taking all her decisions free from the stress of being socially stigmatized. She realizes she is free to make her own choices, values her independence and feels empowered. This is another positive change within the familial domain; women no longer unquestioningly adhere to irrational expectations from household members. They are not afraid to garner change. They begin to understand the dynamics of their own oppression and begin to change the power dynamics, no longer wanting to be path dependent under changed circumstances of bridged social capital:

My mother in law would get angry at me, then my husband would get angry with me, then I would get angry and hit the children and then they would hit each other. In our meetings with Sabina we were taught to understand that the child is an individual and has a personality. This personality responds to my behaviour in the role of a caretaker. I had to understand the reason for my own anger and control it, because first it was not my child's fault, second I was perpetuating a vicious cycle of anger and violence. In this neighbourhood, is it a wonder then, that the youth is being recruited into gangs? I had to understand the repercussions of my actions and take responsibility. I did not know this. (Parent 9)

This was a common description in almost all interviews conducted. There is a shift towards the individualization and decommodification of a child, such that the child is recognized as individual with a mind of his/her own, not someone to be dictated or disciplined through force, which the parents now realize is a recipe for disaster since the children are emulating them. As parents they are becoming more reflexive and mindful. They use emotions as a resource, to answer their children's curiosity and questions, rather than doling out rude and forceful rebuttals. They also understand that the child is not a commodity or an economic gain (through child labour/apprenticeship) nor a status symbol (gender). He/she is an individual 'being' with likes and dislikes to which he/she has a full right. They also understand that childhood is a period of training for intellectual and personal development that has future gains for the child who can become a productive member of the society towards which he/she has a responsibility.

6.2.2. SCHOOL 'CHANGES LIVES'

This section describes the experience of parents when their children were in the Kiran School as toddlers and their experience in new schools outside Lyari to which the children graduated into. One of the teachers interviewed at Kiran School said:

I've worked at a local government school before. This school is different for several reasons. It has a shorter chain of command [...] a small teacher student ratio where we have two teachers for 10 children in a classroom [...] we let the children's performance decide how we will design our curriculum on a weekly basis [...] and we constantly monitor learning outcomes. We are child-

centred, not curriculum centred and we are able to do that by accepting change, adapting to it and evolving with it. This is a part of our training. (Teacher 1)

This shows how the school aims to respond to the children who need to be activated into a state from where they can perform. The ethnic backgrounds of enrolled families are different. They are of Sindhi, Balochi, Katchi, Pushtoon origins and all speak different languages. Of foremost importance is to standardize the language of all the children to both Urdu and English. Attention to this detail affects educational performance and curtails drop-outs. A child who does not understand his/her teacher's language as well as verbal and non-verbal cues will not develop an interest in learning or coming back to school. In the following quotes the interviewees describe their educational experience with the Kiran School:

In other schools the teachers are abusive. Here at Kiran School, the teachers never yell, scream or hit children. When I would drop my child to school, it felt it was not teachers greeting the children, it felt as if it was mothers meeting their children. There was such a big difference in my child after going to Kiran. She became confident, loved to go to school and was keen on learning new things and asking questions. (Parent 2)

A bird is not just a bird, it is a crow, a robin, a sparrow, a stork, an ostrich. It sounds silly to me to not have known this before. I could not distinguish between different varieties of birds. I know the difference between 'tan' and 'ten' [...] language makes me see and understand the world differently. (Parent 5)

I did not know that the sun is a natural source of vitamin D. I did not know how many hours children need to sleep to wake up fresh in the morning. I did not understand the importance of routines. (Parent 9)

Parents are developing themselves through their children and the regular meetings they attend before a new topic is introduced in school. This is so that there is synergy between what the child has learnt at school and positive reinforcement of the same at home. Parents report happy children, who are very passionate about learning and who love going to school. Through education, they improve their capabilities as parents to take better care of their own and their children's physical and mental health. In the following excerpt, a parent relates her experience when the children moved on from the pre-school to a school outside Lyari:

When we were being coached by Sabina in our meetings on how to deal with our children after they had been admitted to schools outside Lyari vicinity she said to us: 'we are sending your children on scholarship for TALEEM (education) [...] the education your children will get there is not what you have here [...] a high status school, in a different environment, they will be exposed to new things, you will face new problems, adjustments will need to be made to know how to deal with them and to encourage them'. (Parent 12)

Here it is observed how Khatri in her role as a broker between two worlds, is able to guide the parents because she has relevant knowledge of both. She prepares and plans with the parents every time she anticipates a new challenge, or every time a new problem presents itself. This is an active *nepantla* state which is unstable, unpredictable and precarious (Elenes, 2013). It is crucial for the

children and their families to survive this transition, Khatri understands this challenge as a broker, and is keen on plugging the structural holes that she expects the families to fall through in this new situation:

