



**LUND**  
UNIVERSITY

Lund University

Faculty of Social Science

Graduate School

Master of Science in Social Studies of Gender

Major: Gender Studies

[SIMV07 Spring, 2015](#)

Name: Sharmin Rashid

Personnummer: 880917 – 1781

Supervisor: Helle Rydstrøm



## Abstract

Begging has been one of the oldest coping mechanisms for the poor people in Bangladesh. However, social attitudes towards begging changed along the notion of modernization, with the changes in modes of production in which the productive potential of individuals was emphasized and begging became a direct threat to the prominent values such as work initiatives, stable social relations, and beauty and decency. This paper will contribute to our understanding of locating spheres of governmentality practices derived from the functioning of a civil society organization. The organization – Ain o Salish Kendro (ASK) located in Bangladesh have initiated a project named *Prevention of Child Begging*, and it is the experiences of these people involved in the project formulate the basis of analysis. At the same time, the paper will confirm that civil society is the location of power, struggle, resistance, and negotiation.

Keywords: Civil society, gender practices, and governmentality.



## Acknowledgement

I am grateful to my supervisor of this research, Helle Rydstrøm for her constant support and guideline. In times when I was lost doing field work and writing for this thesis she always brings me back to the track and I am indebted to her for both professional and mental support. I have received tremendous help from my department, Gender Studies. Particularly to mention Sara Goodman, Maja Sager, Rebecca Selberg, our Academic Advisor and International coordinator Helena Gyllensvärd, and my colleagues who have helped my writing through their valuable advice, suggestion, and references. I am also very grateful to me examiner Diana Mulinari for her constructive criticism which have helped me to look back issues that I could not at the first stage. I am also indebted to the Swedish South Asian Studies Network (SASNET) and to the South Asian Student Association (SASA) for their generous travel grant to conduct my fieldwork. Similarly, my utmost gratitude is to Ain o Salish Kendra (ASK), an organization that allowed me to conduct my fieldwork in their organization. I need to mention some other name who have helped me through their time and references – Mohammad Salehin, Shaheen Mushtaq, Shaheenur Rashid, Noore Wazid Lamin. Last but not Least I am indebted to my parents for their unfailing support. However, views in this paper and any errors are all mine.





## Table of Contents

<b>1. Introduction .....</b>	<b>1</b>
<b>1.1 Problem formulation.....</b>	<b>2</b>
<b>1.2 Research questions .....</b>	<b>3</b>
<b>1.3 Research Objective:.....</b>	<b>4</b>
<b>1.4 The state of research.....</b>	<b>4</b>
1.4.1 Existing scholarship on legal Justification.....	5
1.4.2 Research on Begging in Bangladesh.....	8
<b>2 Contextualizing ASK and Prevention of Child Begging Project.....</b>	<b>10</b>
<b>2.1 ASK as an Organization.....</b>	<b>10</b>
<b>2.2 Prevention of Child Begging Project from ASK.....</b>	<b>12</b>
2.2.1 Background of the proposed work done so far .....	13
2.2.2 Problem identification.....	13
2.2.3 Project constituencies.....	13
2.2.4 Advocacy with Governmental institution and other collaborative partners.....	14
<b>3. Methodological consideration.....</b>	<b>15</b>
<b>3.1 The role of the (feminist) researcher .....</b>	<b>15</b>
<b>3.2. Ethics.....</b>	<b>15</b>
<b>3.3 The research process .....</b>	<b>16</b>
3.3.1 Research design.....	17
3.3.2 Gaining access .....	18
3.3.3 Sampling: place to interview.....	18
3.3.4 The interviews.....	19
3.3.5 Focus Group Discussion (FGD).....	20
<b>3.4 Interview material .....</b>	<b>21</b>
<b>4. Theoretical framework: Civil Society and its relationship with states, governmentality</b>	<b>22</b>
<b>4.1 Civil Society and State .....</b>	<b>22</b>
<b>4.2 Civil Society in Asia .....</b>	<b>24</b>
<b>4.3 Governmentality.....</b>	<b>27</b>
4.3.1 Foucault's on 'the free subject' and 'the state' .....	28
<b>5. Civil society, governmentality and 'Prevention of Child Begging' project .....</b>	<b>30</b>
<b>5.1 Gender-based oppression and traditional culture .....</b>	<b>30</b>
<b>5.2 Gender practices and measures by Prevention of Begging Project .....</b>	<b>34</b>
<b>5.3 Consent towards the aim of the project .....</b>	<b>40</b>
<b>5.4 Collaborative partner of the project .....</b>	<b>43</b>
<b>5.5 Ideology, Conflict, Resistance .....</b>	<b>46</b>

5.5.1 Clashes of ideology .....	47
<b>5.6 Negotiation process: How ASK is responding in line with government initiatives.....</b>	<b>50</b>
<b>6. Concluding discussion .....</b>	<b>53</b>

## 1. Introduction

How civil society organization as an authoritative body of governance designs tools to govern marginalized section of the society? It is the imperative that overall guided this research and to explore the answer of this question contextualizing a civil society organization with its political juncture came into focus. Since governmentality was a theoretical basis to provide an answer to this question, data focused on the mechanism through which civil society organization discursively functioning indicates that its conflicts are inevitable. Therefore, it needs to be negotiated finding threads in everyday lived experiences which are already gendered finding synthesis in structural inequalities. However, other sorts of negotiation happen with collaborative bodies with which civil society practices governance. It is a contribution of this thesis that stress the more the organization can accept different political stance the more it create its path in the web of governance. Nevertheless, to limit the scope of the thesis only a few trends are highlighted those are circuitously connected to multifaceted experiences from gender relation and beggary in an urban city like Dhaka, Bangladesh. Those trends were influenced by experiences both gathered by a civil society organization named Ain o Salish Kendra (ASK) while running a project called 'Prevention of Child Begging' and by those they are including in the project – the beggars.

During the time of the Vagrant and Shelter-less persons (rehabilitation) Act 2011, ASK together with other civil society organization took seriously the issue of begging. ASK consider themselves as a leading civil society organization of Bangladesh having a legacy to report on the human rights issue to the international body. Together with many other campaigns from human rights activists and local television reporting on the heinous criminal activity based on child beggary it raises conscious both in the national and international sphere (Burke and Hammadi, 2011). However, still there is a lack of proving but it is a well-known allegation that these activities happen within big gangs. In this situation government also disperse some of its responsibility to the organization that becomes motivated to take action against it. It is the first initiation of this thesis motivated to lights on. It is important to understand the process in which governmentality is practiced throughout since it is an active mechanism goes in and out to both comply and resist state's intervention.

The paper is thus structured around the interview material based on the Prevention of Child Begging project. The introductory chapter outlines the context in which the project is situated relating it to the existing scholarship on beggary. The chapter concludes with the research question that will help to achieve sets objectives. The following chapter introduces and contextualizes the organization and then incorporates a brief consideration of the project itself. The chapter next stress methodological and theoretical consideration. The fifth chapter analyzes material gathered through interviews and reports on the project. The last chapter initiates a concluding discussion which is structured around whether the initially composed research question enabled to achieve objectives sets out for the research.

### **1.1 Problem formulation**

Dhaka – convincing around 300,000-400,000 new migrant each year, expecting to reach 20 million people by 2020 and will make the 3<sup>rd</sup> largest city of the world (World Bank, 2006, 2007). Mostly coming from rural areas these people search for new livelihood opportunities, translating a fortune in their living standards (World Bank, 2007). Having a centralized administrative system, this rapid mass urbanization has brought serious consequences to stabilize social justice and equity (Hossain, 2006). Soon after independence in 1971, though the economy of Bangladesh used to depend largely on agriculture it quite swiftly shifted to liberal, industry-based economy. Based on the classic liberal assumption it is at injunction of the state agency to employ their remarkable abilities to shape our activities and performance, yet it has to achieve in mutual acceptance (Stears, 2007). However, the motivation of shifting the economy towards industrialization left behind the vulnerable group of society. These groups of people often cannot cope with the shift and finding no other ways of survival chose to beg, later may fall into the proposition that they consider begging as a profitable business supported further by social and religious sentiments of the people (Mahmud 2011 cited in Uddin, Aktar and Sultana, 2014, p.2)

Be that as it may, social attitudes towards begging have changed. Through the change in modes of production in which the productive potential of individuals have marveled begging became a direct threat to the prominent values such as work initiative, stable social relations, and beauty and decency. As a result, begging lost the usual support of the masses (Ramanathan, 2008).

Within the limited scope, however, ASK have been conducting the survey to find out whether those children who are engaged in begging are interested in carrying out begging in their life ahead. The statistics prepared by the Child Rights Unit of ASK, under the mentioned project, showed that out of 239 children found in begging during spot visit, a total of 183 children were below ten years. ASK reported this to the concerned ministry as a shame and a horrible feature of society that they are employed in begging at such a young age when they can barely take a decision of their life. Moreover, only 4 of them expressed their interest in begging; therefore, ASK mentioning the structure of the survey generalized that those “children who are engaged in begging are somehow forced to beg against their will or interest” (Staff Correspondence, 2014, p.14).

Besides that there is a growing irritation among city dwellers being bumped by street beggars, especially if the beggar is a child. Having various kinds ranging from occasional/seasonal, disabled, men, women and children (Huda, 2010 cited in Uddin, Aktar and Sultana, 2014, p.2), bagging have raised the consciousness of government. However, according to ASK there is an adequate legal mechanism to fight against child begging. Highlighting The Children Act, 2013 ASK stress that though the act does not provide any juridical provision, yet the offense under Section 70 and 71 of the present act is "cognizable as per provision of the Schedule II of the Code of Criminal Procedure, 1898" (Staff Correspondence, 2014, p.14). Nevertheless, ASK started the Prevention of Child Begging project out of the realization that only legal provision is not enough to abolish child begging, instead a collaborative afford among all the actors involved is necessary. This is the point of departure from which my thesis finds its sphere of intervention. It is a constellation of governmental power functioning through acceptance, resistance, and negotiation.

## 1.2 Research questions

In order to have a framework for data collection and data analysis, the following research question is formulated as - *What is motivating ASK to fight for the beggar's right?*

To further guide the broad research question two sub-questions is followed:

1. What measures has ASK put in place to fight for the rights of beggars?

2. What are the priorities of beggars regarding this organization?

### **1.3 Research Objective:**

The above-mentioned research question is hoped to achieve the following objectives.

1. To explore how ASK is responding in line with government initiatives.
2. To explore how gender as a social construct is being highlighted in such response.
3. To explore how ASK priorities measure to put in place for beggars.
4. To explore gender-specific experiences of those people, ASK takes under 'Prevention of Child Begging' project.
5. To examine the line of governmentality throughout the way, the above-mentioned project is functioning.

### **1.4 The state of research**

In this section, a brief account of existing literature will be presented. The contexts of this literature are mostly based on Bangladesh, yet some conducted in the Indian context. The reason to search in these two contexts is the similarity of orientation in measures applied in begging and circumstances in which that measure are applied. Before that, I need to mention what does the terminology of begging means.

In its simplest form begging refers to asking for alms or charity and people out of sympathy gave alms to the poor (Macdonald, 1972 cited in Uddin, Aktar and Sultana, 2014, p.3). The Bombay Prevention of Begging Act, 1959 defines a 'beggar' as "one soliciting or receiving alms in public place whether or not under any pretense such a selling article or performing, exhibiting injury of self or other, having no visible subsistence and wandering". Age, character, and circumstances in which the "beggar" is living would also be examined as important characteristics to process and punish him/her under the beggary prevention legislation (BPBA, 1959).

### 1.4.1 Existing scholarship on legal Justification

In this part it will be discussed how the justification for the criminalization of beggary appeared; consequently the operationalization of such law in the context of Bangladesh and India will be followed.

A revisit of the older English legislation concentrated on evaluating historical and contemporary justifications for the offenses of vagrancy and begging. A constructive effort to trace back the legislative history of the older vagrancy offenses reveals that there is no normative justification for the continuation of such measure (Baker, 2009). There is a contradictory effect between the Vagrancy Act 1824 and article 3, 5 and 8 of the European Convention on Human Rights<sup>1</sup>, an emphasis that any criminalization as a legislative response needs justification, requiring the involvement of handling a genuine societal problem (ibid,p.213). The study advocated that begging should not be considered as a punishment provision since it does not objectively bring any harm to the society.

The contemporary justification for criminalizing beggary is highly motivated by ‘Broken Window’ theory (ibid, p.221). James Q Wilson and George Kelling in 1982 introduced this hypothesis that depicts by establishing control over minor disorder serious crime can be prevented (Wilson and Kelling, 1982 cited in Harcourt and Ludwig, 2006, p.272). Harcourt and Ludwig (2006) reexamined the 2001 Kelling and Sousa, Jr., (2001) study<sup>2</sup>; moreover, they been able to overcome some of the limitation found in the previous empirical testing of the theory.

---

<sup>1</sup>European Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms, 4 November 1950, 213 UNTS 222 (entered into force generally on 3 September 1953).

<sup>2</sup>Kelling, G. and Sousa, Jr., W. (2001). *Do Police Matter?: An Analysis of the Impact of New York City's Police Reforms*. Civic Report No 22. [online] Manhattan Institute Center for Civic Innovation. Available at [http://www.manhattan-institute.org/pdf/cr\\_22.pdf](http://www.manhattan-institute.org/pdf/cr_22.pdf) [Accessed 14 Sep. 2015].(which support the Broken Window hypothesis by showing that aggressive arrest policies for minor crimes in New York City resulted in the significant drop in crime during the mid-to-late 1990s). Harcourt, B, & Ludwig, J (2006).Broken windows: New evidence from New York City and a five-city social experiment. *University Of Chicago Law Review*, 73, pp. 271-320. (However, other possible explanation for this drop in crime, such as low unemployment from a booming economy, decline use of cocaine and demographic aspects of that particular time have not been taken into consideration).

The experiment conducted in the New York City together with other five cities showed no support for the relationship between disorder and crime, whereas, the hypothesis of the broken window stress that there exists a developmental sequence between disorder and crime. However, broken window thesis has been widely used to support the government's claim to criminalize beggary (Harcourt and Ludwig, 2006, p.221).

