

Better Work Haiti

Women's Economic and Social Upgrading in Haiti's Apparel
Value Chains.



LUND
UNIVERSITY

José Luis Rodríguez Ortiz

Abstract

In Haiti, the apparel industry is considered a key sector for driving economic growth, reducing poverty and improving living conditions through employment. Thereby, participation in Global Value Chains (GVCs) is essential for the country's development plan. The apparel industry is a significant source of employment and income generation, especially for women. Notwithstanding, women workers are often subjected to gender-based discrimination. Better Work Haiti brings together public, private and social actors into a synergistic form of governance to address these challenges and helps improving working conditions and the overall well-being of men and women workers. This study examines the extent to which Better Work Haiti helps at improving the social and working conditions of women workers in the apparel industry by using a gendered approach to GVCs' economic and social dimensions of upgrading. The analysis consists of a qualitative content analysis of compliance reports and other documents published by Better Work from 2010 to 2019. The findings indicate that Better Work Haiti has significantly improved the conditions for women working in the apparel value chains. Nonetheless, pervasive gender-based discrimination still constraints women's opportunities to fully benefit from the programme.

Key words: Global Value Chains, Gender, Upgrading, Better Work, Apparel Industry

Words: 10,297

Table of contents

1. Introduction.....	3
1.1 Aim and research question.....	4
1.2 Thesis Outline.....	5
2. Background.....	6
2.1 Better Work Haiti.....	6
2.2 Apparel industry in Haiti	8
2.3 Women’s economic and social context in Haiti.....	9
3. Theoretical Framework.....	11
3.1 Global Value Chains’ Framework.....	11
3.1.1 Governance.....	12
3.1.2 Upgrading: Economic and Social.....	14
3.2 Gendered Global Value Chains Approach.....	17
4. Methodology.....	18
4.1 Case selection	18
4.2 Empirical Data.....	19
4.3 Qualitative Content Analysis.....	19
4.4 Coding	20
4.4.1 Coding Economic Upgrading	20
4.4.2 Coding Social Upgrading	21
4.5 Limitations.....	21
5. Analysis.....	22
5.1 Economic Upgrading.....	22
5.2 Social Upgrading	24
6. Conclusion.....	27

References.....30

1. Introduction

The global economy is increasingly structured around Global Value Chains (GVCs) which describe the full range of activities that companies and workers perform to bring a product or service from its conception to the end use and beyond (Global Value Chains Initiative, 2019). For many developing and least developed countries, GVCs are vital for ensuring development as they enhance businesses' productive operations and generate waged employment which, in turn, can potentially lead to economic growth, reduce poverty and increase living standards. More recent, major international organisations such as the International Labour Organisation (ILO) and the World Bank, governments, as well as multiple NGOs have encouraged participation in GVCs as a key strategy for development. In the case of Haiti, like many other low-income countries, development policies have been heavily focused on driving economic growth and improving living conditions through GVCs' participation (Shamsie, 2017). Since the 1970s, international donors have actively invested in Haiti's export manufacturing sector, especially in the apparel industry which has become the main pillar of the country's economy. Currently, the apparel sector accounts for approximately 90% of the country's exports earnings and 10% of the national GDP (Better Work, 2018a:8). Foreign direct investment (FDI), development aid and preferential trade agreements have facilitated the entry of Haiti's apparel industry into GVCs, however, it has often been pointed out that the national institutional framework has been inadequate to attain an inclusive and sustainable path for development (Lundahl, 2011; Singh and Barton-Dock, 2015; USAID, 2018).

Better Work Haiti brings together public, private and social actors into a synergistic governance structure to tackle shared challenges in the apparel industry. The programme is mandatory for all apparel producers under the Haitian Hemispheric Opportunity through Partnership Encouragement Act, better known as HOPE II (Better Work, 2019a:6). The aim of Better Work Haiti is to boost national income and improve social stability by enhancing competitiveness of national apparel business, improving working conditions and respect of labour rights for workers (Ibidem). Better Work is often presented as "win-win" opportunity, however there are concerns about whether the programme improves economic and social conditions, especially for women workers in the apparel sector (Hughes, 2007; Blackett, 2015).

The Global Value Chains framework is considered to be an effective tool in the examination of development initiatives such as the Better Work Programme in Haiti, as it provides an understanding of the dimensions of production and employment by using core concepts such as governance and upgrading (Gereffi and Fernandez-Stark, 2018:337). For this study, a GVCs upgrading analysis is used for explaining how the economic and social benefits of participation in Better Work Haiti are distributed. More recently, feminist scholars have argued that the upgrading outcomes are unequally distributed between men and women as GVCs are gendered structures (Barrientos and Pallangyo, 2018; Dunaway, 2014). Therefore, this thesis incorporates a gendered GVC approach to examine the upgrading outcomes of women workers in the apparel industry in Haiti.

1.1 Aim and research question

Women play an important part in the development of the Haitian apparel industry and the economy of the country as they account for around 68% of the total apparel's workforce (Better Work, 2019b: 13). However, women tend to be concentrated in low-skilled and low-paid occupations, and are often subjected to gender-based discrimination in terms of wages and working conditions (Better Work, 2018a:5) which limit their opportunities of upward mobility. As mentioned before, Better Work Haiti is a promising strategy for development that brings together multiple actors from the private, public and social levels in a synergistic governance structure to incentive and enhance businesses competitiveness, economic growth and better living standards. One of the main goals of Better Work Haiti is to empower women by creating more and better job opportunities for women in the apparel sector (Better Work, 2018c).

By using theoretical insights from the Global Value Chains' framework from a gender perspective, this study aims to analyse the effects of the Better Work programme on women workers in the apparel sector in Haiti. The analysis is based on publications produced by Better Work during the years of 2010 to 2019 in regard to Haiti. The selected time period will allow me to analyse material from the first compliance synthesis report published in 2010 to the latest compliance synthesis report published in April 2019. The purpose is to use a gendered GVCs approach to examine the strategies adopted by Better Work Haiti in order to enhance the economic and social

conditions of women. Thus this thesis aims to answer the following question: *To what an extent does Better Work enhance the economic and social upgrading for women workers in the apparel sector in Haiti?*

For this study, economic upgrading is understood as the increase of workers productivity and skill development which can potentially allow them to move from low-value to relatively high-value activities in global production networks (Barrientos et al., 2011; Gereffi, 2005). Social upgrading, on the other hand, is understood as the improvement of rights, working conditions remuneration and the overall well-being of the workers in the value chains (Barrientos et al., 2011:324). Both, economic and social, dimensions of upgrading are explained with more detail in the theoretical framework as well as in the methodology of the study.

1.2 Thesis Outline

Following this section, Chapter 2 will present the contextual background by first describing the Better Work programme in Haiti, followed by an overview of the Haitian apparel industry and its relevance as a key development strategy, and a brief description of the social and economic situation of women in Haiti. Thereafter, Chapter 3 will present the selected theoretical framework which consists of a gendered approach to the Global Value Chains framework. The first part of the chapter describes the GVC framework and the key concepts of governance and upgrading. Moreover, it presents the core characteristics of a gendered GVC analysis. Next, Chapter 4 presents a detailed description of the methodology selected as the analytical tool for this research. In order to conduct the study, I have selected a qualitative content analysis to analyse three types of documents published by Better Work consisting of: Compliance Synthesis Reports, Briefs and Discussion Papers. Furthermore, the chapter describes the coding of the empirical material based on categories related to economic upgrading and social upgrading. Thereafter, Chapter 5 presents the findings of the analysis. Finally, Chapter 6 concludes the study by summarising the findings.

2. Background

Haiti is the poorest country in the Western Hemisphere, and one of the poorest countries in the world (World Bank, 2019). Since the tragic earthquake in 2010, the UN agencies and government donors have made considerable efforts to implement development strategies that help to improve the economic and social conditions in Haiti. One of such strategies consisted of strengthening the Export Processing Zones (EPZs) and revitalising the country's apparel industry (World Economic Forum, 2011:8). Despite some improvements, the high political instability and vulnerability to natural disasters have prevented the country from enhancing economic and social conditions, as the levels of poverty and human rights violations remain critical, especially among women. More recently, partnerships between international organisations, governments, the private sector and civil society have been built to provide a more effective and inclusionary approach to the remaining economic and social constraints that affect the population of Haiti. For example, initiatives such as Better Work Haiti have been implemented as a strategy in order to drive business competitiveness and promote inclusive economic growth in the country by bringing together public, private and civil society actors (Better Work, 2019c) into a synergistic governance structure.

Women in Haiti play an important role in enhancing the economy, however, patriarchal cultural norms and stereotypes continue to constrain women's economic and social mobility (USAID, 2016). In order to better address gender disparities and upward mobility, Better Work Haiti has introduced and promoted a gender equality and empowerment agenda that targets specific needs of women by increasing women's labour force participation in the apparel Global Value Chains (Better Work, 2018c). This section describes the Better Work programme in Haiti implemented by the ILO and IFC. Similarly, it provides an overview of the national apparel industry, and the socioeconomic context of women in Haiti.

2.1 Better Work Haiti

The Better Work Programme emerged as a collaboration between the International Labour Organisation (ILO) and the International Finance Corporation (IFC). The programme was first introduced in Cambodia in 2001 as Better Factories Cambodia, and it was part of a trade agreement

between the governments of Cambodia and the United States. After the expiration of the agreement in 2004, the programme was redesigned by the ILO and the IFC. Currently, Better Work operates in nine countries as a comprehensive programme that brings together all levels of the apparel industry in order to improve the working conditions and labour rights for workers, while boosting the competitiveness of the country's apparel businesses (Better Work, 2019c).