We must keep changing constantly till equilibrium has been reached, but that balance will also be lost - I tell the parents, there is no room for inertia and stagnation in this fast paced social urban environment, we must keep searching for solutions, because they exist. (Khatri)

A parent relates these struggles in the following excerpts:

'I work very hard', my child says, 'but im still not the top of my class. Had I been in a Lyari school I would have been the star student!' We instil in him the value of good education vs getting top grades in a low quality school (Parent 1)

I wish I had a good education; I could have helped my children more with their homework, like educated mothers do. I would've been able to talk to them in English. I wish I had studied. An education is what is missing in my life (Parent 5)

Here we see that the child realizes he has to work twice as hard as the local kids to stay in a private English speaking school. He values achievement and in his own locality, and realizes he is probably the smartest kid in that context, but not so when he competes with his peers in upper-middle class schools outside Lyari. His habitus is switching in between two spaces and frames of reference such that he is in an uncomfortable state of transition. The parents, having been coached, continue to encourage him and explain to him the value and the quality of education he is able to receive in the school outside Lyari. Those children who do not perform well in schools outside Lyari are then admitted to the top private schools within Lyari. The goal is to keep children in school and to keep nurturing their interest in education through the course of their internal-individual and external-social/environmental struggles. Not having an education themselves to assist and accommodate their children's needs better, creates a deprivation for the parents too, but this hurdle is overcome through an afternoon-shift at the Kiran School that provides graduates with after school support. Teachers are available who help the children with their homework; the students have access to computers, internet, printing stations and avail an in-house library. The following excerpts shed further light on how parents' are now constantly negotiating with their situations:

Im not a free-rider and I don't like being dependent on anyone. I have integrity and I want to be able to pay for my child's fees [...] they cannot be on scholarship forever. Why can't the schools make the fees reasonable so that it is affordable for parents? Why is education not subsidized? (Parent 6)

My son said to me once 'I want to be able to help you with my school fees'. I told him when he is older he can work part-time and tutor students and have some pocket money for himself or be able to pay for his college. Mostly I tell him he must concentrate on his studies and when he is older, he can get a good job and earn well. (Parent 1)

I tell her, why don't you study as hard as you can and then get a good job and then we can move into a better house. (Parent 2)

There is a dichotomy here on the extent of one's exercisable agency that has the potential to create conflicts in the future (Barker, 2005). Both parents and the children have developed a keen sense of agency and empowerment. They know that they lack capital and resources and they question their disadvantage. Then they are able to link it back to education and subsequently try to understand their marginalization. When they question, they begin to understand that education ought to be a basic right. But since they do not hold the state responsible for anything (this is perhaps one major area for activation of agency) they feel powerless, hence disabling agentic empowerment through dejection. Another interesting insight is that though the parents wish to pay for their children's school fee, this payment could lead to perpetuating the intergenerational contract (returns on investment) (Göransson 2009:9) into an allegiance pattern where a child's future earnings are tied to the family's well-being. As can be seen, the children already are worrying about the future of the household. At some point in time, this will curtail individual autonomy, thus balancing the sense of 'personal integrity' of the parents with 'individual autonomy' of the children is crucial for building a new doxa.

6.2.3. NEIGHBOURHOOD 'AS WE SOW SO SHALL WE REAP'

Nurtured and supervised children are able to resist against negative forces of the neighborhoods. That is why there is a lot of stress in the school on parenting. The following is an overview of the ensuing discussions:

If someone had come before and talked about these gangs, the situation Lyari is in today, wouldn't have happened. The child in the hearts of these gangsters wishes that they too had been saved by someone's guidance and then they would not have gotten into this quicksand. (Parent 12)

100 Children go to Kiran and in a few years these numbers and this mindset will grow and then they will not get negatively influenced. They have that confidence, they already know the difference between right and wrong, there will soon be no reason to fear the effect of this negative culture. (Parent 6)

My child says to me: 'mama the terrible things happening in Lyari have reduced, things are changing for the better'. His wisdom and earnestness astonished me. I did not ask him why he thought that. It is enough that he is thinking about it. (Parent 1)

The van driver refused to pick up my kids for school during a three-day shoot-out, they stayed home. (Parent 10)

The children are troubled by their social milieu and are engaged in reflexively understanding why the situation persists. They are able to understand the difference between alternative ways of 'being' and are able to resist falling prey to perverse habits that are a characteristic of their neighbourhood. They get affected when the violence gets worse in the neighbourhood and it adversely affects their school attendance. This was a cause for concern both the children and the parents. Moreover, with bridging social capital that is now becoming a part of their habitus, the young children who have been going to

upper-middle class schools are now beginning to see differences between the localities they go to for schooling and the locality they come back home to:

