Indonesian Travel Bloggers:

The Empowered Negotiators

Aryo Prionggo

Lund University

Master of Science in Media and Communication

Supervisor: Tobias Linne

December 2018

Abstract

Despite aiming for more civic engagement in tourism industry, The Indonesian Tourism Board effort to transform more citizen to become government-version of travel bloggers was faced by a protest since some travel bloggers didn't feel common values exist. Therefore, this thesis identifies travel blogger's intrinsic and extrinsic motivations by recognizing the transformation process that develops regular bloggers to be travel bloggers in the context of digital participatory culture. This thesis includes travel bloggers who have experienced the transformation until they have become semi-professional and professional travel bloggers who manage to include sponsored contents. Therefore, this thesis critically analyzes the effect of commercialization and the presence of corporate narratives in correlation with travel blogger's personal storytelling narratives.

This thesis manages to find the development of intrinsic and extrinsic motivations, the development of challenges to entry and to sustain in the travel blogger's participatory culture, the enabling factors to be a travel blogger, and sustaining factors to keep on being identified as travel bloggers. Notable finding includes how the commercialization adds financial motivation and competition against new travel bloggers. However, financial issue doesn't appear as constraining a factor since most travel bloggers have another profession.

Taking into account the oligarchic nature of Indonesian digital media industry, this thesis observes how the travel bloggers are able to negotiate the corporate's interest with their own agenda. Recognizing that this negotiation involves narrative competencies, this thesis includes both written and video elicitation materials to capture the sense of reconfiguration process from the travel bloggers when they are being provided by mainstream tourism narratives. The thesis findings show that travel blogger's personal storytelling contains authenticity and informal language delivery and is focused on travel and tourism related topic. This storytelling tends to be constructed and planned by the travel bloggers with or without their sponsors.

Keywords: Travel Bloggers, Indonesia, Participatory Culture, Intrinsic Motivation, Extrinsic Motivation, Digital Media

Acknowledgement

Dedicated for the brave Indonesian travel bloggers.

My gratitude for:

Tobias Linné for all the guidance.

All of the lecturers and staffs in the Department of Media and Communication.

All of the 2018 master students in the Department of Media and Communication.

Indonesian ministry of finance for the scholarship.

National Taiwan University for the unforgettable courses.

National Taiwan University's School of Musicology for making me become part of them.

Yannick Dauby for being the best lecturer.

『残酷な天使のテーゼ

Table of Contents

1. Introduction

Tourism industry in Indonesia is considered to be an important national strategy for national development and has becoming a hope for the country's economy. It is shown, for example, when the government projected 20 million of visitor in 2019[1]. This goal can be challenging since the Indonesian tourism board were criticized in the past for being old-fashioned and seemed to deny any form of partnership with the whole tourism community, specifically the lack of digital media strategy (Bungin, 2015). Only until 2018, the Indonesian tourism board then began to prioritize 'digital tourism' with the help from a blogging community called Generasi Pesona Indonesia (GenPI/Wonderful Indonesia Generation) initiative[2]. Despite being under-researched (Stainton & Iordanova, 2017), travel bloggers have becoming important digital media producers both for their audience and for the elites. This is because previous studies suggests that Indonesian travel blogging communities managed to provide interactions between multi-cultural society (Kumar, et al., 2009), being important information resources for tourism (Divinagracia, et al., 2012), and are able to articulate 'post authoritarian nationhood' (Triastuti & Rakhmani, 2012). Perhaps, these qualities are part of the reason that attracts the Indonesian government to make use of the travel bloggers.

While the Indonesian tourism board highlighted their target to include more participation from Indonesian travel bloggers throughout 34 provinces, tourism development is unequal within the country. As a result, there are areas with better infrastructures like in Java Island and there are remote areas that need different treatment and approach like in East Indonesia (Cole, 2007;Bungin, 2015). This disproportion of development is argued to affect the small scale digital media producers like travel bloggers. According to Tapsell (2017), there are only 'empowered minorities' in urban areas in Indonesia who are able to use their media production skills effectively due to uneven social and technological factors. They are minorities since non-mainstream and smaller media companies are struggling to compete with the corporate media. Additionally, previous

---

[1] Kompas, 3rd September 2018
[2] http://www.kemenpar.go.id/asp/detil.asp?c=16&id=4024

research shows that digital media development in Indonesia is not currently equally distributed as a result from both technological and non-technological disparities including education, economic development, and telecommunication infrastructure (Sujarwoto & Tampubolon, 2016). The further implication is that the internet penetration in Indonesia's poorer districts tends to be limited since there is lack of digital media infrastructure as opposed to the cities in main inlands. Indeed according to Tapsell, there are only a handful of empowered minorities which are skillful individuals who mainly reside in urban areas in Indonesia with certain competency, which is a competency to usurp mainstream media narratives by publishing their own. Considering travel bloggers as alternative media producers, their competency requires media-related skills and is appreciated by Tapsell because at the fullest potential, they are able to counter and disseminate the elite agenda for the sake of democracy as it was shown in the Jakarta governor's election of 2012 (ibid). However for the case of travel bloggers, some scholars expand it further that such skills can also be used by the corporates since they are becoming more beneficial compared to the more mainstream tourism campaign (Stainton & Iordanova, 2017). Azariah (2017) confirms that there are ongoing negotiations and tensions between 'tourist' agenda which is located in a more commercialized domain and the more authentic 'traveling' experience. In Indonesian media power context, the dichotomy of two agendas can be regarded as the division between 'mainstream' and 'niche' interests (Tapsell, 2017:45) and indeed it is the travel blogger's task to be trusted by their niche community by reconfiguring mainstream elite's messages if they want to enter the moral economy of Web 2.0 (Jenkins, et al., 2013) - where there are mutual understanding between the corporates and non-corporates that makes them possible to make work together (ibid: 52). Therefore, collaboration between travel bloggers and the corporates can be problematic since travel bloggers need to be valued as authentic information provider by the general public while still maintaining their bargaining position with the media oligarchs. Studying the media participation of travel bloggers is important since both in tourism and media field of study, participation is argued to bring benefit for democratization process since it connects with the notion of community empowerment (Tapsell, 2017: Cole, 2006) and one of the Indonesian tourim board program is to empower the local communities so that they are able to develop their own touristic place. The mentioned scholars also indicate that travel bloggers are attached to some kind of community and they have closer social proximity with local people by not being part of the elite or corporate. However, it needs further clarification for the case of Indonesian travel bloggers.

Some previous scholars haven't been able to confirm whether Indonesian travel bloggers have the specific competency according to Tapsell's finding. At the current state, better knowledge is required to confirm whether there are some non-mainstream media producers in Indonesia who are more than ordinary civilians and if they are able to separate between mainstream and niche interest. Therefore, the thesis wants to identify the travel bloggers who use the blog for something more than personal use by recognizing that there are travel bloggers who are able to contribute in certain ways in media industry.

2. Background

2.1 Mainstreaming the travel bloggers

Travel bloggers in Indonesia tend to be mainstreamed both by the government when they use a modified journalism ethic in the GenPI website and also by the scholars (Roesma & Mulya, 2018) by putting up the same journalism ethic as if a suitable guideline for all citizen media producers. Therefore, travel bloggers in Indonesia are being oversimplified by since even though Hanusch introduced the term 'travel journalism' (2010), he argues that it does not suit in the category of traditional journalistic work. Likewise, while Haryanto appreciates the Indonesian Press Council's effort to regulate the digital media, he argues that it has not bring significant progress due to the nature of online media for being a mixture of journalistic and non-journalistic works (2014:26). Therefore, travel bloggers need to be studied thoroughly since travel blog is a new form of tourism communication that derives from personal diary instead of established newspaper or other mass media and may contain multiple style of narrative techniques (Azariah, 2017). In that regard, Dahlgren (2013:122) confirms that there are alternative forms of digital media practices that defy the older media traditions. The multiplicity of travel blogger's role, whether in media or tourism industry, brings the question about how the travel bloggers should participate in digital media. If travel blogging activity is categorized under the context of citizen journalism, Goode (2009) points out that there is political economy in this alternative journalism and therefore this thesis recognizes that the travel bloggers are not entirely the opposite of corporate media. If fact, they are able to work together through sponsorship, collaboration, and other monetizing efforts. This particular political economy is connected with the notion of 'new moral economy' (Jenkins, et al., 2013) where corporates and non-corporates digital media

producers are involved in ongoing negotiations in order to collaborate since technological shift allows empowerment for both parties. Therefore, it is important to explore the relationship between mainstream and non-mainstream media domain since it is still unclear how the travel bloggers in Indonesia position themselves in the participatory culture. Since travel blog derives from personal diary, Azariah argues that authorial control should be possessed by travel bloggers and it can be problematic when corporates and sponsors try to alter the travel blogger's content with commercial interests (2017:42). She continues that the presence of sponsorships and advertisements can lead the travel blogger's narratives become polyphonic and blur the personal and commercial interest. Therefore, the thesis follows the suggestion to examine possible narrative techniques incorporated to give the multivocality of travel blog (ibid).

A problem that comes from commercial interest was shown when the Indonesian tourism board was recently protested in March 2018[3]. A member of GenPI refuses the idea of governed and dictated community by arguing that GenPI was actually an independent blogging community and shouldn't be commercialized by the government. The protest declares: 'let us free to create and express'. The protest informs that elite and blogger's interests can be different and need to be investigated further. Although the protest indicates an altruistic motivation by how they refuse commercialization, the thesis is still aware about possible financial matter as smaller scale digital media producers in Indonesia are struggling financially, being underpaid, and tend to be unprofessional due to unbalance competition against the digital media oligarchs in Indonesia (Tapsell, 2017:27). Therefore, the thesis recognizes the importance of financial benefit for travel bloggers if they want to be sustainable or expand their participation since travel blog is more expensive compared to other popular type of blogs in Indonesia – for example, fitness blog and food blog (Roesma & Mulya, 2018).

2.2 The promise of decentralization

Digital media platforms enable the other tourist professionals such as travel agents and travel guides to gain benefit from the birth of travel bloggers by the distributed information.

---

[3] https://www.kabarmakassar.com/specials/view/94/relawan-ini-protes-komersialisasi-genpi-sulsel.html

Nowadays, travel bloggers have an option to include sponsored content which means that travel blog can be more than simply a personal blog and allows the travel bloggers to be more involved in the media industry. Indeed, digital media have enabling as well as constraining aspects (Fuchs, 2013:25) where the participants find ways to adapt and develop new possibilities through various practices (Schaefer, 2011:11). In the context of Indonesian tourism industry, this could have been an important feature that marks the decentralization from the previous authoritative regime where the tourism industry used to be controlled by the central government. However, the emergence of travel blogging as a new digital media practice was responded by the former vice minister of tourism. She admitted that the emergence of digital media and travel bloggers were about to be taken seriously by the government since there are problems in tourism industry as a result from the emergence of digital media[4]. In another separated interview, the former tourism board officer explicitly pointed out that the travel bloggers can endanger the sustainable tourism since they are able to attract mass tourism into less prepared places and therefore need to be monitored[5]. What Fuchs (2013), Dahlgren (2013), Jenkins et al (2013), and Schaefer (2011) have in common is they confirm that the concept of participation in digital media tends to be associated with positive remarks as if the internet is a single solution for democratic society. Quite the contrary, they suggest that new alternative practice is potentially at risk for being controlled and confronted by corporate and political interest. And digital media environment in Indonesia is a good example. The emergence of travel bloggers that are able to work together with other industry professionals such as hospitality industry, advertising, and government is an indication that travel blog which used to be a personal blog for personal use has becoming more important for bigger impact. Furthermore, it coincides with the ongoing spirit of decentralization in current Indonesian political arena where the control of the industry has now becoming looser.

While digital media environment in Indonesia is a promising arena for challenging the oligarchy power, the corporate media owners who have media infrastructure and direct affiliation with political parties also gain benefit from digital participatory culture (Tapsell, 2017). As a result, divergent aims exist between elite media companies versus smaller digital media producers. These

---

[4] In separated interview, W - former vice minister of tourism, 2018
[5] In separated interview, H - former tourism board officer, 2018

smaller, non-mainstream media producers are consisted of empowered Indonesians who are able to utilize technologies in order to 'lobby' the forces (ibid). However, Haryanto (2014:24-29) argues that unlike in Europe or United States, Indonesian mainstream media is still powerful so that they are able to purchase and control the smaller digital media start-ups when they think it's profitable. This thesis then proposes that there is a mechanism within the participatory culture where the elites can take advantage of travel bloggers buy various method: either by purchasing them, letting them to struggle with unfair competition, or by gaining authentic credibility through collaborating with the travel bloggers. On the latter, Jenkins et al call travel blogger's role as the 'grassroots intermediaries' (2013:83). It means that there is a possibility that the travel bloggers are positioned between the corporate and their audience for the benefit of both parties. Additionally, there is a possibility for other opportunities that are important for the travel bloggers since digital media producers should have certain motivations that make them become participants despite constraining factors such as elite control, financial constraint, and other factors that need to be investigated. However, just like in other parts of the world, the direction of media convergence in Indonesia is not yet established (Haryanto, 2014:45). Therefore, this thesis hopes to observe where the travel bloggers will take their participation and whether there collaboration through sponsorship brings any benefit or further challenge for the travel bloggers.

2.3 Digital commodification of place in Indonesia

The importance of travel bloggers for bigger cause is connected with the emergence of 'digital tourism' that has been proposed by the Indonesian government. According to the Indonesian tourism board, digital tourism is related with the role of digital media in fulfilling tourist's imagination through digital images. In another press release in March 2018[6], current minister of tourism Arif Yahya describes that digital tourism is a suitable theme to cope with online travelling where 63% of tourist activities are being purchased online. This emergence of digitalization inspires the minister to recommend the staffs and municipals to construct 'digital destinations' to refer places that are popular in social media platforms. Additionally, the minister claims that new tourism destinations in Indonesia have been able to be introduced as new standards for modern destination - mainly by providing physical 'Instagram-able' objects at the location.

---

[6] http://kemenpar.go.id/asp/detil.asp?id=4023

Instagram as an arena of digital visual culture is important in tourism industry since visuality is an important aspect in modern tourism industry (Urry, in Molz, 2012:8). Without specifically mentioning travel bloggers, Haryanto implies that exploring places in Indonesia and to make it as an expedition or exclusive news reporting is more important than the mainstream or conventional journalism work (2014:47) since there are still many places in Indonesia that need to be explored further – especially in remote areas. By his statement, it is to support the dichotomy between explorative, authentic travel values versus the mainstream touristic values (Azariah, 2017). Additionally, also the dichotomy between commercial and smaller media producers since Haryanto mentions the problem for travel bloggers where the mainstream media companies tend to have much more financial resources to do such effort (2014).