Begging as an offense in India derived from the Vagrancy Act 1824, United Kingdom. In many studies the way criminalization of beggary has been defined under the Bombay Prevention of Begging Act, 1959 revealed that it has led to the victimization of a mass of people and thus, increased harassment.<sup>3</sup> Unjustifiable arrests and afterward ineffective rehabilitation mechanism revealed into studies (Ramanathan, 2008; Nagarathna, Jaishankar and Ronel,ed, 2011). In fact legal aid provision is a recent addition for these arrests, started from 2000 (Mukherjee, 2008). In the Indian context, studies indicate the treatment of those who are ostensibly poor under these acts and the denial of rights to them, thereby rendering it unconstitutional. The protest of different civil society organizations has not yet resulted in change in the laws (Ramanathan, 2008). Discussion on rights of beggars and vagrants attempts to trace the historical roots of the phenomena of begging, locate the origins of beggary and evaluate the realities of the beggary law administration and legal measures for protection of the beggars. It reveals that purpose of the act was the reformation of persons in begging who are forced by difficult circumstances to be on the streets. However, with its unconstitutional framework, the act has turned out to be one of the most patent anti-poor documents (Pande, 1986).

However, there is no common law applicable in everywhere India for the prevention and control of beggary. In 20 State Governments and 2 Union Territories have enacted anti-beggary laws but they have wide variations in legal provisions administrative procedures and quality of services.

---

<sup>3</sup>Ramanathan, U 2008, 'Ostensible Poverty, Beggary and the Law', *Economic and Political Weekly*, 44, p. 33, JSTOR Journals, EBSCOhost, viewed 12 December 2014. (Arbitrary arrest and criminal complaint which induce to implement BPBA, 1959 has been revealed in this study. These cases lead to the practice such as clearing the streets.) Mukherjee, D 2008, 'Laws For Beggars, Justice for Whom: A Critical Review of the Bombay Prevention of Begging Act 1959', *International Journal Of Human Rights*, 12, 2, pp. 279-288, Political Science Complete, EBSCOhost, viewed 7 January 2015. (Other cases of arbitrary arrest under this law revealed in this study)

The literature discussed above informed existing approach is primarily based on punitive devices, with a little specific and comprehensive procedure for a diversified program of care, treatment and rehabilitation of different categories of beggars. Even in the State and Union Territories where the laws have been enforced, the coverage thereof has been limited to specified areas. The enforcement machinery invariably functions in an ad-hoc manner without the requisite support from the government. Though the State laws provide for the involvement of voluntary organizations at various stages of the handling of persons apprehended as beggars, it is important to explore how they are cooperating with governmental initiatives to comprehend the handling of this phenomenon.

Studies in the Indian context reveals similarities with what 'Prevention of Child Begging' project advocates for. In the initiative to understand the tenets and factors related to the criminalization of beggary in the Indian context, it has been suggested that a humanistic attempt involving both a punitive and therapeutic initiation is needed. The focus of the study was to review criminological principles from relevant texts and articles and they stress how criminalization of begging is unjustified since it is lack of 'means era'<sup>4</sup> of criminal law (Nagarathna, Jaishankar, and Ronel.,ed, 2011).

Parliament of Bangladesh has ratified *The Vagrants and Shelterless Persons Act 2011* on August 25, 2011. The law empowers the police and judicial officers to capture suspected vagrants and detain them for up to two years in rehabilitation centers, and attempt to escape from these centers will leads to a punishment of up to three months of imprisonment (Rahman, 2015). It is expected to run the rehabilitation program by the money that would come from the detainees (Dempsey, 2011). Similar to the Indian context the law was originally enacted to rehabilitate the homeless. However, concerned personnel of this project confirmed what have been reported recently in the

---

<sup>4</sup>Nagarathna, A., Jaishankar, K., and Ronel.,ed, N. (2011). Criminalization of beggary: A critical look at the existing Indian legal approach. In: *First International Conference of the South Asian Society of Criminology and Victimology (SASCV)*. Jaipur, Rajasthan, India.: South Asian Society of Criminology and Victimology (SASCV) and Department of Criminology and Criminal Justice. (In the paper 'means era' has been mentioned as "the 'state of mind' of a person of a person in form of 'intention' or 'knowledge' to commit a wrong" (ibid, p.268).

newspaper article that detainees are being tortured and sexually abused by the people in charge of these centers.

Again human rights activist come along to protest out of their concern, for example, the National Human Rights Commission (NHRC) expressed it to be a violation of the civil rights of the poor people. Similar to what Kelling and Sousa study in 2001, the *Vagrants and Shelterless Persons Act 2011* brands homeless people as possible criminals. Like the Indian context, it gives the authority to pick up any vagabond anytime needing no grounds. Such views shared in the roundtable discussion by civil society organizations held right after the enactment (Staff, 2011). A report about the roundtable titled *Vagrant and Shelterless Persons (rehabilitation) Act 2011: Protest and assessment* published in a daily newspaper named The Daily Star. NGO such as BRAC, Human rights organization ASK, legal aid organization Bangladesh Legal Aid Services Trust (BLAST) all come along in the discussion (ibid). While enforcing the law government wanted advice from ASK. The organization conducted a survey with 50 beggars to understand what they need and what should be the parameters of this act. Under this law, some places have been selected as safe zones where begging is not allowed. There is a mobile court which takes care of this if any beggar is found in those areas then deport them to other areas where begging is not prohibited. ASK's project personnel informed that there are some safe houses where beggars are kept, but these safe houses are not in a good condition: low-quality food, no mental support and it is said that poor people are not getting better in any ways. The authorities of these safe houses tend not to admit the fact at all. They say everything is running perfectly when they report higher authority. Still, there are beggars in the prohibited areas; however, in case of an inspection by the mobile court then, it forces beggars to move away.

#### **1.4.2 Research on Begging in Bangladesh**

Domestic research on the issue of begging also highlighted forced begging especially among children. There is research attempted to investigate on the vested syndicate - who are bringing children from the countryside, disfiguring them barbarically to gain sympathy and force them to sit for begging (Helal and Kabir, 2013). Research on the domestic level indicates that a lot of other criminal activities conjure up with begging – abduction, maimed, drug and alcohol abuse etc. Begging as a profitable business amalgam with big mafia leaders since allegation says that at

the end of the day beggars hand in all the alms to the mafia in exchange of minimal basic human needs or may be for drugs or alcohol (ibid).

Another research focusing on socio-economic-cultural realities of the beggars explores work value among beggars. Whether beggars are interested in taking begging as a profession or they are compelled to do so finding no other alternatives have been problematized by anthropologic, psychology, management researcher (see Uddin, Akter and Sultana, 2014, Malik and Roy, 2012) It is quite interesting to see even though majority (75%) of the beggars tried other income sources before engaging in begging, yet more than half is not trying for another job while begging, nevertheless they are not happy with their profession (Uddin, Akter and Sultana, 2014). Similar to the data presented in the next chapter, this research argued that along with rehabilitation programs developing awareness and self-disgust needs special attention. Furthermore, raising self-esteem rather than increasing legal enforcement is recommended (Uddin, Akter and Sultana, 2014, Malik and Roy, 2012), also this might have motivated civil society actor like this (ASK) organization. In the Indian context governmental survey by Social Welfare Department of the Delhi in 2009 and Social Development Centre of Mumbai in 2004 revealed begging as a profitable profession (Malik and Roy, 2012). However, civil society actors in this research opine that such attitudes perceive among beggars in the Dhaka city as well. Most of these literature shapes up the way civil society organization, in general, are justifying their activities, at least it is evidential in the data presented in chapter 5. Yet, there is a gap in the scholarly literature on how civil society itself as an autonomous actor contributing to knowledge.

A lot of studies intended to figure out the condition that allows begging in different parts of the world. Correlation of drug addiction and homelessness with begging in Melbourne, Australia (Driscoll and Wood, 1998 cited in Uddin, Aktar and Sultana, 2014), social exclusion and isolation increases begging in the United Kingdom (Kemp, 1997), all these study shaping ideas that begging as an undesirable outcome of society. Though Kemp's study conducted on homeless people using hostels, night shelters and bed and breakfast (B&B) hostel, it mentioned begging among these people prevails as a significant and precarious source of income. Moreover, apart from getting prosecuted under the 1824 Vagrancy Act and moved by the police, it has been considered by them as a humiliating way of earning money.

Apart from that research on the living condition in urban settings contributed to scholarship on begging in general. These research informed illiteracy, poverty, ignorance, lack of self-esteem deemed to have pushed people begging in the local context (Mahmud, 2011), high dependency rate among poor (Afsar, 2000), context specific variation regarding socioeconomic condition, physical disability, religious sentiments and natural calamities (Ahmadullah, 1962) all seemed to have done the same. Research conducted particularly in Dhaka city contributed to categories beggars based on their reason of begging (Narayan and Petesch, 2000). Indicating poverty to be the main perpetrator, under helpless poor it categorizes those who can not avail basic supports for a living and under bottom poor it includes those are destitute having no means for earning. However, though it is not clearly stated, yet, the differentiating line between these two categories exceeds each other and women consists high proportion in it due to their long stay in the poverty cycle.

## **2 Contextualizing ASK and Prevention of Child Begging Project**

Begging is a common scenario in most of the developing countries. Logically, as a developing country Bangladesh comes with no surprise. The capital of Bangladesh Dhaka alone has 40,000 beggars. Basically, Poverty drives these people to choose to beg as a profession (Helal and Kabir, 2013). Moreover, social cultural realities and religious belief among people inspires poor individuals to pick out this lifestyle. However, 75% beggars in Dhaka city have tried to get another income source before starting begging. Sadly, 5% beggars are street children and they follow their parent's lifestyle. Furthermore, 30% beggars of Dhaka city would go for another profession if they were offered another income source. It is visible that, education, efficient financial support, and training will surely play an important role in terms of dealing with begging phenomenon (Uddin, Aktar and Sultana, 2014).

### **2.1 ASK as an Organization**

ASK is a humanitarian organization that aims to establish a society, which is based upon gender equality, equity, secularism, law, social justice and democracy. The basic principle is to secure human rights in three different levels, institutions, individuals, and society. Moreover, 27 years of experience enabled ASK to focus on the exact points where people need help to shape up their

lives, which is just from human rights perspective. Additionally, in the 30 districts of Bangladesh they have different projects going on, dealing with ordinary people and children trying to establish human rights in several ways. Furthermore, international organizations, the government of Bangladesh both prefers to follow ASK's advice in terms of maintaining human rights and forming legislation. While trying to change society for the betterment, concrete understanding of the social system is nothing but necessity. A social system is like a living organism, to impose changes on it, dynamic mutating steps are required. While trying to implement women empowerment, issues like stalking, sexual harassment occur which can even result to suicide. Another example would be trying to stop child labor; surprisingly it can be the reason behind girl child ending up at sex industry. ASK knows these complicated issues and well aware of managing it in a balanced and optimized way (Alam, 2013, pp.7-8).

According to ASK in Bangladesh 1 out of every 17 children between the age of 5 and 17 works for a living. Many poor children randomly migrate to cities in order to change their financial condition and become victims of abuse, exploitation, and violence. In the urban area, 9% of the children are engaged in begging. ASK recognizes socio-economic reason such as property, landlessness, unemployment, river erosion, broken family, family feud along with natural phenomenon especially flood, cyclone are pushing factor for their migration in the city where they ultimately find themselves in begging. Overall, ASK cited reasons for coming to cities are mostly economic and services available in the modern city life; however, which is also for many an alternative to violence and abuse they experienced in their family or village community. The nature of employment is considered to be destroyers of self-esteem, seriously hampering their physical and mental development (Staff Correspondence, 2014, p.1). Unequal economic progress leads the situation. It is still a prevailing culture in the society allowing sympathy from the general public (ibid), this notion of sympathy have leads adults to force children in begging. This might be a tricky situation for civil society organization to raise an action against begging and general people may feel very reluctant and sort of hopeless towards making initiatives. Part of this ignorance is also because the amount of such population is huge and governmental initiatives for civil society are not up to the mark. Especially if it is a child beggar, the chances of getting money increase finding its basis on sympathy value. This encourages many poor parents to engage their children in begging. To many disabled children, it is apparently their last survival resort having no other alternatives. This situation even mystifies with the existence of some

hidden syndicate controlling beggars in a group. According to ASK Position Paper later confirmed by project personnel, though it is a well-known allegation there is no authentic fact-finding investigation or report as a reference point (ibid).

As a signatory of Universal Declaration of Human Rights, 1948, Bangladesh opens up for the global community to intervene, as the discourse of human rights does to tackle the countless global social problem. Since the protocol set up by the UN for monitoring compliances with HR Covenants, it has opened up expanded opportunities for civil society groups and rights activists to mobilize public opinion and bring pressure on the government for legal reform (Alam, 2013, pp. 9-10). ASK acts as the Secretariat for reporting on the HR situation in Bangladesh to international bodies or is called upon by regional networks to assess the performance of the National Human Rights Commission, or comment on draft legislation proposed by the Government (ibid, p.7). ASK also runs different kind of investigation as well to measure the type of violence occurs in society. These investigations gave this organization a concrete ground to work on their sector. ASK's agenda strongly affirms that child begging cannot be justified nevertheless whatever is the individual and collective socio-economic situation of the country. As a social actor of civil society ASK recognizes its responsibilities but indicates states should envisage providing basic needs of these children. ASK recognizes its social responsibility in vision committed to bringing about a wholesale change in the system; such change is to signal society's capacity to value and maintain human rights. The notion of human rights to this organization is bound to be operational through standardized mechanisms in institutional form as law and procedures, with conscious interaction and participation of individual and civil society within it (Alam, 2013, p.7). It stresses that about culture of a given society which condones violence and retaliation in social relations and corruption is accepted as inbred human nature in law enforcement and institution, it constraint individual to develop a sense of rights and the society fails in ensuring equality and dignity of all citizens and the rule of law.

## **2.2 Prevention of Child Begging Project from ASK**

From 2013 onwards AKS is working in this prevention of child begging project, before starting this project a survey were conducted to have an overview of the situation in different areas of the Dhaka city. Result acquired from the survey showed that in Mirpur there are lots of children

begging due to having Majar (Majar, it refers to someone's grave surrounded by religious manifestations). At the beginning the project started with a two-room apartment office, the target was to start with 100 children but the real scenario was quite overwhelming, surprisingly the project started with 200 children. Participation in the mentioned survey together with permission from their parents was two selection criteria for children to get admitted into the program (Staff Correspondence, 2014).

### **2.2.1 Background of the proposed work done so far**

Bangladesh is committed to end child labor and has ratified the Child Rights and ILO Convention. ASK refers to analyze the situation in the lens of UNCRC according to which child begging is a serious violation of child rights. Employing children for begging is not only harmful to the psychological growth of a child but also hazardous for overall mental and physical development of the child. On many occasion, children are bound to stay on the roadside for long hours asking for money from the passerby. Sometimes, they become the victim of cruelty or even face permanent disability only for the purpose of being used in begging (ibid).