When we moved as a nuclear family in a new house my daughter said she wished she could pick up the house and put it in another neighbourhood closer to her school. (Parent 3)

My child says: 'my friends call me to their homes, but they do not come to my home, because it is dangerous to come to Lyari'. (Parent 1)

This can work in two ways: one, it creates a feeling of deprivation and in some cases it could lead to disappointment and dejection. Second, it could heighten ambition and the will to want to compete because their status as they know it now, is not ascribed, it can be achieved through hard work and talent. They have established networks and know that they now have more than one institutional fallback. The overall sentiments of the beneficiaries are summarized in the following excerpts:

It is word of mouth. Everyone in our community says we want to put our children in this school too. Children transform in this institution. This kind of positive energy spreads. Even random community members feel happy, for them the Kiran School is a ray of hope, for their own children. (Parent 5)

My daughter stands out, with her English accent and her western garb. She tells me she will never wear the burqa or chadder (shroud/ covering). I tell her to be careful and try to minimize her presence when walking to school. She says: 'this is who I am, and people must get used to me, they have become used to me, I will not change for them, they will change for me'. (Parent 3)

My son says: 'I will invent a device that will sense motion and will be placed under the streets of Lyari. When a person chewing tobacco will spit on the street the spit will bounce back and hit him/her on the face, when someone will throw rubbish the rubbish will be thrown back to his/her face. It is our responsibility to keep Lyari clean'. (Parent 1)

There is a positive spiral within the neighbourhood too. Crime and violence, though is a regular feature of their lives, the children have now found a way through this school to navigate this terrain with caution. Since innocence is bound to be lost, the school makes sure that it talks about how violence is perpetuated and how it can be curtailed. The establishment trains the children to foster a positive attitude and to stay in school.

Sabina asked us to keep a picture of ourselves as a snapshot from a mirror, what we were like [...] keep taking new snapshots of ourselves every year to see how we are growing, both in terms of grooming and in our thoughts and behaviours, and to tabulate that change for ourselves as a growth chart [...] I chart the environment at home and my children's progress [...] to see whether I am stagnant or have moved on [...] without Kiran School, I see many children, I see myself yelling and screaming, with an irritated face, wrinkled forehead, a cloth around my head. (Parent 1)

The above quote sums up the discussions on the school intervention acting as a change agent. It is able to do so with the help of those it aims to benefit. Active engagement, adaptation and evolution are the key elements that are ingrained in this system of educational dissemination. The goal is to continuously keep reflecting on oneself. To know where one started from and where one has reached. The habitus is continuously evolving and is able to understand the position of misrecognition and false power (Waquant, 1998). When the families compare their situations year after year, they feel

they have advanced and made positive changes. These are small steps in the right direction and that direction is achievement and success. This is where their previous positions of misrecognition are now converting into more self-aware positions where they understand there are structural holes they can fall through, but that there are ways to catch oneself, and keep moving forward.

7. CONCLUSION: WE NEED A SCATTER GUN NOT A MAGIC BULLET

'I used to think I was poor. Then they told me I wasn't poor, I was needy. Then they told me it was self-defeating to think of myself as needy, I was deprived. Oh not deprived, under-privileged. Then they told me under-privileged was overused, I was disadvantaged. I still don't have a dime, but I have a great vocabulary'. (Jules Feiffer)

Addressing the menace of urban poverty through education is like a blind man searching for a black cat in a dark room. This is how complex and multidimensional this phenomenon is. Poverty impedes social progress and the potential for human transformation because it inhibits the chances of individuals adjusting to paradigmatic shifts in economic, social and political systems. The interplay between what the condition is defined as from the perspective of those outside of its celestial galaxy to those whom it directly affects, determines the outcomes of a prescription aimed at addressing this societal malfunction we call 'poverty'. This case study of an educational 'school' intervention called the Kiran School functioning in a neighbourhood known for its violence and criminal sub-culture is a humble effort at describing how complex the terrain of policy-making is, when divorced from the sensitivity of the local context within which it operates. There are three key findings that are elaborated as follows. First, Lyari is characterized by large families in which parents are care-takers and decision makers for their children. They are also socializing agents transmitting traditional values that are negatively related to educational attainment i.e. early marriages, rigid gender roles, disabled individual autonomy, tolerance for apprenticeship at an early age, and a work ethic that is based on present-time orientation. Second, formal and informal schools working in the vicinity are of poor quality, are characterized by high drop-out rates and teacher absenteeism. Third, the slum neighbourhood is an informal urban regime characterized by drug operations, a prominent gun culture, patron-client relationships, and gang wars that adversely affects educational aspirations since youngsters (and adults alike) have more chances of falling into this downward spiral than being lifted out from it through poor role models or narratives of 'better times'. All these factors together lead to disempowerment of agency, which becomes a way of life. The Kiran School designed itself to adapt to and change the social milieu of Lyari through a holistic system of education that engaged students along with their families, connected them to other networks for micro-credit and employment

opportunities, and conducted regular meetings and counselling sessions with the parents addressing each of the three disempowering attributes through creative activation.