Similarly to Cambodia, Better Work Haiti was introduced as part of a preferential trade agreement with the United States in June 2009. The programme in Haiti is mandatory for all apparel producers exporting their products to the U.S. market under the Haitian Hemispheric Opportunity through Partnership Encouragement Act of 2008, better known as the HOPE II legislation (Better Work, 2018a:6). The HOPE II Act is an extension of the previous HOPE legislation enacted by the congress of the United States in 2006, HOPE II “offers duty-free treatment to apparel articles if wholly assemble or knit-to-shape in Haiti from materials (yarn, fabric, and components) sourced from any country provided that a minimum portion (60 percent) of the material is produced by a country that is party to a U.S. unilateral preferential trade arrangement or a free trade arrangement.” (Lundahl, 2011, 248). The act also established the Technical Assistance Improvement and Compliance Needs Assessment and Remediation Programme (TAICNAR) in order to strength and monitor working conditions in the textile and apparel sector through the ILO (Better Work, 2013:8).

Shortly after the earthquake in 2010, the government of the United States passed the Haiti Economic Lift Programme (HELP) in May 2010 to contribute to Haiti's recovery, economic growth and development by extending the trade preferences enacted in the HOPE II legislation. In order to benefit from the HOPE II and HELP acts, Haiti is required to work together with the ILO, and promote compliance with core labor standards and national labour law in order to secure and improve the labour rights for workers in factories benefited (Better Work, 2019a:7). Furthermore, the compliance and improvement of core labor standards are monitored by Better Work Haiti under the HOPE II legislation, implementing the TAICNAR programme. Better Work Haiti assesses factory compliance on eight categories, four core labour standards and four standards set in Haiti's national legislation. The core labour standards consist of “freedom of association and collective bargaining, the elimination of forced or compulsory labour, the abolition of child labour and the elimination of discrimination in employment and occupation.” (Better Work, 2013:11). The remaining four categories set in the national labour law refers to “compensation, contracts and

human resources, health and safety at work and working time” (Ibid.). More detailed information about the compliance assessment framework is found in the annex section.

Better Work Haiti assists the participating factories by conducting compliance assessments and providing advisory services, as well as implementing a wide range of training programs. Currently, the programme is implemented in 32 factories employing about 53,000 workers, of which 65-70 percent are women who support several family members (Better Work, 2018b:8). The programme brings together brands and retailers, national government bodies, private enterprises and civil society. Trade preferences enacted in the HOPE II and HELP acts have supported and facilitated the integration of the country’s apparel industry into GVCs (IMF, 2015:10). However, Better Work Haiti is key for strengthening policymaking and industry development by identifying and addressing cases of non-compliance. Most importantly, the programme represents an opportunity for the economic and social upgrading of particularly women workers in the apparel industry.

2.2 Apparel industry in Haiti

Since the 1970s, international donors such as the International Monetary Fund (IMF) and the World Bank have actively invested in Haiti’s export manufacturing sector as a way to create jobs and reduce poverty in the country (Shamsie, 2017). Recently, the apparel industry represents a key sector for Haiti’s economy, as the sector accounts for approximately 90% of the country’s exports earnings and 10% of the national GDP (Better Work, 2018b:8). The apparel sector in Haiti was developed during the 1950s and 1960s under the government of François Duvalier, former president of Haiti. During his period, from 1957 to 1971 (Lundahl, 2011:39), François Duvalier promoted Haiti as a corporate paradise with abundant cheap labour, non-existent taxes and closer proximity to the U.S. than other outsourcing countries (Steckley and Shamsie, 2015:86). After the death of François Duvalier, his son Jean-Claude Duvalier took over the presidency from 1971 to 1986 (Lundahl, 2011:39) and established the manufacturing sector as the main pillar of the country’s economy, offering generous benefits to U.S. firms such as “a tax holiday of 10 years, complete profit repatriation, and non-unionised workforce.” (Shamsie, 2017:38).

During the Duvalier's regime, the export manufacturing sector constituted a significant economic growth and provided employment to 40,000 to 60,000 Haitians, most of them women (Lundahl, 2011). However, economic development was never pursued and the industry never provided the economic uplift that was anticipated. According to Shamsie (2017:38), workers concentrated in the manufacturing sector were unable to overcome poverty as wages were extremely low. Similarly, the strong focus on manufacturing in the urban capital increased regional inequality, and the prices of food and housing raised considerably. During the military rule in the first half of the 1990s, a series of international sanctions were imposed on Haiti, these severely damaged the apparel manufacturing sector which almost disappeared (Lundahl, 2011:36).

The earthquake of 2010 represented a new opportunity for Haiti's manufacturing reconstruction and economic growth. The post-earthquake development plan was heavily focused on attracting foreign and domestic investment to reconstruct and enlarge the apparel industry (Steckley and Shamsie, 2015:188). Today, the apparel industry is considered the most important pillar for the economy of the country, and key to ensure poverty reduction. International donors continue pouring investment in the sector based on the terms that the apparel and textile manufactures will increase employment, especially it is expected that women will benefit the most (IFC, 2019). However, the industry has been widely criticised and described as exploitative sweatshops due to the extreme low wages and poor working conditions. For instance, it is noticed that the minimum wage in the apparel industry is not enough to cover basic needs such as rent, food, health, schooling, transportation among others (Shamsie, 2010:15). Likewise, it is suggested that women in the apparel industry are the most affected as they suffer from gendered based discrimination and sexual harassment (Gender Action, 2013).

2.3 Women's economic and social context in Haiti

In Haiti, gender inequalities are rooted in patriarchal cultural norms and beliefs, which shape the roles of women and men in society (USAID, 2016:25). Despite significant improvements in the national law in terms of gender equality, "Haitian women continue to have a disadvantage and unequal position compared to men in the economic, education, health, justice, labour and decision-

making sectors.” (Gender Action, 2016:2). Moreover, the 2010 earthquake exacerbated the existing gaps in gender equality, increasing women’s levels of social, economic and physical vulnerability (Duramy, 2011).

Despite the fact that women play a central role in the Haitian economy, they are significantly disadvantaged in the labour market, as women have long been considered second-class citizens (Padgett and Warnecke, 2011:538), and often positioned below men in terms of rights and opportunities due to gendered stereotype attitudes (USAID, 2016:25). According to the World Bank data (2018), 63% of Haitian women participate in the labour market, however, they face greater barriers in accessing secure and decent jobs as the vast majority is employed in the informal sector (UNDP, 2014:14). For instance, about 75% of women are employed in the informal sector (USAID, 2016:26), and on average women earn 32% less than men (Singh and Barton-Dock, 2015:35).

At the household level, unpaid work is unequally distributed as women continue to be the main responsible for the household and caring responsibilities. In this regard, “women invest more than twice the time men invest in unpaid care work activities weekly (15 versus 7 hours, respectively).” (World Bank, 2014:3). In addition, Haitian women are also expected to earn enough money to cover the daily household maintenance and support their families (Padgett and Warnecke, 2011: 539). Such inequalities at the household level are directly linked to the gender gap in labour participation (World Bank, 2014:3) as women’s household work and caring responsibilities undercut their economic opportunities.

Women’s economic and social positions have also been disrupted by a widespread gender-based violence (Padgett and Warnecke, 2011:540). In Haiti, sexual violence and abuse towards women have increased since the earthquake of 2010 (Duramy, 2011; Heartland Alliance, 2016). According to Haiti’s Demographic and Health Survey (2017:389), 29% of women between 15 to 49 years old have been victims of physical abuse, while one in eight women reported experiencing sexual violence at some point of their lives. The report does not consider the number of unreported cases. A study conducted by Heartland Alliance (2016) reveals that women are exposed to gender-based violence in the public and private arenas, especially they found an overwhelming presence of sexual harassment in almost every aspects of women’s lives. At the workplace level, it is estimated that 75% of women workers have been victims of gender-based violence (Gender Action, 2016:5). In the apparel industry, different studies show that women workers often suffer severe repercussions

if they do not comply with sexual requests from employers or supervisors (Better Work, 2019b; Gender Action, 2013; Heartland Alliance, 2016:27).

3. Theoretical Framework

Global Value Chains are gendered structures that affect women and men in different ways (Barrientos, 2014; Staritz and Reis, 2013). Therefore, a gendered approach to GVCs will be the most appropriate to examine the economic and social gains for women's workers in the apparel factories participating in the Better Work programme in Haiti. However, in order to better understand the gendered approach to GVCs, it is important to first describe the GVCs framework and the dynamics of upgrading and governance as its two core components. Thus, this chapter provides an overview of the Global Value Chains framework and its two key concepts: governance and upgrading. Consecutively, the last part of the chapter discusses the gendered approach to GVCs as an addition to the conventional GVCs framework.

3.1 Global Value Chains' Framework

The Global Value Chains framework was collectively introduced by Gereffi, Humphrey and Sturgeon (2005) as a reformulated and broader concept that addressed some of the gaps from the previous Global Commodity Chains (GCCs) approach. The GCCs approach focused on the geographical dispersion of production activities, as well as the distribution and consumption of commodities. The relatively new GVCs framework shifted the focus from the term 'commodity' to 'value-added' emphasising on the processes of creating and transferring of value in supply chains (Gereffi, 2018:16). Likewise, the framework offers a better understanding of the different ways in which global production and distribution systems are integrated, as well as how countries can potentially improve their position in the global market (Gereffi et al., 2005). In addition, the GVCs approach includes a broader variety of stakeholders from different levels that influence on the power structures of the value chain (Ibid.).

Global Value Chains refer to the full range of activities that firms and workers perform to bring a product or service from its conception to the end use and beyond (Global Value Chains Initiative, 2019). For many countries, GVCs are vital for ensuring development as they enhance business' productive operations and generate waged employment which, in turn, can potentially lead to economic growth, reduce poverty and increase living standards (Gereffi and Fernandez-Stark, 2018; Bamber and Staritz, 2016, Barrientos et al., 2011). The GVCs framework has been widely adopted by policy makers and researchers to examine the developmental implications of participating in value chains by using key concepts like upgrading and governance.