### **2.2.2 Problem identification**

36 percent of the population of Bangladesh earn less than one dollar per day. With this financial situation, it is no wonder that 38000 children of this country are engaged in begging. It is nothing but a social malaise, which destroys self-respect among children, deprives them of all basic rights. When they grow up, they become the burden of the society and engage themselves in different kinds of crimes. For these reasons, it is very important to protect these children from being a part of this inhuman situation (ibid).

### **2.2.3 Project constituencies**

There is two location of this project - Mohammadpur and Mirpur of Dhaka City Corporation where most of the slum children are engaged in begging (ibid). The basic focus group of this project is children who are engaged in begging. This project works towards achieving a society where begging is not an option. Under the project, there are pre-schools for the street children which are to prepare them to join in the formal primary school. Support does not end here, when they are over 18 years ASK finds them sponsors in order to continue their study. Parents of these children get training from ASK for changing their financial situation. Moreover, excursions, art

competition, music class and other recreational activities for children are offered in mentioned pre-schools as well.

#### **2.2.4 Advocacy with Governmental institution and other collaborative partners**

In order to change the situation help from the government is needed, there is a different ministry that work with children to make sure their rights are well preserved. Government of Bangladesh signed and ratified the Convention on the Rights of the children which show determination towards achieving child rights. However, till now the project approach to Social Welfare Ministry of Bangladesh. It is described in the project proposition that if the project deems success, recommendations for the protection of children will be submitted to government authority for needed implementation.

Moreover, the project considers that strategic effort and social movement is needed to change the situation of begging. Therefore, education is not the only key of success; combined effort from different social sectors and organization will do the job. Moreover, a movement to create awareness among people will change their traditional attitude about begging. A different organization like child governance assembly networks is also parts of this project in order to do advocacy of children engaged in begging. Media was recognized as an important part of this project for creating awareness, conducting baseline survey by photography and article. Corporate sectors can contribute as part of their corporate social responsibility to change these children's lives.

Municipality and ward commissioner can play a very important role towards achieving the goal of this project. However, from the past experience it says that they are not helpful in terms of supporting projects like this. Co- operation from the city corporation and other organization can help a great deal in rehabilitating these street children. Therefore, pursuing them to work with AKS is one of the concerns of the project as well.

There are community-based organizations that help children in several ways. Various kinds of clubs, cable TV networks, and health campaigns etc. creates awareness among people about the cognitive and mental growth of children. Support from organizations like this will make this project nothing but goal oriented. Primary and secondary school teacher plays an important role

in terms of bringing changes in the society. The project recognizes effort from school is necessary for dealing with the ongoing situation.

### **3. Methodological consideration**

My methodological choices are inspired by critical feminist epistemology and post-structuralism (particularly, the scholarship of biopolitics). Following a dialogue with feminist epistemological insights, a reflexive outline of the research process will be presented. In the first section, I will present some epistemological standpoint that are central to my work and help me to situate myself as a scholar and in this stage of my life a humanist and a feminist. This will be followed by an outline for possible practical consideration required to conduct fieldwork for a research based on case studies. Later in the chapter the process of turning empirical material derived from semi-structured interviews into data will be discussed. Finally, this chapter will conclude with a reflection on the process of analysis.

#### **3.1 The role of the (feminist) researcher**

In the aim of revealing the truth, scientific research employed techniques of knowledge production. It is an important contribution of feminist researchers that bring our attention to the enterprise of the apolitical claim of knowledge production. Highlighting the epistemological construction of the researchers this scholarship argued that in every step in the research process when we made methodological choices it become a political enterprise.

#### **3.2. Ethics**

The research was conducted taking consent from the head of the Child Units under which the 'Prevention of Child Begging' project is running. A cover letter explaining research objectives, a brief framework of the research design and an initial methodology was submitted to them. However, the concerned authority allowed me to mention the name of the organization, the unit under which the project is running and the name of the project. Although I was not allowed to mention the name of any of my interviewee and their designation but in special case I was allowed after asking their permission.

The aim of the research was always clearly mentioned to every respondent both by presenting the documents and describing it orally. Every aspect including the selection process of the respondents to the final analysis was promised to share with the respondents by sending a soft

copy to the respective organization. In case of relocation of the respondents, consent was taken to whom the report should be shared. My interviewee from the beneficiary category agreed to me sending the copy to the organization in case they have any inquiries.

### 3.3 The research process

The choice to focus on begging was based on the event of the Vagrant and Shelterless persons (rehabilitation) Act 2011 when civil society – consists of NGOs, human rights activists, legal aid organization, international correspondence – came along to recognize the act as resulted as a tool to put the shelter-less behind the bars (Staff, 2011). It was also influenced by human rights campaigners and local television company's influential coverage in 2010 on how criminals abduct and maim children before putting them into work as beggars (Burke and Hammadi, 2011). Although such practices have been frequently reported yet, hard evidence is still very rare. This is evidential even in the 'Prevention of Child Begging' project by ASK, where their experience regarding abduction or maim reported none till now. However, one reason for this assumed to be the age of the project which is very little.

However, the onset of enforcement of the act ASK's Child Rights Unit was motivated to conduct a survey at different public places of Dhaka city which took place during 2013-2014. The situation and circumstances came out from the study leads ASK to start the project titled 'Prevention of Child Begging' tentatively from 2013. ASK points out from the survey that it is a form of child rights violation since most of the children expressed that they were not interested in begging (Staff Correspondence, 2014). The project initially started with establishing preliminary schooling incentives for children who are begging. Later on from the beginning of 2015 they started focusing on the parents or guardian of these children in the logic that if the parents/guardian is given some livelihood training it will increase their income, and it will restrain them from using their children in begging. Besides, beneficiaries are only chosen on the condition that they will send their children to school. However, it was also mentioned that since advocacy is a major objective of ASK, they want to run the project as a pilot/experimental project to consult the government ministry to apply this initiative, if the project is a success.

ASK as a civil society organization inhibiting begging, therefore, governing the life of the people they are taking in the project. Gender construction through such governance was aimed to highlight in the realm of the functioning of civil society in a broader spectrum. I was not only

motivated to locate how gender construction come into play from above authoritative regime but also how it is negotiated with existing gender-based experiences at the bottom. As an independent researcher, I was free to develop research framework, design, method, and research question and selection criteria of my interviewee.

### 3.3.1 Research design

Given a focus to the way the project is structured and the aim of the study, I decided to employ qualitative methods based on in-depth interviews and participation in a focus group discussion. The nature of the project is much competent for qualitative study since it is a pilot project consisting of fifteen beneficiaries in the livelihood training and a hundred children in the preliminary school. Besides, there is a lack of aggregated statistics on beggary in the governmental record.

I started my research from contextualizing ASK as a part of broad spectrum of civil society situated in multi-layered space; for this research multi-layered space is confined to the discussion of punitive approach often taken by the government, rehabilitative suggestion from the human rights activists and experts, the democratic and political role of this organization in particular, negotiation strategy of the beggars who have received any form of assistance from this organization. This understanding of the context of the organization enables me to create a mind-map for outlining my fieldwork and interviews. Further, the inclusive and exclusive aspects of the organization which is discursively present located by looking at who, what, when, where, how and why they are providing this assistance. I tried to explore those discursive locations of the organization which is influencing their functioning; the same device was discrete for looking at organizational stance while the collaboration with other stakeholders. This understanding enabled me to create a mindmap to outline the data for analysis.

All beneficiaries willingly participated in the project; though some were first contracted by the organization. It would have interesting to do a comparative study between beneficiary and non-beneficiary of the project. Since the research aimed at exploring the governmental aspect in gender construction through the functioning process of civil society actors, it was limited only to whom such governance have applied. However, it is important for this research to depict that by the connotation ‘beneficiary’ of the project it does not render those people as a ‘docile’ subject

rather described as ‘active subjects’ who have negotiation power to put in place in the formation of the project.

In the end, my research design confirmed me that in-depth interviews would be the best alternative to explore these locations and to find out juncture in which governmentality takes place. Moreover, FGD seemed to have the best possible method to understand how different stakeholders are negotiating with each other highlighting their agenda.

### **3.3.2 Gaining access**

My experience as a citizen of Bangladesh allowed me easily to locate civil society organization that is running the project on beggars. However, I got permission from the organization by submitting a proposal of my research where I included research question, initial research framework, and my theoretical orientation. After reviewing it, the organization allowed me to conduct the research with them.

Though finding people who are working for the betterment of the beggars seems comparatively easier than getting access to other actors with whom the project is collaborating. In this scenario, developing a sample frame for FGD was a challenge. However, a leading daily newspaper of Bangladesh named ‘ProthomAlo’ initiated a roundtable discussion at their office with the help of ASK on 2nd of July 2015. ASK gave me the opportunity to attend the discussion and later permitted me to use the information came from the discussion in my research as FGD. The discussion was published in the newspaper on 3rd of July 2015. However, my first interview with the beneficiary category was arranged by the organization. Later I applied snowball sampling method for the interview in this category.

### **3.3.3 Sampling: place to interview**

The interviews held in two of the drop-in centers of the project. It was located in the slum area of Mohammadpur and Mirpur. These are the areas where ASK done their initial survey before starting the project. However, I was aware that interviewing beneficiary in the drop-in center may influence their responses. To overcome this, I went to visit two of my interviewee’s place in this category. Their response did not differ much due to changed environment. However, their residential place has some of the common feature of any other slams in Bangladesh, inadequate

and tiny living space with a lot of people staying in the same place, unhygienic sanitation system etc.

### **3.3.4 The interviews**

Based on the nature of the project I categorized my interviewee broadly in two categories: beneficiaries of the project and project personnel. However, since the project has two categories of beneficiary: children and guardian; therefore, I decided to interview four people from each category.

#### **3.3.4.1 Beneficiary category**

Since my interview with beneficiaries has been arranged by the organization, it is quite obvious that they went for those who are most interested in the project or having regular access to the organization. For example, all of the participants in this category live near to the drop in the center of the organization. Staff members from the organization informed me that participants of this project have relatively fixed area of habitat than other beggars in the street. I had the opportunity to visit two of the participant's place of living.

##### **3.3.4.1 (a) Primary beneficiary – children**

In order to explore how governmentality finds its root through schooling, especial counseling I interviewed children age between 6 and 10 under this project. However, recently the project is thinking of incorporating children aged between 10-15. This is one of the reasons why violence between 10/15 years adolescent children is not very visible in this paper. While interviewing, they were very comfortable which indicates that bias derived from laboratory setup was somehow minimal. One reason for that may be the drop-in center being quite familiar to them.

##### **3.3.4.1 (b) Secondary beneficiary – parent/guardian of children**

However, in order to bring the gender-specific effects of governance initially I wanted to interview both women and men parents/guardian of the primary beneficiary of the project – children who were engaged in begging. Unfortunately, man's involvement in this project is so minimal that I had to exclude them. I was informed that from the beneficiary side there were only once the men came to a counseling session and that is all men's involvement in this project. Moreover, all the adult beneficiary who have received livelihood training under this project are women. However, my adult beneficiary interviewee are between the age of 24 and 36. A total

respondent in this category for in-depth interview were four. In the data presentation adult beneficiaries and beneficiary mother refer to the same person.

Each family I interviewed consists of at least three children, highest at six. Most often beggars move from place to place and this has been recognized by the program staff as a problem towards rehabilitation initiatives. However, this project chooses beneficiaries who has a comparatively stable living place. This is to ensure tracking of these people and to monitor the success of the project. This category of my respondents has been living in their respective place for at least about five months.

#### *3.3.4.2 People from the organization – project personnel*

To explore how the organizations as part of civil society are responding to the issue and making preference among different rehabilitation initiatives to offer to the beggar four interviews were conducted with people working in the project. In order to response ethically to my interviewee I can reveal neither their name nor their designation in the project but I tried to purposively select my interviewee in this category from the highest level to the bottom level of the hierarchy. My rationale for purposive sample selection in this category is to bring the different level of opinion derived from their interaction with beneficiary and other collaborative partners. However, Staff member mentioned in the data presentation and analysis chapter refers to those who are not directly involved to the project but related to the project, for example, people from other units – such as legal unit.

Gender meant by the project personnel particularly for this project as a social construction ascribed to biological male and female. Gender relation, therefore, limited to relationship derived and evolved around this two categories. Rehabilitation meaning raising work value among beggars to bring them back to ‘dignified’ life. ‘Dignified’ life meant by the project personnel as having a livelihood other than begging.

#### **3.3.5 Focus Group Discussion (FGD)**

As mentioned earlier FGD of this research was initiated by a daily newspaper. In the FGD participator were project personnel from ASK, Southern Dhaka City Corporation Mayor, Joint Secretary of Welfare Ministry of Bangladesh, Additional CEO of City Bank, Bangladesh,

Professor from Dhaka University, Assistant Professor from BRAC University, Communication and Development Head of United Hospital, Child Safety Specialist of UNICEF, Country Program Officer of ICCO Cooperation and correspondence from ProthomAlo. All of them have individual experience of working for beggars but what has been highlighted in the discussion is that there is lack of co-ordination among initiatives undertaken by these stakeholders/actors (relating to the project concerned). However, a major outcome of the discussion was to have an approach for beggars' rehabilitation which is sustainable. I was a participant of the discussion, though for the sake of my research I prefer to observe rather than to participate. I think it helped my observation to be more objective since biases from researcher were possible to minimize.

### **3.4 Interview material**

A map of the field to bring about different levels and themes that I wanted to analyze: pre-understanding and ideas about beggary before starting the project, the experience of starting of the project, process of considering thematic goal of the project, initial and current operationalization and struggle of the project, operationalization strategy to cope up with hindrances of the project, the everyday experiences of running the project; experiences of collecting funds for the project (access and/or non-access, negotiation process between different agents and/or parties) and influences of such funding agency and support network. An open-ended interview scheme has been employed to cover this thematic cartography. To do this I asked about their funding trajectory and everyday experiences of this project and I thought two sets of open-ended question will allow me to locate governmentality throughout the process. My approach was particularly motivated to bring about struggles, conflict and negotiation imperatives into the analysis. In order to achieve that closer attention been employed to highlight their everyday struggle for problem solution (i.e. allocating services to whom, why, what) and strategic changes within organization (derived both from beneficiaries and collaborative actors). Along with that organization's annual report, project reports, website, news updates have been reviewed to understand aim of the project, criteria for choosing beneficiaries, working methods, justification of such methods, collaborative organization in process of establishing networks. Research tools such as an interview guide and schedules have been used to record data. The observation method was employed to understand and record various phenomena (i.e. internal politics, motivation, and negotiations) on field systematically, which may or may not come through in interviews.