Family structures have begun to transform into nuclear set-ups, conjugal relationships are improving, fertility decisions have become more autonomous, the value of education in the family has increased, the children are enjoying their studies at upper-middle class English speaking schools and are navigating happily between their own neighbourhood and the one in which they go to school. Parents and children have become more reflexive and are constantly questioning their world views. The Kiran School is a domain of struggle and transformation that is seemingly yielding promising results after seven years of its operations in the urban slum. One has to proceed with caution however, because these changes may have multiple causes, and we therefore cannot be entirely sure whether they are entirely driven by this intervention or if they are part of a wider pattern of change- though from the narratives, it can be assumed that the intervention has a role to play.

As mentioned in section five, Pakistan's education system is extremely fragmented, its cities are rapidly urbanizing, and inequality is on the rise. A polarization between classes, ethnic groups, disconnect between urban centre and urban sprawl coupled with lack of human capital to navigate within this complex social terrain breeds frustration and becomes a recruiting ground for gangs, fundamentalists, and opportunists. A nation that has been struggling to build a state since 1947 must reap its currently underutilized 'demographic dividend' as a top priority. A restless, uneducated, out of school youth must be put to productive use to avoid civil discontent.

Levelling the playing field to reduce inequality requires not just a top-down approach achieved through big banner global projects like the MDG's Universal Primary Education for a country like Pakistan. There is a risk that when national educational policies succumb to global agendas, the cost is efficiency over equity. Without equity, in a fragmented social environment, education risks creating rifts and divisions in society, unless the stipulated role of education is to provide poor schools for poor people and thus produce a mass army of labour that caters to the informal markets within the national boundaries and chugs economic growth in the globalized world, at the cost of redistribution. To create similar world views, if the aim is to foster debate in society through agency freedom, context sensitive qualitative knowledge is required to provide education that is empowering. Basic needs must be fulfilled through the government and the state must guarantee citizenship rights and social insurance against the market forces. Moreover, standardization of the curriculum, medium of instruction and implementing a uniform system of quality education in the country is crucial, so that there is equality of opportunity in achievement. Furthermore, activating communities to enhance the control that poor people have over the services to which they are entitled; provision of micro finance programmes, public works programmes and food transfer

programmes to mitigate risk and enhance resilience of urban poor are also likely considerations. Finally, there is a need to augment social capital of the urban poor by assisting networks to engage with market and nonmarket institutions to strengthen their influence in society.

REFERENCES

- Adato, M., T. Roopnaraine, N. Smith, E. Altinok, N. Çelebioğlu, and S. Cemal. (2007). 'An Evaluation of the Conditional Cash Transfer program in Turkey: Second Qualitative and Anthropological Study'. Project Report. Washington, D.C.: International Food Policy Research Institute.
- AEPAM, (2009). *Pakistan Education Statistics 2008–09*. Islamabad: Academy for Education Planning and Management.
- Ahmad, S. (2009). 'Reasons for Poverty in Pakistan'. Business Recorder. Retrieved 25 December, 2013, from <http://www.Brecorder.com/index> last viewed on June 30, 2014.
- Ainsworth, James W. (2002). 'Why Does It Take a Village? The Mediation of Neighbourhood Effects on Educational Achievement'. *Social Forces* 81:117-152.
- Ali, S., Tahir, M. S. (2009). 'Reforming education in Pakistan – Tracing Global Links'. *Journal of Research and Reflections in Education*, 3(15), 1-16. Available at: Available at <http://ecommons.aku.edu/pakistan_ied_pdck/77> last viewed on August 01, 2014
- Arif, G.M. and Chaudhry, N. (2008). 'Demographic Transition and Youth Employment in Pakistan'. *The Pakistan Development Review* 47:1 pp. 27–70.
- Awan, M.S. and Nasir, Iqbal. (2010). 'Determinants of urban poverty: the case of medium sized city in Pakistan'. PIDE Working Paper 60, Pakistan Institute of Development Economics, Islamabad. Available at <[http://72.9.146.122/pdf/ Working%20Paper/WorkingPaper-60.pdf](http://72.9.146.122/pdf/Working%20Paper/WorkingPaper-60.pdf)> last viewed on August 2, 2014.
- Baker, J.L. (2008). 'Urban Poverty: A Global View'. The International Bank for Reconstruction and Development. UPE-5. The World Bank Washington DC. Available at <http://www.alnap.org/resource/9427> last viewed on July 30, 2014.
- Banerjee, Abhijeet and Duflo, Esther. (2011). *Poor Economics: Radical Re-thinking of the way to Fight Global Poverty*. Public Affairs Publishing. United States of America.
- Bano, Masooda. (n.d.). 'From Madrasas to Low-Cost Private Schools: Developing New Education Partnerships'. Available at http://www.sbs.ox.ac.uk/sites/default/files/Skoll_Centre/Docs/essay-masooda.pdf last viewed on July 31, 2014.
- Barker, Chris. (2005). *Cultural Studies: Theory and Practice*. Sage publications. London. United Kingdom.
- Bouillion C.P. Tejerina L. (2007). 'Do We Know What Works? A Systematic Review of Impact Evaluations of Social Programs in Latin America and the Caribbean'. Inter-American Development Bank Sustainable Development Department Poverty and Inequality Unit. Available at <http://ssrn.com/abstract=996502> last viewed on July 28, 2014.
- Bourdieu, P. (1977). 'Cultural Reproduction and Social Reproduction'. In Karabel, and Halsey, A. H., eds, *Power and Ideology in Education*. OUP, Oxford.