For travel bloggers, the Instagram-able objects are important resources to be reproduced for their audiences since travel blog is participatory and the contents are public despite containing personal narratives (Azariah, 2017). Additionally, digital images are argued to have significant impact in configuring the tourist's perceived reality (Urry & Larsen, 2011; Regnault, 2016). Therefore, it is apparent that the Indonesian government has been able to keep up with the digital media strategy. However, non-mainstream media producers like the travel bloggers tend to avoid governance and are able to do things that the mainstream can't (Carpentier, 2013). Tapsell (2017) has identified the advanced individuals with skills that are able to modify, filter, and redistribute mainstream messages to niche communities in Indonesia. Unfortunately, the amount of this type of producers are limited only in urban areas, and possessing internet connection is not enough to have such skills. Hence Tapsell calls them the 'empowered minorities' (ibid). Despite mentioning several competencies by the non-mainstream media producers, it is still unclear about how the empowered minorities acquire the access and knowledge of the skills and what particular skills are important for travel bloggers in Indonesia in order to become what they are.

3. Research question and aim

The previous sections have shown that even though the Indonesian government have been trying to keep up with the digitalization, there is a lack of mutual understanding between the elite and Indonesian travel bloggers regarding the travel blogger's needs and motivations. Despite various researches have been able to study the intrinsic and extrinsic motivations of bloggers as digital media producers, most of them don't specify the scope for travel bloggers. Moreover, most researches do not include professional or sponsored bloggers. Therefore, this thesis considers that there is a research gap regarding how the Indonesian travel bloggers see themselves related with external and internal factors that contribute to their identity. Keeping in mind that tourism industry is digitally commercialized in Indonesia, it is highly possible that the participatory culture for Indonesian travel bloggers involves 'mediated tourist gaze' (Molz, 2012) where new mode of cultural production and connectivity can be identified. As the previous researches suggests, the dichotomy between mainstream or elite media interest and the non-mainstream media producer's need to be carefully investigated since it involves a particular form of economy that makes them intertwined instead of opposing each other. Therefore, the purpose of this research is to clarify the Indonesian travel blogger's identity as digital media producers based on their internal and external factors in the digital participatory culture according to their own voices.

In relation with digital media producer's needs, Van Dijk (2013) suggests to explore the interrelation between human and non-human actors by assessing how the needs are produced. Therefore, the thesis is aware that there is an 'internet divide' in Indonesia as a result from technological and non-technological disparities such as telecommunication infrastructure, human capital, and economic development (Sujarwoto & Tampubolon, 2016). These disparities can be seen as a constraining factor that makes individuals are less capable to exert any digital media competency. However, at the same time, Indonesia has been recognized to have a significant number of growing digital media users nonetheless. Therefore, there are ongoing constraining and enabling factors that make common digital media users become travel bloggers. Since digital participatory culture has its constraining and enabling factor, Tapsell (2017) and Schaefer (2011) argue that skill is required for digital media producers to navigate themselves and make their needs become fulfilled. However, particular competency that can contribute to democracy which is any

skill to usurp mainstream agenda is currently limited in Indonesia. Therefore, this thesis also includes the competency of travel bloggers who manage to consider themselves as travel bloggers as another aspect to be researched.

Therefore, wants to answer the questions as follows:

- What are the driving factors that motivate individual to be a travel blogger?
- What are the constraining and enabling factors for travel bloggers?
- What are the important digital media competencies according to the travel bloggers?

The thesis aims to get better understanding of media powers in Indonesia by exploring how travel bloggers as the empowered minorities who have digital media production skills manage to sustain and how they position themselves with regards to the mainstream powers. Therefore, the thesis will answer the questions by giving better explanation about how the travel bloggers navigate themselves in participatory culture. In Indonesian context, exploring these empowered minorities is argued to be beneficial to understand the role of participatory culture that shapes the Indonesian society (Tapsell, 2017). On the bigger picture, he argues that the presence of the non-corporate, smaller scale media producers with niche audience can give a sense of the democracy in Indonesia. According to Tapsell, the specialized media producers can help the democracy since they are able to disseminate elite narratives. However, these smaller, non-mainstream media producers have always been challenged by the oligarchs because they tend to have different values. In that regard, travel bloggers can be a good example of specialized media producer who can counter the oligarchs.

The 'corporates' in this thesis is an umbrella term and is interchangeable to include all the mainstream industry's stakeholders including Indonesian tourism board and elite private sectors. This is because in Indonesia, conglomerates and governments tend to have close proximity - including in digital environment (Tapsell, 2017). Therefore, the term 'corporate' is also related with the notion of 'mainstream', 'oligarch', and 'elite'. This study of travel bloggers as media producers is to complement the existing studies that focus on the tourists as audiences (for example, Abercrombie & Longhurst, 1998; Urry & Larsen, 2011; Roesch, 2009), on travel blogger's content (Chandralal, et al., 2014; Tudor, 2012), and also as a contribution to bridge the

gap between communication and tourism field since a research on tourism experience sharing by using digital media needs to be explored (Wu & Li, 2017: 220; Tudor, 2012).

4. Literature review

This section is intended to review and summarize what the previous literatures and researches have touched in identifying travel bloggers their digital participatory culture, particularly in Indonesian context. The selected references are intended to position the scope and limitation of the research analysis and to guide the methodology of the research.

4.1 The role of digital media in tourism industry

Predominating literatures that are influential in connecting tourism industry and media field suggest that imagination of travelling experience are actually the capital of tourism industry (see Appadurai, 1986; Abercrombie & Longhurst, 1998; Wang, 1999; Urry & Larsen, 2011; Roesch, 2009). Additionally, after evaluating the Indonesian tourism board strategy, Bungin (2015:244) argues that 'conventional social construction of reality' by Luckmann & Berger is not suitable to serve as an analytical framework in the context of tourism communication. He argues that tourism destinations nowadays are constructed by embedding 'social image' in certain place and to be published then distributed again immediately. He continues that the role of digital media thus need to be taken into account while keeping in mind that tourism industry is media and communication phenomena for turning places to be 'brands'. In the past, the process of constructing social image of place relies on separated processes which Bungin (ibid: 245) called *internalization* and *legitimization* that happen in tourist's domain. Then the process of *externalization* refers to the process of transmitting the meaning of place as a brand in a mediated manner (ibid). However, the emergence of digital media is argued to diffuse that processes by distributing the role of digital media in 'every communication channel' (Pickton & Broderick, in Bungin, 2015:246).

Therefore, the meaning and reality of touristic objects are not fixed since the cultural agents are able to intercept the tourist's subjective gaze to protect the tourists from the 'harsh reality' (Urry & Larsen: 7). This argument is supported by the research about how digital images that are available online have significant role in shaping tourist's perception regarding the value of places

in Indonesia by creating spatial orientation and by putting cultural value (Divinagracia, et al., 2012).

In Indonesian blogosphere, the travel blog is among the most popular theme. Together with sport/fitness blog and culinary blog they constitute the 'the trinity of trendy lifestyle' (Roesma & Mulya, 2018) and are able to provide sense of novelty. Then, the research wants to explore the activity of travel bloggers as reality constructing powers that are located in digital participatory culture. By not being fixed, the reality of places are able to be constructed both by the travel bloggers and the mainstream media producers which such ability should be included as the basic domain of the travel blogger's competency.

4.2 Travel Blogger's Competency
4.2.1 Non-mainstream media producers
According to Azariah (2017:3), travel blogger's qualities are still being identified by many scholars and it hasn't been easy since travel blogs are 'multifaceted and polyphonic'. For example, even though blog embodies journalism practice (Gill, 2004), Hanusch (2010) hints that travel bloggers can be located at the intersection between information, entertainment, journalism, and advertising. Krishnamurthy (in Campbell, et al., 2009) offers two dichotomies in order to categorize type of blogs – individual or community oriented, and topical or personal focus. Despite highly personalized blog can have a 'free-style' narratives, it is not to say that travel bloggers are free to make up stories all they want. Although authenticity tends to be staged together by tourist professionals and the local people (Urry & Larsen, 2011), tourists as the travel blogger's audience pursuit the true meaning of place (Scarpato & Daniele, 2003:296) and this sense of accuracy is something that needs to be fulfilled by travel bloggers if they want to be trusted by their audience or community.

In Indonesian context, the 2012 presidential election illustrated how alternative digital media producers have started to separate themselves from the mainstream traditional media by being informal yet organized producers (Tapsell, 2017:105). The sense of informal and organized network has been identified by Azariah (2017), mainly in independent travel bloggers who are able to use various online tools and multi-platform social media accounts in order to spread their online identity to larger audience.

Even though Dahlgren argues that journalism and non-journalism practice are being diffused as a result from the emergence of bloggers, what he means by 'blogger' is specifically the 'journalistic blogger' (2013: 124) thus it is possible to separate travel bloggers from the journalistic bloggers. Campbell et al (2009) confirm that there are actually various types of blog. And a travel blog seems to be incompatible with 'news blog' since Gordon & Murnane (ibid) specifically mention that news blog is more focused on the 'politics and current affairs' while travel blogs are frequently talk about trip experiences as the common theme (Stainton & Iordanova, 2017). Therefore, specialized topic and content can be important features to make a separation between travel bloggers and other type of bloggers. The notion of topic and content is associated with specialized media. In Indonesia, most independent companies are in danger of dying out and it is argued as a threat to diversity (Tapsell, 2017:40). The struggle that is faced by these specialized media in Indonesia is related with financial issues. An interesting example is shown by how Aristides Katoppo, founder of Indonesia's oldest newspaper, refused to sell the company because 'a lot of financiers believed in a certain kind of journalism' (ibid: 41). Therefore, it is possible that specialized media's interest is not about surviving financially.

Furthermore, numerous scholars (Campbell et al, 2009; Uzunoglu, 2014; Jenkins et al, 2013) attempt to conceptualize the quality of bloggers with previous communication theories. While all of them agree to use the two-step model of communication in order to locate blogger as an in-between agent, the journalistic bloggers have a distinct particularity that separates them from bloggers in general. This is shown where Jenkins et al (2013: 79) points out further description about the two-step model which they make a division between brand audience and media audience. Then, the dependency of journalistic bloggers can be different with the travel blogger's. Comparing different literatures, while journalistic bloggers are concerned to influence their audience by filtering the mainstream mass media (Campbell et al, 2009), perhaps travel bloggers are more interested to reconfigure mainstream tourist destination's narratives since tourism industry has adopted digital media to configure meaning of places as brands (Bungin, 2015: Azariah, 2017) and bloggers in Indonesia tend to associated with corporate's brands rather than mainstream mass media.

Travel-related stories are often accompanied by travel-related photographs. However, it is difficult to determine which one is more important since they are closely intertwined (Azariah, 2017: 134). Therefore, in order to investigate travel blogger's narrative competency, it is important to take both visuality and text into account. Azariah (2017) has identified some storytelling qualities from travel bloggers. Indeed, according to Marahimin (in Sobur, 2016: 4), narrative is a story with sequence, character, and conflict. Combined, these elements can form a plot. While Sobur points out that narrative technique has been used in 'narrative journalism' in order to attract reader's attention (ibid: 39), still, narrative journalism must follow journalism ethic since it would be dangerous for journalists if their storytelling imagination overtake the real events (ibid: 42). Since this thesis will involve motivations as the driving factor, the form of participation should be the explicit participation (Schaefer, 2011: 52). It means that the content production must involves 'conscious activity of cultural production, different methods in problem-solving, collaboration, and communication with others'. Therefore, it is important to investigate beyond the digital media's technological feature regarding how a travel blogger would reformat mainstream narratives, what would they change, and what would be their main concern. Additionally, while it's been proposed by scholars that travel bloggers rely on storytelling narrative, storytelling photography, and certain topic, most researches tend to discuss the travel blogger's content and motivation without addressing how the travel bloggers deploy their skillsets in actual practice. Therefore, it is important to explore how travel bloggers can have access to develop their skills as well.

4.2.2 Pulling apart the travel bloggers from the tourists

While the emergence of digital media has been influential among the whole stakeholders, Azariah (2017) suggests to identify the particularity of travel bloggers in comparison with general tourists by pointing out that the medium of travel blog is the place where the values between 'travel' and 'tourist' are negotiated and such differentiation has been a central debate among scholars. And this is another similar dichotomy with the previously discussed mainstream and non-mainstream media producers. According to Azariah (ibid), tourist values are located in commercial or mainstream domain where they are subject to mass organized activities, while travel values are more authentic and explorative. However, she continues that the negotiating nature in travel blogs means that travel bloggers may include both values in their content. Therefore she argues that the

performance, identity, and practice of travel blogger are fluid, resulting wide range of personal narratives that can take in many forms including social media, website, or mobile application. As content producers who can work together with other tourist professionals in tourism industry, travel blogger's narrations may include 'commercial narratives' (ibid: 4) as well and this is where simple division between mainstream and non-mainstream media producers need to be carefully explored since being non-corporate media producer doesn't mean that the travel bloggers don't seek for financial benefit by commercializing their content.

Another important feature that need to be addressed is the publicity of travel blog. As opposed to the 'personal diaries' which the travel blogs are rooted from, travel blogs are open for public participation. For example, by allowing the audience for making comments, putting up hyperlinks, and providing free public access (Campbell, et al., 2009; Azariah, 2017). Moreover, recent development of digital media makes able for different kinds of content to be immersed and to be shared. Therefore, the travel blogger's contents in digital media are not limited in the form of written narratives since contents in social media are dispersed between various digital platforms where website blogs are able to be integrated with Facebook page, Twitter, YouTube, and Instagram accounts or vice versa (Azariah, 2017: 97).