To grasp the relationship between the purpose of networking and the level of strategic footstep of struggle a focus has been given to question: what kinds of information are they disbursing for the promotion of their project, how they (the beggars) are networking to avail services from the organization; and issues such as: consideration regarding the legal and policy level changes, their ideas, predictions and aspiration upon the future. The interviews followed more or less the same structural consideration, except for some obvious differences depending on the positioning of the informants: experts from the organization and beneficiary categories. A similar technique was followed to grasp their day to day practices of struggle for rights, both the ways experts were struggling for the rights of the beggars they were assisting and their experiences on beggar's own strategies. Along with beggars' trajectory to this livelihood, I also asked the expert informants about the trajectory into their engagement in beggars' rights.

Transcribing data – a traditional working agenda of qualitative methods was employed to all the interviews. Then transcribed material was thematically structured around the codes and themes found to recur while interviewing as well as concepts derived from the theoretical framework. Different interpretation strategies such as long quotes, description of the context of conversation as well as personal reflection, conversation with researcher's own probing was employed in order to invite more interpretational space. The analysis was based upon the understanding of the informant's narrative and preferences they made to highlight.

#### **4. Theoretical framework: Civil Society and its relationship with states, governmentality**

This section is motivated to elaborate theoretical frame which will structure the analysis. The relationship between civil society and state seemed important because it has the potential to contribute to frame how civil society is placed in state, then the frame will be motivated to contextualize the way civil society in Asia is operating. The final section will create a structure for the analysis of governmentality and workings of individual agency towards making transformative change in life.

##### **4.1 Civil Society and State**

The relationship between the state and the civil society perceived quite differently before the nineteenth century, occupying no distinction - civil society was a replica for state based on social

contract (Kaldor, 2003, p.584). Tracing back to Lockean adherence of this concept, depicts it to be a society based on equality before the law. Consent in such analysis is achieved and practiced through social contract agreed among its members. It was the Hegelian contribution that depicts the intermediary position of the civil society between the family and the state and in which individual through membership in various institutions goes in and out from personal to public and vice-versa. Such a realm of civil society allows including the economy into the table. However, this notion was further developed in Marx's and Engel's scholarship. In the twentieth century, Gramscian thought brings the notion of ideological play into the debate. As a continuation of ideological workings, the distinction between hegemony contributed to framing up civil society. Thus, hegemonic complexity based on consent and domination contributed to understanding the relationship that individual have with each other and with the state. Kaldor (2003, p. 585) in this regard define this mechanism as a "process through which individuals negotiate, argue, struggle against or agree with each other and with the centers of political and economic authority." Similar to Gramscian negotiations between dominant hegemonies, such a definition allow us to locate the process of negotiation exists between each individual and institutions where s/he argues, agree and struggles for ideologies (ibid, pp.584-585). Thus, at the close of the twentieth century civil society transformed with factors ranging from reconfigured notion of sovereignty of the nation-state, consequently changed meaning of citizenship, identities of the modernist subject, the changed nature of the bourgeoisie and the public place together with the experiences of moral community – all of which we apprehend within society and culture (Comaroff and Comaroff, 1999, viii).

During the time of the 1970s, 1980s when the link between the state and the civil society constantly deteriorated, an emphasis on autonomy and civil organization came into focus and boost its global meaning. Kaldor (2003, p.587) highlights that the emergence of islands of civil engagement was made possible because like-minded groups in other countries collaborated with each other, and their countries further associated with international human rights legislation which allows them to pressure their government. Although his analysis was based on Latin American and eastern European context (ibid), still it is applicable for ASK and context in which they are operating. For instance, ASK under the concerned project collaborate with different stakeholders including governmental ministry and enforcement agency, yet in the operational level they negotiate highlighting human rights norms and standards which often reflects what

their international collaborative partners have framed. Moreover, ASK acts as the NGO Secretariat for the Universal Periodic Review process reporting on the human rights situation in Bangladesh to Human Rights Council of the UN, and called upon by regional networks to assess the performance of the NHRC (Alam, 2013, p.10). Since Bangladesh is a signatory of UNCRC, ASK pressurizes the government to analyze the situation in the lens of UNCRC according to which child begging is a serious violation of child rights.

In other words, through international links and appeals to international authorities, these groups were able to create political space (Kaldor, 2003, p.587). In the book on transnational activism, in the form of 'boomerang effect' it was mentioned that government are now often being approached indirectly, instead appeals to the international community to bounce back and put pressure on governments to tolerate certain activities (Keck and Sikkink, 1998). Transitional activism spread its channel of access to the international system by collaborating with different civil society actors, states and international organizations (ibid, p.1). Such advocacy network mentioned to takes up issues as the environment and human rights and "makes international recourses available to new actors in domestic political and social struggles" (ibid). Keck and Sikkink further proposed that "By thus blurring the boundaries between a state's relations with its own national and the recourses both citizens and state have to the international system, advocacy networks are helping to transform the practice of national sovereignty" (ibid, pp.1-2). However, in case of transforming national sovereignty, civil society in Asia and particularly in Bangladesh is not institutionalized enough. Civil society in Asia will be now described in the following.

## **4.2 Civil Society in Asia**

In a much focused texture around political studies, the edited volume *Civil society and political change in Asia* is written work of accumulation of practitioners and academicians having contribution in the field such as political science, sociology, and history (Alagappa, 2004). It disposes of a comparative inquiry into the nature of civil society and the role of organizations in the changing situation in 12 Asian countries in the direction of open, participatory, and accountable politics. However, a preconceived theory of civil society focuses therefore its potential to contribute "to ongoing debates in the developed states on elite versus participatory democracy, rights-oriented liberalism versus communitarianism, and the free market versus the

welfare state" (ibid, x). Although another group of scholarship have evolved with connecting declined network of social capital and civil society in the democratic, advanced industrialized countries. However, Asia has been quite neglected in the civil society literature due to having a legacy in communist and authoritarian regimes, and its distinctive and nondemocratic Asian value (ibid). In general civil society in Asia is considered as an "instrumental term to bring about or prevent political change in the state and its institutions; it is less commonly viewed as an autonomous arena for self-governance" (ibid xi).

Alagappa in the framework for analysis develops four sets of findings: on the nature and development of Asian civil societies; on the connection between civil society and democracy; on the implications of the rise of civil society for the state and for state-civil society relations; and on the relationship between civil and political societies (ibid, p.10). However, particularly in this paper some of the propositions on the nature and development of Asian civil societies will be focused to narrow it down to contextualize ASK's position concerning this project excluding others. These propositions have developed to analyze civil society in 12 Asian countries which is very diverse as a context, therefore, propositions potential to provide the analytical framework to this research have backed up with other theoretical assumptions.

The framework concentrating on nature and development of civil society in Asia depicts six propositions. First proposition introduces dramatic growth of civil society since the mid-1980s in Asia. Second one brings our focus towards the social reality and multiple factors that fuel development of civil society depicting it to be "social-reality specific"; anti-colonial mobilization, weakness of states, resistance to repressive rule, government sponsorship of organization all these events and legacy in general shown to have shape the formation of civil society in Asia (ibid, p.10). Particularly, it is by no means a coincidence that Bangladesh and India have shared experiences on these mentioned accounts.<sup>5</sup> However, to this research an

---

<sup>5</sup>Lewis, D. (2004). On the difficulty of studying 'civil society': Reflections on NGOs, state and democracy in Bangladesh. *Contributions to Indian Sociology*, 38(3), pp.299-322. (Particularly in Bangladesh legacy such as weakness of states, resistance to repressive rule, government sponsorship of organization is highlighted in Lewis's (2004) study. Although the study is solely based on non-governmental organizations (NGO's) effort as a civil society actor it is influential to this research as it critically assesses the normative assumption of civil society. The democratic process and practices beyond formal organization merely exist in Bangladesh yet the substantial

important contribution is Lewis (2004, p.317) accounts that stress 1990s and aftermath discourses of civil society in Bangladesh are motivated by the agendas of international donor agency. Some of these agendas included even models of citizen actions which have been designed to improve democratic accountability, yet discourses as such has political, historical and cultural limitation. Therefore, new analytical account requires not only to focus on the imported donor model of civil society (ideology such as structural adjustment, some mixed approach of welfare services) but also substantiate with issues such as patron-client mechanism, conflicts and power derived from existing "organizational and moral diversity of civil society"(Lewis, 2004, p. ibid). Self-derived conflicts of civil society organization together with the social mobilizing effort by local institutions, citizen associations, and the religious group all are playing a significant role in Bangladesh (Lewis, 2004). These have also evidentially playing a role in the current project and in the next chapter is has been revealed that negotiation process with different actors requires to resolve, ignore and legitimize these issues.

Talking about social reality specification deciding nature and development of civil society, existing literature indicates that prevention of begging effort by government in both Bangladesh and India resembles each other. However, it does not mean diversities and differences are non-exist here. Particularly to mention, civil society in India still fighting against already enforced punitive effort; on the other hand, it is the civil society in Bangladesh preventing the government from taking up such measure, although it is at the edge of doing so. Nevertheless, the third proposition developed by Alagappa (2004) on the nature and development of civil society in Asia is important to understand how cooperation and negotiations occur within and between civil society members. It stresses that "civil society in Asian countries are highly diverse in composition, resource endowment, and goals; they are areas of power, struggle, and cooperation" (ibid, p.10). Multiple actors merge here with their distinct political agenda and create space

---

emphasis on patronage relationship as a dominant string of power exercise is highlighted in the paper.) Fadaee, S. (2014).Civil society organizations in India and construction of multiplicity of human rights.*The International Journal of Human Rights*, 18(4-5), pp.567-577. (However, in the context of India Fadaee's (2014) study is a significant account of civil society's effort dispersed in a range of areas including patron-client relationship.)

within the available resources. The merge and reorientation of different civil society actors boost up what fourth proposition depicts that it has altered dramatically over time and subject to alter again. Fifth proposition stresses the existence of neo-Tocquevillian and neo-Gramscian features in Asian civil society. However, the sixth proposition in this notion stresses that though expansion of a number of civil society organizations in Asia dramatically took place yet, not "been accompanied by institutionalization of the non-state public sphere" (ibid). It is true and evidential that the necessary rights and rules to protect the autonomy of civil society are not quite there in Bangladesh, part of the reason is long instability in political power and constellation of power by few people. However, through collaboration with international and regional human rights organization have leads civil society in Bangladesh to create political space and that space is enabling them to operate autonomously.

Human rights – as a jargon initiated diversified motivation for action in the realm of social movements and civil society organization all over the world (Fadaee, 2014). However, though civil society in Asia has not flourished the way in Western society (Alagappa, 2004), it has its own legacy. At the same time, scholars are critically assessing the effect of this discourse saying it to be "Eurocentric, exclusionary and against the people of the global south" (Fadaee, 2014, p.567). Fadaee analyzes the multidimensional projects taken by different CSOs in Delhi. The analysis develops within a framework that considering 'human' and 'rights' as empty signifiers. It gets significance when it is contextualized within specific norms and issues of struggle.

### **4.3 Governmentality**

Michel Foucault in his influential work in *Discipline and Punish* (1977) brings the discussion of power/knowledge apparatus inbuilt in criminology. In his theoretical contribution a new theme on governmentality has been highlighted which indicates the relationship “between two poles of governance: the forms of rule by which various authorities govern populations, and the technologies of the self through which individuals work on themselves to shape their own subjectivity” (GARLAND, 1997, p.174). Though GARLAND (1997) takes up Foucault's notion of governmentality to analyze particularly criminological scholarship, it is an important theoretical frame for this study to understand if ASK through this particular project plays an authoritative role in governing life of the project's beneficiaries. However, while mentioning contribution of governmentality literature, particularly the way notion of crime have been problematized,

GARLAND (1997, p.174) it highlights the shift in current politics from welfarist to neo-liberal approach, from totalizing effects to open-ended effects.

#### 4.3.1 Foucault's on 'the free subject' and 'the state'

Power operates through disciplinary techniques; although these techniques vary over time it is possible to locate its workings in a specific context of time (Foucault, 1978). In the beginning of the eighteenth century when the sovereign state as part of building these mechanisms targeted individual and collective biological life, it put in place scientific engineering, expert administration, and technologies of self-governance (ibid). However, as times goes by those mechanisms no longer confined to enclosed institution as prison and school, rather felt the need to get control over modes of production of life which will contribute to the flow of capitalist economy (ibid). Nevertheless, Foucault's earlier analysis of discipline attracted criticism for their 'neglect' of the state and for the tendency of "characterizing human individuals as 'docile bodies' rather than active subjects" (Foucault, 1977, 1980 cited in GARLAND, 1997, p.175). His later work as in 1982 essay *The Subject and Power* is a revised version of the concept of power in which it states that governmental power holds on technologies of self and individuals willingly as an active subject align their choices according to the governing authorities, in other words, works on own 'subjectification'. The decentralized nature of the practices of governance is located in various extensions of governmental authorities. The complexity arises due to the functioning of such powers of the governmental authorities "dissolves 'any rigid line of demarcation between the 'public' and the 'private' or between 'state' and 'civil society'" (GARLAND, 1997, p.175).

GARLAND continued with post-Foucault scholarship on governmentality of which Jacques Donzelot's accounts on the relationship between the state and the individual, and scholarship around the concept of insurance is important contribution to this study (Donzalot, 1979 cited in GARLAND, 1997). GARLAND borrowing from Jacques Donzalot's (1979) history of *The Policing of Families* together with his account of the modern welfare state (1991a, 1991b), mentioned that different authority having expertise in philanthropic work, medical supports, social work feminist – all intervening into family and make a space work between the state and the individual (GARLAND 1997, p.179). The success of these programmes taken by these expert authorities depends on the extent to which they can align with the objectives of the state

authorities be it - national efficiency, the health of the population, control the birth rate, control of crime - and with the aspirations of the individual family members (Donzalot, 1979 cited in GARLAND, 1997, *ibid*). Saying that it indicates governmental power is no longer concentrated only to the state but is instead discursively practiced around social field sites as hospitals, social work offices, schools, juvenile courts and clinics. Existing literature on begging indicates that discourse around begging is related to religion (Ahmadullah, 1962), effort by the civil society organization (Ramanathan, 2008), prevalence of drug abuse (Helal and Kabir, 2013) criminalization (Harcourt and Ludwig, 2006) – all informs about the existence of multiple actors and certainly all derives power in its own. Donzelot's claim that through explosion of such governmental authority which operates within the space between the state and the family normalizes family sets notion and aspiration to which individual shapes to comply (Donzalot, 1979 cited in GARLAND, 1997, p.179).