- Bourdieu, P. and Boltanski, L. (1981). 'The Education System and the Economy: Titles and Jobs'. In Lemert, C., ed, *Rupture and Renewal Since 1968*. CUP, New York.
- Bourdieu, P. (1989). 'The Forms of Capital'. In: Richardson, J. (editor) *Handbook of Theory and Research for Sociology of Education*. Westport: Greenwood Press, pp. 241-258
- Bourdieu, P. (1990). *In Other Words*. Polity Press, Cambridge.
- Burt, R.,S. (1997). 'The Contingent Value of Social Capital'. *Administrative Science Quarterly*, Vol. 42, Vol. 2, pp. 339-365.
- Burt, R.,S. (2004). 'Structural Holes and Good Ideas'. *American Journal of Sociology*, Vol. 110, No. 2, pp. 349-399.
- Calhoun, C. (1993). 'Habitus, Field, and Capital: The Question of Historical Specificity'. In *Bourdieu: Critical perspectives*, ed. C. Calhoun, E. LiPuma, and M. Postone, 61–88. Cambridge: Polity.
- Calhoun, C., LiPuma, E., Postone, M. (Eds.) (1993). *Bourdieu Critical Perspectives*. Cambridge: Polity Press.
- Cameron, Stuart (2010). 'Access to and Exclusion from Primary Education in Slums of Dhaka, Bangladesh'. Available at <http://www.create-rpc.org/pdf_documents/PTA45.pdf> last viewed on August 4 2014.
- Chambers, Robert (2007). *Poverty Research: Methodologies, Mindsets and Multidimensionality*. Institute of Development Studies Publishers, University of Sussex, United Kingdom.
- Chaudhury Nazmul, and Dilip Parajuli (2010) 'Conditional Cash Transfers and Female Schooling: The Impact of the Female School Stipend Program on Public School Enrollments in Punjab, Pakistan'. *Journal of Applied Economics*, 42, 3565–3583.
- Chisti, A.K. (2014) 'Gangs of Lyari'. Available at <http://www.thefridaytimes.com/tft/gangs-of-lyari/> last viewed on August 1, 2014.
- Creswell, J. (2007). *Qualitative Inquiry and Research Design*, Sage Publications, London.
- De Janvry, A. and Sadoulet, E. (2006). 'Making Conditional Cash Transfer Programmes More Efficient: Designing for Maximum Effect of the Conditionality'. *World Bank Economic Review*, 20.
- De La Rocha M.G. (2006). 'Vanishing Assets: Cumulative Disadvantage among the Urban Poor'. *The ANNALS of the American Academy of Political and Social Science* 606:68-94.
- De Vas, David. (2001). *Research Design in Social Research*. Sage Publications Ltd. London. UK.
- Dey, Ian. (1993). *Qualitative Data Analysis*. Routledge. New York. USA.
- Durlauf, Steven (2003) 'The Neighbourhood Effects'. Available at <http://www.econ.brown.edu/faculty/henderson/durlauf.pdf?q=durlauf> last viewed on August 9 2014.