Another suggestion to put aside certain subjective lenses that are different with the tourist's ones can be found in the *Tourist Gaze* book (Urry & Larsson, 2011) where the promotional activities in the past must involve cultural agents to control the information flow since the tourists were not able to produce their own content or information (ibid: 43). Therefore, they suggests to consider the emerging role of blog and the participatory culture that enable the emergence of producers that are able to 'edit, update, remix, respond, share, and tag'. This role is similar to the previously mentioned 'grassroots intermediaries' and Jenkins et al (2013:38) also have similar definition of participatory culture that such abilities are intended as blogger's ticket to enter the stages of 'different niche communities'. The role of cultural agents and grassroots intermediaries show that the general tourists are less competent to do such practices. This is because tourists tend

to take the staged realities for granted since they see them as 'tourist cliché' (Urry & Larsen, 2011: 12) and the process of constructing them happens in the 'backstage' so it is not accessible for general audience (Abercrombie & Longhurst, 1998). Therefore, Schaefer (2011: 14) argues that in studying participatory culture, one must consider the 'engineering culture' since digital media is not neutral. The users need to acquire certain ability since digital media possess technological qualities that can 'stimulate or repress certain use' and 'socio-political mindset' is embedded in the design of any digital platform (ibid). It was exemplified when the current minister of tourism specifically addresses 'Instagram-able' objects as part of the government's strategy. While those objects are intended to be spread by tourist's cameras, the thesis considers them as 'raw materials' (Jenkins et al, 2013:63) to be developed by travel blogger's work. Moreover, the digital contents produced by travel bloggers are argued as resourceful marketing or advertising tools for corporates (Azariah, 2012;de Burgh-Woodman, 2018). In order to collaborate with the Indonesian corporates, Roesma & Mulya summarize their research by describing specific qualities of bloggers including personal branding, content organization, visual taste, audience awareness, regular posts, content planning, and teamwork. However, since it was mentioned that there are many type of blogs, this thesis wants to explore if there is any other quality that needs to be taken into account specifically for travel bloggers.

Another crucial competency for travel bloggers have been assessed by Azariah that travel bloggers are able to deploy narrative technique (2017). This technique is required so they are able to serialize certain topic in the form of personal narrative. In comparison with personal diaries that travel blogs are rooted from, they are participatory despite using personal narrative. The personal narrative may exist both in the form of written texts and images, and can be in various digital platforms as long as it contains online thematic story from identifiable author (ibid: 9). According to Azariah, the authenticity of personal experience is contained in authorship and this is an important quality for travel bloggers. In relation with the skill of lobbying the corporates, Azariah also mentioned that travel bloggers need to balance their personality and their audience's needs. In order to balance the mainstream and niche interest, travel bloggers are able to adopt 'several

faces' or 'multiple narrative role' to meet the needs of audiences they interact with. Therefore, they are able to channel multiple voices including themselves, readers, and advertisers (ibid).

Similar to literatures that are concerned with the skill to participate, travel bloggers are able to represent themselves as 'travelers' instead of 'tourist'. It means they are more sophisticated individuals. Azariah implies the skill in balancing mainstream and niche interest since it is argued that travel bloggers seek unique experiences instead of 'destinations marketed by the tourism industry' (ibid:4). While Azariah points out that corporate tourism discourse has clearer commercial narrative, bloggers have to find 'other ways' to include the commercial narrative within their blogs. In order to have better understanding of how travel bloggers present themselves as part of the research aim, Azariah suggests to identify how they establish narrative techniques, context, and themes in order to position themselves as travel blogger instead of mainstream tourism narrator. In accordance with personal narrative contained in the travel blog, self-presentation of personal identity is considered to be unique capability possessed by travel bloggers as opposed by mainstream tourism discourse. Often, the mainstream tourism discourse tend to be authoritarian and more organized in second person voice. Azariah's mechanism of negotiation has been observed by Tapsell (2017) when he observes skillful Indonesian digital media producers that are able to disseminate mainstream messages. Therefore, skill of disseminating can also appear in travel bloggers. With certain digital media production skills, the discourses generated in travel blogs are to be negotiated between mainstream and the intended audience of travel bloggers.

Another example to characterize travel bloggers is by separating them with the tourists. Azariah suggests to add 'non-linguistic semiotic system' (Azariah, 2017: 4) such as photography. If tourists are more interested to take iconic photo about mainstream destinations, travel bloggers tend to choose different path although mainstream material can still shape their narrative. In a broader sense, it is argued that travel blogs contain both words and images that are maintained and performed by the bloggers to stimulate tourist activities. Therefore, although general tourists can possess similar media production skills, the purpose and intended audience of travel bloggers can be different.

4.3 Travel blogger and participatory culture
4.3.1 Tangible and intangible opportunities

According to Jenkins et al (2013), motivation for sharing digital contents depends on the digital media's attributes and also certain social network that makes the content becomes meaningful. Therefore, the motivation may vary according to each producer's community. Jenkins et al continue to exemplify it by arguing that activist, religious group, art enthusiast, and many other communities have multiple purposes. While they don't particularly mention travel blogger, bloggers in general are argued for having intention to engage the 'local communities' (ibid: 29). According to Houn Liu, et al. (2007), intrinsic and extrinsic motivations are involved in general bloggers. Additionally, intangible opportunities which are to channel out feelings and to connect with people are among the highest rewards. However, based on Jenkins et al suggestions, travel bloggers and general bloggers might have different characteristics since different type of digital media producers can belong to certain groups of audience. While travel blogger's purpose and motivation still need to be explored in this research, it can be understood that travel bloggers in particular may belong to certain network and pursuit particular rewards.

Since Stainton and Iordanova (2017) suggests to be aware of the emergence of paid travel bloggers who seek for career in travel blogging, the research also recognizes this professional pursuit. Additionally, the travel bloggers who seek for career is argued for being under-researched (ibid). Indeed, Jenkins et al (2013) recognize social as well as financial motives in participating (ibid: 61). For Jenkins, this type of digital media producers are called the 'superusers' who are able to build business by maintaining their niche audiences (ibid: 93). Therefore, it is important for this research to examine the competency of this type of travel bloggers if financial motivation is mentioned by the research participants.

How the digital media participatory culture fulfill the travel blogger's needs is important because it will make them feel engaged rather than being exploited even if they lose the business competition and gain much smaller profit against the corporate media (Jenkins et al, 2013:58). This argument fits with the Indonesian digital media environment where the digital media oligarchs are also being empowered by the participatory culture and making the smaller digital

media producers tend to be underpaid, scattered, unprofessional, and in danger of selling their small business to larger corporates (Tapsell, 2017:97) – similar to Terranova's concern regarding the notion of exploited labor (2000:46) where digital economy creates 'badly paid work'. Although Jenkins et al recognize the economic challenge of digital media business, they point out 'non-commercial logics' (2013:55) that should be taken into account. This logic must be included because the participants of digital media consisted of both professional and amateur users. The amateur users are argued to be disruptive for the professionals as they have different purpose and media usage - thus their motivation is not always economic. Among the non-commercial motives according to Jenkins et al are recognition, personal expression, status, prestige, esteem, relationship building (ibid:61). As opposed to financial motives, these social motives for sharing contents are described as the 'intangible opportunities' (ibid: 58). However, Jenkins et al argue that the social motives for digital media producers can be varied and need to be explored further in this thesis.

More specific from the perspective of tourism industry, travel blogger's motivation has been identified and share the same notion of Jenkin's spreadable media. According to Molz where she started observing the traveler's behaviors in Yogyakarta, Indonesia, she mentions that travel blogger activity is rooted from traveling as a hobby and the emergence of digital media which allows the travelers to adopt mobile lifestyle (2012). Molz identifies travel blogger's personal reasons for bringing mobile gadgets during their trips, which is to record and share the experience with friends and other travelers. Molz's research indicates that travel bloggers have a wide range of audience, both from the close acquaintances to general public – complementing the previous arguments regarding social dichotomy between mainstream and niche interests within the travel blog's audience. Molz also mentions that modern tourism industry that accompanied by the emergence of digital media generates desire to escape the structure of modern world (ibid: 8). If these tourist devote themselves to be travel bloggers, the motivations to publish the contents that are supposed to be private and personal are complex and can be derived from either personal or collaborative expression motives (ibid: 67).

According to Uzunoglu's research, corporates regard the blogger's intention to publish their content for being sincere and authentic (2014). Therefore, corporates value them as opinion leaders that can benefit the product through collaboration. However still, Molz carefully questions the sincerity of the motivation by asking the form of participatory culture that the travel blogger operate - whether it is narcissist-driven or a new mode of togetherness (2012:67). For that matter, the thesis regards the importance to explore whether the travel blogger are able to maintain or change their intrinsic expectation of their participatory culture. For example, whether collaboration with the corporate is something that they actually want to pursuit. Therefore, the following section will summarize literatures that identify how digital media participatory culture and both of their technological and social arrangement have enabling and constraining factors for travel bloggers.

4.3.2 Enabling and constraining factors

As it was pointed out in previous chapter, researchers suggest the nature of shareable content contributes to the emergence of travel bloggers. This suggestion supports the thesis to conduct the research in Indonesia, where Tapsell argues that bottom up participatory media environment is increasingly prevalent since Indonesians are among the most active social media users in the world, with Jakarta is regarded as the most active city on twitter (2017:xi). It leads to division of labor among the social media users where Roesma & Mulya use the term 'social media butterfly' to refer bloggers who are able to establish themselves as 'the new money maker', and this type of users is argued to be the highest caste of Indonesian netizen (2018: 61). Roesma & Mulya expand their argument by pointing out the important role of professional photography equipment for the social media butterflies. Indeed, as Urry & Larsen (2011) in the previous chapter, visual culture and mobile images play significant part in tourism industry since they can stimulate tourist's imagination. Similar to Jenkins et al, Roesma & Mulya also recognize other type of social media users other than the ones with financial motives such as passive and active users (2018:59). However, they don't address Tapsell's concern regarding the amount of such skilled users are currently limited in urban areas. On the other hand, both literatures are agree that mainstream media in Indonesia are much more powerful, so they support each other's claim that alternative media producers like travel bloggers tend to be struggling financially if they don't collaborate with the elites. Since travel blog is argued to be more expensive to maintain, the thesis wants to explore how the travel blogger fund their production. In relation with the social motivation, the role of

opinion leader in Indonesia is still relevant since unequal literacy - especially in remote areas, makes the two step flow is able to affect larger society.

According to Jenkins (in Schaefer, 2011:43), cultural production in participatory culture possess low barrier for civic engagement, strong support for creating and sharing, informal mentorship, beliefs that contribution matters, and social connection among members. Schaefer then challenges this definition of participatory culture by arguing that there are cultural production with different dynamics thus Jenkins's participatory culture only happens when the members follow that rules. Therefore, the thesis will explore the form of travel blogger's participatory culture by assessing whether Jenkins's definition is challenged or fulfilled by certain factors. In accordance with the emergence of digital media, Nurudin argues that communication technology will change the communication pattern since there will be younger opinion leaders who are able to possess new skill and knowledge (2014:182). Nurudin proposes his concern that communication technology will create more consumptive society and exemplifies it by how giving information as a business will be considered as normal as opposed to Indonesian grassroots value that was based on mutual understanding and sincerity (ibid: 183). It connects with Schaefer's concern that participatory culture is not primarily intrinsic (2011:45).

The transformation of people who initially experience leisure in traveling to become more serious or more into professional travel bloggers has been identified by Bates (2014) where Serious Leisure Perspective (SLP) is used in order to conceptualize various degree of commitments in leisure activities. According to SLP, knowledge, training, skills, and achievement can be developed in leisure and recreational activities to turn novice participants into professionals. Therefore, both social and financial motivation in Indonesian communication system is argued to be mutually important if the thesis wants to examine the impact of participatory culture.

4.4 Navigating the skills

Since digital participatory culture contains both constraining and enabling factors that can affect the travel blogger's desires, how can they navigate themselves using their competencies? Several researches suggest that the corporates are able to take advantage from the blogger's capability of providing the authenticity of experience. In tourism context, authenticity is regarded for being fluid or staged by tourism industry (Urry & Larssen, 2011). Therefore, for travel blogger who seek for financial benefit, they need to lobby the corporates concerning the value of the portrayed authenticity as part of the travel blogger's practice. Stainton and Iordanova (2017) manage to identify this type of travel bloggers who run their website as a paid work. This thesis is aware that in Indonesia, such work is possible to emerge. The example of GenPI's ongoing attempt to organize travel blogging communities throughout Indonesia leads the thesis to understand that there can be ongoing process of transformation that change casual bloggers who employ unspecific theme and until they pursuit certain interest and eventually call themselves as travel bloggers. However, even though a travel blogger becomes more advanced to the point that he/she is aware of the financial benefit, the characteristic of the blog is still a negotiation between the mainstream and niche interests. Or as Stainton & Iordanova put it for being 'communal' and 'cross-consumer' (ibid). The emergence of paid travel bloggers doesn't change any blog to be a mainstream digital media until an enterprise decide to buy the blog - which is a typical scenario in Indonesian digital media industry (Tapsell, 2017). For Tapsell, this is a constraining aspect of online participatory culture in Indonesia where the digital media oligarchs are able to control the smaller and specialized media producers. Furthermore, Tapsell reveals that in Indonesia, the small scale digital media producers (less than 30 employees) are financially struggling due to competition against the oligarchs. The problems that need to be dealt by the paid or sponsored travel bloggers must be included in this thesis since Stainton and Iordanova argue that they are not currently observed well by literatures (2017). Whereas for Tapsell, the ability to lobby and counter the oligarch's agenda while being financially healthy are valuable skills for the Indonesian non-oligarchs for the sake of democracy. Therefore, the thesis regards travel blogging activity can be driven by various motivations – social and financial motives (Jenkins et al, 2013).

Conclusion

In Indonesia, participatory culture is argued by Tapsell (2017) to allow the citizens to both individually a collectively alter the messages that derives from elite powers. Therefore, he argues

that Indonesia is important place to study the impact of digital media on democracy since it has problematic realities where even though digital media facilitate individual empowerment, there is also a concern about democracy since there are just a few numbers of citizens who are able to alter the messages. Hence Tapsell proposes the term 'empowered minorities'. Furthermore, small, independent, and specialized media that tend to separate themselves from the elite interest are dying out in Indonesia because they refuse to sell and to be controlled by the elite. According to Tapsell, it is a threat for democracy since it will limit diversity. Indeed, being able to survive financially as a small media producers requires specific competency which make these producers become 'super users' (see Jenkins et al, 2013). Moreover, even participating as ordinary digital media producer also requires some kind of skills (Schaefer, 2011). Some mentioned literatures have only touched general digital media skills and competencies for any digital media producers yet for the case of travel bloggers, the thesis sees it possible to explore additional skills and competencies that are suitable in their context.