It is important for this research to frame an understanding of some of the issues relating to authority and individual. Individual who actively participate in the governmental process exercises their agency, however, according to Kabeer (2005, p.14) agency have both positive and negative connotation. It is positive when it – “refers to people's ability to make and act on their own life choices, even in the face of others' opposition” as “power to” and it is negative when it - “refers to the capacity of some actors to override the agency of others through, for example, the exercise of authority or the use of violence and other forms of coercion” as “power over” (*ibid*). Kabeer further states that “Cultural or ideological norms may deny that inequalities of power exist or that such inequalities are unjust” (*ibid*). Therefore, norms as such may allow and/or prevent the exercise of agency both in the positive and negative way depending on the particular historical context we are talking about. Previously presented literature on the context allows to speculate that it is more likely that culturally embedded, suppressive norms are prevalent in the context this research took place, particularly to consider gender relations. Unequal gender relations often persist through cultural and ideological norms which normalize unequal power relations. Then again, if all these are true then how do people mobilize for transformative changes? Kabeer in this regards has given much emphasis on the potentiality of grass-root organization (Kabeer, 1999). Though individual effort to act against suppressive gender norms has been recognized by Kabeer but women's organizations and social movements, in particular, have better potentiality to raise question against injustice which has been normalized (*ibid*,

p.108). Moreover, the impact of individual effort to bring change on the situation of women seems likely to remain limited and many times at a high cost of the individual per se. Kabeer proposed, then when individual women and men will have expanding range of alternatives to choose from these institutional set-up may leave it to the individual to work out towards the kinds of social change they want to bring about and to the process they want to bring it (ibid). Yet it is interesting to see in the circumstances when the individual is denied from practicing 'explicit forms of agency', whether or not they makes or thrives for strategic life choices. Beggars shared experiences – of which this research is based on – represents one of the marginalized section of the society. In the following chapter their strings to make strategic life choices, available alternatives dispersed from the organization, power play by the organization as an authoritative body and overall web of governmental processes and practices are aimed to focus on using the theoretical framework discussed above.

## **5. Civil society, governmentality and 'Prevention of Child Begging' project**

In this section interview material will be analyzed which has been organized around some thematic code. These thematic codes were employed having its basis in the theoretical frame but motivated to answer research question formulated at the beginning of this thesis.

### **5.1 Gender-based oppression and traditional culture**

This part illustrates structural inequality having the basis in gender-based oppression experienced by the beneficiary of the project. Though most of the experienced shared by the project personnel and adult beneficiary interviewee but then again these experiences has a direct effect on the child beneficiary of the project. However, it introduces responsibility mechanism in raising a family, abuse and physical violence against women and religious dogma governing in and out of their life. It ends with a consciousness that even though it seems these shared experiences can be explained by the injustice of culture yet it will be an 'incomplete' story if not contextualized in the broader economic and political structure.

The precarious pattern of responsibility is displaying many shades of power in this context. Men are usually being reluctant to take responsibility of the family; furthermore, the broken family, loss of parents, accident or unwanted natural phenomena all of these are living experience of my

interviewee. Existing speculation saying, women in the lower class are being the victim of physical violence, deprived of decision-making power and autonomy. All of my adult interviewees mentioned that they have been the victim of physical violence by their husband at least once. However, a question may arise then, why these women stay in such relationship? Response from my interviews differs; for two of still married women - whose husbands are financially contributing to family from sources other than begging – it is the social and economic security they are availing from their marriage lingers them to such partnership. Both of them expressed being beaten by their husband. Two of the other respondents, one separated and one divorced – whose husbands not used to contribute financially to the family and one of them was physically disabled- said they also tried to keep up their marriage because of social security. Such norm of social security reproduces male superiority over female.

Prevalence of abuse among lower class wives in rural Bangladesh is quite common (Schuler et al., 1996). Study on physical violence by husbands in Bangladesh reveals the reason behind this silence akin to stigma, fear of greater harm and high acceptance of violence (Naved, Azim, Bhuiya and Persson, 2006). The very few looked for help from institutional sources either could not endure anymore or violence become life threatening. Moreover, despite having more institutional source of support in urban areas than rural, it might be their shorter duration of stay in the slums and unique lifestyle resulted lack of social support network for them (ibid). This has also made it difficult to supervise and keep track of the beneficiaries by the project staff. Since, fall back situation, particularly to mention - support from parents and social safety from government is frail, it fuels male domination<sup>6</sup>. However, to add to precarity of responsibility, it is interesting that parenting is more or less a sole responsibility of the mother. Employees of the organization mention that male participation in this project is almost none. Regardless of having parents or not women's involvement with begging children is prominent.

As one of the staff of the project mentioned these children (living in the street or in low-quality habitat areas as slum) live under the loose supervision of parents, three of the children I interviewed engaged in begging after corresponding with their peer group. From the staff member and later throughout my interaction with adult beneficiaries I came to know that since

---

<sup>6</sup>Weak fallback position women and children begging in Bangladesh have been mentioned many times in the roundtable discussion held in the 'ProthomAlo' news office.

they live under chronic poverty and malnourishment, in many times they fail to take proper care of their children even if they want to. Moreover, the socialization process of these children evolves within precarious responsibility mechanism exists within their family described above.

"There exists no gender parity, most of the time mothers are coming in our meeting because in our society we thought a child is solely of a mother's responsibility, this is a far more prominent view among these people than others" (Project personnel, age around 38, my translation).

"Those children without parent come themselves. In this section of society, women are being exploited, do not have decision-making power, cannot speak for them. Even though both of them are equally working still wife have to cook for the husband, otherwise she will be beaten. Also, if these wives are asked why are they staying in such bondage, they replies as he is the husband he possesses the right to beat and control" (Project personnel, age around 33, my translation).

Religion comes to play a significant role in these families. Since many of them faces structural inequalities and themselves vulnerable in the money-driven economy, they fail to take control of their life, not to exclude family life. The development of the idea of family practices allows us to locate family as a juncture of practices and tension which been shaped historically (Morgan 1996 cited in Fink and Lundqvist, 2010). Moreover, as Fink and Lundqvist showed that political, economic and cultural shifts in wider society have impacted upon policy-making, similarly, policies are shaped by pressure from social movements and the challenges that research evidence pose (ibid, P: 3), it is an important contribution to this paper, since movements and discussion based on religious doctrine trends to shape many norms of family in Bangladesh. Likewise, women living in a society where exists marked inequalities between men and women, fixed gender roles, norms supporting positively to men to have sex without considering women's rights on same terms in this regard – increase their vulnerability to abuse by their partners (WHO, 2002). Therefore, it may be speculated that religious doctrinal structure e.g. gender division of labor, gender-differentiated access and control over resources, patriarchal family as a useful tool is prevailing to motivate people to maintain certain regulation. Similarly, acceptance of practicing these regulations is actually derived from the necessity of complying with traditional conformity to the religious doctrine which dictates women needs to submit to men's authority, at the same time reproducing the domain through which this doctrine can prevail.

"Many NGOs are trying to abolish marital violence but due to religious sentiment back this up."(Project personnel, age around 30, my translation).

"Those poor people believe mostly in luck, so they easy to motivate and many times in religion husband are given the superior position, women are dominated. Moreover, as last resort these women want to have a shelter from husband, she would prefer to live with a disabled, abusive husband since at least people in the society will not comment disrespectfully to her character. So there are many social issues lies here. These few came out of such relationship are seen as over courageous or dangerous. She asks for justice to that people."(Project personnel, age around 33, my translation).

"Since they are economical, politically, socially vulnerable, they are most likely to think that they might not be lucky in this life but be rewarded afterlife if they carry out religious norms."(Project personnel, age around 35, my translation).

However, describing women's situation in this category does not have the intention to summarize their oppressive stories in an illiberal, non-western culture and such assumption has implication of revealing "incomplete" story (Jaggar, 2005, p. 56). Like the way popular press runs stories of non-western practices such as - sexual slavery, dowry murder, honor killings, genital cutting, sex-selective abortion, and female infanticide, it has not only created irritation and concern among Western countries but also produced a lot of speculation and debate (Jaggar, 2005). Such an approach quite a resemblance to what global radical feminism stress: "the universality of "patriarchal" violence against women" (Morgan, ed., 1984 cited in *ibid*). However, criticizing such assumption to be a form of "imperial feminism" or "feminist Orientalism", postcolonial feminism brings the notion that women's oppression across the world is diversified and shaped by multiple factors (Jaggar, 2005: *ibid*). Otherwise, it creates an essentialist form of knowledge which falls into the danger of incoherency and mystification.

"I used to clean up streets in which I had bitter experiences. Sometimes people used to think I am a prostitute or something, but luckily I had an aggressive attitude which drove them away. After doing that job for one month, I quit." (Adult beneficiary, age 25, my translation).

"After this I took training from AKS, working as housemaid got its bitter part too. Sometimes children get sick, employers are demanding and security issue is always there". (Adult beneficiary, age 24, my translation)

"If I had a van to sell vegetables, then it would be really easy to earn our livelihood. I have so many problems in my life, got a child who is not mentally undeveloped, life is full of uncertainty. Everything I am doing is basically for my children. My husband used to be a good person, but he went through an accident some years ago, after that he became negative about life. He used to be a wood crafter but doesn't get much work these

days. Actually, it is really hard to be positive in your life when you have so much hardship going on every day". (Adult beneficiary, age 27, my translation)

If we consider these beneficiary's experiences of oppression can be explained by what offered in the "injustice by culture" thesis then it will fall into criticism brought to the global radical feminist. However, through the way these beneficiaries life has been problematized both by them and by project personnel reflects what injustice by culture thesis to assert. Unlike to Jaggar this asserts, local cultural tradition has all explanation for injustice suffered by women in poor countries (Jaggar, 2005, p. 62). According to Jaggar only focusing to the "unjust local tradition" cannot provide a cohesive explanation for women suffering from poverty and associated abuse in the poor countries (ibid). Rather, these traditions need to contextualize in the "broader geopolitical and geo-economic context" (ibid). Moreover, as mentioned by her the contemporary processes of economic globalization and Western based neoliberal ideology, in particular, have sifted life of many women in poor countries (ibid, p.63), this will be evidential in the parts following.

## **5.2 Gender practices and measures by Prevention of Begging Project**

As Foucault's genealogy of the modern state introduces us with series of rationalities for modern state, it also implies each of these rationality's distinctive objectives and aims to know subject it governs (GARLAND, 1997, p.177). Thus, to reflect upon epistemological and institutional transformation from pre-modern state to modern state, the state needs to create space for discovery and differentiate between social categories (ibid,p.178). Society – in which "the central political issues of the time have to do with choices about the exercise, the techniques and the objectives of that very specific form of governmental power" (ibid), here in this project if ASK had to negotiate their political stance that begging cannot be someone's profession than it also needs to function with the existing power exercised around begging, not at all to exclude power derived from those who beg. This part of the analysis will first attempt to describe an overarching situation mentioned by the project personnel to reflect upon how gender practices intertwined with girl children towards begging. This will follow by a discussion of control mechanism deriving from multiple actors. Consequently, it will describe measures ASK has put in place to fight for the rights of beggars.

While mentioning about the situation regarding gender equality in Bangladesh, project personnel's view refers, it is still not up the mark. Despite having a heavy budget allocation to bring gender equality and even success for a while, it is not sustaining due to incomprehensiveness. There is still a lack of optimum atmosphere for girl children to flourish, educate and progress. Underlying structural inequality such as - inadequate sanitation system, the insecure journey towards school, unequal mobilization has been highlighted as some of the major hindrances. However, particularly to focus on children who are begging mostly girl children are being used, according to the project personnel. To answer the reason behind this they mention it is the gender biased mindset of the society that promotes girl children to be more vulnerable. This mindset leads to catching more sympathy toward them, therefore, their constellation in begging. It seems this constellation is another reason the project focuses more towards girl child than boy child. However, from personnel's experience girl children are more visible in the street based job as well where the risk of sexual abuse is high for them.

"You also need to mention that our government has tried hard to bring gender parity in school and it brought a lot of successes, but it does not sustain. It is because we do not apply other required option to ensure sustainability of something. We do not follow comprehensive option. For example in the primary school, we have almost equal participation rate between boy and girls, in fact, more but no suitable sanitation system for girls and no strong awareness, the street to go to school is not secure for girls especially in the village, therefore, their parents does not feel secure to let her go to school and by eight or nine grade they make married. Eve-teasing is another reason." (Project personnel, age around 38, my translation).

"It is important to this project because a significant amount of those children who beg are the girl since she attract more sympathy than a boy, therefore adults are using girl child more that boy child in begging. So automatically gender aspect come into our consideration, while spot visit we find the same case, even those girl children are more visible in sell flowers or other kinds of street work. They are being used more in bad intention. Therefore, there is no scope to avoid gender issue to address this problem." (Project personnel, age around 35, my translation).

"It's in our mindset that we consider a girl to be vulnerable which is a gender biased mindset of society, and a group of people wants to make use of this mindset."(Project personnel, age around 30, my translation).

As already mentioned in the genealogy of modern state, police are the second rational refers to the program envisaged to achieve an overarching knowledge about the population and uses close inspection and a range of regulatory mechanism(Foucault, 1981 cited in GARLAND, 1997). Therefore, the project need to address existing practice of control mechanism by guardian to

“make visible the idea of population as an entity in and of itself”: here particularly the children, therefore, can “bring into focus (and thus into being) a new practicable object of governance, a new field for authorities to know and to work upon” (GARLAND, 1997, p.177). How the project as a regulatory mechanism functioning through counseling session will be discussed in the following. Before that, I need to explore acquired knowledge about our particular population.

Social and parental control over girl child, which prominently differs with a boy child, even in the life of these street children. According to the staffs, street children's lives are less controlled. To make it clear they mention that abiding social norms and behavioral manner are not strictly obligatory to these children. However, the control operates differently in this context. For example, girl children have to ask permission to join in any group under whom she is being reared, which is quite unlikely in the case of a boy. Why is the guardian interested in controlling children's choices of joining groups? Since children are earning source, it can be one reason to locate whom they are peering with. This control mechanism affects their likeliness of access to this project as well. According to the project personnel since boy child has broader mobility compared to girl child they can be easily involved.

“More boys than girls want to join as a beneficiary of the project since they can move more than a girl. A girl needs to ask for consent, they both being used and controlled.” (Project personnel, age 33, my translation)

"A boy sees something in the street, quickly can join it, but a girl needs to take permission." (Project personnel, age 38, my translation)

After reflecting upon how they consider this overall situation based on gender experiences described above, project personnel mentioned that the overall gender sensitivity of the project is covered under the binding guideline – gender policy of the organization. Particularly in this project they focus on ensuring hundred percent inclusions of girl children, even have considered doing positive discrimination for girl children to work simultaneously for gender equality. They realize chances of sexual abuse is more to a girl than to a boy, therefore, has given out most focus towards their abuse and works to increase their security. To mention about their measures they pointed towards special counseling mechanism.