- Dyer C. Rose P. (2006) *Chronic Poverty and Education: A Review of literature*. Revised draft. Manchester. Chronic Poverty Research Centre. January 2006.
- Fiszbein, A. and Schady, N. (2009). 'Conditional Cash Transfers: Reducing Present and Future Poverty'. Research Report available at http://siteresources.worldbank.org/INTCCT/Resources/5757608-1234228266004/00i-xviii_PRR-CCT_FM.pdf last viewed on August 1, 2014.
- Flyvbjerg, Bent (2006). 'Five Misunderstandings about Case Study Research'. *Qualitative Inquiry*, vol. 12, no. 2, pp. 219-245.
- Forrest, Brad (2010). 'Disaster in Pakistan: The legacy of Colonialism'. Available at <http://workerscompass.org/the-disaster-in-pakistan-legacy-of-colonialism/> last viewed on August 1 2014.
- Fukuyama, F., (1996). *Trust: The social virtues and the creation of prosperity*. New York: The Free Press.
- Gaventa, J. (2003). 'Power after Lukes: A Review of the Literature' Available at http://www.powercube.net/wp-content/uploads/2009/11/power_after_lukes.pdf last viewed on August 4 2014.
- George L. Alexandra & Bennett Andrew (2005) *Case Studies and Theory Development in the Social Sciences*, MIT press, London.
- Green Maia and Hulme David. (2005). 'From Correlates and Characteristics to Causes: Thinking About Poverty from a Chronic Poverty Perspective', *World Development Vol. 33, No. 6, pp. 867–879*.
- Greig Alan. (2009). 'Troublesome Masculinities: Masculinity in Trouble'. *IDS Bulletin Volume 40 Number 1*. Institute of Development Studies. Published by Blackwell Publishing Ltd., Oxford UK.
- Grenfell, M. (Ed.) (2008). *Pierre Bourdieu: Key Concepts*. Stocksfield: Acumen.
- Göransson, K. (2009) *The Binding Tie: Chinese Intergenerational Relations in Modern Singapore*. Honolulu: University of Hawaii Press.
- Harker, R., and S.A. May. (1993). 'Code and habitus: Comparing the accounts of Bernstein and Bourdieu'. *British Journal of Sociology of Education 14, no. 2: 169–78*.
- Hasan A and Mohib M. (n.d.). 'Urban Slums Report: The Case of Karachi, Pakistan'. Available at http://www.ucl.ac.uk/dpu-projects/Global_Report/pdfs/Karachi.pdf last viewed on August 9 2014.
- Haq, R. (2005) An Analysis of Poverty at the Local Level. *The Pakistan Development Review 44:4*.
- Helmke G and Levitsky. (2004). 'Informal Institutions and Comparative Politics: A Research Agenda'. *Perspectives on Politics, Vol. 2, No. 4:725-740*.
- Herreros, F., & Criado, H. (2008). The state and the development of social trust. *International Political Science Review, 29:53-71*.

- Hussain, I. (1999). *Pakistan: The Economy of an Elitist State*. Oxford University Press. Karachi, Pakistan.
- Jamal, H. (2005). 'In Search of Poverty Predictors: The Case of Urban and Rural Pakistan'. *The Pakistan Development Review* 44:1.
- Jenkins, R. (2002). *Pierre Bourdieu*. London: Routledge.
- Kabeer, N. (1999) 'Resources, Agency, Achievement: Reflections on the Measurement of Women's Empowerment'. *Development and Change* Vol. 30, no. 3, pp. 435-64.
- Kabeer N. Mumtaz K, Sayeed A. (2010) 'Beyond Risk Management: Vulnerability, Social Protection and Citizenship in Pakistan'. *Journal of International Development* Vol. 22, 1-19.
- Kabeer Naila. (2012). 'Empowerment, Citizenship and Gender Justice: A Contribution to Locally Grounded Theories of Change in Women's Lives'. *Ethics and Social Welfare* Vol 6:3, 216-232.
- Kandiyoti, D. (1988). 'Bargaining with Patriarchy'. *Gender and Society*, Vol. 2, no. 3, pp. 274-90.
- Kay, M.,F. & Johnston, R. (2007). 'Ubiquity and Disciplinary Contrasts of Social Capital'. In: Kay, M.,F. and Johnston, R. (editors) *Social Capital, Diversity, and the Welfare State*. Vancouver: UBC Press, pp.17-40.
- Khan, Shahinshah Baber. (2010). 'Problems in Universalization of Primary Education in Pakistan'. *Pakistan Journal of Commerce and Social Science* Vol. 4 (2), 147-155
- Khan, Faraz. (2012). 'Violence 101: A Primer to Lyari Gang War'. Available at <http://tribune.com.pk/story/372834/violence-101-a-primer-to-the-lyari-gang-war-karachi/> Retrieved on 1 August, 2014
- Kurosaki, T. and H. Khan. (2006) 'Human Capital, Productivity, and Stratification in Rural Pakistan'. *Review of Development Economics* 10:1.
- Lewis, Valerie A. (2009). 'Slums and Children's Disadvantage: The Case of India'. PHD thesis. Princeton University.
- Lindberg, Staffan. 2012, 'Community Studies- Learning what can be Generalized and Preparing for a Revisit', Lecture notes, Lund University, Sweden.
- Malik, Muhammed Iqbal. (2003). Institutional Failure in Pakistan. Available at <http://www.letsstartthinking.org/articles/Institutional%20Failure.pdf> last viewed on August 2, 2014.
- Masud M.M.H., Ahmmed H., Choudhury A.H. and Mustafa M.R. (2013). 'Pakistan: On the Way to be Failed State?' *Mediterranean Journal of Social Sciences* Vol. 4 (1) 63-70.
- May, Tim. (2002). *Qualitative Research in Action*, SAGE Publications Ltd, England, United Kingdom.
- May, Tim. (2011). *Social Research: Issues, Methods and Process*. Mc-Graw-Hill House. USA.