In studying the non-mainstream digital media producers, various motivations need to be taken into account and the variety depends on many factors. The thesis considers that it is important to separate financial and social motivations (Jenkins et al, 2013). For travel bloggers, researchers suggest to pay more attention to travel bloggers who manage to build their career (Stainton & Iordanova, 2017). However in Indonesia, there are constraining factors that need to be addressed. Other than the previously mentioned financial issue, there are factors that come from both human and non-human factors, such as unequal infrastructure and human capital that create 'internet divide' (Sujarwoto & Tampubolon, 2016) that connects to the notion of 'empowered minorities'. Therefore, the thesis wants to reveal how elements that make any individual to be a travel blogger contribute to their process of becoming and how they use their motivation and skill to participate in the Indonesian blogosphere considering that this participatory culture has constraining and enabling factor. Identifying the source of travel blogger's driving factor and motivation is important since travel blog is argued to be a double bladed communication tool because one might appear as sincere and uncensored yet at the same time the travel bloggers are able to create and alter the image of tourist destination by using digital media (Tudor, 2012).

5. Research Method and Methodology

This thesis used qualitative interview with semi-structured interview guidelines. Additionally, three elicitation materials were used in order to help the research informants to understand the context of the questions. In order to analyze their position with mainstream narratives, all of the elicitation materials are published by the elites and corporates. They are a tourist information about the Kota Tua (Old Town) from the official website of Jakarta and a tourism promotional video from the Indonesian Tourism Board. Overall, the research managed to interview 11 individuals from both genders in urban areas in Indonesia where all the informants identified themselves as travel bloggers albeit with different motivations and level of dedication. While Tapsell (2017: 104) specifically mentions Jakarta to find the empowered minorities, there are other important touristic cities such as Yogyakarta for being the best tourism region in Indonesia according to the Central Bureau of Statistic[7]. Therefore, this research includes travel bloggers who reside in Yogyakarta as well. This chapter is intended to provide the steps that were taken to collect the data, process of analysis, and ethical reflection upon the interviewing process.

5.1 Qualitative and Elicitation Interview

This research generates analytical objects both from qualitative interviews (Seale, 2011: 207) that were conducted in order to gain meaningful sets of data. Indeed in order to understand travel blogs, after extensive research using travel blog's content Tudor argues that qualitative interview with travel bloggers themselves is equally important (Tudor, 2012). Additionally, elicitation materials were provided so the informants were able to perceive and discuss the research questions in a more specific context. Indeed, incorporating elicitation materials as a part of research tool is considered useful especially when the research considers travel blogging as an activity that involves the process of becoming or construction of self-identity that categorize the individual to be a travel blogger (see Roth, 2015). Since this research interview borrowed Flyvbjerg's phronetic guideline, approaching power and conflict between mainstream and non-mainstream media producers follows two elements that are provided by Habermas and Foucault (Flyvbjerg, 2001: 107). Therefore, a possible precondition of democratic situation can follow Tapsell's research that media oligarchs in Indonesia need to be counter-balanced by smaller media producers who are

---

[7] https://www.merdeka.com/uang/yogyakarta-jadi-lokasi-wisata-terbaik-indonesia-v

able to alter the elite narratives. Another element is this research investigate how such counter-balancing powers work by understanding how they are exercised since according to Foucault, power is dynamic (ibid). Therefore, elicitation materials were helpful to recall the informant's understandings of their actions, processes of becoming, and other related statements.

The elicitation materials were included in the qualitative interview and were arranged accordingly based on the context of the question. For example, elicitation materials from the Jakarta's tourism board and a video from the Indonesian tourism board were included when the informant and the interviewer were discussing about travel blogger's writing. Therefore, when showing the materials, the interviewer could simply asked, "how would you change this?" Since the research used existing video as in the YouTube video, it is suggested to "understand the history of a video, its context of production, its original purpose and audience, and how these factors are embedded in the video as an artefact, as well as what is missing in the video record" (Tremblay & Peredo, 2014). By integrating qualitative interview, photo, and video elicitation materials as research tool, they were intended as tools to 'stimulate recall or provide a basis of reflection', gain insights on travel blogger's point of view, practice and structure of knowledge. They were mainly done by highlighting informant's specific attention, for example, by asking an open question to stimulate their responses.

There are concerns that need to be addressed in using video in social science research. This is a consequence from specific character of video that 'differs significantly from other kinds of data, such as audio recordings or field notes' (ibid, p.4).

1. Video in this research is watched in 'normal speed' for every informant. This is intended to treat the informants as if they were normal tourists.
2. Video data will be analyzed both in micro and macro analytical level. It means the focus can be in any segment of the video or in a more general idea depends on informant's attention.
3. Video is fully presented in order to bring the viewer inside it.

4. Interview fulfills the '*Chronological verisimilitude*' and 'perspectivity' where the informants were provided additional contexts. For example, the UNWTO competition and recent infrastructure developments by the government.

Additionally, the sequence of watching and general qualitative interviewing was deployed in a flexible manner. Since the informants possess particular competencies that the thesis wanted to investigated, interviewer borrowed practical influences from expert interviewing. Especially when some informants fulfill the characterization of expert knowledge by being knowledgeable in their domain (Littig, 2009: 19). When dealing with this circumstance, it is suggested for the interviewer to be prepared on the topic in order to be seen as competent interviewer. Additionally, the interviewer has basic insight about touristic places in Indonesia especially the two cities where the informants were lived in. Therefore, the interviewer didn't appear as being naïve and was able to focus on exploring the informant's competency (ibid: 32).

5.2 Informant Recruitment and Sampling

Since the research requires informant who possess certain features, at least all the informants must identify themselves as travel bloggers. Snowball sampling was beneficial in this research since snowball sampling strategy has advantage in accessing vulnerable and impenetrable social groupings (Atkinson & Flint, 2001) as in this case of travel bloggers as empowered minorities. It is not so say that they were hidden because they were at risk of being discriminated if they were openly identify themselves (Browne, 2007). Rather, the challenge was to find travel bloggers who had potential of having various motivations especially financial and professional motivations in order to fulfill the previous theories. Therefore, it was intended to approach the isolated informants by targeting a certain social network of established travel bloggers. The sense of isolation for the case of travel blogger as research subject was apparent where one informant, Nuri, responded, "Oh are you studying us? Thank you, I did not know that we are getting important. It thought we didn't matter". It means that the research did not find it difficult to access some degree of trust and therefore the interviewer did not have to appear as a group member (ibid) since researching them had already given a sense of enthusiasm. Additionally, it shows that travel bloggers are indeed being under-researched.

At first, the interviewer manage to gain initial contacts from existing personal network. Prior conducting research, the interviewer only knew three travel bloggers and it was confirmed by their website and social media accounts that clearly declared them as bloggers. Prior interviewing, their identity as a travel blogger is confirmed by the consent form which stated the purpose of this research. At first, the interviewer wasn't sure if the snowball sampling would lead the research to include travel bloggers who are able to create sponsored content. However it turns out that while not every informant takes their travel blog as a full business, all of the informants possess experience of collaborating with sponsor. Therefore, the research managed to follow previous literatures that recognize multiple motivations, including financial and social motivation in producing digital media contents. In order to follow Foucault's suggestion in approaching any kind of power for being local and context-dependent (Flyvbjerg, 2001:107), the sampling still followed Tapsell's (2017) suggestion to search for the empowered minorities in Jakarta or urban areas in Indonesia. Not only did the research managed to include urban citizens, other typical features of the empowered minorities were also fulfilled as the informants are mainly middle class and locally produce the contents on numerous platforms to be spread all over Indonesia (Tapsell, 2017:104). That can be seen by how the informants use multiple digital platforms such as Twitter, Instagram, Facebook, and website although still using the same account name. However, it is also the thesis's limitation since the research was only conducted with the urban citizens in Java. Another limitation that needs to addressed is the sampling doesn't include any travel bloggers who has no experience in publishing sponsored content.

Stating the purpose of the research to the informants such as their competencies, motivations, and how they sustain their activity was beneficial as the existing three informants were able to recommend various potential informants until the informants consist of travel bloggers who knew each other and some were not. As for the business status of the travel bloggers, most of them admitted that they don't take it as a full time business or not fully professional. It means that although all of them may include sponsored content, not everyone relies his/her travel blog for a living and they didn't create sponsored contents on regular basis with various reasons

that later on will be revealed in the analysis chapter. A table of informant's data is provided in the appendix.

In order to overcome representativeness problem that can be found in snowball sampling, the informants are consisted of different travel blogging communities including those who don't have any membership at all. Another way to minimalize the risk of missing out the 'isolates' (Atkinson & Flint, 2001), the research ensures that there were informants who don't know each other since it was started with three initial informants which some of them didn't know each other. Eventually, the overall informants are mixed of acquintances and some are not as a result from different direction of snowball samplings. In addition, the sampling employed 'ascending strategy' (ibid) to look upwards and managed to include some travel bloggers who can be regarded as the most advanced travel blogger since they manage to establish themselves as fully professional travel bloggers. This particular strategy was deployed since it was suggested to reach the 'urban elites' or in this case, 'non-mainstream elites' by asking the referrals regarding who they respected in local arena in order to give sense about local power bases (ibid). Additionally, a criteria of participants was applied based on Tapsell's research that points out the characteristic of specialized media in Indonesia must not exceed 30 persons (2017: 40). This is important since it was revealed that there are travel bloggers who actually work as a company where there is a division of labor involved in their website. However, the participants in this research employ much less people since the maximum amount of main team members were only 3-4 persons.

5.3 Elicitation Materials

Since the research wants to analyze how the travel bloggers as non-mainstream media producers position themselves within the participatory culture, the proposed mainstream narratives were used in order to help the informants to understand the context since it was unknown whether the informants were aware of the dichotomies. Additionally, the elicitation materials were useful as tools to reveal additional depth of the research interview. The visual and video elicitation materials are intended to capture the travel blogger's competency in altering the visual and written narratives from mainstream sources. The narratives in the elicitation materials were provided in Bahasa Indonesia since all of the informants were Indonesians. The actual screenshots of the materials, URL, and the English translations are provided in the appendix.

- Museum article in jakartatourism.go.id

  This elicitation material is combination of both narrative and photo that are included in an article on the official website of Jakarta Tourism Board. The article page is a single photo of Jakarta Historical Museum's front yard located in the most important touristic district in Kota Tua (Old Town), Jakarta. The narratives state brief explanation regarding the importance of museums in Jakarta for tourists and are available in English. Therefore, other museums outside Old Town are mentioned as well. This elicitation material is a tourism narrative that is provided by an elite and was intended to ask the travel bloggers about their responds and whether there would be something that they wanted to change if they were about to write similar topic in their blog. In order to scope the context, only this article page was provided within the jakartatourism.go.id website.

- Wonderful Indonesia video campaign

  This elicitation material is a video from the Indonesian tourism board as a part of their recent campaign. This video was submitted in the United Nation World Tourism Organization (UNWTO) tourism video competition where the video received several awards. Despite the positive remarks, this video is produced by joint effort from the Indonesian Tourism Board and corporate media company as their consultant. Therefore, this video material is a good example of the very mainstream of media producers as it is a combination from elite powers. Therefore, this material is suitable if the travel bloggers are regarded as the non-mainstream media producers. This 3 minute length video is titled "Wonderful Indonesia: the Journey to a Wonderful World". Despite the Indonesian Tourism Board as the original uploader has erased the video for unknown reason, the interviewer managed to download the video and this particular video can be found in various 'YouTube reaction videos' where people post their reaction. Therefore, this video can be seen as one of the most popular or mainstream content from the elite powers.

5.4 Methodology

Following the method of thematic coding (Seale, 2011: 367), data generated from the interviews was analyzed by plotting overarching themes that were based on quotes by informants. In addition, the quotes were analyzed based on how the informant expressed the important sentences (ibid: 212). In that regard, expert interviewing was useful since the interviewer understood important concepts related with economy in digital media production such as monetizing, native advertisement, audience engagement, and several mainstream corporate tourism companies in Indonesia. Moreover, speaking the same language was proven to be beneficial since there were expression in Indonesian language that needs to be considered. For example, addressing the second person in Indonesian language can be done with various tone and it depends on the status of the speaking person. Therefore, in vivo coding was applied to remind the interviewer that language and expression can be important (ibid: 372). In analyzing the informant quotes as codes, literature frameworks were needed in order to approach the codes as empirical data. This is particularly helpful to identify and categorize the transcribed informant statements so that the volume of data can be reduced and easier to be read. Additionally, 'zig-zag' approach was conducted when necessary (ibid: 369), e.g., to seek for further confirmation whether or not an event actually took place or if such travel blogging community was actually exist by asking it again to other informants separately. As a further step of thematic coding, open coding is deployed to extract general categorizations from a larger amount of data across the manually written informant's statements.

Upon conducting open coding, inductive approach was used to create sub-themes before turning them into concrete concepts by referring again with literature references. In order to avoid overwhelming of data collection from the video, the coding follows the recommendation to focus on a 'short period of data collection' (Jewitt, 2012: 6). Even though some informants were provided by another video from other country since they asked for it, the analysis will only apply for the main video. Additionally, the video elicitation interview was intended only for constructing the informant's responses. Not for analyzing social effect (ibid: 8) and the video will not be part of data. Rather, the video is merely a data collection tool. All of the data analysis was conducted by writing down all of the important informant's statements and categorize them based on the

connections found between statements to construct themes. Later on, different themes were processed in the computer by giving different colors and tables (see appendix).

5.5 Ethical Reflection and Reflexivity

Since this research utilized several elicitation materials, interactivity was proven to be helpful to maintain the informant's enthusiasm. Therefore, the interviewer found it necessary to let the informant being aware about the role of the interviewer as a researcher who also shared some experience regarding media production as a job in Indonesia. It is where the interviewer was able to borrow some aspects of expert interviewing including for being aware of their financial constraints and as well as their passion. In order to be trusted, even though it was not necessary for the interviewer to be part of their community, the interviewer found it useful to at least read their blogs before conducting the interviews. For example, the interviewer could ask, "I realize that you have just arrived from India, how do you compare it with the previous place?" Therefore, the interviewer could extract the data in two-ways and interactive conversation. Additionally, the interviewer had an experience of being a digital and non-digital specialized media producer - both for a corporate and as a corporate. Therefore, the interviewer needed to be aware that the research informants were also fellow digital media producer yet they were in different field since the tourism and travel topic wasn't the interviewer's expertise.