To reflect upon gender-sensitive practice from organization's part, project personnel said, as part of their gender policy employee of this organization receives gender training and they demanded

that they ensure not to use any gender insensitive words. By mentioning gender insensitive words they meant words that will make a person uncomfortable or abused, be it verbally or physically. However, it is important to remember that high acceptance of violence is one of the reasons behind silence towards it.<sup>7</sup>(Naved, Azim, Bhuiya and Persson, 2006), the parameter for individual discomfort towards abusive practices may differ as well. The organization is also trying to raise gender consciousness through counseling beneficiary parents. Yet, counseling as such opens up to critically asks - how does the gender-based behavior, manner and practices are taught, what is the aim and what kinds of implication it may bring? Since the project undertake that to go into the depth of the situation they need to starts with a small portion of them and take them under close supervision, it allows them to intervene into their private life. In the forms of governance the two poles of governance indicate that authorities imply different ruling mechanism: here the gender training module; and consequently, individual shape own subjectivity using 'technologies of the self' (Foucault, 1988): here the motivation to be self-employed and not to make their child a beggar. However, in the broader economic structure where the government of Bangladesh is motivated to take control of the life of these people who are important but yet not been able to quantify them to govern, eventually want to make them part of the neo-liberal economic thrives. Therefore, it can be a reason to educate these people to create an optimum family environment where they can be the small entrepreneur and their child can be included under governance through them. For example, in the counseling session gender module for this project includes practices of conversation between couples as an effective mechanism to resolve quarrel and the same in the relationship between parents and children. Child rearing, the lesson about healthy lifestyle, the practice of having a conversation between couples, having control over their life all these they come to know from the counseling sessions.

"ASK works for women's rights, we have a gender policy so each of initiatives are accordance to gender sensitivity, particularly in this project we assured hundred percent inclusion of girl children, we been most focus towards their abuse and security, because chances of sexual abuse are more to a girl than to a boy, therefore, provide her a more security, in case of being abused, send her to shelter home, council her."  
(Project personnel, age 38, my translation)

"Boys and girls have equal access of admission to this project. Although, accordance to our gender policy we emphasize more on girl child than boy child in case of providing access. It may at first seem discriminatory

---

<sup>7</sup>Though it has been mentioned in the study on physical violence against women particularly by husband, I think it has an implication to the overall situation.

toward boys, but it is a positive discrimination just to bring gender equality, which is still not here in our society." (Project personnel, age 35, my translation)

"Those who are conducting counseling session received gender training when joining our organization in this regard, they do not use any gender insensitive words." (Project personnel, age 30, my translation)

"We have gender and social justice unit, they are a specialized group who works for raising gender awareness, formalize gender plan and policy for other small organization." (Project personnel, age 33, my translation)

While mentioning about gender-specific incidence which has made a change in this project, one of the leading personnel informed that in the beginning when they started with only education program, they found that often girl children are not concentrating in classroom. They decided to arrange an especial counseling session with them and found that they become the victim of child abuse by adults while begging in the street. This experience leads them to arrange life-skill training which includes identifying abusive touch, self-rescuing techniques, informing others if being abused etc. It is interesting to see the political stance of the project thus needs to do with and merge with existing 'choices of exercise' and incorporate new exercising tool to governmental practices.

"After this incidence we realize to strengthen their inner force before taking them to the classroom. Besides, while doing workshop which inform about different sexual organ, sexual need we felt that girl children are hesitating with the presence of boy children, so we arranged it separately, then we take them together and see they are not hesitating anymore. So we gain such experiences." (Project personnel, age 38, my translation)

Insurance is an area of inspection through which the organization injecting norms of savings needed to run business, quite similarly, the way state govern its population. In a small-scale the organization employed close inspection mechanism consists of field supervisor and field worker. They have also created space for the community committee in the policing mechanism. As Foucault (1995) discussed governmentality not only runs through policing, coercion, punishment rather it needs individual's conformity for its existence, and it has to do through various mechanisms that realize the necessity of this regulation; thus, the consent from these small entrepreneurs (beneficiaries) is achieved through making them realize the social 'deservedness' concept work value. Power is produced within structures also create the praxis for its continuation.

"Since we are doing it in small scope we can keep them under close supervision provided by our field supervisor, field worker, community committee. Also we arrange a quarterly meeting with community committee about the problem we face, they share their observation and we change our progress together". (Project personnel, age 38, my translation)

"We provide them the training, but community helps them with the business material, but they report us that they have not engaged in begging during the practicing of alternative livelihood. Sometimes those beggars expressed that, now I earn less than what I earned from begging but I feel good because I have earned respect." (Project personnel, age 35, my translation)

Since ASK is a legal aid based organization they believe they can provide every kind of support under this project using all other existing strength of the organization, combine of particularly - legal unit, counseling unit, drop-in center. However, it was not possible to include legal unit's experiences with this project since at the time of my data collection they were preparing a report for the government. Yet, they shared a report with me in which they took an oppositional stance with the government regarding a survey on beggars in the Dhaka city. This analysis will be followed in coming section. In case a need of immediate remedy of abuse they mention that they sent the girl to the nearby shelter home since they have a special network with each community's shelter home. Nevertheless, one of the staff member working in the drop in center of the project suggested it would have very useful if they had the capacity to build separate shelter home for boys and girls under supervision of the project.

"If a child becomes victim of sexual abuse s/he can avail legal aid, counseling, any form of insecurity while living in community we can arrange her place in shelter home, to ensure justice, mental strength for life, children of this project can avail every support from our organization." (Project personnel, age 30, my translation)

"Well, we tried to assess the category or characteristics of these children and likewise modify, refine our module so they can follow, make it in a recreational way, it involves need and mental assessment. Since they used to beg in the street, they cannot concentrate for a long hour. Our trainer, we all sit together and generate idea to make it more child-friendly." (Project personnel, age 38, my translation)

"Personally I learned that there are many categories among street children, some sell stuff, some beg. So they are different and we have approached them differently as well. Even if they are same there need might be different, so need assessment and their mental assessment is first to realize than introducing our module." (Project personnel, age 33, my translation)

### 5.3 Consent towards the aim of the project

Since power derived and practiced in a discursive way, now it would be interesting to see how power is derived from the part of the beneficiaries of this project. Feminist scholars have mentioned that in many times culture not only oppress some of their member especially women but also make the oppressed socialized to give consent to it (Jaggar, 2005, p.69). However, cultural domination as such often pointed towards poor women in the poor countries. On the other hand, scholarship on women in the Third World country and their discursively perceived notion and experiences allow us to locate sites of resistance and struggles (Mohanty, 2003). In the following part struggle by the beneficiary of this project through and within the organization will be discussed.

When the project started, the staff member contacted two of my adult beneficiary respondents and the rest of the two came willingly after hearing about the organization from the neighbor. As it has been mentioned that their temporary stay in a place is a hindrance to this project it also applies that those beneficiaries are very much willing to be part of this project still having the conditionality of irregular living place. As civil society is a mechanism in which "individuals negotiate, argue, struggle against or agree with each other and with the centers of political and economic authority" (Kaldor, 2003: 585), negotiation from beneficiaries of this project revolves with their self-initiated small entrepreneurship motivation. Self-motivation to join and to be engaged to this project is very high among all the interviewee, it implies that begging is not something desirable to them; however, it was not the case at the beginning of the project. The staff member had to spend a lot of time to motivate them neither to beg not to let their child beg. Now, none of these parents interviewees wants their child begging. Although depending on their educational and economic situation there level of rejecting differs, for example, mother of the handicapped child is comparatively educated and financially well to do and she is very enthusiastic about the project as well as very much against begging. On the other hand, the mother who used to beg is more into describing the reasons that lead her and her children into begging. Perhaps it is their lived experiences that decide how much willing they can be towards any project, profession, and lifestyle.

"I have one son named Kamal. He used to come here with his friends to beg. I tried to stop him but couldn't do so due to his stubbornness. Then I came to know about this office and talked to the teachers. Then Mam

(referring project personnel) from AKS used to know about Kamal's begging and appreciated my effort to come here at the office of AKS." (Adult beneficiary, age 25, anonymous, my translation)

"I came here by myself talked to the teachers, nobody informed me about this school before that. I told Mam, begging is something which I will never approve of and it hurts my feeling as well, can you please help me in this circumstances?"(Adult beneficiary, age 27, my translation)

"Mam told me about this school and advised me to admit my son here. I took her advice because in this way Jamal wouldn't be able to beg any more. I used to drop him at the school at 9 am and pick him up at 1.30pm. Then I admitted both of my children here, and school time was same for both of them. In this way, my children got out of the begging business." (Adult beneficiary, age 36, my translation)

"At first they were at preschool then these teachers from AKS also admitted to another school. In January after six months both of my children got admitted to Jahanarabad (school name of a local school) which is a government school. These teachers are really nice to the kids; they also gave them food in this pre school." (Adult beneficiary, age 27, my translation)

"I went to school even when my parents does not know, I like it very much, they gave us food and I started to like study." (Child beneficiary, age 8, my translation)

Their form of agency is visible even in their lived circumstances. Two of the adult beneficiary mother I interviewed first use their judgment and visit the drop in center before letting their children to the preliminary school. Even the other interviewee who used to beg expressed that since the staff from the organization went several times to talk to her and make her familiarized with project personnel, she trusted to let her girl to the school. However, it may contradict with the provision that they could less oversee their children, but perhaps it may also show that they took control over their life wherever and whenever they can. Their form of practicing agency is also visible when they make a decision about their future. For example, when they decide to be small entrepreneur they actually take concerned life choices within available opportunities. However, one of interviewee from project personnel informed me that some of the livelihood trainees have already started their business in a small scale with own savings. This they considered as a great success of their project as they could motivate these people towards 'dignified' profession. The project personnel also train how to do marketing in the business. To create demand for their product, they need to attract customer and also to find out who are their potential customer.

“Well, I came to their office first, talked to them and had the privilege to judge their quality of work and how they treat children in their school. They had a really good environment and teachers are really nice to the kids, which I liked very much. Children are having food, good environment, good education etc. (Adult beneficiary, age 27, my translation)

"In these slum areas the kind of environment we have been not good for a children's mental growth. In this school teachers are teaching them good things which gives them a hope that there is a better world out there, to get out of this situation education is needed and that's what teachers are providing in this school. There are six teachers and they are really amazing in terms of taking care of children." (Adult beneficiary, age 25, my translation)

"We had cooking training in which we learned how to cook singaara, puri, moglai (name of some popular local snacks) and they also gave us instruments so we can practice cooking these dishes at home. In this way, we might be able to start a small business which can support us financially in the near future. (Adult beneficiary, age 36, my translation)

"If we get some instrument and some raw materials to cook these foods in this way we will be able to start up a small business of our own. They also gave us training which is very useful. At first I cooked things and gave them food for free, then I told them that after this you guys will pay me for this delicious food and they agreed to that. The raw materials, training and instrument I got from AKS helped me to advertise my cooking. Now, they pay me when I cook food for them. They also said my cooking is really good." (Adult beneficiary, age 24, my translation)

It seems that though they use their judgment at the same time they have trust on the agenda's of the organization that is the value of doing well for society. This goes in line with what project personnel mention when they encourage the community to come forward to help these people. Believe – to think and contribute for the person next to me – is the basis of raising a social movement of this project. When they were asked why they think the organization is helping them their answer reflected that no matter what we live in a society and everyone has an effect on each other. If someone is not happy with life s/he will not make the surroundings livable. Therefore, we need to think of each other betterment within our capacity.

"I think this is for the welfare of the society, so we can have a better life. I cannot afford to buy foods for all my children all the time, but my children are getting food from this school, which makes my duty as a mother easier." (Adult beneficiary, age 27, my translation)

“They are doing a lot for us. If these training works out may be their help will make me financially stable. As a woman if I can earn even 50 taka on a daily basis by selling singara( local food), still it’s a big contribution.” (Adult beneficiary, age 24, my translation)

"They taught us how to make our lives better. We used to scold and beat up our children, but these teachers from AKS taught us to avoid these for their better mental growth. How to lead a healthy lifestyle, how we can get out of our depression these things we learned from our counseling sessions. These lessons really helped us to get hold of the mental peace we seek for." (Adult beneficiary, age 25, my translation)

“We are getting benefits from AKS, our children are getting a better life because their parents are getting a good guideline from these teachers. When parents go through problems it affects children in so many ways, so they are trying to solve the issue from the root. For achieving this, they are training us in different ways.” (Adult beneficiary, age 36, my translation)

#### **5.4 Collaborative partner of the project**

The project runs through trial and error process; in the process of working find potential new actors, try to incorporate them likewise. In this section a discussion on the different collaborative partner of the project will be presented. It is necessary to understand the infrastructure within which the project is running and this will help us to understand how conflict arises and negotiation come into place discussed in the next and final section.

So we are trying to work out with local initiatives, through our experience we are learning and finding key actors, it’s not that we are strict to only presumed actor instead we are collaborating with new actors that come along.

There are many international organization that have taken social developmental initiatives in Bangladesh, and it is undoubtedly true, especially in some cases they help to survive and sustain many local NGOs and organization (Jaggar, 2005). However, it should be keep in mind that there is a controversial allegation towards them that international powers (particularly to mention Western powers) "are disproportionately responsible for designing, imposing, and enforcing a global economic order that continues to widen the staggering gap between rich and poor countries"(ibid,p.69). Though the allegation is on the basis of economic order yet a lot of initiatives by external powers focuses on economic empowerment of the poor in the poor countries. Staffs of the project inform that a Netherland-based organization that supports under-

developed countries, particularly working for social development in Bangladesh, is providing all the monetary help to this project. The project avails the donation by submitting the proposal that gone through assessment; after assessment when the donor agency finds similarities with their objectives they grant the funding. Like all other donor agency it ensures overall monitoring of the project and the corresponding project personal is accountable to them for overall progress, budgeting, financial credits, and expenditure. Moreover, every year they make a report on gender sensitivity and practice that they send to their donor agency and it goes through assessment. Besides, gender focal point created by their donor consortium is responsible for gender assessment of the partner organization. However, since the particular project on which this study based on is very new, it's not on the report yet. Nevertheless, it is a future potential area of study to measure what kinds of effect does this monitoring and assessment process has in the life of the beneficiaries of this project.