3.1.1 Governance

The GVCs governance analysis allows us to understand how power operates across global value chains, and how power dynamics affect the global economy. As an abstract concept, governance refers to all processes of governing undertaken by highly diverse actors from the public, private and social sectors (Bevir, 2012). For this specific research, Mayer and Pickles (2014) offer a more meaningful term of governance, the authors describe governance as “those institutions that constrain or enable market actor behaviour -both in the public sphere in the form of governmental policies, rules and regulations, and in the private sphere, in the form of social norms, codes of conduct adopted by business, consumer demand for social responsibility or other non-governmental institutions and social movement.” (Mayer and Pickles, 2014:17).

Within the GVCs framework, governance structures shape power relations among actors at different nodes of the value chains, and determine how the benefits of participation are distributed (Staritz, 2013:2). These structures are complex and continuously changing, which influences the way value chains activities operate and how they are linked to the global economy. Initially, GVCs governance analysis emphasised mainly on inter-firm linkages and how they exercise corporate power to shape the distribution of profits and risks which determine the upgrading prospects of firms (Gereffi et al., 2005). However, the analytical focus of this approach was limited to the role of firms and the economic dimension of upgrading in value chains.

More recently, the GVCs literature have acknowledged the importance of the variety of actors that influence the power relations and upgrading outcomes within value chains. Scholars recognise that GVCs operate in social and institutional contexts which influence economic activity and actors' behaviours. For instance Gereffi and Lee (2016:26) suggest that the operation and coordination of Global Value Chains are influenced by a wide range of actors including lead firms, civil society, national and local governments, unions, NGOs and international organisations. Thus, the GVCs analysis have adopted a more inclusive governance framework by including private as well as public and social forms of governance which allow us to better understand the economic upgrading, and most importantly, the social dimensions of upgrading.

Gereffi (2018) describes three levels of governance analysis that allows us to understand how the global economy is organised and governed. The first one refers to the *macro* level composed by international organisations such as the World Bank and the International Labour Organisation. The *meso* level is represented by countries and firms, and the *micro* level which focuses on consumer groups, activists, and transnational social movements. Each level exercises a different form of governance according to the type of actors involved. Private governance focuses on inter-firms transactions and it is led by firms such as global buyers and brand manufacturers. Public governance is exercised by governments and international organisations. Social governance is driven by civil society organisations as labour unions and NGOs (Lee, 2016).

Private, public and social governance can determine the paths for economic and social upgrading or downgrading in GVCs. For instance, in private governance, lead firms determine the working conditions by adopting codes of conduct such as Corporate Social Responsibility (CSR) which involves social and environmental dimensions across the value chain. Most often, private regulations are influenced by national laws and international framework agreements dictated by public governance institutions. A clear example of this are the ILO core labour standards which aims to promote decent working conditions from the *macro* level. Similarly, at the *meso* level, state-level governance has the capacity to create and enforce national labor laws which can regulate production processes and facilitate or hinder social and economic upgrading. Both private and public regulations, can be influenced by social governance driven by actors at the *micro* level through various forms of activist campaigns (Gereffi and Lee, 2016, Mayer and Pickles, 2014).

These forms of governance can create tensions or complement each other as a hybrid system referred as synergistic governance (Gereffi, and Lee, 2016), which brings together strategies from

firms, governments and civil society actors, and can potentially enhance the economic and social gains for workers in GVCs. The ILO's Better Work programme is one example of a hybrid, multi-stakeholder form of governance which brings together actors from the *macro*, *meso* and *micro* levels to enhance productivity and improve factory worker's lives.

3.1.2 Upgrading: Economic and Social

The Global Value Chains literature highlights two types of upgrading; economic upgrading and social upgrading. Early GVC analysis focused primarily on the mechanisms whereby Global Value Chains generate higher value added in production activities. In this context, economic upgrading was the main analytical tool for studying the improvement on the position of firms or nations in the global market (Gereffi, 1999). Recently, GVCs scholars have moved away from the narrow focus of firms' upgrading, arguing that there is a need to include labour and social outcomes of upgrading into the analysis (Barrientos et al., 2011).

Economic upgrading is defined as "the process by which economic actors -nations, firms and workers- move from low-value to relatively high-value activities in global production networks." (Gereffi, 2005:171). This concept is directly related to gains in productivity and labour skills which are expected to improve firms and national competitiveness. The GVCs literature identifies four categories of economic upgrading; (1) process upgrading which involves a more efficient process of production, (2) product upgrading refers to the development of more advanced products, (3) functional upgrading occurs when firms move into higher added value activities, and (4) chain upgrading involves moving into new industries of product markets. Moreover, each category involves a capital dimension referred to machinery technology, and a labour dimension which refers to skill development and productivity of the workers (Barrientos et al., 2011: 323-324).

The dimension of economic upgrading is complex as it involves various economic indicators such as export quantity and export value, productivity growth and international competitiveness (Milberg and Winkler, 2011:345). It is suggested that economic upgrading in the apparel value chain is fulfilled when: "1) there is an increase in its world export market share, reflecting international competitiveness of its exports; and 2) there is an increase in the export unit

value, implying the production of higher-value products.” (Bernhardt, 2014:42). However, it is important to consider further aspects of economic upgrading that are directly linked to the role of workers. In this regard, Barrientos et al. (2011:324) mention that economic upgrading embodies a capital and a labour dimension, the capital dimension refers to technology upgrading, while the labour dimension is focused on skill development and productivity of workers (Barrientos et al., 2011:324). In this context, an increase of workers productivity and skill development can potentially influence competitiveness and production of higher-value products.

Economic upgrading for workers in the apparel industry can be perceived as the progression from low-skilled labour to knowledge-intensive work. Most often, within Global Value Chains, the level of acquired skill will determine the type of work performed by an individual, which in turn, influences directly on the upgrading outcomes. The GVCs literature identifies five types of work related to skill level (Gereffi and Fernandez, 2018):

- Small scale household and home-based work, typically performed by small scale producers, production takes places around the household, with limited separation between commercial productive activity and reproductive activity.
- Low-skilled labour, labour-intensive work refers to wage labour in formal factories. It involves a relationship based on wage employment between an employer and a worker. Apparel manufacturers are a clear example.
- Medium-skilled, mixed production technologies work associated to full-package production which requires adequate technologies and skilled workers.
- High-skilled, technology intensive work is linked to the automobile, electronic or any other industry based on sophisticated technology and high working skills.
- Knowledge-intensive work includes simple service jobs such as call centres to more advanced business services such as finance and medical services.

According to Gereffi and Fernandez-stark (2018:324) the GVCs framework considers the skill dimensions of labour, mentioned above, arguing that job categories defined by the skill levels will directly affect the conditions of the workers in the value chains, the challenges they face and the upgrading opportunities.

Social upgrading, on the other hand, is understood as the improvement of rights, working conditions, remuneration and the overall well-being of the workers in the value chains (Barrientos et al., 2011:324). This definition moves away from the conception of labour as commodity by viewing workers as social agents, and it places a strong emphasis on the social impact perceived by the workers in regard to attainment of rights and decent working conditions (Rossi, 2013:224). In part, social upgrading is based on the idea of inclusive growth and poverty reduction through job and income creation (Bamber and Staritz, 2016:4). However, it also contemplates qualitative components such as freedom of association and collective bargaining, as well as other dimensions such as gender and environmental rights, among others (Salido and Bellhouse, 2016:11).

Social upgrading can be subdivided into two broad categories: measurable standards and enabling rights. On the one hand, measurable standards refer to easily quantifiable aspects of worker-wellbeing such as type of employment, wages, working hours, type of contract and sex. Enabling rights, on the other hand, include aspects which are more difficult to measure and quantify such as non-discrimination, freedom of association and collective bargaining, voice and empowerment (Barrientos et al., 2011:324-325; Rossi, 2013:224). Thus, measuring social upgrading is complex as it varies according to how the concept is defined or understood (Salido and Bellhouse, 2016:12). According to Bernhardt (2014:43), social upgrading occurs when there is an increase in sectoral employment and there is an increase in sectoral real wages. This rationale directly links social upgrading to economic upgrading by focusing on measurable standards such as employment and wages assuming that higher wages will automatically lead to better living conditions. However, the parsimonious approach presented by Bernhardt (2014) does not contemplate the qualitative aspects within the enabling rights category. On the contrary, scholars such as Barrientos et al. (2011:234) have paid closer attention to the qualitative aspects of social upgrading, suggesting that “measurable standards are often the outcome of complex bargaining processes, framed by enabling rights of workers.”

Empirical research suggests that, to some extent, economic upgrading is necessary but not sufficient for social upgrading (Barrientos et al., 2011; Rossi, 2013; Gereffi and Luo, 2018). Moreover, Barrientos et al. (2011) mention that the type of work across household-based work and knowledge-intensive work, and the status of employment such as the type of contract as well as gender bias influence directly on the outcomes of social upgrading or downgrading for workers. In addition, it has been suggested that social, public and private forms of governance directly affect the opportunities and challenges for economic and social upgrading (Gereffi and Lee, 2016).

3.2 Gendered Global Value Chains Approach

Globalisation has intensified female labor participation into the global production. Especially in the Global South, women are heavily concentrated within Global Value Chains. While GVCs create opportunities for economic and social upgrading, feminist scholars argue that the benefits from participating in the global production are not evenly distributed between men and women as gender influences on the upgrading opportunities within the value chains (Barrientos and Pallangyo, 2018, Dunaway, 2014). The gendered GVCs literature acknowledges that Global Value Chains are gendered structures because of the different positions and roles of women and men in the households, communities, labor market and global economy (Staritz, 2013:3). Thus, important contributors to the gendered GVCs literature such as Stephanie Barrientos (2001) argue that GVCs analysis needs to incorporate gender as an essential element to be better understood.