In accordance with ethical guidelines, Stainton & Iordanova (2017) suggest to follow the traditional ethical principles where the research should consider potential harms or risks associated with the study and any potential issue that may involve vulnerable people. While this thesis has pointed out the informants as the empowered minorities with media skills that stand out from the general population, the thesis at the same time recognizes potential risks if any informant states his/her concern or experience regarding other parties. This is possible since there were questions about constraining factors in their participatory culture that could come from external source. For that matter, it is suggested to keep in mind that travel blogs are written for various purposes. As a result, despite being public, it may not clear if the travel bloggers as the content makers consider their travel blog for being 'psychologically private' (ibid). It means that while the travel bloggers may aware of the contents for being public, they may have no intention to be viewed as research materials. Therefore, Stainton & Iordanova suggest to that informed consent is crucial. While they also point out the difficulty of contacting the travel bloggers, it is where the snowball sampling

was useful since sending permission request while stating the referrals were helpful and the participants didn't see it as an invasion of privacy. Moreover, most travel bloggers who take their blog as business put their contact info openly to public and some of them were more responsive with direct messages.

A useful approach to establish the trust from the participants was providing the basic interview guidelines beforehand besides the research purpose. Additionally, data protection was assured that the interview records were kept in private and would be used for academic purpose only. Therefore, the interviewer must demonstrate confidentiality in order to obtain participant's confidence (Atkinson & Flint, 2001). In conducting travel blog research, Stainton & Iordanova argues that the research should be sensible regarding the ownership of travel blog (2017). From their perspective the interviewer should be aware that whilst some travel bloggers might have desire to be anonymous, there might be some cases where the travel bloggers as authors should receive credits for their work. In that regard, the informed consent form provided choices where the participants can fill their real names or if they wanted to be confidential thus they could fill in with their preferred nick names. Accordingly, they were also given a choice whether they wanted to reveal their website as a credit for their work. As a result, the appendix includes some of their website addresses in order to provide further verification.

6. Analysis

This chapter sums the discussion based on informant's responses and overarching themes during research interview. All of the informants were interviewed individually. All of the informants are Indonesian citizens who reside in urban areas in Java Island, mainly Jakarta. Although there were two informants who were interviewed through video call, the research still managed to provide all of the elicitation materials since the video materials was still available online from the original uploader. Additionally, the interviewer ensured that all of the informants used hearing device as a tool to have the fullest experience in watching the video elicitation material. It was revealed that despite they have been involved in commercial sponsorship, most of them didn't really think that their travel blogging activities were fully commercial or even a

professional. However, they also didn't think that they were amateur either. In fact, they were able to distinguish themselves with ordinary bloggers and beginner travel bloggers. Following Bates (2016) recommendation, therefore, this thesis carefully identifies the participants as active travel bloggers. The notion of 'empowered minorities' from Tapsell is useful here since their digital media power is not necessarily held by professional or mainstream media producers (2017). Rather, Tapsell suggests this empowerment applies to any Indonesian citizen as long as they can use digital platform in order to promote their own agenda (ibid: 19) and later on it will be revealed that most of the participants fulfil this criteria. In accordance with the research aim, the following sub-chapters will explore how these active travel bloggers transform themselves since they were ordinary bloggers up until now they have become active travel bloggers with certain characteristics and dynamics.

6.1 The origin of empowerment

Before deciding to be a travel blogger, every informant is situated as an ordinary digital media producer. According to them, at this point, they were not yet a travel bloggers and most of them were just blogging solely for recreational purpose. It was revealed there were driving factors that enabled them to consider being a travel blogger.

Initial motivations and enabling factors

At the initial point, it was identified that there were intrinsic and extrinsic motivations for the travel bloggers. The intrinsic motivations were the most mentioned by the informants. The most notable intrinsic motivation was to channel their self-expressions. As it was stated by several informants.

> "I consider writing as a hobby and I have been writing since I was a kid. I used to write game scenario to fulfil my childhood fantasy. So it is similar to travel blogging. I found it as a channel for my hobby when I got introduced by internet…" (Satu, 29 years old, male).

> "So I just wanted to channel my hobby, which was writing. However, I was not good at writing fictional stories. Therefore, I wanted to share my traveling experience by

35

writing unusual genre – volunteering…through travel blogging, I find self-satisfaction by discovering my writing style…" (Nuri, 30 years old, female).

"Basically, I have always writing whenever I feel depressed…it's always like that" (Moon, 30 years old, female)

The statements show that many informants have already accustomed to writing activities in general before they became travel bloggers. For other informants like Shassy (29 years old, female) and Adli (26 years old, female), a slight variation appeared where they had already started to use blog as a 'convenient tool' to store personal memories from their trip. However, what they have in common is they took blogging as a recreational activity without consistent production of traveling-themed narration just yet. In addition to their previous self-proclaimed identity before becoming a travel blogger, many of them admitted that they were also started as tourists. Therefore, there are also another motivations which are more extrinsic from other statements. These motivations are more associated with their traveling activities.

"Just before I became a travel blogger, I liked to review hotels since I also travel as a hobby…I would write the reviews and published it in my blog because I was pretty sure that many fellow travelers needed this kind of informations…" (Ogie, 30 years old, male).

Similar to Ogie, a desire to help fellow traveler was also apparent for other informants as described by Satu, and Titi (25 years old, female). Interestingly, extrinsic motivation for Shassy is not related with other travelers. Rather, she wanted to help promoting a village so that the place could become a new destination for traveler. For Molz, travel blogging activities with a purpose to help others through online interaction is an indication of togetherness that is created by digital media and this is a display of community-building (2012:67). The difference of the intended audience between Shassy and other informants shows an indication of clustered digital media audiences and producers. Later on, the following chapter will reveal how this sense of community-building manages to develop and generate travel blogger's network. Another example of extrinsic motivation was mentioned, that is about gaining recognition and reputation as described by the following statement.

"I believe every tourist including myself has a desire to be acknowledged…'to show that I am here'…somehow I believe it's just the nature of every tourist…" (Bondan, 33 years old, male).

Likewise, Nuri stated that she wanted to show herself and to be recognized as a travel blogger. While Nuri, Tari, and Satu only identified families and close friends as their targeted audience and Bondan mentioned that he only took pictures of local areas in his hometown, Tari mentioned bigger extrinsic motivation which was connected with the notion of empowered minorities.

Tari: When I was in university, there was a blog contest to celebrate Jailolo festival. I thought it would be cool if I won. So I think that was the first time I had motivation to put traveling content with more audience.

Interviewer: But you said you have started blogging when you were in high school

Tari: It was different. When I was in high school, I took it for granted. When I was competing for Jailolo festival, I really shared my contents and I intentionally targeted as many audience as possible. I didn't hold it back anymore…after I graduated from university, it made me want to work in traveling magazine…I have built my self-confidence in travel writing as a career.

Interviewer: When you were just graduated, did you think that it would be a good career?

Tari: There was no apparent financial motivation for me. I just wanted to make good portfolios since there was no way that a new kid would get sponsored…I won more competitions…I gained reputation…then the corporates knew me from there. (Tari, 26 years old female).

The statement from Tari shows that there was a development of motivation. And the extrinsic motivation was developed from her activity in creating randomly themed content for herself until she started to target wider audience. Here it was also revealed that although professional motivation started to appear, financial motivation was not present. Likewise, all the informants weren't aware of the financial opportunities. The important point to be taken into

account is there was tangible opportunities that is mentioned by Bates (2016), where travel bloggers may develop high level of achievement as they travel. Here, the achievement was tangible since there were actual competition with concrete form of reward. At the same time, knowledge, training, and skill can also developed as well. It was also revealed that other than Tari, some informants experienced the same process. Satu, Duck, and Farchan won writing competitions that enabled them to possess self-confident since the reward was either high amount of money (Duck), or an inspiring trip (Farchan and Satu). Here, it is to say that a sense of empowered minority was apparent for some informants since they were selected through competitions which means that not everyone had the same privilege and at the same time a sense of disparity is also noticeable since Duck and Satu have master degrees. While Farchan didn't, holding an undergraduate degree can be considered a minority in Indonesia since there are only 11 percent of working class citizens who hold undergraduate degree and becomes Minister of Education's concern in 2017[8]. As warned by Norris (in Sujarwoto & Tampubolon, 2016), while internet has becoming important for facilitating educational advancement, researchers must take into account possible systematic exclusion for certain groups at the same time. A form of competition is an example where some informants managed to exclude themselves from the general producers. For this case, it is to argue that writing competition, internet, and digital media platform became their tangible enabling factor since they were able to use internet in order to receive concrete rewards.

Furthermore, intangible opportunities were also detected where Tari, Farchan and Duck gained inspiring and memorable trip from reward trips which contributed in transforming them to become travel bloggers. Likewise, even though Shassy didn't mention any competition, she admitted a memorable trip from a volunteering activity during college as an important starting point. To include personal memory from traveling journey as intangible factors is possible since Azariah challenges the concept of tourist gaze where she argues that memories and self-identity shape the cultural lens (2017: 58). By creating memories and self-identity from traveling,

---

[8]

https://regional.kompas.com/read/2017/05/21/17445991/menristek.dikti.prihatin.jumlah.lulusan.sarjana.indonesia.kalah.dari.malaysia

individuals are able to select and filter blog's material in the future (ibid). Perhaps, the variation of their cultural lenses also contributes to their intended audiences and the blog's theme.

Initial challenge and the role of community

In accordance with the travel blogger's participatory culture, it was revealed that the form of Jenkin's participatory culture was not fully constructed. By asking the informants about initial challenges that they endured in their transformation to become travel bloggers, their responses touched the concept of participation. That is, the barrier to entry the participation. However, at this early point, Schaefer's concern regarding the engineering culture of digital media technology was not apparent. Rather, the challenges were more related with acquiring the travel blogger's writing skill.

> "At first…I didn't know how to write…I didn't know where to start and what to do. It was like you were given a blank paper and didn't know what to draw. Moreover, I didn't know the structure…like, do I have to make a guideline or what…but if it were to be structured…for beginner, it was unproductive because you would not start anything…some beginners are like that, they are being reluctant to start…fortunately I wasn't a perfectionist…"

From the statement, it can be seen that although Satu won writing competition as his starting point and was exposed to writing as his childhood hobby, travel blogging requires particular structure of storytelling. Similarly, Nuri and Ogie also expressed the challenge about how to write a good written article since they admitted that their basic was more into photography rather than writing narratives. Many informants shared their concern including Duck, Shassy, and Moon who were more specifically concerned about the use of language. Therefore, even though previous literatures tend to point out that a blog is a mixture of both visual and textual narratives, it can be seen that both elements can be treated separately. Especially when a certain identity of a digital media producer is being formed. Furthermore, technological aspect can also be seen as a separated element at this point since for Farchan and Titi, the most challenging thing for them was more related into technological aspect of digital media.

> "…yeah it turns out that writing is not easy…and to be honest, I am not good with technology so it was hard for me to arrange layout and something like that…" (Titi)

Additionally, Tari, Titi, and Farchan pointed out the difficulty to consistently write about travel stories. Keeping in mind that these barriers were their initial challenges, the research confirmed that they were able to solve the mentioned challenge by self-training. Therefore, it means that other than barriers, the 'strong support for creating and sharing one's creation with others' and 'informal mentorship from the more experienced' (Schaefer, 2011:43) were missing. Only Titi and Ogie who received some helps from senior travel blogger through personal network. For Tari, she needed to attend various trainings in order to get better. For the rest of the informants, the self-training was mainly conducted by reading tourism narratives as 'raw materials'. Later on, some of the informants were able to find suitable communities for them. However, despite Adli, Titi, Tari, and Duck appreciated travel blogging community for providing mentorship, connectivity, and sense of networking, the role of the community doesn't guarantee the Jenkins's participatory culture since Travel Blogger Indonesia, a travel blogging community, have some restrictions.

> "Being a member of Travel Blogger Indonesia is not easy. You need to have a consistent blog, good traffic, and good rating if you want to get approved. This community only has 40 members, even though I don't see any hierarchy, it's something to adapt if you are a newcomer." (Adli).

> "As far as I know, the most active travel blogging communities in Indonesia is Travel Blogger Indonesia and Indonesia Corners…actually they are all the same but not everyone can join Travel Blogger Indonesia, for Indonesia Corners, the selection is not that hard." (Tari).

Based on that statement, the travel blogging communities apply some requirements from their members and all of the members must perform when they have joined the communities. In that regard, both identified travel blogging communities, Indonesia Travel Blogger and Indonesia Corner, have selection and verification process. Both communities also have routine 'FAM trip' or familiarization trip. This trip supposes to be a free trip for travel corporate's business partners such as travel agents, ticketing companies, and other hospitality industry in order to introduce the business concept. However, it turns out that both communities are regularly invited by the corporates. For Adli, Titi, Duck, and Tari, FAM trip is used to expand their connection and to gain tangible benefit such as free trip and accommodation. However, Adli added that if a member failed

to post any content regarding the FAM trip after a while, he/she wouldn't get invited to FAM trip again. The typical characteristic of Indonesian travel blogging communities is not appealing for Nuri and Shassy which they perceive it as 'a fierce competition inside the community'. Their concern is supported by Adli's statement as follows.

"They (Travel Bloggers Indonesia) have members who are also business agents for corporates. These member-agents are the ones who give us project information…more established travel bloggers are personally close with those member-agents. Or rather, there are established travel bloggers who are also the agents…usually they select who are invited in fam trip or who are not." (Adli).

By this statement, the concern regarding the competition seems to make sense since later on, both Shassy and Nuri despised over commercialization of their blog and therefore Nuri joins volunteering community rather than travel blogging community. There were more informants who seem to disagree with the system other than Nuri and Shassy, for example Ogie who stated that he has been searching for suitable community for him to no avail. Other informants such as Farchan and Satu felt that they didn't need a community since they were more confident working alone or with personal acquaintances. For Bondan and Duck who are members of GenPI, the reason to join were not artistic pursuit as opposed to Schaefer's suggestion (2011:43).

"In GenPI for me, it's 80% professional…I have reduced my previous personal motivations…" (Bondan).

"I joined GenPI because I see most members are incompetent beginner travel bloggers. As Indonesians, it was a shame since it is a government's initiative. In rural areas, GenPI members have bad visual taste. They only have cellphone cameras since they only want to make the contents become viral rather than their quality. Therefore I want to change them from inside" (Duck).