“There is a Beggars Cooperation Organization who is working for social development in our country who are providing all the monetary help to this project.” (Project personnel, age 35, my translation)

"We submit our proposal, they assess it and found similarities in objectives with them and decided to fund this project. We have to be accountable to them about the progress, financial credit, success or failure, in other words, they are monitoring our project." (Project personnel, age 38, my translation)

"After receiving gender training there is an assessment for our staff, gender parity, and sensitivity is ensured in governing body and throughout. It is maintained very strictly." (Project personnel, age 30, my translation)

"Those who funded us, our donor consortium includes gender focal point who are responsible for gender assessment of partner organization and including all the partner organization they create a gender platform. We have six such international partners, SIDA, Norwegian Embassy, DANIDA, Nets Germany, Novic, Netherlands Embassy." (Project personnel, age 33, my translation)

Since their primary beneficiaries – these children mentioned about their acute poverty which has been justified by their parents or guarding the project become motivated towards providing financial assistance. Till now the project is focusing more towards CSR than assistance from the government as CS is swifter towards reflecting on any issue and less bureaucratic than the governmental agency. Moreover, CS have the legacy of contribution in the social development sector, e.g. environmental harmonization, income generating intervention etc. This legacy has motivated the concerned organization to correspond with them. Still allocation of financial recourses differs highly on connection different sector have with CS: different sector mentioning

organization working for the various cause such as environmental sustainability, livelihood program for women in rural areas and many more. However, it can be speculated that organization having a legacy of doing social work for long is a plus to get financial support from CS. Till now second most important contributor recognized by the project personnel is the community, member. Their idea of involving the community generates from the notion that since there is no aggregated data on beggars if each community comes forward to abolish child begging in their own community then it is easily possible. While I was conducting the interviews, some community member contributed to providing tea flux to eight families who participated in the livelihood training season provided by the organization. Now the adult beneficiaries have started selling tea and earning a living from it. However, the role of media seems to have a positive remark to this project. Not necessary to mention the roundtable discussion held at ProthomAlo (A national Newspaper) office where a huge publicity for this project came across. Others television media such as Somoy Television (A national television) is promoting the project as mentioned by project staff.

"If we want to take beggars out from their undignified job then we need financial help, because parents of these children severally mentioned about their poverty, so we thought who can provide financial help, and we found as a part of CSR, corporate sector have to give away a percentage of their profit towards social development which is guaranteed by our country's CSR policy. They have been doing so in the environmental sector, income generation sector, so we can approach them in this regard. Thus logically we realize to find out those with whom our interest goes in line, the community can, therefore, come forward." (Project personnel, age 38, my translation)

"Since we do not have any aggregated study in begging, if every community come forward to abolish child begging in their own community then it is possible easily, because community people often do many things through social clubs for which need no money, just need some motivation, so we are pointing to do so." (Project personnel, age 33, my translation)

"AKS is also trying to involve different organizations, but it's not that easy. They (CS personnel) have their own sectors to work on and they would like to do so rather than changing into this project." (Project personnel, age 30, my translation)

"Media is really coming forward to help us in this issue; they are helping us financially in terms of promoting and advertising our project. Shomoy television, Prothomalo( leading national newspaper of the country) these are good examples of that. They are promoting this project in a rate lower than their general rates due to

their own responsibility for the society. Furthermore, other volunteers from the society are also coming forward to help us.” (Project personnel, age 35, my translation)

However, though mentioned earlier governmental agency and personnel has been working for the beggars, their effort with this project is not very visible yet. However, in the roundtable the mayor of the Southern Dhaka City Corporation expresses his willingness to collaborative with governmental, civil society organization, CS, communal effort. He mentioned that children who are begging will get preference in the already stated project of inaugurating 200 schools for marginalized and poor children. It is very positive that his political ideology informs that it is easy but not effective to swipe off beggars from the city ordering enforcement agency. Moreover, this ideology goes in line with the initiative taken by the livelihood project: rehabilitate them by making financially self-sufficient through small entrepreneurship.

"We already had meeting with the IG of police regarding this issue, he said if we can find any sources or news, which proves that children are parts of any kind of gang, they will immediately take actions. Luckily we didn't bump into any situations like this till now." (Project personnel, age 35, my translation)

## **5.5 Ideology, Conflict, Resistance**

The project by the organization started with a governmental project to rehabilitate those who were shelter-less. The more was their engagement with those people from the street the more they become inspired to work for them. The extreme violation of child rights e.g. forced begging without their consent, making them physically handicapped and weak for public sympathy, using them in criminal activity, forced to take drugs all these that has been mentioned by staff members inspired them to work in this project. Although these heinous activities have been mentioned under the realm of hidden syndicates as described in Helal and Kabir's study in 2013, particularly this organization's experiences associating syndicates seems not evidential enough. However, in the process of working they believe they will be able to dig into this phenomenon and make a precise recommendation for the government. Their aim is to promote their project as a successful measure of rehabilitative intervention. They have already submitted a position paper consists of existing legal regime of Bangladesh for child rights and protection of children, their hypothetical suggestion is to combine effort of CSR money with community's inspection and support. They admit to state's capability of mobilization to engage

more actors in the table. In this section, the discussion will be based on how different ideology came along to play and how conflict derived from different ideology 'resolved/negotiated'.

"It's very risky for them, they are being forced to engaged since infant, though it's not proven, but it's a well-known allegation that there is a third group who are making them physically disabled and weak to attract public sympathy and preparing for the street to beg. It is surely a violation of human rights. As human rights based organization, we thought that we need to go deep into the situation and to do so we need to work with a small portion of them. If we do not go close to them we will not be able to realize the depth of this problem in the society. This ultimately motivated us to work on this project." (Project personnel, age 38, my translation)

"We have made a positional paper to submit to government and to create some positive evidences which we can suggest to government that by incorporating CS and community to rehabilitate beggars we can achieve success without waiting for donation. We are doing it in small scale; the government can do it in large scale. We will locate appropriate corporate sector to use their CSR to rehabilitate beggars in the community." (Project personnel, age 38, my translation) (Project personnel, age 35, my translation)

### **5.5.1 Clashes of ideology**

Activist ethical responsibility derived from human rights discourse seems to be the motivational sprite for members of the project. The thought that a child who barely could realize what begging means became a beggar – is what they are against for. To them, it is strongly undesirable to a civilized society. Yet, the organization's political ideology – to apply the human rights sensitive approach in this regard have already experienced inconsistency with the governmental attempt. In 2010, when Government of Bangladesh took an initiative to conduct a survey on beggars in the Dhaka Metropolitan City two human rights organizations stopped it by judicial intervention. The survey came to know as the 'Beggars Rehabilitation and Alternative Employment Program' and invited expressions of interest from NGOs to conduct the survey vide notification dated 23.09.2010. The survey design stated that "beggars shall be identified by age groups from 1-12 years, 12-50 years and above 50 years. Together with another human rights organization named Bangladesh Legal Aid and Services Trust (BLAST), Ask challenged the initiative by filing Writ Petition No. 3015 of 2011. The challenge was based on the notion that such attempt would result in categorizing and classifying infants and minors as beggars in the official records. This came into sharp criticism under two grounds as a derogation of the fundamental principles of state policy as stated in the Constitution of Bangladesh and as a form of deprivation of their identities. However, a Division Bench of the Honorable High Court Division of the Supreme Court, under the Rule Nisi ordered to show cause as to why the impugned notification should not be declared

to have been done without lawful authority, and in violation of the fundamental rights of citizens and also stayed operation of the said program (Staff Correspondence, 2014).

“However, no human being can be registered as beggars, because no one born as beggars in this world, government itself is violating human rights and dignity by doing so because it states in the constitution that say every human being will be equal before law and rights.” (Project personnel, age 38, my translation)

"There is random survey method, spot visit as well where we stand in a place for a while and randomly count number of beggars, then multiply and get an idea about location of their concentration, that way we don't need to register them as beggars. We can do a short survey in many places likewise, we bring objection towards such registration, a person has a national identity, beggar cannot be his/her identity. For example when we survey for street children, do we ask them to register as street children?" (Project personnel, age 35, my translation)

"As a human rights activist it is my ethical responsibility wherever is an extreme violation of human right there is a need to knock, I become inspired by this. Worst of all is, we see adults are carrying a kid of only two years who have not learned to speak but asking for money. S/he could not even know about his or her rights but predestined to be a beggar. It is not desirable to a civilized society where someone is growing up with this realization. We feel compassionate about this." (Project personnel, age 33, my translation)

However, though in the round table as a representative of the Social Welfare Ministry of Bangladesh Government, Joint Secretary M. M. Sultan Mahmud did not mention about the petition but affirm some of their project to abolish begging from the Dhaka city. Beggars were transferred to the rehabilitation center in Mymensingh District <sup>8</sup> under one of such initiatives and were given husbandry to have an alternative livelihood. Unfortunately, the project was unsuccessful as these beggars decamp from the center. It repeats in the case of child begging as well. In the interviews with the project personnel pointed two reasons behind failure of these projects: one, lack of understanding of the people who they want to rehabilitate, another improper and/or low services in the center.

"It is not a proper way to monitor them because we need to understand why they would stay in the place where they have sent. Since in the village only a minimum level of livelihood they can avail, but in the city they can have cash money. Gov. needs to understand in the street they don't have a shelter, sanitation system,

---

<sup>8</sup>Mymensingh is one of the districts under Dhaka division, Bangladesh, and is located on the border of the north by Meghalaya state of India and Garo Hills. See in ENCYCLO.CO.UK, English Encyclopedia at <http://www.encyclo.co.uk/meaning-of-Mymensingh%20District>. However, it was not clear why government choose this area to build rehabilitation center.

proper food, an education system for their children; still they want to stay here." (Project personnel, age 35, my translation)

"Most of the employment or livelihood opportunity is in the capital city, on top of it, at first there is poverty hunting them but then they see just by approaching people they can earn a lot of money without any service in return. Psychologically they have lost self-dignity; therefore, thinking poverty is the main reason will not address their problem." (Project personnel, age 38, my translation)

"Rather a context-specific or need-based approach is needed. If they don't want to go back we should create some opportunity at the place where they want to stay. Another reason is they are not focusing on ground assessment; therefore, though a lot of money has been invested still it is not seeing much success." (Project personnel, age 33, my translation)

ASK's ideological position after the experience suggests that arbitrary and rapid decision in the name of beggar's rehabilitation and utter disregard to human rights principle will not bring success. Therefore, prevention of begging and rehabilitation of beggars program should take a proper consideration of all aspect of the problem in compliance with human rights principle. Nevertheless, the involvement of the stakeholders including civil society and rights-based NGOs must be ensured from the very beginning stage of decision making.

Ideological clashes between actors continue in other circumstances as well. ASK's realizes that advocacy cannot be carried out alone but need joint collaboration. Hitherto, workings of different ideology lead fragmentation in approach of rehabilitation; particularly to mention, ideology that promotes begging should be considered as a way of living (Harcourt and Ludwig, 2006) or justifying categorization of beggars in the official records in order to keep track. Furthermore, though literature focusing on religious aspect (particularly to mention Islam) of begging stress it does not promote begging, staff member opine otherwise. However, though begging should not be abolished on the ground that no one is giving arm out of pressure (ibid), staff members opines that prevailing norms boost up begging in times of religious festival. Such a norm is raising tension in the justification ground from which the organization is working.

Within civil society exist different theory; area of interest differs as well. For example, there is this opinion that if an adult chose to live by begging it is his/her choice. Therefore, raising strong voice around one direction seems very difficult to achieve. For example, in the case of our petition against the government, some have an opinion that without survey how they will

proceed. There is some campaign promoting begging, do they actually want to strengthen beggar's voice? So, there is problem in the level of understanding.

“Also general sentiment combined with religious sentiment promotes it further. For example, when there is a religious festive people seek beggars to donate money. We, civil society actor are not being able to raise our voice strongly in this regard.” (Project personnel, age 38, my translation)

Ideological challenges derived from corporate sector points towards the aim of investment. To make it specific, it is the profit that motivates CS to invest in any sector. Though corporate policy as a binding set up for CS in the form of social responsibility yet in the round table the City Bank representative Faruq Moinuddin mentioned about loops to avoid it. However, looking at profit CS would like to invest where there is marketing for their sector. It is not economically viable to investment to rehabilitate beggars which only bring social progress to certain parts of the community.

Corporate sectors, on the other hand, have a tendency to invest in prominent sector, for example if they invest on buying jersey or bat in cricket it will enhance business profit, gives more publicity than a campaign for beggars. It is very logical that they will invest where there is more publicity. So they feel the risk to invest in initiatives similar to us, to keep a track of investment. Since everyone is motivated to increase business and profit, these groups remain in marginalization since investment for them will not return any profit.

## **5.6 Negotiation process: How ASK is responding in line with government initiatives**

Negotiation process to resolve the conflict among ideologies happens in the point of when an actor is approached finding similarities in their motives and initiatives. Although the resolving conflict between aims is identified as a challenge by the staff of the organization, they mention when they approach any stakeholders they look into their previous work areas, intention and process.

“It is difficult to negotiate between different intention of actors, but we have to find similarities with each other objectives; for example, we see our national corporate sector can play a role here, we see our welfare ministry can play role in policy level because they have similar work like us, so we identified them as a key actor.” (Project personnel, age 38, my translation)

The proposition developed by Allaggappa mentioned that although "the rise of civil society has limited the power and reach of the state", state has strong influence on the nature and development of civil society (ibid). Especially, in Asia the emergence of civil society in such a broader spectrum covering a range of issues, the relationship and interaction between civil society organization and state evolved in mutual respect and on the cornerstone of accepted norms to negotiate confrontation (ibid, xii). Similarly, in this context we see different stakeholders are putting their own ideological dimension in the negotiation process: ASK with their international donor consortium to promote humanistic approach, government promoting neo-liberal ideology and CS following the path, research in the national level problematizing 'super-structural' inequalities. However, each party following their ideology accepting each other since all are accepted norm in the broader structure. For instance, even though state together with CS merging with neo-liberal ideology yet ASK believes state power has the highest potential to generate and practice human rights in large scale. This may be the reason that ASK highlights state's obligation towards the international Human Rights covenant in the position paper they prepare to present to the government (Position Paper, ASK, 2014). At the same time, the joint action combining international and national level that cross to shape the life of these concerned people finding a solution through injecting work value. These international organization is also promoting the practice of human right in the national setting. They have established wing to frame human rights value as a guiding tool both for them and their partner organization.