Thus, the gendered GVCs approach brings an alternative path of analysis to the research agenda by incorporating both productive and reproductive economies as constitutive of the global production activities. According to Ramamurthy (2014:40) this approach allows us to:

“(1) Pin-point and investigate the different nodes of global commodity chains in which women are key agents, (2) to understand how gender and sexual ideologies structure social relations and code value in the production and consumption of commodities, and (3) to track how value is created, extracted and distributed in commodity circuits so as to accomplish the social reproduction of labour and capital.”

A gendered GVCs approach focuses on gender as a key category of analysis highlighting the differences and inequalities between men and women participating in Global Value Chains. Moreover, it argues that gender as a social construct is reflected in different institutional contexts in which gender-relations intersect (Dunaway, 2014; Benería et al., 2016). For instance, from a gender perspective, labour markets are gendered institutions which reflect a socially constructed division of labour embedded in a gendered economy (Pearson, 2007:736). Moreover, this socially constructed notion of gender shapes the opportunities, experiences, and social and economic outcomes of individuals. In this context, Global Value Chains are gendered structures characterised by a gender division of labour whereby women’s work is most often undervalued (Barrientos, 2014:4).

According to Benería et al. (2016:115), the notion of gender based on patriarchal norms is manifested at every node of the value chains where women are often segregated in low-skilled or unskilled jobs as they are perceived as unskilled and secondary workers.

Furthermore, the gendered GVCs approach argues that in order to fully understand the gender dynamics of upgrading it is necessary that within economic upgrading value capture and value creation is equitably distributed to female and male entrepreneurs and workers. In the case of social upgrading, it is necessary that improvements in conditions and rights benefit women on an equal basis to men (Barrientos, 2014:6). Similarly, a gendered GVC approach argues for the inseparability of the productive and reproductive spheres, as reproductive activities such as childcare and housework are indispensable to the function of the productive economy (Barrientos et al. 2003:1515). Thus, a gendered GVC approach aims at making the social reproduction of labor visible, and integrate gender at every level of governance in GVCs.

4. Methodology

This section provides a detailed description of the selected methodology implemented for the purposes of this thesis. The focus of this particular research is to analyse the effects of Better Work Haiti on the economic and social upgrading or downgrading of women workers in Haiti's apparel industry. The methodological tool of analysis consists of a qualitative content analysis of compliance reports and other documents published by Better Work Haiti from 2010 to 2019. The empirical data will be coded in two themes: economic upgrading and social upgrading and will be analysed from a gendered Global Value Chains approach.

4.1 Case selection

Currently, Better Work Haiti operates in nine countries. This study will only focus on the Better Work programme in Haiti. I have selected Haiti as a case study because of the lack of research on

the economic and social context of Haitian's workers in the apparel value chains, especially from a gender perspective.

4.2 Empirical Data

The empirical material that is used for the analysis consists of official documents published by Better Work. There are three types of documents: a) compliance synthesis reports, b) briefs and c) discussion papers. The compliance synthesis reports provide transparent information regarding working conditions in participating factories. The briefs highlight key aspects of research and policies, and the discussion papers present work-in-progress research material.

The primary sources for the analysis are the compliance synthesis reports. Better Work Haiti produces biannual synthesis reports based on factory assessments which focus on compliance with core international labour standards and national labour law (Better Work, 2019). Up till now, Better Work Haiti has published a total of 18 compliance synthesis reports, however the 5th report, corresponding to the second half of 2012, is not available. These reports provide valuable information about the overall working conditions which are mostly linked to the social dimension of upgrading. Similarly, three briefs and three discussion papers are included in the analysis. Moreover, I made use of secondary sources consisting of gendered GVCs literature discussed in the theoretical framework, as well as a study conducted by Solidarity Center¹ (2019) and a publication made by the ILO in 2013. These secondary sources are used to help explain and provide a more complete picture of the analysis.

4.3 Qualitative Content Analysis

¹ Solidarity Center is an NGO which aims at defending workers rights to freedom of association, supporting them to organise, advocate and build workers voice.

The nature of this research is a pure desk-base study consisting of a qualitative analysis of reports and other official documents published by Better work. In order to examine and facilitate a systematic analysis of the selected documents, the methodology is based on a qualitative content analysis. This method can be used to identify and interpret specific subjects embedded within a text. Qualitative content analysis is a widely used qualitative research technique described as an approach of empirical and flexible methodological analysis of text data including official, cultural and personal documents (Halperin and Heath, 2012:318). There are three approaches to content analysis; conventional, directed and summative. For this study, a directed approach to qualitative content analysis is the most appropriate as it allows me to use existing theory (in this case, a gendered approach to the GVCs framework) to identify key concepts and determine the initial coding scheme (Hsieh and Shannon, 2005).

4.4 Coding

As it was mentioned above, this study uses a directed approach to qualitative content analysis which allows the use of theory to predefine an initial coding scheme. In this sense, the analysis applies priori coding, also known as closed coding which refers to a pre-existing coding framework based on previous research or theory (Halperin and Heath, 2012:323). Thus, the empirical data is coded according to two themes, economic upgrading and social upgrading. Each theme involves several categories which are related to the GVCs theoretical framework and the dimensions of upgrading, which will be interpreted using a gendered approach.

4.4.1 Coding Economic Upgrading

Economic upgrading is understood as the process by which firms and workers move to a higher value activity in value chains (Gereffi, 2005:171). In the apparel sector, economic upgrading is achieved when both an increase in its world export market share, and in the export unit value is obtained (Bernhardt, 2014:42). For this specific research, I will focus on the labour dimension of economic upgrading, which in the context of Haiti's apparel production, is mostly undertaken by women workers. Therefore, the empirical data used to analyse the economic upgrading of female

workers will be coded according to two identified labour implications. The first one is an increase in employment, which is mainly linked to the expansion of the industry, in this case Haiti's apparel industry. The second labour implication is referred to an increase in skill content of work which is most often, but not necessarily, attributed to an increase in the export unit value.

4.4.2 Coding Social Upgrading

The concept of social upgrading has been operationalised in different ways, for this research social upgrading is understood as the respect and improvement of the worker's rights, working conditions, remuneration and the overall well-being of the workers across the nodes of the value chains. This definition is adapted to the analysis of the reports published by Better Work Haiti. In order to identify social upgrading, I will make use of the ILO's decent work agenda to code the data into measurable standards and enabling rights.

Whereas measurable standards are quantifiable aspects of worker well-being which include type of employment, wages level, social protection, working hours, occupational safety and health, and the percentage of union members. Enabling rights refer to bargaining process, freedom of association and non-discrimination (Barrientos et al., 2011:324).

For the purpose of the study, social upgrading (or downgrading) will be based on the Better Work's compliance assessment framework which is divided into 4 clusters based on core labour standards and 4 clusters based on working conditions according to the national legislation, each cluster is divided in several compliance points pertinent to each cluster's category. The empirical data is categorised in 5 measurable standards: (1) Child labour, (2) forced labour, (3) compensation, (4) occupational safety and health, and (5) working time. And 3 enabling rights: (1) discrimination, (2) freedom of association and collective bargaining, and (3) contract and human resources.

4.5 Limitations

As it was mentioned before, Better Work provides transparent information regarding compliance with the ILO's core labour standards and the national legislation. However, it is important to acknowledge possible biases in the material. For instance, information regarding workers' sensible

topics such as sexual harassment, physical and verbal abuse is usually underreported. Better Work recognises that sexual harassment is one of the most sensitive and most difficult issues to detect during factory assessments, and in Haiti most cases of sexual harassment and discrimination continue to be underreported by factory workers (Better Work, 2019). In light of this, it is important to consider the last mentioned when analysing the material, especially the results under the discrimination cluster. Moreover, the compliance synthesis reports lack of detailed distinctions between genders which could limit the analysis. Despite the fact that governance analysis is a central part of the GVCs framework, this analysis will only focus on the economic and social upgrading outcomes for women workers in Haitian factories participating in the Better Work Programme.

5. Analysis

This section will present the findings based on the examined data. The first part of the section will present the findings related to economic upgrading. The second part of the section consists of the findings regarding social upgrading.

5.1 Economic Upgrading

The expansion of the apparel industry in Haiti has been an important source of employment generation. Since the beginning of the Better Work programme in Haiti, the number of apparel factories has increased from 21 registered factories in 2009 to 33 factories in 2019 (Better Work, 2010:1; Better Work, 2019a:10). This increase is in part because of the work of the national government and international donors in promoting Haiti's apparel industry as a key driver for economic growth, and most importantly because of the trade preferences provided by the U.S. government under the HOPE II and HELP legislations which have facilitated the integration of Haiti's apparel sector into Global Value Chains.

In terms of exports, the apparel industry in Haiti continues to account for approximately 90 percent of the national exports earnings (Better Work, 2019a:9), this number has remained stable

since the beginning of the programme. Nonetheless, export revenues have more than doubled, growing from US\$ 412.4 million in 2008 to US\$ 926 millions in 2019 (Better Work, 2018a:7; Better Work, 2019a:9). These numbers reflect a positive increase in productivity which is attributed to the expansion of the sector.

Based on what mentioned above, Haiti's apparel sector has experienced economic upgrading in the following aspects: (1) The apparel industry is continuously growing and increasing productivity, firm competitiveness and employment opportunities, (2) there has been an increase in its world export market share, principally to the U.S. market, and (3) the value of apparel exports has increased since the Better Work Programme started operating in Haiti.