Therefore, it can be said that although community plays significant role in participatory culture by providing network and informal mentorship, travel blogging communities in this research possess certain barriers for the informants instead of eliminating a barrier. Perhaps it also connects to the notion of 'internet divide'. Once again, even when there are travel blogging communities in Indonesia, there is an exclusion mechanism among them. Furthermore, the Travel

Blogger Indonesia and Indonesia Corner situation confirms Jenkin's example in convergence culture where activities of users collide with business interest of media companies (ibid). Duck's statement also indicates a sense of disparity where access for information technology is limited outside urban areas. In accordance with the notion of empowered minorities, some informants like Satu, Nuri, and Farchan who like to work alone stated that they have already passed the beginner phase and have already adopted specific theme of writing style thus they didn't need any mentorship. Therefore, with taking into account that GenPI members are colossal and are spread across Indonesia, informants in this research can be considered to possess more experience than the general Indonesian bloggers. Certainly, being able to win writing competitions, attending higher education, and able to access telecommunication infrastructure put them in better position.

To summarize this sub-chapter, it has been revealed that at the initial stage, the informants didn't possess financial motivation. Rather, the personal, social, and professional motivations were more apparent. These motivations include intrinsic motivation and extrinsic motivation with most notably was to channel self-expression and to gain recognition respectively. Despite the absence of financial motivation, there were tangible and intangible opportunities. For tangible opportunities, it turns out that there had been various writing competition with interesting rewards for Indonesian bloggers. At the same time, the internet penetration in urban areas made them feel easy to engage with digital media production which enable them to develop their cultural lens. As for the intangible opportunity, internet enables the informants to develop their cultural lenses by providing useful platform to keep memorable journey. Although media production in participatory culture tend to be associated with "socially cosy matrix" (Schaefer, 2011:43), it was revealed that major Indonesian travel blogging communities have adopted a certain kind of moral economy where the members must perform and show their dedication in order to gain benefits. As a result, there are informants who chose to work alone without being attached to any community. This situation illustrates the notion of empowered minorities and internet divide.

6.2 To strive for participation

As Jenkins (in Schaefer, 2011) points out, digital media enables new mode of production where bottom-up participation can be more apparent. The previous sub-chapter has shown how the informants can possess various motivations and enabling factors in order to be travel bloggers. While they have expressed some challenges in being travel bloggers, the informants eventually have managed to overcome the barriers and now have been able to sustain as travel bloggers for 3-4 years on average. This chapter will discuss how they are situated in a more recent circumstance. Using Serious Leisure Perspective (Bates, 2016), this sub-chapter considers travel blogging as a continuum from leisure activity – an activity that nuanced the initial setting. Therefore, it will explore whether the previous motivations and challenges were developed. In addition, since maintaining a travel blog requires strong finance as it was proposed in the literature review, this chapter will also reveal how the informants have been able to fund the travel blogs while keeping in mind that at this stage, sponsorships can start to be involved.

New Challenge: How to Sustain

As it was indicated in the travel blogger community's requirement from the literature review, being consistently produce digital contents as a travel blogger should not be taken for granted. Indeed for the informants, being a travel blogger is not self-declared. Rather, it involves recognition and dedication. In that regard, many informants stated that consistently publishing travel stories as a new challenge that they didn't expect before.

> "…the challenge about how to fund your blog or to travel for free is one thing, but at the end of the day, it is crucial for travel bloggers to stay sincere. Being authentic is a key to survive" (Moon).

> "Joining the Travel Bloggers Indonesia at the beginning was fun…the connection…the FAM trips…but there are more travel bloggers than when I started…so I have to consistently active. For me it's very hard to do because currently it's only a side job as I am doing my master program…if you're making it as a side job, you can't make a masterpiece…" (Adli).

"So the new challenge is how to make people keep on reading your content while making sure that you can spend your time for something else…" (Tari).

Since it was argued that travel blog should contain distinct and identifiable authorial voice as essential feature for any blog (Azariah, 2017: 9), the statements above are connected with the struggles to be identified as a travel blogger with one's own preference. It seems that being a travel blogger itself should consider sustaining factors since the informants feel that recognition is not stable. Therefore, in order to be identified, a travel blogger must provide a sense of consistency. Even for Nuri, she admitted that she has been searching for her established writing style. She argued that since her background is photography, writing as a travel blogger requires adjustment. Moreover, many informants associated this notion of consistency with more competition due to the emergence of new travel bloggers. According to the informants, as more established travel bloggers, the emergence of unidentifiable newcomers will affect their reputation. The following statement describes it well.

Tari: …also, there have been new travel blogger wannabes with inconsistent contents. To make it worse, in our world the competition has already fierce.

Interviewer: Why do you consider them as challenges if they are just newbies?

Tari: I am speaking as a travel blogger and also as a person who works in digital agency. For example, if I am about to drop a post in a forum looking for a travel blogger who has certain niche to do a project, there will be many candidates sending their random blogs. They will make the real travel blogger's reputation becomes bad…the fact that these newbies can get projects…these people decrease travel blogger's credibility.

Similarly, Titi explained further that as a result, Travel Blogger Indonesia will temporarily expel inactive member in order to motivate the rest. Therefore, these findings connect to Azariah's argument that for non-amateur travel blogs, authorship should be central and more apparent (ibid: 42). Then, it turns out that authorship requires to be maintained by consistent and dedicated self-presentation because travel bloggers want to be identifiable and unique among the emergence of newcomers.

For other informants who have already been confident with their niche writing style, while they were aware with the competition, the challenge is to expand their activities to become more professional or even more commercial. Usually, it was expressed by the informants who don't belong to a specific travel blogging community. It seems that they had already passed the process of being identifiable by choosing their niche audience. However, it also indicates that the absence of travel blogging community makes the following informants unable to enjoy the support and informal mentorship since they expressed lack of knowledge, skill, and access to expand their blog like they want.

> "…yeah, I think I am getting good at maintaining my website…the challenge used to be about how to maintain it and how to make people aware that I am a travel blogger. Now I am thinking about how to edit video since vloggers are becoming a new trend but I don't know how…" (Farchan).

> "Obviously there has been more travel bloggers nowadays. And they are able to get sponsors somehow…I have to admit it makes me want to be like them (get sponsorships)…I want to raise my standards but I still don't know how…now writing blog is also associated with photography and video…my current video-related skill is not that good…" (Satu).

Likewise, Shassy also expressed her desire to get even more sponsorships yet she didn't know how to do that. Moreover, she mentioned that she has been wondering how the corporate's algorithm managed to figure out the niche of her blog which is an ocean-related traveling. Based on the statements, it is apparent once more that the technological aspects of digital media affect the user participation (Schaefer, 2011) and therefore can become a challenge for the informants even after they managed to deal with the previous barrier since they want more quality of participation.

In accordance with Tapsell's concern regarding the control from the elites (2017), the more professional informants, Duck and Bondan, were able to point out the presence of elite's control as they have been able to interact with the corporates in daily basis. The mentioned informants are regarded as 'more professional' since they take travel blogging as their full time job. Moreover,

Bondan and Duck work with other travel bloggers and freelancers respectively under their command.

"…in fact, it's getting more complex since we have to synchronize our content with the government's program. They have event calendar…well, it's our job to design our contents to be aligned with their calendar…It makes me realize that there are so many things to be constructed…it's getting harder…" (Bondan).

"…so I need to find a balance. Here is the condition…netizens are getting more demanding. Once I put multiple sponsored contents for a couple of days…And my comments were full of people saying "too many sponsors!"…so I just realized that sometimes there are sponsored contents that I like and sometimes I don't. And it will contribute to my writing style…" (Duck).

Still in accordance with the authorship, the statements above exemplify Azariah's argument regarding a complexity that occurs when content production is difficult due to travel blogger's involvement with commercial interest (2017: 42). In this case, Bondan's statement is still related with commercialism since the government's tourism board indeed have certain target of annual visitors.

Motivation 2.0

Keeping in mind the complexity of motivations in the participatory culture and the Serious Leisure Perspective's process, the research then explored whether the informant's motivations were developed at the point when they have become travel bloggers. Keeping in mind that all of the informants are involved in sponsorships, it turns out however that intrinsic motivations are still exist. However, the personal intrinsic motivations were only expressed by the minority of the informants as follows.

"I want to have more freedom to write…that's why I limit the amount of sponsored content because I want to preserve my blog's quality" (Farchan).

"While I am not going to monetize my blog, I have been trying to put my blog among the Google top list…it is only for personal satisfaction" (Titi).

While the challenge to be identified is still apparent, these informants were able to add their strategies in order to achieve the personal motivations. Based on the statements, perhaps at this state of being more mature travel bloggers, these findings can confirm the complexity of travel blogger's motivation because these motivations have been developed from their previous ones. Sense of development can be seen from how Farchan was already aware how external interests would affect his content. Likewise, Titi was able to include technological dimensions in her intrinsic motivation compared with her previous motivation.

Scholars have been trying to define whether mediated tourist gaze are based on collaboration or narcissistic 'ego-enhancement' (Molz, 2012: 67). Based on the statements above, it is apparent that both Farchan and Titi don't use their travel blogging activities as a way for socializing. Therefore, it can be an indication that they are more situated in 'ego-enhancement' domain. Also, it was revealed that their motivations have been developed since both Farchan and Titi actually expressed extrinsic motivations in the previous sub-chapter which were to make other travelers visit certain places and to help fellow travelers respectively. However, later on, it can't be said that Farchan and Titi's motivations have been replaced. Rather, the motivations have become more complex. For the majority of the informants, extrinsic motivations are now become more apparent. Therefore, there were some development of motivations detected since it was the intrinsic motivations which was to channel self-expressions that seemed to be more dominant when they were transforming themselves to be travel bloggers.

> "…Now there has been a financial motivation…started when a backpack company sent a proposal to me...That was the time when I think 'Ok, being a travel blogger is interesting!' After that, there was also an endorsement contract from a software company…I think the more I make better contents, more companies will come to knock the door" (Shassy).

This kind of extrinsic, financial-driven motivation is common for many informants. However, other kind of extrinsic motivation which is social-driven motivation was identified, even from a more professional travel blogger like Duck.

Duck: I consider it as a full time job…however, I always tell the sponsors that I am a partner. I will write reviews about what I like and I don't want to do what I don't like. I disclose every corporate narrative and I make them obvious that they are separated from my own content as advertorials…I tell them that it is my readers who will decide whether to buy or not.

Interviewer: But still, they are the ones who pay for your activities, right?

Duck: Yes, but let me put it this way…if you're an authentic person, the companies that will approach you will be the corporations with authenticity value as well. If they only want to do 'hard selling', usually they will look away…that's why it is 'quiet' (not much income) for me.

Interviewer: You don't feel being underpaid for being a travel blogger?

Duck: Not at all, this business is based on trust. Many people start to distrust influencers because they don't think they can trust us right? Well I am trying to prevent that. For me the most important thing is to have loyal followers.

Based on Duck's statements above, it can be seen that the travel bloggers seem to be aware of the moral economy since according to Jenkins et al, social-related value such trust in this conversation has currency in participant's social network which makes Duck didn't feel being exploited (2013: 60) since Duck managed to put her social motivation alongside financial motivation. Other variation of social motivation were identified such as 'to inspire more people' (Moon and Satu), Keeping in mind that Duck and other informants were able to establish themselves despite the financially demanding of a travel blog, it doesn't mean that non-financial motivations replace the financial motivation or the other way around. This complexity is described by Nuri.

"…However, there are moments where I want to be supported both technically and financially. Because it is not cheap at all… I hope to receive sponsorship while still being consistent in my genre as a travelling volunteer…I don't want my travel blog becomes too commercialized…people would say "oh it's a placement" and they would get bored…there would be no storytelling…If commercials were to be involved, I would be a little bit under control. I want to make brutally honest

opinion…the last time I posted a sponsored content, I felt guilty…now I am becoming more selective to include sponsorships. But if the money is good, I will take it. It's that simple…"

Nuri's statement shows that she is in a dilemmatic position where she explicitly pointed out her initial self-expression motivation while making it clear that she would be willing to rearrange the motivations by negotiating with commercial interest because she is aware that travel blogging requires strong financial support. Therefore, it confirms that travel bloggers produce and consume simultaneously as 'prosumers' (Bates, 2014). Additionally, this research adds another depth by demonstrating that the notion of being a prosumer is more apparent when the travel bloggers have identified themselves as travel bloggers. By being a prosumer, travel blogger's motivation is getting more complex as they have becoming more aware of the new challenges that they didn't expect before. Many scholars have warned this condition, including Molz who argues that travel blogger's motivation are 'multiple and complex' (2012: 67) and these motivations 'cannot be reduced' (Jenkins et al, 2013: 61) to purely economic. Then, the findings show that the motivations cannot be purely non-economic either. Additionally, Ogie pointed out that he's aware the money is not good if he accepts 'soft selling' sponsorships exclusively. However, he is already happy because for now, all he wanted was to travel for free from sponsorships. The dichotomy between 'hard selling' and 'soft selling' here must be mentioned because it was significantly apparent from Ogie, Duck, Tari, and Farchan when they expressed the negotiation between corporate and non-corporate interest.

Interviewer: How do you fund your journeys?

Tari: By using my savings, proposing sponsorship contract to hotels…however, not all is sponsored, only 70%.

Interviewer: why not 100%?

Tari: Because I would feel bad for my readers…because there are brands that ask for hard-selling even though we have explained that the traffic would be bad…maybe because it's related to SEO things that they are after.

Interviewer: How do you limit hard-selling?

Tari: It's all coming back to each travel bloggers…the filter is from ourselves.

According to Tari, the term 'hard selling' is commonly used by travel bloggers. This term is applied when a sponsor asks for good product review rather than authentic and honest review. Similar to Tari's experience, most informants started to be more selective in collaborating with the corporates at some point. By being more selective, however, it doesn't mean that the travel bloggers are the direct oppositions of the corporates. Rather, it seems that the corporate and individual interests can be negotiated. Despite this negotiation has already mentioned by previous researches, these findings illustrate further that travel blogger's intrinsic and extrinsic motivations play significant part in the negotiation rather than the actual expenditures. Another significance of motivation is demonstrated by the fact that many informants deliberately chose to be non-fully professional because they were being strict in accepting sponsorships. In that regard, most informants have to work for another job outside being a travel blogger. The informants have their own formula in term of budget allocation. For example, Farchan admitted that he was already happy that the website's maintenance fee was already covered from the sponsors despite having to spend his own fund for the journeys. Therefore, it actually confirms that travel bloggers as specialized media producers in Indonesia tend to be unprofessional (Tapsell, 2017:45). However, the following sub-chapter points out that some informants do have certain professional pursuit by being a travel blogger.