- McDowell, Linda (2008). 'Thinking Through Work: Complex Inequalities, Constructions of Difference and Trans-national Migrants'. *Progress in Human Geography* vol. 32 (4) pp. 491-507.
- Mistruelli F. and Heffernan C. (2012). 'The Shape of Change: A Memetic Analysis of the Definitions of Poverty from the 1970's to the 2000's'. *Journal of International Development*. 24, S3-S18
- Montgomery, Mark, Richard Stren, and Bamey Cohen. (2003). *Cities Transformed*. Washington, D.C.: National Academy Press.
- Moser, Caroline. (1996). 'Confronting crisis: A Comparative Study of Household Responses to Poverty and Vulnerability in Four Poor Urban Communities'. World Bank Environmentally Sustainable Development Studies and Monographs Series no. 8. Washington, DC: World Bank.
- Mugisha, F. (2006). 'School enrollment among urban non-slum, slum and rural children in Kenya: Is the urban advantage eroding?'. *International Journal of Educational Development* 26:471-482.
- Nash, R. (1990). 'Bourdieu on Education and Social and Cultural Reproduction'. *British journal of Sociology of Education*, 11(4), 431-447.
- North, D.C. (1990). *Institutions, Institutional Change and Economic Performance*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Petti, Jethro. (2006). Power and Pedagogy: Learning for Reflective Development Practice. IDS Bulletin Volume 37 Number 6 November 2006 © Institute of Development Studies
- Portes, A. (1998). 'Social Capital: Its Origins and Applications in Modern Sociology'. *Annual Review of Sociology*, Vol. 24, pp. 43-67
- Rahman, Tariq. (2010). 'The Education System in Pakistan with Respect to Inequality'. In Lyon S. and Edglar I.R. (ed.) *Shaping a Nation: An Examination of Education in Pakistan*. Oxford University Press.
- Ritzer, George. (1996). *Classical Sociological Theory*. McGraw-Hill Publishing Inc. Newyork.
- Salman, Ali. (2010). 'Liberate to learn: Education vouchers in Pakistan'. *Economic Affairs*, Vol. 30 (3) 35-41.
- Sampson, Robert J., Jeffrey D. Morenoff, and Thomas Gannon-Rowley. (2002). 'Assessing "Neighborhood Effects": Social Processes and New Directions in Research'. *Annual Review of Sociology* 28:443-478.
- Scott, Richard.W. (2010). 'Reflections: The Past and Future of Research on Institutions and Institutional Change' *Journal of Change Management* Vol. 10, No. 1, 5-21
- Sen, Amartya. (1999). *Development as Freedom*. Anchor Books. United States of America.
- Sen A and Hoff K. (2005) 'Kin as a Poverty Trap'. World Bank Policy Research Working Paper 3575. Available at <<http://elibrary.worldbank.org/doi/book/10.1596/1813-9450-3575>> last viewed on August 6 2014.

Small, Mario Luis, and Katherine Newman. (2001). 'Urban Poverty after The Truly Disadvantaged: The Rediscovery of the Family, the Neighborhood, and Culture'. *Annual Review of Sociology* 27:23-45.

Spicker, Paul (2007). *The Idea of Poverty*, The Policy Press, Great Britain

Sullivan Alice. (2002). 'How Useful is Bourdieu's Theory for Researchers?' *The Netherlands Journal of Social Sciences* Vol 38 – 110:2.

Temple-Reston, Dina. (2013). 'The Tony Soprano Of Karachi: Gangster Or Politician?' Available at <<http://www.npr.org/2013/01/02/168197733/the-tony-soprano-of-karachi-gangster-or-politician>> last viewed on August 1, 2014.

Tsujita, Yuko (2009). *Deprivation of Education in Urban Areas: A Basic Profile of Slum Children in Delhi, India*. IDE discussion paper no 199.

Tvedten Inge and Nangulah Selma. (1999). 'Social Relations of Poverty: A Case-Study from Owambo, Namibia'. Michelsen Institute. Development Studies and Human Rights. Norway. Available at < <http://www.cmi.no/publications/file/1085-social-relations-of-poverty>> last viewed on 20 March 2014.