The expansion of the apparel industry has resulted in continuously increase of employment from 22,172 workers in 2009 to 53,000 workers in 2019. Women represent the majority of the labour force accounting for around 68% of the total number of employees (Better Work, 2019b:13). Based on these numbers, it is observed a feminisation of labour across the production activities where most women workers are concentrated in low-skilled, labour-intensive work within the value chains.

In terms of economic upgrading, from a labour dimension, the material suggests a higher productivity from workers linked to training programmes such as the Supervisory Skill Training programme which aims at improving women's career opportunities in the factories such as line supervisors and management positions. According to Better Work's Global Gender Strategy (2018c: 19) "female supervisors trained by Better Work achieved a 22% increase in productivity on their line." However, the findings suggests that the number of women benefited by skill development programmes is much smaller than the amount of male workers benefited by the same programmes. For instance, during the latest compliance report's period, Better Work Haiti trained a total of 1724 managers and workers from which only 770 were women (Better Work, 2019a:31). Despite that women constitute the majority of the total workforce, they continue to be underrepresented in supervisory roles. For instance, Haitian women make up less than 30% of supervisors or management members in the apparel industry (Better Work, 2018c:16). In addition, women are less likely to receive a promotion due to gender stereotypes and differences between women's and men's educational attainment. From a gender perspective, the findings suggest that the benefits of economic upgrading remain unequally distributed between female and male workers.

5.2 Social Upgrading

As it was previously mentioned, social upgrading is understood as the respect and improvement of the worker's rights, working conditions, remuneration and the overall well-being of the workers across the nodes of the value chains. In order to examine social upgrading, I will discuss the findings from the 5 measurable standards (Child labour, forced labour, compensation, occupational safety and health, and working time). Thereafter, I will present the findings from the 3 enabling rights (discrimination, freedom of association and collective bargaining, and contract and human resources).

The first two measurable standards refer to the clusters of child labour and forced labour. Since the beginning of the Better Work programme in Haiti, there have been very few cases of non-compliance under the cluster of child labour. However, the non-compliance issues are due to the fact that some factories could not verify workers' age during the hiring processes. No child was found working in any of the factories. The evidence suggests a possible ageism as the average woman worker in Haiti's apparel industry is between 21 to 35 years old (Better Work, 2018c:16). Moreover, under the forced labour cluster, a total of eleven cases of non-compliance were found between between 2010 to 2013. For instance, in some cases the workers reported that they felt they could not leave the factories overtime, as they were threatened with dismissal or suspension if they did (Better Work, 2012:16). Similarly, some workers reported that "the employers retained the workers' time card to ensure that needed workers stayed on the shop floor for overtime." (Better Work, 2011a:15). Better Work Haiti has directed the issue and no case of forced labour has been found since April 2014.

The third measurable standard is related to the compensation cluster. As it was previously mentioned, the expansion of Haiti's apparel value chains has increased women's participation in paid work. However, most of those women are concentrated in low-skilled and low-waged labour. The empirical data suggests that wages in the apparel industry are very low, which have created constant tensions in the country, in part because workers have gone on strike multiple times demanding an increase in wages. Since the Better Work programme started operating in Haiti, the minimum wage in the apparel sector has increased from 200 Gourdes (1.92 Euros) per 8 working hours in 2010 to 350 Gourdes (3.36 Euros) in 2018². Yet, this increase is not enough for workers to

² 1 Haitian Gourde is equivalent to 0.00960 Euro. The conversion is based on the currency value of the 4th of August 2019. Changes in the conversion may be applied to a different date.

climb out of poverty as it is considered to be barely enough to live on (Better Work, 2019a; Solidarity Center, 2019). In this sense, the situation is less favourable for women as they earn slightly less than their male counterparts, this could be partially because of the occupational segregation of women in low production activities of the value chain like sewing and because of constraints related to women's reproductive roles (Dunaway, 2014; Bamber and Staritz, 2016:7).

According to Better Work, there has been a substantial reduction in the gender wage gap in participating factories over the course of the programme (Better Work, 2018c). Some of the findings from the briefs suggest a decrease of women's weekly working hours and an increase in their total pay relative to men for work of equal value. Better Work states that the remaining wage gap is particularly linked to the predominance of working mothers and their caring responsibilities at the household level (Better Work, 2018c:18). However, based on the compliance reports, it is possible to identify gender-based discrimination in wages reported within the compensation cluster. For instance, payment related to maternity leave has been a recurrent issue since the beginning of the programme. It is noticed that participating factories have often failed to provide the correct payment to Haitian women workers during maternity leave. Another identified maternity-related constraint under the compensation cluster is the lack of compliance in relation to breastfeeding breaks. According to the Haitian law, and the international law, women are entitled to maternity leave and breastfeeding breaks (Better Work, 2017c), however the material suggests that these rights are often neglected leaving women most vulnerable throughout maternity which constraints women's opportunities for social upgrading.

Regarding the last two measurable standards, the empirical evidence suggests that workers perform under poor working conditions and long working hours without any break. The working time cluster demonstrates that issues related to overtime has considerably improved, yet non-compliance in terms of break-time remains a common problem. In the apparel sector, workers are entitled to 90 minutes daily break according to the national law (Ibid), however the material and data show that some factories do not provide any morning or afternoon break for the workers. Moreover, occupational safety and health has remained the cluster with the highest levels of non-compliance since the beginning of the Better Work Programme in Haiti. According to the findings, in most of the participating factories, workers are often exposed to chemical and hazardous substances without receiving periodical medical examinations as it is required by law. In fact, it is noticed that most of the factories have failed to provide the right medical facilities and/or personnel. Likewise, workers are often exposed to high temperature levels and inadequate ventilation in the

facilities. Some other recurrent non-compliance issues under the same cluster are the lack of necessary protective equipment, inadequate fire-fighting equipment and not easily accessible emergency exits. Better Work Haiti has offered various seminars and training programmes regarding safety and health concerns, however it has been stated that factories lack of motivation to address such issues, mainly because of a weak management system and lack of sanctions from the authorities in charge (Better Work, 2018c:22).

In 2013, the Herhealth programme was introduced by Better Work Haiti in collaboration with the Share Hope Foundation in order to train factory workers, especially women, on key health issues such as nutrition, personal and menstrual hygiene, family planning, and maternity health. Despite the fact that the programme has contributed to improving women workers' health, it is recognised that women and men have different risks and health problems at work because of gender-occupational segregation (ILO, 2013), in this sense the compliance reports lack of a strong gender-sensitive framework to highlight these differences.

In terms of enabling rights, the empirical data indicates a significant progress in the clusters of discrimination, freedom of association and collective bargaining, and contract and human resources. However, cases of gender-based discrimination are still found in most of the compliance reports under the discrimination cluster, mainly because of concerns related to sexual harassment. For instance, from the beginning of the programme till the latest compliance report, some women workers have reported cases of inappropriate behaviour from male supervisors and/or managers. It is also found that some female workers have been downgraded to a lower paid occupation after refusing to give sexual favours requested by the managers. Better Work recognises that sexual harassment is widespread in the workplace, mainly because of occupational segregation and power asymmetries between male supervisors and female workers (Better Work, 2018c:14). Despite the fact that the number of cases reported has been significantly reduced, it is noticed that sexual harassment is difficult to identify because of underreporting by workers due to stigma, lack of awareness and cultural perceptions of sexuality. Similarly, a couple of pregnancy and maternity-related discrimination cases have been found. For instance, it has been reported that nursing mothers returning from maternity leave are usually transferred to the training section which has a negative impact on their earnings. In most of the reported cases, Better Work has taken action in form of mediation and multiple sexual harassment prevention trainings which have contributed to raise awareness among workers and reduce the number of non-compliance under the discrimination cluster.

Based on the second enabling right related to the cluster of freedom of association and collective bargaining, the empirical data identifies significant progress in terms of union participation. However, anti-union discrimination still a recurrent issue. For instance, some worker's contracts have been terminated or not renewed due to worker's union membership or activities. In most cases, Better Work's intervention has helped to reinstate the terminated workers with compensation for back pay. Moreover, despite women workers' participation in unions has increased, they are still underrepresented. According to the data, around 80-90% of the leadership positions are predominantly male, this is mainly because of gender ideologies and unpaid work at the household level that constraints women's participation as union representatives (Better Work, 2018c:14-15).

According to the third enabling right which refers to the cluster on contracts and human resources, evidence suggests recurrent violations in terms of dialogue, discipline and disputes, as well as problems regarding termination. For instance, in some factories, workers have reported to be subject of humiliating treatment, indicating bullying and harassment from part of the supervisors. Moreover, the highest non-compliance point under this cluster is related to contract termination. For instance, in some cases workers have been terminated without any warning and/or opportunity to defend themselves.

Overall, the findings suggest a mixed picture in terms of social upgrading. While there has been considerable improvement with labour standards and working conditions, the findings suggest unequal benefits for women workers. The findings indicate that women's social upgrading is limited mainly because of maternity-related discrimination. Better Work Haiti highlights that it is necessary that national stakeholders engage more in order to improve gender constraints at work and advance in their gender equality agenda.

6. Conclusion

Participation in Global Value Chains is a central part of the development strategy of Haiti. In this regard, women have played an important role in the economic growth of the country as they constitute the majority of the workforce in the apparel industry. This study examined the economic and social upgrading outcomes for female workers from factories participating in the Better Work

programme in Haiti. Overall, the analysis suggests that Better Work Haiti has significantly improved the conditions for women working in the apparel value chains. Nonetheless, gender constraints continue limiting women's economic and social upgrading.