Sustaining and Constraining Factors

Since the research findings indicate that there are more complexities when the informants become a travel blogger, the following section will try to find any common pattern regarding the most rewarding opportunities given the fact that they have possessed new arrangement of motivations. Therefore, by asking what the most enjoying part of being travel bloggers, the thesis wants to investigate which motivation was able to be fulfilled with what reward. In other words, it is the sustaining factor that makes them strive as travel bloggers so far. While tangible opportunities have been fulfilled by financial and professional benefits as stated by Duck, Adli, Tari, and Farchan where they pointed out travel blogging has been able to provide a 'paid job', 'inspiring career path', 'professional opportunities', and 'free tickets', the intangible rewards were equally apparent as well. The identified intangible rewards from being a travel blogger were mixed, both intrinsic rewards such as 'life quality enhancement' (Nuri), 'authentic experience' (Bondan),

'stress releasing channel' (Moon), and also extrinsic intangible rewards such as 'acknowledgement of work' (Satu, Titi, Ogie, Shassy).

Additionally, the thesis tried to find whether there was a complexity in term of constraining factor since there is an indication that the aforementioned new challenges such as fierce competition can be dealt with skills and knowledge in order to raise their content's standard. Therefore, the thesis is interested to investigate whether there is a constraining factor that they have been constantly worried about. Moreover, it was intended to confirm whether financial issue is the main problem for travel bloggers. The strategy to extract this data was by asking a simple and open question about the worst part of being a travel blogger.

Some informants pointed out concerns that are similar to their previously mentioned new challenges. Farchan, who was worried about the challenge of maintaining his blog described 'strange technical problems' as his main concern. Moon and Duck who were concerned about current travel blogger's reputation explained that they were being misjudged by the society as 'lavish people', Titi who were concerned about technological aspects expressed her disappointment if her website's traffic is decreasing, and Adli who were still concerned about competition due to emergence of new travel bloggers.

Still related with Adli's concern regarding the competition, it was also revealed that financial-related constraint becomes more apparent and it was translated when informants Satu and Tari expressed their feelings of insecurity over the new travel bloggers who manage to be sponsored. It seems that the financial-related constraint is a result from the more commercialized participatory culture as it was described by Shassy's statement.

"I feel worried that the rural areas which used to be pristine becomes famous and
they will build and develop touristic infrastructures without responsibility…I am
always worried that I will be the one who brings negative impact for the society"

Therefore, rather than financial constraint, Adli, Satu, and Shassy's concern can be categorized as commercial related constraint. This type of constraint wasn't mentioned by any

informant when the context of interview was about their beginner phase as travel bloggers. It seems that commercialization at the participatory culture can be perceived differently. While Satu and Adli took it as a threat due to fierce competition, Shassy returned to her altruistic motivation where she started travel blogging as a way to help a small village to self-promote themselves.

To summarize this sub-chapter, using Serious Leisure Perspective (Bates, 2016), the research findings suggest that the informants encountered a process of becoming a travel blogger. By being exposed to new networking, new skill sets, more audience, and commercialization, the informant's motivations are developed. Most notably, financial and professional motivations become apparent. However, the findings suggest that being a fully professional travel blogger doesn't mean it only involves financial and/or professional motivations because the findings managed to capture professional and financial motivations from informants who regard travel blogging as part-time job. Given the fact that the informants are able to sustain themselves despite noticeable challenges, the complexity of their motivations seems to be connected with Amabile's suggestion that at the context of professional activity, intrinsic and extrinsic motivations can combine positively and they are not completely separated systems (Amabile, 1993). This circumstance is described by Schaefer as 'heterogeneous participation' where it is difficult to separate between 'work time and leisure time' (2011: 103). Therefore, there are financial/professional reward and intangible rewards that make the travel bloggers strive. As a result, many informants turn down contract offers if the negotiation between corporate and non-corporate interests meets a dead end. While this kind of refusal can endanger the specialized media producer's survivability (Tapsell, 2017), most the informants deal with the financial issues by making travel blogger as a part-time job.

The key feature of this type of heterogeneous participation is related to the development and execution of technological skills (ibid: 102). Indeed, many informants at this phase have developed their skills by dealing with the previous barriers to enter the travel blogger's participatory culture. Additionally, the role of travel blogging communities has been identified for being positive since they can provide mentorship and connectivity given that an informant manages to be accepted by the community.

6.3 Travel Blogger's Competency

To make the informant's blog becomes identifiable and recognizable have been revealed in previous sub-chapter as an important strategy to deal with competition. Therefore, Azariah (2017: 97) points out the importance of networking competency for travel bloggers in order to distribute their content so that they can be recognized by others. This sub-chapter starts by discussing how the connectivity among travel bloggers contributes to their skill development and also to their practice.

Online and offline network

Some informants who are members of travel blogging community mentioned the term 'blog walking' as a way to connect with other travel bloggers in general. Simply put, blog walking is when a blogger visits other blog, leaves a comment, while introducing his/herself as a fellow blogger. The purpose of blog walking is to distribute and promote travel blogger's blog since it is possible that when doing a blog walking, the blog walker will leave his/her blog URL link. Doing a blog walking in Indonesian blogosphere requires some kind of ethical reflection since the blog walkers should leave a comment with apparent sincerity by leaving a topic-relevant comment. By doing so, the blog walker will not be perceived as a spammer. Therefore, many blogs in Indonesia write about 'tips and tricks for blog walkers'. The importance of URL link for blogger's network has been pointed out by Helmond since it contains the 'distributed nature' of digital media (in Azariah, 2017: 97). The importance of blog walking is exemplified in how it becomes something to be enforced in travel blogging communities.

> "The benefit from joining a travel blogging community is there will be useful programs for the members such as following each other's blog, blog walking, blog competition, and of course the FAM trip" (Tari).

According to Tari's statement, travel blogging communities in Indonesia tend to enforce member's connectivity by facilitating regular blog walking and other networking-related activities. Based on Tari's statement, it is apparent that blog walking can be rewarding for travel bloggers. Additionally, other than being a distribution tool to build travel blogger's connectivity, Adli appreciated the role of travel blogging community because it contributed to her skill development and knowledge. Indeed, linguistic scholars have pointed out that blog walking is useful to promote peer review and will improve writing skills (SK, 2012). However, peer review for travel bloggers

is not exclusively occurs in travel blogging communities. Many informants who don't belong to a travel blogging community explained that they receive informal mentorship from close relatives and friends. While peer review in blog walking is related with skill development when a travel blogger is still a beginner, when the travel bloggers have become more established, offline networking becomes more apparent in order to improve the blog's quality. Many informants explained that their content making process involves different parties beyond their blogs.

> "I usually travel with 2-3 persons in for every content. They are consisted of videographer and writer. However, our community members will be standby with their mobile phones to publish our stories. The link will be spread across Indonesia immediately" (Bondan).

Bondan's statement illustrates an example where a travel blogger can make use both the online networking and offline networking. Moreover, it can be seen that the offline networking is used as a division of labor. This division of labor is apparent in many informants when the context is about their current content making process. Although not all of the informants mentioned blog walking as their distribution strategy, Bondan's statement nuances the power of URL link is because many informants use multiple social media platforms to cross-link their blog website to their social media accounts – mainly Facebook and Instagram.

Satu also stated that he uses his travel blog as a promotional tool for his traveling company by including his company's URL link. However, in order to make the travel blog looks personal, he doesn't use this mode regularly. Similar mode of production was also stated by Tari. Therefore, it also exemplifies the multivocality of travel blog. However, almost half of the informants (Moon, Shassy, Adli, Ogie, Titi) prefer to work alone while Nuri and Farchan stated their intention to hire a videographer in the future. Therefore, this finding joins the debate whether a blog is maintained by multiple actors or one user (Campbell, et al., 2009). However, at least it can be explained that Bondan and Duck are the informants who take travel blogging as a full time job. Therefore, perhaps there is a tendency that the size of networking for travel blog is determined by the author's professional aim.

Narrative strategy

As it was predicted by the previous literatures, the responses from informants in answering an open question about the most important skill were consistent as all of them included writing and photography skills. However, many informants seemed to be confused in deciding whether it was photography or writing skill as the most important. Therefore, it confirms that both visual and written narrative in the case of travel bloggers tend to be intertwined and both of them possesses equal qualities in terms how they can enable storytelling. Additionally, in understanding the narrative strategy of travel blogger, the elicitation materials were useful to capture some media production aspect in order to understand how their narrative strategy works in practice.

Most informants stated that personal experience storytelling are among the most important travel blogger's qualities. Indeed, personal representation and storytelling have already observed by previous researches as essential qualities of travel blogs. However, elicitation materials were useful to discover additional dimensions based on informant's responses when the elicitation materials were provided. The responses from the informants can be categorized in several aspects of media productions. First, some informants were sensitive to language and wordings being used in the written mainstream narratives. While criticizing the grammar and structure from the written elicitation material, they were able to point out the style of storytelling from both elicitation materials.

> "…to me it seems that they used direct translation from English to Indonesian…it seems weird…and it's too formal…the video lacks of storytelling. It relies too much on beautiful sceneries…" (Adli).

Adli's response is an example about the travel blogger's sensitivity to mainstream narratives. While it is been observed that certain language to present themselves as a traveler as opposed to tourist, their objection against the formal storytelling was not mentioned in the previous literature reviews. The sensitivity of formal language delivery was apparent in most informants with slight variations of the way they perceive it, including for being "too standardized" (Farchan) and "too tourism rather than travel" (Nuri). For the visuality, while some informants criticize the video elicitation since it lacks of personal storytelling as well (Adli, Satu), many informants added

that the plot and visuality of the video is inauthentic (Duck, Moon, Shassy, Nuri, and Tari). The responses from the video also managed to capture additional narrative aspect other than visuality, which was the music background (Tari, Titi, and Duck). Many informants also added their preferred version of production based on their assumed purpose of the elicitation materials. It means that they manage to identify possible agenda of mainstream narrative.

> "…production-wise, the video is good…but this is for a promotional purpose, I can
> tell so no wonder they make the places look like wonderful…" (Tari).

This agenda setting identification perhaps is related with how they actually create their own production. Most informants admitted that they plan the trip based on sponsorship priority – although it can be negotiated. Therefore, travel blog is more than sets of information. When the production involves other parties like the corporates, the content planning involves briefing and negotiation. This is also where the division of 'hard selling' and 'soft selling' is filtered by the informant's motivations like it was described before. However, there were an indication of disagreement among informants regarding the agenda. While some informants explicitly stated that the elicitation materials were good efforts to attract tourists, Duck and Nuri were against commodification of places. Here, it can be seen that altruistic motivation still plays even when the context was already about commercialization. At least, it can be said that they have common focus regarding the agenda, which is strictly about traveling and tourism related topic. Coming back to the notion of consistency, any blogger who doesn't possess this consistency is not considered as a travel blogger by the informants.

While some informants didn't mention the involvement of corporates behind the scene, they admitted that most trips are also planned and they are always aware of the audience engagement including the 'ideal time to post a content' based on their audience's statistics. In fact, some informants like Shassy, Farchan, and Duck adapt their writing styles based on the trend and demography. It seems that these findings can enrich Molz observation regarding how digital media provide new form of connectivity by helping tourist to organize and coordinate their journey (2012: 48). While Molz tend associate the corporates as the initiator of this new form of connectivity, these findings show that it is possible for non-corporates to collaborate with the corporates and use their cultural lenses to shape the connectivity even more through narratives.

To summarize this sub-chapter, it was shown that travel bloggers incorporate both individual and social skills. The findings confirm the previous researches that travel bloggers rely their personal storytelling to connect with their audience by using both written and visual narratives. The findings in this sub chapter manage to give additional depth that in using narrative strategy, travel bloggers in this research consider various aspects of media production while at the same time using their inherent motivations to negotiate the narrative with the sponsors. The identified narrative strategies include: personal storytelling has to be informal, audiovisual and written narratives should be provided in detailed and authentic manner, and content making process should be planned by involving various actors. Additionally, some senses of gatekeeping and agenda setting were captured when the informants insisted that travel blog should contain personalized experiences which more than just information. Therefore, they manage to separate or negotiate between their self-representation and mainstream representation.

In accordance with the notion of empowered minorities, the findings illustrate that while most informants didn't feel any challenge when traveling outside the main island, the mentioned content planning seems to be only possible in the places with established industrial infrastructure since the informants have to keep in touch physically with the sponsors and have to monitor the statistics of their audience when they are not traveling.

Conclusion

This thesis starts by identifying problematic condition when elite and corporate interests meet with the travel bloggers. Therefore, the thesis wants to have better understanding about how internal and external factors can affect the travel bloggers. Keeping in mind that the dichotomies between mainstream and non-mainstream media producers are complex, the thesis choose intrinsic and extrinsic motivations, intangible and tangible opportunities, and travel blogger's competency. In addition, this thesis is aware that travel blogging is related with human development. Therefore, it can be approached by Serious Leisure Perspective (Bates, 2016) which considers travel bloggers can develop their motivation from leisure pursuits into profession. Therefore, the thesis also regards the enabling and constraining factors with the same way.

Conducting the research in Indonesian urban areas, this thesis includes the empowered minorities which are able to establish themselves as travel bloggers and they also include sponsored contents. The qualitative interview managed to grasp the motivational development within the informants. Extrinsic motivations were detected with the most prominent are to help other travelers and to gain initial recognition. Intrinsic motivation was detected that is to channel for self-expression. These motivations are backed by enabling factors such as the capability of digital media to keep personal memorable journeys, and by various blog writing competitions in Indonesia. However, at the starting point, the informants were not able to participate at the fullest potential since they were still lacking of required competencies. Although some informants manage to gain informal mentorship from the travel blogging communities, some informants chose to do self-learning.

When the informants become more mature, new challenges were detected. Those are to be consistently recognized as travel bloggers, to make their travel blogs become more professional, and to balance the sponsored and personal contents. These challenges seem to be connected with the need to be an identified author since author identification has been observed as an essential feature of a travel blog (Azariah, 2012). It turns out that this essential feature should not be taken for granted since. Additionally, these new challenges were apparent where competition against the new travel bloggers were identified due to commercialization. Likewise, the new motivations were seem to be developed as well at this point and not to replace the previous motivations. Among the most dominant were the financial motivation, social motivation to influence more people and there was also a minor personal motivation which was to keep on enjoying freedom of expression. Therefore, the rewards at this point include financial benefit, professional acknowledgement, and leisure activity enhancement. This development of motivations, challenges, enabling and constraining factors perhaps indicates that media use should be situated in certain social context since the informants managed to identify different media producers such as the beginner bloggers, corporate, junior/experienced travel bloggers, and including travel bloggers with specific genres. These social contexts can be promising researches in the future. In order to strive, travel bloggers relies on their story telling competency. This narrative competency involves equal degree of

writing and photography skills. The kind of narrative that the travel bloggers prefer should contain authenticity, personal self-representation, and informal language. While authenticity is important, the travel bloggers in this research managed to find a meeting point where constructed reality and honest opinion can be negotiated – even by involving other party such as the sponsors. With these findings, this thesis hopes to give a glimpse of idea about how the citizen based media producers can sustain themselves by engaging the participatory culture using motivational-driven strategies. It is also to remind that most travel bloggers in this research, even though they don't feel any financial constraints, they tend to be unprofessional since they have to share their time with other occupation in order to fully fund their travel blogs – as it has already observed by Tapsell (2017).