UIS (2012). *Online Database and Glossary*. UNESCO Institute for Statistics. <http://www.uis.unesco.org>

UNESCO (2007). 'Urban Poverty and the Working Poor: Facing the Challenges of Urbanization and Urban Poverty In Asia and the Pacific'. Committee on Poverty Reduction. E/ESCAP/CPR(4)/4.

UNICEF 2012. Available at <http://www.unicef.org/bangladesh/Newsletter_21.pdf> last viewed on August 5, 2014.

UNESCO (2013). 'Education Transforms Lives'. Published by the United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization, Paris, France. Available at <http://unesdoc.unesco.org/images/0022/002231/223115e.pdf> last viewed on 2 August 2014

UNICEF (2013). 'Out-of-School Children in the Balochistan, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Punjab and Sindh Provinces of Pakistan', Islamabad, Pakistan.

Wacquant, L.J.D. (1998). 'Pierre Bourdieu'. In *Key sociological thinkers*, ed. R. Stones, 215–29. New York: New York University Press.

Wilson, William J. (1987). *The Truly Disadvantaged: The Inner City, the Underclass, and Public Policy*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.

Wood, G. & Gough, I. (2006) A Comparative Welfare Regime Approach to Global Social Policy. *World Development*, Vol. 34, No. 10, pp. 1696-1712

Xin, K. R., & Pearce, J. L. (1996). 'Guanxi: Connections as substitutes for formal institutional support'. *The Academy of Management Journal* Vol 39: 1641-58. <http://dx.doi.org/10.2307/257072>

Yasmeen G., Begum R., Mujtaba B.G. (2011). 'Human Development Challenges and Opportunities in Pakistan: Defying Income Inequality and Poverty'. *Journal of Business Studies Quarterly* Vol. 2, No. 3, pp. 1-12.

Yusuf, Huma. (2012). 'Conflict Dynamics in Karachi'. United States Institute of Peace 2301 Constitution Ave., NW Washington. Available at <<http://unesdoc.unesco.org/images/0022/002231/223115E.pdf>> last viewed on August 6, 2014.

Zaidi, Syed Hashim. (2011). 'Urban Poverty in Pakistan'. Master's Thesis. University of Texas at Austin. USA.

Zia, R. (2010). 'Social Justice and Access to Education: A Case study of Pakistan'. In Lyon S. and Edglar I.R. (ed.) *Shaping a Nation: An Examination of Education in Pakistan*. Oxford University Press.

Zia, S., and Bari, F. (1999). 'Baseline Report on Women's Participation in Political and Public Life in Pakistan'. Islamabad: Aurat Publication and Information Service Foundation.

APPENDIX I: INTERVIEW GUIDE

1. Socio-economic background /demographics:

- Q. What is your age?
- Q. What is your level of education or the number of years of schooling?
- Q. When did you get married?
- Q. How many children do you have?
- Q. Are you currently employed? If so, what is your occupation? What are your hours of work?
- Q. What is your income (or average income per person per month)?
- Q. What is the tenure of your residence in Liyari? Have you always lived in Liyari? Why live in Liyari?

2. Household Characteristics, housing/living conditions and material possessions

- Q. Could you describe your household?

3. Poverty

- Q. Can you describe your current life situation?
- Q. What is poverty?
- Q. How can your life be improved? What is missing? How can it be accessed?

4. Capabilities

- Q. How old was your child (in case of female child ask if there were any considerations taken into account) when he/she started with the Kiran School? Why did you take this decision?
- Q. Could you describe your life?
- Q. Could you describe your experience in the Kiran School?
- Q. What do you like about the school? What don't you like about the school?
- Q. Could you describe your relationships in the household? Who makes economic decisions at home? Whose decision was it to enrol your child in the Kiran School?
- Q. How does the neighbourhood of Liyari affect your lives? What is your coping strategy?

4. Empowerment

- Q. Who is responsible for your current station in life? Who is responsible for improving your lives?
- Q. Where and with whom (institutions) do you voice your frustrations, claims, complaints? Are you aware of your rights as a citizen of Liyari?

5. Future

- Q. What is your aspiration for the future?

APPENDIX II: DETAILS ABOUT THE INTERVIEWEES

Parent 1 interviewed on 08.03.2014

Parent 2 interviewed on 08.03.2014

Parent 3 interviewed on 08.03.2014

Parent 4 interviewed on 09.03.2014

Parent 5 interviewed on 09.03.2014

Parent 6 interviewed on 09.03.2014

Parent 7 interviewed on 10.03.2014

Parent 8 interviewed on 10.03.2014

Parent 9 interviewed on 10.03.2014

Parent 10 interviewed on 11.03.2014

Parent 11 interviewed on 11.03.2014

Parent 12 interviewed on 11.03.2014

School Staff 1 interviewed on 12.03.2014

School Staff 2 interviewed on 12.03.2014

Teacher 1 interviewed on 12.03.2014