In terms of economic upgrading, the expansion of the apparel industry has represented an important source of employment for women, which in many cases did not have any access to formal wage employment beforehand. Based on the labour dimension of economic upgrading, the results suggest that Better Work Haiti's training programmes such as the Supervisory Skill Training have increased women workers' productivity. However, despite the fact that women constitute the majority of the total workforce in the factories, the number of women benefited by skill training programmes is much smaller than their male counterparts. Similarly, most women are concentrated in low-skilled and labour intensive occupations such as sewing, and they are less likely to receive promotions due to pervasive gender stereotypes and differences between women's and men's educational attainments. Notwithstanding, Better Work Haiti aims at reducing these disparities by promoting different skill development programmes that contribute to expand women's leadership and career opportunities in the apparel value chains, however it is recognised the importance of men's engagement in supporting gender initiatives and breaking gender stereotypes.

In relation to social upgrading, the analysis undertaken in this study provided a mixed picture. Nonetheless, it is important to mention that assessing the degree to which social upgrading is occurring for women in Haiti's apparel industry is a challenging task. Since the establishment of Better Work Haiti in 2009, significant progress has been made in terms of compliance with the ILO's core labour standards and the national legislation. One of the most significant outcomes of the programme is the substantial reduction in gender wage gap in participating factories. However, the findings suggest that women's reproductive roles and caring responsibilities continue to affect women's wages. Especially, payment related to maternity leave has been a recurrent issue since the beginning of the programme. Issues related to forced labour and overtime have considerably improved, yet some factories do not comply with the 90 minutes break required by the national law. Despite significant progress in the clusters of discrimination, freedom of association and collective bargaining, and contract and human resources, it is noticed that gender-based discrimination remains a constraint that limits women's opportunities to fully benefit from the programme.

Better Work Haiti has focused on ending all forms of gender-based discrimination in participating factories. Despite the efforts, sexual harassment remains a big concern which is largely

underreported due to cultural norms and lack of awareness. Gender-based discrimination in form of sexual harassment and maternity-related discrimination have been associated to women's downgrading due to a negative impact on their productivity, wages and overall well-being. Another aspect that constraints social upgrading is the lack of compliance regarding occupational safety and health which is the cluster with the highest level of non-compliance since the beginning of the program. The findings suggest that both, female and male workers, are exposed to dangerous and poor working conditions. Better Work Haiti has addressed the situation multiple times by introducing different advisory and training programmes, however most factories remain non-compliant mainly due to the lack of sanctions from the authorities in charge.

Although Better Work Haiti has contributed to the overall improvement of productivity and labour standards, the compliance reports lack of strong gender-sensitive framework and do not necessarily prioritise aspects related to social reproduction. Therefore, there is room for a closer analytical assessment of the intersection between the productive and reproductive roles of women workers to provide a more gender-responsive framework. In addition, it is important the full commitment of the public, private and social actors involved in the programme to strength policies and factories' practices to target discriminatory practices and differential power relations between women and men in the apparel industry. Better Work Haiti works closely with the national government of Haiti and the private sector to improve the working conditions for workers in the apparel industry, however Better Work has little, or no power, to impose changes over national policies and private practices that affect workers. Further research on the GVCs' governance aspect of Better Work programme in Haiti would allow us to have a better understanding of the causes for which the benefits of economic and social upgrading remain unequally distributed between women and men workers in Haiti's apparel value chains.

References

Bamber, Penny and Staritz (2016) The Gender Dimensions of Global Value Chains. *International Centre For Trade and Sustainable Development*.

Barrientos, Stephanie (2001) Gender Flexibility and Global Value Chains. *IDS Bulletin*, 32(3): 83-93.

Barrientos, Stephanie (2014) Gender and Global Value Chains: Challenges of Economic and Social Upgrading in Agri-Food. *Robert Schumann Centre for Advance Studies*.

Barrientos, Stephanie and Pallangyo, Charlotte (2018) Global Value Chains Policy Series: Gender. *World Economic Forum*. In http://www3.weforum.org/docs/WEF_51129_WP_Global_Value_Chain_Policy_Series_Gender_report_2018.pdf [Last accessed on 12 July 2019].

Benería, Lourdes, Berik, Günseli and Floro, Maria (2016) Gender, Development and Globalization: Economics as if All People Mattered. *Routledge*.

Bernhardt, Thomas (2014) Economic and Social Upgrading of Developing Countries in the Global Apparel Sector: Insights from Using a Parsimonious Measurement Approach. In *Towards Better Work: Understanding Labour in Apparel Global Value Chains*, Rossi, Arianna, Luinstra, Amy and Pickles, John (eds). *Palgrave Macmillan*.

Better Work (2010) Better Work Haiti: Garment Industry 1st Compliance Synthesis Report. *International Labour Office; International Finance Corporation*. In <https://betterwork.org/blog/portfolio/better-work-haiti-1st-biannual-synthesis-report/> [Last accessed on 13 August 2019].

Better Work (2011a) Better Work Haiti: Garment Industry, 2nd Biannual Synthesis Report Under the HOPE II Legislation. *International Labour Office; International Finance Corporation*. In <https://betterwork.org/blog/portfolio/better-work-haiti-2nd-biannual-synthesis-report/> [Last accessed on 13 August 2019].

Better Work (2011b) Better Work Haiti: Garment Industry, 3rd Biannual Synthesis Report Under the HOPE II Legislation. *International Labour Office; International Finance Corporation*. In <https://betterwork.org/blog/portfolio/better-work-haiti-3rd-biannual-compliance-synthesis-report/> [Last accessed on 13 August 2019].

Better Work (2012) Better Work Haiti: Garment Industry, 4th Biannual Synthesis Report Under the HOPE II Legislation. *International Labour Office; International Finance Corporation*. In <https://betterwork.org/blog/portfolio/better-work-haiti-4th-biannual-compliance-synthesis-report/> [Last accessed on 13 August 2019].

Better Work (2013a) Better Work Haiti: Garment Industry, 6th Biannual Synthesis Report Under the HOPE II Legislation. *International Labour Office; International Finance Corporation*. In <https://betterwork.org/blog/portfolio/better-work-haiti-6th-biannual-report-under-the-hope-ii-legislation/> [Last accessed on 13 August 2019].

Better Work (2013b) Better Work Haiti: Garment Industry, 7th Biannual Synthesis Report Under the HOPE II Legislation. *International Labour Office; International Finance Corporation*. In <https://betterwork.org/blog/portfolio/better-work-haiti-7th-biannual-compliance-synthesis-report/> [Last accessed on 13 August 2019].

Better Work (2014a) Better Work Haiti: Garment Industry, 8th Biannual Synthesis Report Under the HOPE II Legislation. *International Labour Office; International Finance Corporation*. In <https://betterwork.org/blog/portfolio/better-work-haiti-8th-biannual-compliance-synthesis-report/> [Last accessed on 13 August 2019].

Better Work (2014b) Better Work Haiti: Garment Industry, 9th Biannual Synthesis Report Under the HOPE II Legislation. *International Labour Office; International Finance Corporation*. In <https://betterwork.org/blog/portfolio/better-work-haiti-9th-biannual-synthesis-report-under-the-hope-ii-oct-2014/> [Last accessed on 13 August 2019].

Better Work (2015) Better Work Haiti: Garment Industry, 10th Biannual Synthesis Report Under the HOPE II Legislation. *International Labour Office; International Finance Corporation*. In <https://betterwork.org/blog/portfolio/better-work-haiti-10th-biannual-synthesis-report-under-the-hope-ii-legislation-apr-2015/> [Last accessed on 13 August 2019].

Better Work (2015b) Better Work Haiti: Garment Industry, 11th Biannual Synthesis Report Under the HOPE II Legislation. *International Labour Office; International Finance Corporation*. In <https://betterwork.org/blog/portfolio/better-work-haiti-11th-biannual-compliance-synthesis-report/> [Last accessed on 13 August 2019].

Better Work (2016a) Better Work Haiti: Garment Industry, 12th Biannual Synthesis Report Under the HOPE II Legislation. *International Labour Office; International Finance Corporation*. In <https://betterwork.org/blog/portfolio/better-work-haiti-12th-biannual-synthesis-report-under-the-hope-ii-legislation/> [Last accessed on 13 August 2019].

Better Work (2016b) 13th Biannual Synthesis Report Under the HOPE II Legislation Haiti. *International Labour Office; International Finance Corporation*. In <https://betterwork.org/blog/portfolio/better-work-haiti-13th-biannual-synthesis-report/> [Last accessed on 13 August 2019].

Better Work (2017a) 14th Biannual Synthesis Report Under the HOPE II Legislation Haiti. *International Labour Office; International Finance Corporation*. In <https://betterwork.org/blog/portfolio/better-work-haiti-14th-biannual-synthesis-report-2/> [Last accessed on 13 August 2019].

Better Work (2017b) 15th Biannual Synthesis Report Under the HOPE II Legislation Haiti. *International Labour Office; International Finance Corporation*. In <https://betterwork.org/blog/portfolio/better-work-haiti-15th-biannual-synthesis-report/> [Last accessed on 13 August 2019].

Better Work (2017c) Practical Guide, Haitian Labour Code. *International Labour Office; International Finance Corporation*. In <https://betterwork.org/blog/portfolio/practical-guide-to-haitian-labor-law/> [Last accessed on 13 August 2019].

Better Work (2018a) 16th Biannual Synthesis Report Under the HOPE II Legislation Haiti. *International Labour Office; International Finance Corporation*. In <https://betterwork.org/blog/portfolio/better-work-haiti-16th-biannual-synthesis-report/> [Last accessed on 13 August 2019].

Better Work (2018b) 17th Biannual Synthesis Report Under the HOPE II Legislation Haiti. *International Labour Office; International Finance Corporation*. In <https://betterwork.org/blog/portfolio/better-work-haiti-17th-biannual-synthesis-report-under-the-hope-ii-legislation/> [Last accessed on 13 August 2019].