"It starts from the human ground, there is no give and take matter here. What we want to inspire among people is whether we want to give a dignified life to a person or not, if we do then is there anything individual can do. We want to aware the human consciousness of a human being and this is our basis of negotiation." (Project personnel, age 38, my translation)

"Since they want to address vulnerable sector and our project do the same, our project goes in line with their objectives, we are able to work together. Besides, as an international organization they can provide the fund needed and we as a national organization has influences over governmental body and policy makers, therefore we thought these two expertise body can run the project". (Project personnel, age 33, my translation)

"They are working 50 years, they have a wing called Law and Human Rights, their sense of responsibility derives from this wing since it is human rights violation issue". (Project personnel, age 35, my translation)

"Off course, government to take more responsively as a key actor since it has been declared in our constitution about equal rights and dignity for everyone. But if the volume of the problem is not manageable

only by the government then as a citizen of this country everyone needs to take some responsibility." (Project personnel, age 30, my translation)

To resolve conflict and to enhance advocacy for human rights norms and standards different stakeholders sit in roundtable discussion where they inform about their initiatives, locate space of involvement of other actors and find out similar interest with different groups to merge and work further. For instance, in the roundtable in ProthomAlo, all stakeholders after presenting individual experiences recognize that lack of comprehensiveness among different initiatives resulted in continuous hindrance towards effective rehabilitation of beggars. This ultimately hampers projects to sustain in the long run.

Diplomacy in justifying measures exists in every interaction, not necessarily it is unjust. However, the project personnel has recognized community's potential to mobilize social responsibility among others. Positive attitude and example can spread the motivation for doing 'social work' as a mantra for the project's forward-looking strategy. Their hope is to initiate a social movement where positive example by one community will transfer and motivate other communities and CS to come forward in the rehabilitation initiatives of these children and their family. It will distribute some of the responsibilities of the government among different actors of the society.

"Collaboration of different actors definitely brings new thread. When a community takes up such responsibility it inspires another community so, definitely add value. When we exemplify someone's initiative to a community they become inspired. For example when we exemplify to the corporate sector that a few community member took rehabilitation initiatives of some beggars, therefore with corporate sector's capacity they can do for more people. Thus, as a chain, a good example motivates another." (Project personnel, age 38, my translation)

"Take up of such responsibility and awareness can provide help in different ways, be it financial, motivational or educational. In the position paper, they have mentioned those who used to be the beneficiary of this project but now is a contributor. The contribution of the civil society in social mobilization is visible in the roundtable discussion as well." (Project personnel, age 33, my translation)

"It is the same for raising awareness. If someone cannot provide financial help, may take responsibility of raising motivation to take alternative profession. A student of a community, for example, admitted two children to school and provided their school fees from his tuition money. So one good example inspires another that is the rule of the society, difficult is to find this good person, once there is something good it received by many. We are just trying to raise this human power." (Project personnel, age 30, my translation)

The organization identified begging as an 'undignified' form of profession. As mentioned earlier beneficiaries who have interviewed think in the same way. Even negotiations process is also visible when the organization to decide upon the distribution of intervention among scarce resources. One of the adult I interviewee has a child who is mentally handicapped, but his parents at least can run the family without begging. Under the project, the organization contributed a lot of money for his treatment. My interviewee has also received livelihood training, but she did not get the tea flux. On the other hand, the only adult beneficiary who does not have children, therefore, technically does not meet the requirement of joining the livelihood training has given the flux since she does not have anything to start a life without begging.

## **6. Concluding discussion**

In this final section, it can be said that interview material analyzed in the above section organized under different theoretical frame but motivated to answer research question formulated at the beginning of this thesis. Material analyzed illustrated that structural inequality in the form of responsibility mechanism in raising family, abusive partner relationship, physical violence, and improper support system in case of vulnerability – all these are existing threads in which the Prevention of Child Begging project is trying to find way to intervene. On top of it religious sentiment as a 'superstructure' is an interesting juncture not only functions in their being beggar but also a trend governing in and out their life in immediate relationship: with the partner, parents and community in which live. However, the second sets of analysis start with Jaggar's(2005) expansion of analysis depicting apparently seeming vulnerability and destitution need to contextualize in the broader economic and political structure.

My second sets of data analysis try to find out more about the structures in which ASK through the project designed to intervene. To transform from pre-modern state to modern state, it needed to create space for discovery and differentiate between social category(GARLAND, 1997, p.177); be that it may, central political issues here by what is driving from ASK that begging cannot be someone's profession have to do with power exercised around begging. My interviewee's response constellated around overarching situation such as incomprehensive measures by the government to bring gender equality in school together with gender practices

intertwined with girl children employed more in begging. Particularly, practices of different control mechanism over boy child and girl child indicate possible speculation that control over children's peer group is necessary to employ them in begging. This sets of analysis inform not only what measures ASK has put in place to fight for the rights of beggars but also give an explanation why is particularly this measures fit in the place.

However, gender sensitivity from ASK's part is guided through their gender policy. A review of the gender policy would have enabled to explore more of its effect of governance but to limit the scope of this research I have to rely on my interviewee from the beneficiary category. It has been explored that such policy surely play a role in the counseling which is one of the imperative sources of governance. Power is spread among different actors in the sovereign state as their part of building disciplinary mechanism and the central governance achieve its goal through employing different expert administrative body (Foucault, 1978). Though the counseling, the project creates the optimum situation where the neo-liberal ideology of government to raise work value among those people can be practiced. Nevertheless, it was as important area of this research to consider beneficiaries as active participant in the process governmentality and it was analyzed from the notion that civil society is a location where "individuals negotiate, argue, struggle against or agree with each other and with the centers of political and economic authority" (Kaldor, 2003, p.585). There is no way to disagree that those who are the beneficiary of the project are forced to comply with this neo-liberal ideology of government. Rather, since they could not be part of the ideology due to the existing structure, governmental authority had to envisage new structure to include them and the project is the location where they are negotiating, struggling and agreeing.

The final sets of discussion put lights on the complex mechanism of collaboration among actors in the civil society who disagree and struggle with each other, having their own political issues to highlight. However, they are also informed that their existence depends on the very power of negotiation. At the end it the power civil society achieved through their governance that motivates them to negotiate and to look forward to fighting for the rights of marginalizes, here the beneficiary who used to beg.

## References

- Afsar, R. (2000). *Rural-urban migration in Bangladesh*. Dhaka: University Press.
- Ahmadullah, A. K., Momen, M. A., and Islam, M. H. (1962). They Live on Charity: The Report of a Survey on Beggars in Dhaka City." *Report Studies* 6.
- Alagappa, M. (2004). *Civil society and political change in Asia*. Stanford, Calif.: Stanford University Press, pp.Preface and Introduction (i-xiii, 1-55).
- Alam, D. (2013). *Strengthening Human Rights Defenders*.Annual Report 2013. Dhaka: Ain o Salish Kendra (ASK), pp.7-65.
- Baker, D. (2009). A Critical Evaluation of the Historical and Contemporary Justifications for Criminalising Begging.*The Journal of Criminal Law*, 73(3), pp.212-240.
- Bombay Prevention of Begging Act 1959*. (Law And Judiciary Department, Government of Maharashtra, X of 1960).Bombay: Director, Government Printing and Stationary, 1976
- Burke, J. and Hammadi, S. (2011). *Bangladesh arrest uncovers evidence of children forced into begging*. [online] the Guardian. Available at:  
<http://www.theguardian.com/world/2011/jan/09/bangladesh-arrest-forced-begging>  
[Accessed 9 Aug. 2015].
- Comaroff, J. and Comaroff, J. (1999). *Civil society and the political imagination in Africa*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.
- Dempsey, E. (2011). *Op-Ed: Homelessness to be a crime in Bangladesh?*. [online] Digitaljournal.com. Available at: <http://www.digitaljournal.com/article/313136> [Accessed 7 Aug. 2015].
- Fadaee, S. (2014).Civil society organisations in India and construction of multiplicity of human rights.*The International Journal of Human Rights*, 18(4-5), pp.567-577.

- Fink, J.&Lunqvist, Å. (2010). Changing relations of welfare.Family, gender and migration in Britain and Scandinavia. Surrey: Ashgate.
- Foucault, M. (1977).*Discipline and punish*. New York: Pantheon Books.
- Foucault, M., Foucault, M., Foucault, M. and Foucault, M. (1978).*The history of sexuality*. New York: Pantheon Books.
- Foucault, M. (1988) Technologies of the self. In L. Martin, H. Gutman& P. Hutton (Eds.) *Technologies of the self: A seminar with Michel Foucault*. pp. 16 – 49. London, England: Tavistock Publications.
- GARLAND, D. (1997). `Governmentality' and the Problem of Crime: Foucault, Criminology, Sociology. *Theoretical Criminology*, 1(2), pp.173-214.
- Harcourt, B, & Ludwig, J (2006).Broken windows: New evidence from New York City and a five-city social experiment.*University Of Chicago Law Review*, 73, pp. 271-320.
- Helal, M. and Kabir, K. (2013).EXPLORING CRUEL BUSINESS OF BEGGING: THE CASE OF BANGLADESH.*Asian Journal of Business and Economics*, 3(3.1 Quarter I), pp.1-7.
- Hossain, S. (2006). Social characteristics of a megacity: a case of Dhaka City, Bangladesh. In: *TASA conference 2006*. [online] Australia 2006: University of Western Australia & Murdoch University, pp.1-4. Available at: [http://www.researchgate.net/publication/228734585\\_Social\\_characteristics\\_of\\_a\\_megacity\\_a\\_case\\_of\\_Dhaka\\_City\\_Bangladesh](http://www.researchgate.net/publication/228734585_Social_characteristics_of_a_megacity_a_case_of_Dhaka_City_Bangladesh) [Accessed 11 Aug. 2015].
- Jaggar, A. (2005). "SavingAmina": Global Justice for Women and Intercultural Dialogue. *Ethics & International Affairs*, 19(03), pp.55-75.
- Kabeer, N. (1999).*The conditions and consequences of choice*. Geneva, Switzerland: UNRISD.
- Kabeer, N. (2005). Gender equality and women's empowerment: A critical analysis of the third millennium development goal 1. *Gender & Development*, 13(1), pp.13-24.
- Kaldor, M. (2003).The idea of global civil society.*International Affairs*, 79(3), pp.583-593.

- Keck, M. and Sikkink, K. (1998). *Activists beyond borders*. Ithaca, N.Y.: Cornell University Press, pp.1-22.
- Kelling, G. and Sousa, Jr., W. (2001). *Do Police Matter?: An Analysis of the Impact of New York City's Police Reforms*. Civic Report No 22. [online] Manhattan Institute Center for Civic Innovation. Available at: [http://www.manhattan-institute.org/pdf/cr\\_22.pdf](http://www.manhattan-institute.org/pdf/cr_22.pdf) [Accessed 14 Sep. 2015].
- Kemp, P.A (1997). The characteristics of single homeless people in England. In Burrows R., Pleace, N., & Quilgars, D., eds. *Homelessness and social policy*". Routledge, London, pp. 69-87.
- Lewis, D. (2004). On the difficulty of studying 'civil society': Reflections on NGOs, state and democracy in Bangladesh. *Contributions to Indian Sociology*, 38(3), pp.299-322.
- Malik, S. and Roy, S. (2012). A Study on Begging: A Social Stigma--An Indian Perspective. *Journal of Human Values*, 18(2), pp.187-199.
- Mohanty, C. (2003). "Under Western Eyes" • Revisited: Feminist Solidarity through Anticapitalist Struggles. *Signs: Journal of Women in Culture and Society*, 28(2), pp.499-535.
- Mukherjee, D.(2008). Laws For Beggars, Justice for Whom: A Critical Review of the Bombay Prevention of Begging Act 1959. *International Journal Of Human Rights*, 12(2) pp. 279-288.
- Nagarathna,, A., Jaishankar, K. and Ronel,ed, N. (2011). Criminalization of beggary: A critical look at the existing Indian legal approach. In: *First International Conference of the South Asian Society of Criminology and Victimology (SASCV)*. Jaipur, Rajasthan, India.: South Asian Society of Criminology and Victimology (SASCV) and Department of Criminology and Criminal Justice.
- Narayan, D and Petesch, P. (2000) *Voices of poor: crying out for a change*. World Bank, Washington, DC.

- Naved, R., Azim, S., Bhuiya, A. and Persson, L. (2006). Physical violence by husbands: Magnitude, disclosure and help-seeking behavior of women in Bangladesh. *Social Science & Medicine*, 62(12), pp.2917-2929.
- PandeB.B. (1986).THE RIGHT TO BE HUMAN.*IndiaInternational Centre Quarterly*, 13(3/4), pp.115-132.
- Rahman, S. (2015).*Global Legal Monitor: Bangladesh: Homeless Persons' Treatment Under 2011 Law / Global Legal Monitor / Law Library of Congress / Library of Congress*. [online] Loc.gov. Available at: [http://www.loc.gov/lawweb/servlet/lloc\\_news?disp3\\_1205402867\\_text](http://www.loc.gov/lawweb/servlet/lloc_news?disp3_1205402867_text) [Accessed 7 Aug. 2015].
- Ramanathan, U. (2008). 'Ostensible Poverty, Beggary and the Law', *Economic and Political Weekly*, 44, p. 33, viewed 12 December, 2014. *JSTOR Journals, EBSCOhost*, 43(44), pp.33-44.
- Staff Correspondence, (2014).*Position Paper on Prevention of Child Begging*.Dhaka: ICCO-Cooperation, pp.1-16.
- Staff, C. (2011).Vagrant act a 'tool' to put shelterless behind bars.*The Daily Star*. [online] Available at: <http://archive.thedailystar.net/newDesign/news-details.php?nid=202904> [Accessed 7 Aug. 2015].
- STEARNS, M. (2007).*Liberalism and the Politics of Compulsion*. [online] Journals.cambridge.org. Available at: [http://journals.cambridge.org/abstract\\_S0007123407000270](http://journals.cambridge.org/abstract_S0007123407000270) [Accessed 11 Aug. 2015].
- Uddin, S., Aktar, M. and Sultana, A. (2014). BEGGARS IN DHAKA CITY: PROFESSION OR COMPULSION. *Asian Journal of Business and Economics*, [online] 4(4.3 Quarter III), pp.1-14. Available at: <http://www.onlineresearchjournals.com/ajbe/art/100.pdf> [Accessed 11 Aug. 2015].
- WHO.(2002). *World report on violence and health*. Geneva: World Health Organization.
- World Bank, (2006).*Dhaka: improving living conditions for the urban poor*. Washington, DC:

Urban Development Unit South Asia Region. World Bank.

World Bank, (2007).*Dhaka: Improving Living Conditions for the Urban Poor*. Bangladesh Development Series Paper No. 17. [online] The World Bank Office, Dhaka: World Bank Office Dhaka, pp.1-46. Available at: <http://www.worldbank.org.bd/bds> [Accessed 11 Aug. 2015].