References

Abercrombie, N. & Longhurst, B., 1998. *Audiences : A Sociological Theory of Performance and Imagination.* London: SAGE Publications.

Amabile, T., 1993. Motivational Synergy: Toward New Conceptualizations of Intrinsic and Extrinsic Motivation in the Workplace. *Human Resource Management Review,* 3(3), pp. 185-201.

Atkinson, R. & Flint, J., 2001. Accessing Hidden and Hard-to-Reach Population. *Social Research Update,* Issue 33.

Azariah, D. R., 2012. Beyond the Blog : The Networked Self of Travel Bloggers on Twitter. *Journal of Media and Communication ,* 4(1).

Azariah, D. R., 2017. *Tourism, Travel, and Blogging.* New York: Routledge.

Bates, T., 2016. *Travel Bloggers: Who Do They Think They Are?.* Massachusetts, Tourism Travel and Research Association: Advancing Tourism Research Globally.

Browne, K., 2007. Snowball Sampling: Using Social Networks to Research Non-heterosexual Women. *International Journal of Social Research Methodology ,* 8(1), pp. 47-60.

Bungin, B., 2015. *Komunikasi Pariwisata: Pemasaran dan Brand Destinasi.* 1 penyunt. Jakarta: Kencana.

Campbell, V., Gibson, R., Gunter, B. & Touri, M., 2009. *News Blogs, Mainstream News and News Agenda.* s.l.:Sussex Academic Press.

Carpentier, N., 2013. The Participatory Organization. In: T. Olsson, ed. *Producing the Internet.* Gothenburg: Nordicom, pp. 63-79.

Chandralal, L., Rindfleish, J. & Valenzuela, F., 2014. An Application of Travel Blog Narratives to Explore Memorable Tourism Experiences. *Asia Pacific Journal of Tourism Research.*

Cole, S., 2006. Information and Empowerment: The Keys to Achieving Sustainable Tourism. *Journal of Sustainable Tourism,* 14(6), pp. 629-644.

Cole, S., 2007. *Tourism, Culture and Development: Hopes, Dreams, and Realities in East Indonesia.* 1 ed. Clevedon: Channel View Publications.

Dahlgren, P., 2013. *The Political Web: Media, Participation, and Alternative Democracy.* s.l.:Palgrave Macmillan

de Burgh-Woodman, H., 2018. *Advertising in Contemporary Consumer Culture.* Sydney: Palgrave MacMillan.

Dijck, J. v., 2013. Social Media Platforms as Producers. In: T. Olsson, ed. *Producing the Internet.* Gothenburg: Nordicom, pp. 45-60.

Dinnie, K., 2011. *City Branding.* s.l.:Palgrave Macmillan.

Divinagracia, L., Divinagracia, M. & Divinagracia, D., 2012. Digital Media-Induced Tourism: The Case of Nature-based Tourism (NBT) at East Java, Indonesia. *Social and Behavioral Sciences ,* Volume 57, pp. 85-94.

Flyvbjerg, B., 2001. *Making Social Science Matter.* 1 ed. s.l.:Cambridge University Press.

Fuchs, C., 2013. Social Media and Capitalism. In: T. Olsson, ed. *Producing the Internet.* Göteborg: Nordicom, p. 25.

Gill, K., 2004. *How can we measure the influence of the blogosphere?,* Seattle: University of Washington.

Golomb, J., 1995. *In Search of Authenticity.* London: Routledge.

Goode, L., 2009. Social news, Citizen Journalism and Democracy. *New Media & Society,* 11(8), pp. 1-19.

Hanusch, F., 2010. The Dimension of Travel Journalism. *Journalism Studies,* 11(1), pp. 68-82.

Haryanto, I., 2014. *Jurnalisme Era Digital.* Jakarta : Kompas .

Houn Liu, S., Li Liao, H. & Tai Zeng, Y., 2007. Why People Blog: An Expectancy Theory Analysis. *Issues in Information Systems,* 8(2), pp. 232-237.

Jenkins, H., Ford, S. & Green, J., 2013. *Spreadable Media : Creating Value and Meaning in a Networked Culture.* New York: New York University Press.

Jewitt, C. (2012). *An Introduction to Using Video for Research*, 3(12).

Kumar, S., Agarwal, N., Lim, M. & Liu, H., 2009. *Mapping Socio-Cultural Dynamics in Indonesian Blogosphere.* [Online]

 Available at: https://www.aaai.org/ocs/index.php/ICCCD/ICCCD09/paper/viewFile/1019/3317/ [Accessed 30 August 2018].

Littig, B., Bogner, A. and Menz, W. (2009). *Interviewing Experts*. Palgrave Macmillan.

Molz, J. G., 2012. *Travel Connections:Tourism, Technology, and Togetherness in a Mobile World.* s.l.:Routledge.

Nurudin, 2014. *Sistem Komunikasi Indonesia.* 7th ed. Jakarta: Raja Grafindo Persada.

Roesch, S., 2009. *The Experience of Film Location Tourists.* Bristol: Channel View Publications.

Roesma, J. & Mulya, N., 2018. *Media Sosialita.* Jakarta: Gramedia Pustaka Utama.

Roth, W., 2015. *Studying Ethnic Schemas: Integrating Cognitive Schemas Into Ethnicity Research Through Photo Elicitation ,* Washington : American Psychological Association .

Scarpato, R. & Daniele, R., 2003. New global Cuisine: Tourism, Authenticity, and Sense of Place in Postmodern Gastronomy. In: M. Hall, et al. eds. *Food Tourism Around the World: Development, Management, and Markets.* Oxford: Butterworth-Heinemann, p. 296.

Schaefer, M. T., 2011. *Bastard Culture!*. Amsterdam : Amsterdam University Press.

Seale, C. (2011). *Researching society and culture*. Los Angeles: SAGE Publications.

SK, N. U., 2012. *Blogger Community and its Role in Writing Skill Development: a Case Study of Bogor Blogger Community in Indonesia.* s.l., International Conference "ICT for Language Learning" 5th edition.

Sobur, A., 2016. *Komunikasi Naratif.* Bandung: Rosdakarya.

Stainton, H. & Iordanova, E., 2017. An Ethical Perspective for Researchers Using Travel Blog Analysis as a Method of Data Collection. *Methodological Innovations,* 10(3), pp. 1-7.

Sujarwoto, S. & Tampubolon, G., 2016. Spatial Inequality and the Internet Divide in Indonesia. *Telecommunications Policy,* Volume 40, pp. 602-616.

Tapsell, R., 2017. *Media Power in Indonesia : Oligarchs, Citizens, and the Digital Revolution.* London: Rowman & Littlefield.

Tremblay, C. & Peredo, A. M., 2014. Participatory Video as an Approach for Strengthening Collective Social Entrepreneurship. *Research Methodology in Strategy and Management,* Volume 9, pp. 189-214.

Triastuti, E. & Rakhmani, I., 2012. Cyber Taman Mini Indonesia Indah: Ethnicity and Imagi-Nation in Blogging Culture. *Internetworking Indonesia Journal ,* 3(2), pp. 5-13.

Tudor, R., 2012. The Image of Tourist Destinations Represented in Travel Blog Photography. *Journal of Tourism ,* Volume 13, pp. 32-38.

Urry, J. & Larsen, J., 2011. *Tourist Gaze 3.0.* London: SAGE Publications Ltd.

Uzunoglu, E., 2014. Brand communication through digital influencers: Leveraging blogger engagement. *International Journal of Information Management,* Volume 34.

Villa, M. I., 2013. Cross-media Production Networks. In: T. Olsson, ed. *Producing the Internet.* Gothenburg: Nordicom, pp. 121-140.

Wang, N., 1999. Rethinking Authenticity in Tourism Experience. *Annals of Tourism Research,* 26(2).

Wu, L. & Li, R., 2017. *Sharing Tourism Experiences: Literature Review and Research Agenda.* Queensland : CABI.

Website References

Azzura, S. (2018). *Yogyakarta jadi lokasi wisata terbaik Indonesia versi BPS | merdeka.com*. [online] merdeka.com. Available at: https://www.merdeka.com/uang/yogyakarta-jadi-lokasi-wisata-terbaik-indonesia-versi-bps.html [Accessed 1 Dec. 2018].

Data, K. (2018). *Relawan Ini Protes Komersialisasi GenPi Sulsel*. [online] Kabarmakassar.com. Available at: https://www.kabarmakassar.com/specials/view/94/relawan-ini-protes-komersialisasi-genpi-sulsel.html [Accessed 1 Dec. 2018].

Kemenpar.go.id. (2018). *KEMENPAR*. [online] Available at: http://www.kemenpar.go.id/asp/detil.asp?c=16&id=4024 [Accessed 1 Dec. 2018].

Kemenpar.go.id. (2018). *KEMENPAR*. [online] Available at: http://kemenpar.go.id/asp/detil.asp?id=4023 [Accessed 1 Dec. 2018].

Kompas (2018). Pariwisata Jadi Harapan. [online] p.1. Available at: https://kompas.id/baca/utama/2018/09/03/pariwisata-jadi-harapan/ [Accessed 1 Dec. 2018].

Media, K. (2018). *Menristek Dikti Prihatin Jumlah Lulusan Sarjana Indonesia Kalah dari Malaysia - Kompas.com*. [online] KOMPAS.com. Available at: https://regional.kompas.com/read/2017/05/21/17445991/menristek.dikti.prihatin.jumlah.lulusan.sarjana.indonesia.kalah.dari.malaysia [Accessed 1 Dec. 2018].

Interviews

Adlina, A. 2018. Interview with Aryo Prionggo, 20 September

Arunbiarti, N. Interview with Aryo Prionggo, 4 November

Bondan, B. 2018. Interview with Aryo Prionggo, 12 October

Cahyani, S. 2018. Interview with Aryo Prionggo, 24 October

Langit, S. 2018. Interview with Aryo Prionggo, 12 October

Ogie, S. 2018. Interview with Aryo Prionggo, 17 October

Rachman, F. 2018. Interview with Aryo Prionggo, 18 October

Satiti, P. 2018. Interview with Aryo Prionggo. 16 October

Tari, T. 2018. Interview with Aryo Prionggo, 20 October

"Duck", 2018. Interview with Aryo Prionggo, 21 March

"H", 2018. Interview with Aryo Prionggo, 27 March

"Moon", 2018. Interview with Aryo Prionggo, 20 March

"W", 2018. Interview with Aryo Prionggo, 19 March

Appendix A: Informants

Informant's identity	Community affiliation	Status of travel blog	Citizenship
Moon (fake name), 32 years old female	None	Semi-professional	Jogjakarta
Duck (fake name), 26 years old female	GenPI and various travel blogging communities in Jogjakarta	Fully professional	Jogjakarta
Adli (real name), 26 years old female	Travel Bloggers Indonesia	Semi-professional http://adlienerz.com	Jakarta
Satu (real name), 29 years old male	None	Semi-professional satucl.wordpress.com	Jakarta
Bondan (nick name), 33 years old male	GenPI (national coordinator)	Fully professional	Jakarta
Parahita Satiti/Titi (real name), 25 years old female	Travel Bloggers Indonesia	Semi-professional	Jakarta
Ogie (real name), 30 years old male	None	Semi-professional siogie.com	Jakarta
Shassy (real name), 29 years old female	None	Semi-professional linggarjati.com	Southern Jakarta
Nuri Arunbiarti/Nuri (real name), 30 years old female	Volunteering community	Semi-professional insidemonochrome.net	Jakarta
Farchan Noor Rachman/Farchan (real name), 30 years old male	None	Semi-professional efenerr.com	Jakarta
Tari (real name), 26 years old female	Indonesia Corners	Semi-professional ivegotago.com	Jakarta

Appendix B: Elicitation Material's Screenshots

1. Wonderful Indonesia : the journey to a wonderful world

URL: https://drive.google.com/open?id=1HUjtPqwgkUxZmUx8f1uwaQQX1WkO1ayA

2. Official Tourism Information From Jakarta's Tourism Board

URL: http://jakarta-tourism.go.id/2015/museums-landmarks?language=en

Appendix C: Interview Guideline

Driving factor

- How did you start being a travel blogger?

- What was your motivation?

- What was the most challenging factor in becoming the travel blogger?

- How did you manage to overcome that challenge?

Constraining and enabling

- Do you feel any change in your challenge before and after being a travel blogger? Challenge that you didn't expect before?

- What have been changed in term of your motivation?

- What is the most enjoying part of being travel blogger so far?

- What is the worst part of being a travel blogger so far?

- How do you fund your journey? Sponsor? Monetize? Native advertising? Self-fund?

Skill

- What is your daily routine as a travel blogger?
  Size of team, content making process, audience research, corporate involvement

- For you, what makes a travel blogger becomes travel blogger?

- What kind of skill that you would recommend for people who want to be a travel blogger?

- Elicitation: how would you change this narrative? What do you find good or bad?

Appendix D: Coding Example

	Satu	Ogie	Titi
Personal experience is combination of writings and visuals to generate storytelling narrative	"I usually travel and make some notes…the bus drivers…passengers…I will find the unique things…I will take photos, I will write them down again when I get back at home. I will open with interesting opening on the title…wonderful photo will help. If it exceeds 1000 words, I will make the second part"	"Travel bloggers must be able to write their experience…Actually nowadays visual is important…I think we have to find the balance because our readers will be bored if it's only about photography"	"Write! No other skill that can take you further as a travel blogger if you can't write. It needs practice. Or your readers will get bored"
Social motivation Financial motivation (extrinsic motivation) Personal motivation (intrinsic motivation)	"I run a travel blog to inspire people but I also want to know how to get more sponsors"	"I know the money is not that much, but I enjoy it as a personal satisfaction. At least I want to travel for free from the sponsors"	"I don't to make it as a professional travel blog since I already have a full time job…I have been trying to make my blog on Google's top list only for personal satisfaction"