Better Work (2018c) Global Gender Strategy 2018-2022. International Labour Office; International Finance Corporation. In <https://betterwork.org/blog/portfolio/global-gender-strategy/> [Last accessed on 13 August 2019].

Better Work (2019a) 18th Biannual Synthesis Report Under the HOPE II Legislation Haiti. *International Labour Office; International Finance Corporation. In <https://betterwork.org/blog/portfolio/better-work-haiti-18th-biannual-synthesis-report-under-the-hope-ii-legislation/> [Last accessed on 13 August 2019].*

Better Work (2019b) An impact evaluation of Better Work from a Gender Perspective. *International Labour Office; International Finance Corporation. In <https://betterwork.org/blog/portfolio/discussion-paper-30-an-impact-evaluation-of-better-work-from-a-gender-perspective/> [Last accessed on 13 August 2019].*

Better Work (2019c) Better Work Haiti. In <https://betterwork.org/where-we-work/haiti/> [Last accessed on 13 August 2019].

Bevir, Mark (2012) *Governance, A very Short Introduction. Oxford*

Blackett, Adelle (2015) Social Regionalism in Better Work Haiti. *The International Journal of Comparative Labour Law and Industrial Relations*. 31(2)163-187.

Solidarity Center (2019) The High Cost of Low Wages in Haiti: New Report. *Solidarity Center. In <https://www.solidaritycenter.org/wp-content/uploads/2019/05/Haiti.High-Cost-of-Wages-2019-Report.English.4.19.pdf> [Last accessed on 10 August 2019].*

Demographic and Health Survey (2017) Haïti: Enquête Mortalité, Morbidité et Utilisation des Services - EMMUS-VI 2016-2017. *The DHS Program. In <https://www.dhsprogram.com/pubs/pdf/FR326/FR326.pdf> [Last accessed on 5 August 2019].*

Dunaway, Wilma (ed) (2014) *Gendered Commodity Chains: Seeing women's work and households in global production. Stanford University Press.*

Duramy, Benedetta (2011) Women in the Aftermath of the 2010 Haitian Earthquake. *Emory International Law Review*, 25(3):1193-1216.

Gender Action (2013) Caracol Industrial Park: Social and Gender Impacts of Year One of Haiti's newest IFI-funded Industrial Park. *Gender Action*. In <http://www.genderaction.org/publications/caracol.pdf> [Last accessed on 6 August 2019].

Gender Action (2016) Gender Issues Facing Women and Girls. *Gender Action*. In <http://www.genderaction.org/pdf/CEDAW-Haiti-Gender-Issues-22.1.16.pdf> [Last accessed on 6 August 2019].

Gereffi, Gary (1999) International Trade and Industrial Upgrading in the Apparel Commodity Chain. *Journal of International Economics*. 48(1):37:70.

Gereffi, Gary (2005) The global economy: Organisation, governance and development. In the Handbook of Economic Sociology, Second Edition, Smelser, Neil and Swedberg, Richard (eds). *SAGE*.

Gereffi, Gary (2018) The Emergence of Global Value Chains: Ideas, Institutions and Research Communities. In Global Value Chains and Development: Redefining the Contours of 21st Century Capitalism, Gereffi, Gary (ed). *Cambridge University Press*.

Gereffi, Gary and Fernandez-Stark (2018) Global Value Chains Analysis: A Primer. In Global Value Chains and Development: Redefining the Contours of 21st Century Capitalism, Gereffi, Gary (ed). *Cambridge University Press*.

Gereffi, Gary, Humphrey, John and Sturgeon, Timothy (2005) The governance of Global Value Chains. *Review of International Political Economy*. 12(1):78-104.

Gereffi, Gary and Lee, Joonkoo (2016) Economic and Social Upgrading in Global Value Chains and Industrial Clusters: Why Governance Matters. *Journal of Business Ethics*. 133:25-38.

Gereffi, Gary and Luo Xubei (2018) Risks and Opportunities of Participation in Global Value Chains. In *Global Value Chains and Development: Redefining the Contours of 21st Century Capitalism*, Gereffi, Gary (ed). *Cambridge University Press*.

Global Value Chains Initiative (2019). In <https://globalvaluechains.org> [Last accessed on 15 July 2019].

Halperin, Sandra and Heath, Oliver (2012) *Political Research, Methods and Practical Skills*. *Oxford*.

Heartland Alliance (2016) *A Barrier to Work, Life and Rights: Sexual Harassment in Haiti*. *Heartland Alliance International*. In https://www.heartlandalliance.org/wp-content/uploads/2016/01/HAI_Haiti_Report.pdf [Last accessed on 10 August 2019].

Hsieh, Hsiu-Fang and Shannon, Sarah (2005) Three Approaches to Qualitative Content Analysis. *Qualitative Health Research*. 15(9):1277-1288.

Hughes, Caroline (2007) Transnational Networks, International Organisations and Political Participation in Cambodia: Human Rights Labour Rights and Common Rights. *Democratisation*. 14(5):834-852.

International Finance Corporation (2019). In https://www.ifc.org/wps/wcm/connect/corp_ext_content/ifc_external_corporate_site/home. [Last accessed on 10 August 2019].

International Labour Organization (2013) *10 Keys for Gender Sensitive OSH Practice - Guidelines for Gender Mainstreaming in Occupational Safety and Health*. *International Labour Organization*. In https://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/---ed_protect/---protrav/---safework/documents/publication/wcms_324653.pdf [Last accessed on 10 August 2019].

International Monetary Fund (2015) *Haiti: Selected Issues*. *International Monetary Found*. In <https://www.imf.org/external/pubs/ft/scr/2015/cr15158.pdf> [Last accessed on 10 August 2019].

Lee, Joonkoo (2016) *Global Supply Chain Dynamics and Labour Governance: Implications for Social Upgrading*. *International Labour Organisation*.

Lundahl, Mats (2011) *Poverty in Haiti: Essays on Underdevelopment and Post Disasters Prospects. Palgrave Macmillan.*

Mayer, Frederick and Pickles, John (2014) *Re-embedding the Market: Global Value Apparel Chains, Governance and Decent Work. In Towards Better Work: Understanding Labour in Apparel Global Value Chains, Rossi, Arianna, Luinstra, Amy and Pickles, John (eds). Palgrave Macmillan.*

Milberg, William and Winkler, Deborah (2011) *Economic and Social Upgrading in Global Production Networks: Problem of theory and measurement. International Labour Review. 150(3-4): 341-365.*

Padgett, Andrew and Warnecke, Tonia (2011) *The Women of Haiti Institutions, Gender Equity and Human Development in Haiti. Journal of Economic Issues. 45(3):527:557.*

Pearson, Ruth (2007) *Beyond Women Workers: Gendering CSR. Third World Quarterly. 28(4): 731-749.*

Ramamurthy, Priti (2014) *Feminist Commodity Chain Analysis: A framework to conceptualize value and interpret perplexity. In Gendered Commodity Chains: Seeing women's work and households in global production, Dunaway, Wilma (ed). Stanford University Press.*

Rossi, Arianna (2013) *Does Economic Upgrading Lead to Social Upgrading in Global Production Networks? Evidence from Morocco. World Development, 44:223-233.*

Salido, Joaquín and Bellhouse, Tom (2016) *Economic and Social Upgrading: Definitions, connections and exploring Means of measurements. United Nations Publications. In <https://www.un.org/en/>.*

Shamsie, Yasmine (2010) *Time for a "High-Road" Approach to EPZ Development in Haiti. Social Science Research Council.*

Shamsie, Yasmine (2017) Recalibration isn't enough: Post-earthquake developments in Haiti's export manufacturing sector. *Canadian Journal of Latin American and Caribbean Studies*. 42(1): 36-53.

Singh, Raju and Barton-Dock, Mary (2015) Haiti, Toward a New Narrative: Systematic Country Diagnostic. *World Bank Group*. In <http://documents.worldbank.org/curated/en/642131467992805241/pdf/99448-SCD-Box393200B-PUBLIC-DOI-10-1596-K8422-PUBDATE-9-8-15.pdf> [Last accessed on 13 August 2019].

Staritz, Cornelia (2013) Global Value Chains, Economic Upgrading and Gender. In Global Value Chains, Economic Upgrading and Gender: Case studies of the Horticulture, Tourism and Call Center Industries, Staritz, Cornelia and Reis, José (Eds). *The World Bank*. In <http://documents.worldbank.org/curated/en/912761468337873624/pdf/832330WP0GVC0G0Box0382076B00PUBLIC0.pdf> [Last accessed on 13 August 2019].

Staritz, Cornelia and Reis, José Guilherme (2013) Global Value Chains, Economic Upgrading and Gender: Case Studies of the Horticulture, Tourism and Call Center Industries. In <http://documents.worldbank.org/curated/en/912761468337873624/pdf/832330WP0GVC0G0Box0382076B00PUBLIC0.pdf> [Last accessed on 13 August 2019].

Steckley, Marylyn and Shamsie, Yasmine (2015) Manufacturing corporate landscapes: the case of agrarian displacement and food (in)security in Haiti. *Third World Quarterly*. 36(1):179-197.

United Nations Development Program (2014) Millennium Development Goals 2013: Haiti a New Look. *United Nations Development Program*. In <https://www.undp.org/content/dam/rblac/docs/Research%20and%20Publications/MDG%20Reports/UNDP-RBLAC-HT-ExecSummaryMDGReport-2014.pdf> [Last accessed on 13 August 2019].

USAID (2018) USAID/Haiti Strategic Framework 2018-2020. *USAID From the American People*. In <https://www.usaid.gov/sites/default/files/documents/1862/USAID-Haiti-Strategic-Framework-2018-2020.pdf> [Last accessed on 13 August 2019].

USAID (2016) USAID/Haiti Gender Assessment: Volume I - Gender Assessment Report. *United States Agency for International Development*. In <https://banyanglobal.com/wp-content/uploads/2017/07/USAID-Haiti-Gender-Assessment.pdf> [Last accessed on 13 August 2019].

World Bank (2018) The Time is Now for Gender Equality in the Caribbean. In <https://www.worldbank.org/en/news/feature/2018/03/07/the-time-is-now-for-gender-equality-in-the-caribbean> [Last accessed on 13 August 2019].

World Economic Forum (2011) Private Sector Development in Haiti: Opportunities for Investment, Job Creation and Growth. *World Economic Forum*. In <https://www.weforum.org/reports/private-sector-development-haiti-opportunities-investment-job-creation-and-growth> [Last accessed on 13 August 2019].

Annex.

Better Work’s Compliance Assessment Framework.

Compliance Cluster	Compliance Point	Compliance Issue	
Child Labor	Child Labourers	Workers under age 15	
	Documentation and Protection of Young Workers	Age verification system	
		Medical certificate, and/or an employment certificate or permit delivered by the Director of Labor provided by workers under age 18.	
		Register of workers under age 18.	
	Hazardous Work and other Worst Forms	Workers under age 18 working at night.	
		Workers under age 18 working overtime.	
Workers under age 18 doing work that is hazardous by nature.			
Discrimination 4	Gender	Changing the employment status, position, wages, benefits or seniority of workers during maternity leave.	
		Conditions of work (gender and/or marital status).	
		Excluding maternity leave from workers’ period of continuous service	
		Hiring (gender and/or marital status).	
		Job announcements (gender and/or marital status).	
		Pay (gender and/or marital status).	
		Pregnancy tests or use of contraceptives as a condition of employment	
		Promotion or access to training (gender and/or marital status).	
		Sexual harassment	
		Terminating workers or forcing them to resign if they are pregnant, on maternity leave or nursing.	
		Termination or retirement (gender and/or marital status).	
		Race and Origin	Conditions of work (race, colour, origin)
			Harassment (race, colour, origin)
	Hiring (race, colour, origin)		
	Pay (race, colour, origin)		
	Promotion or access to training (race, colour, origin)		

		Recruitment materials (race, colour, origin)
		Termination or retirement (race, colour, origin)
	Religion and Political Opinion	Conditions of work (religion or political opinion)
		Harassment (religion or political opinion)
		Hiring (religion or political opinion)
		Pay (religion or political opinion)
		Promotion or access to training (religion or political opinion)
		Recruitment materials (religion or political opinion)
		Termination or retirement (religion or political opinion)
Forced Labor	Bonded Labor	Debts for recruitment fees owed to the employer and/or a third party
	Coercion	Coercive tactics.
		Delaying or withholding wage payments.
		Forced labor to discipline workers or punish them for participation in a strike
		Free exit from the workplace at all times, including during overtime.
	Freedom of movement (dormitories or industrial park).	
	Freedom to terminate employment with reasonable notice and/or to leave their jobs when their contracts expire	
	Threats such as deportation, cancellation of visas or reporting to the authorities	
	Violence or the threat of violence.	
	Workers' access to their personal documents (such as birth certificates, passports, work permits and ID cards)	
	Forced Labor and Overtime	Forced overtime under threat of penalty
	Prison Labor	Prison labourers
Freedom of Association and Collective Bargaining	Collective Bargaining	Access to collective bargaining agreement.
		Collective agreement less favourable for workers than what is required by national law.
		Collective bargaining/bargaining in good faith.
		Implementation of collective agreement.
	Freedom to Associate	Freedom to form and/or join a union
		Requiring workers to join a union.
	Interference and Discrimination	Attempt(s) to interfere with, manipulate or control the union(s).
		Freedom to meet without management present.
		Incentives to refrain from joining a union or engaging in union activities.
Punishment of unionists		
Termination or non-renewal of worker's employment contract due to union membership or activities		
	Threats, intimidation or harassment of unionists.	

		Unequal treatment of multiple unions.
		Union membership or union activities factoring into hiring decisions
	Strikes	Hiring of replacement workers during a strike.
		Preventing workers from participating in a strike.
		Punishing workers for participating in a strike.
		Security guards, the police or armed forces called on to break up a peaceful strike or arrest striking workers.
	Union Operations	Deduction of union dues upon workers' request.
		Union representatives' access to workers in the workplace.
Compensation	Method of Payment	In-kind wage payments.
		Regular and timely payment of wages.
		Wage payment directly to workers at the workplace on working days
		Wage payment in legal currency.
	Minimum Wage	Correct payment of piece rate workers when their piece rate earnings exceed minimum wage.
		Payment of minimum wage for apprentices.
		Payment of minimum wage for temporary workers.
	Overtime Wages	Payment for ordinary overtime.
		Payment for overtime hours worked on holidays.
		Payment for overtime worked at night.
		Payment for overtime worked on weekly rest days.
	Paid Leave	Payment for annual leave.
		Payment for breastfeeding breaks.
		Payment for legally mandated holidays.
		Payment for maternity leave.
		Payment for sick leave.
	Premium Pay	Payment for weekly rest days.
		Payment for regular hours worked at night.
		Payment for regular hours worked on holidays
		Payment for regular working hours worked on weekly rest days
Social Security and Other Benefits	Collecting and forwarding workers' contributions for social insurance funds to ONA.	
	Employer contribution to OFATMA for maternity and health insurance.	
	Employer contribution to OFATMA for work-related accident insurance.	
	Employer contribution to ONA.	
	Forwarding of workers' contributions to OFATMA.	
	Payment of annual salary supplement or bonus.	
	Deductions from workers' wages.	

	Wage Information, Use and Deduction	Informing workers about wage payments and deductions. Payroll records.
Contracts and Human Resources	Contracting Procedures	Limits on the trial period for apprentices.
	Dialogue, Discipline and Disputes	Bullying, harassment or humiliating treatment of workers. Disciplinary measures Resolution of grievances or disputes.
	Employment Contracts	Contracts for all persons performing work for the factory. Employment contracts' compliance with the labor code, collective agreement and/or internal work rules. Internal work rules. Specifying terms and conditions of employment in written employment contracts. Workers' understanding of the terms and conditions of employment.
	Termination	Annual salary supplement or bonus upon termination. Notice of termination. Orders to reinstate or compensate unjustly terminated workers. Payment for unused paid annual leave upon resignation or termination. Reasons for termination. Reductions in workforce size or suspensions due to changes in operations
Occupational Safety and Health	Chemicals and Hazardous Substances	Assessing, monitoring, preventing and/or limiting workers' exposure to hazardous substances. Chemical safety data sheets for all chemicals and hazardous substances in the workplace. Inventory of chemicals and hazardous substances used in the workplace. Labelling of chemicals and hazardous substances. Storage of chemicals and hazardous substances. Training workers who work with chemicals and hazardous substances. Washing facilities or cleansing materials in the event of chemical exposure.
	Emergency Preparedness	Accessible, unobstructed, and/or unlocked emergency exits during working hours, including overtime. Fire detection and alarm system. Firefighting equipment. Marking or posting of emergency exits and/or escape routes in the workplace. Number of emergency exits. Periodic emergency drills.

		Safeguarding possible sources of ignition
		Storage of flammable materials
		Training workers to use the firefighting equipment
	Health Services and First Aid	Annual medical checks for workers.
		First-aid training for workers.
		Health checks for workers who are exposed to work-related hazards.
		Medical checks for workers upon hiring.
		Onsite medical facilities and staff.
		The employer did not ensure that there were a sufficient number of readily accessible first aid boxes/supplies in the workplace.
		Safety and health risks to pregnant or nursing workers
	OSH Management Systems	Assessment of general occupational safety and health issues in the factory.
		Legally required construction/building permits
		Mechanisms to ensure cooperation between workers and management on OSH matters.
		Recording work-related accidents and diseases and/or submitting the record to OFATMA.
		Written OSH policy.
	Welfare Facilities	Certain required facilities.
		Eating area.
		Providing drinking water.
		Toilets.
		Washing facilities and/or soap.
	Worker Accommodation	Accommodation separate from the workplace
		Cooking or storage facilities in the accommodation.
		Lighting in the accommodation.
		Minimum space requirements in the accommodation.
		Preparation for emergencies in the accommodation.
		Privacy in the accommodation.
		Protection against disease carrying animals and/or insects in the accommodation.
		Protection against fire in the accommodation.
		Protection against heat, cold and/or dampness in the accommodation.
		Protection against noise in the accommodation.
		Toilets, showers, sewage and/or garbage disposal systems in the accommodation.
		Ventilation in the accommodation.
		Water in the accommodation.
	Worker Protection	Ergonomic requirements
		Installing guards on all dangerous moving parts of machines and equipment.

		Installing, grounding, and/or maintaining electrical wires, switches, and/or plugs.	
		Posting safety warnings in the workplace	
		Providing workers with personal protective clothing and equipment.	
		Punishment of workers who removed themselves from work situations they believed presented an imminent and serious danger to life or health.	
		Training and encouragement of workers to use PPE, machines and/or equipment safely	
Working Environment		Workplace cleanliness	
		Workplace lighting.	
		Workplace noise levels.	
		Workplace temperature and/or ventilation.	
Working Time	Leave	payment in place of annual leave	
		Time off for annual leave.	
		Time off for breastfeeding breaks.	
		Time off for maternity leave.	
		Time off for sick leave.	
	Overtime		Authorization from the Department of Labor for overtime.
			Authorization from the Department of Labor for work on Sundays.
			Limits on overtime hours worked.
			Voluntary overtime.
	Regular Hours		Daily break periods.
			Regular daily and/or weekly working hours.
			Weekly rest period.
			Working time records.
		Authorization from the Department of Labor before working at night.	

Source: Better Work (2019a:41-46).

