

Human rights on a local level:

A study of Piteå's and Jönköping's approaches to human rights

Nanna Malmborg Rasmussen

Division of Human Rights Studies

Department of History

Course Code: MRSM15

Semester: Spring 2021

Supervisor: Lena Halldenius

Words: 22 367



Acknowledgment

This thesis would never have been possible without the participation of several people. Therefore, I wish to show my gratitude and thank you the persons from Piteå and Jönköping that took their time and effort to participate in this thesis.

I would also like to thank you, my supervisor, Lena Halldenius, for the continuous support and great advice.

In addition, I would also like to thank the people at the European Union Fundamental Agency for Fundamental Rights that made it possible for me to apply the framework for future human rights cities.

Glossary

Kommunstyrelse – Municipal Board

Kommunfullmäktige – Municipal Council

Mänskliga rättighetskontoret – Human Rights Office

Kommunledningsförvaltningen – Municipal District Administration

Stadskontoret – Official office

Nämnd – Committee

Kultur och fritidsförvaltningen – Department of culture and leisure

Sveriges kommuner och regioner (SALAR) - Swedish Association of Local Authorities and Regions

Svenska delegationen för mänskliga rättigheter – Swedish Delegation for Human Rights

EU:s byrå för fundamentala rättigheter (FRA) – European Union Agency for Fundamental Rights

Raoul Wallenbergs Institute (RWI) – Raoul Wallenberg Institute

Rättighetsbaserat arbete (RBA) – Rights-based approach

Abstract

The meaning of human rights locally can vary depending on a city's context. Therefore, the approaches of working with human rights locally can differ. Swedish municipalities tend to lack a structure of approaching human rights. However, the European Union Agency for Fundamental Rights (FRA) is about to publish a framework for how European human rights cities can approach human rights.

This thesis studies how Jönköping and Piteå approach human rights. To accomplish this, eight interviews were conducted with the municipalities, and various policy documents were studied. The framework of FRA is used as a methodological tool and theoretical lens to detect the municipalities' human rights work to investigate if it would be eligible to apply the framework given the lack of approaching human rights and the various ways of practising human rights locally. The theoretical standpoints of the right to the city and the human rights city narrative are applied to frame the implication of human rights within the municipalities.

Overall, the municipalities fulfil the FRA-framework. The municipalities perceive human rights as an embedded part of the services they provide. Human rights are translated into the municipalities' sections, departments and employees' professions due to the variation of activities. Therefore, the meaning and approaches of human rights seem to differ within the municipalities. There is no specific strategy for translating human rights except for a rights-based approach. Consequentially, the thesis concludes that an application of the FRA-framework on a section or department level could make the human rights work more tangible.

Key words: Human rights, human rights on a local level, human rights on a city level, human rights city, right to the city,

Tables of content

1. Introduction	1
1.2 Purpose and Statement of issue	4
2. What do we know about human rights on a local level?	6
2.1 Swedish Background	
2.2 The implications and aspects of human right cities	
2.3 Challenges for human right cities	
-	
2.4 Research gap	10
3. Theoretical framework	11
3.1 The FRA framework	11
3.2 The right to the city and the human rights city narrative compared	15
4. Material and methodological	19
4.1 Documents from the municipalities	
4.1.1 Common values and governing principles of human rights in Jönköpin	ng
municipality	
4.1.2 Jönköping, Municipal program 2019 – 2022	
human rights	
4.1.4 Jönköping, mapping of existing human rights competencies of staff ar	
key policy documents with regard to human rights	
4.1.5 Piteå, Guidelines for human rights and diversity	21
4.1.6 Piteå, Instructions for following up Guidelines for human rights – dive	ersity21
4.1.7 Piteå, Action Plan, a Piteå for everyone – with increased diversity	
4.1.8 Piteå, Budget plan 2021 and Operational Plan 2021 - 2023 City Counc	
4.1.9 Piteå, guidance for human rights analysis	
4.1.10 Websites from the municipalities	22
4.2 Interviews as a methodological approach	22
4.3 Scope of data	23
4.4 Procedure of selecting municipalities	24
4.5 The procedure of selecting interviewees	25
4.6 The collection of interviews and ethical considerations	26
4.7 Process of organising data	27
4.8 Critique and limitations	29
5. Findings and analysis	32
5.1 How the initiative to work with human rights started	
5.1.2 The start of Piteå's journey towards human rights	
5.1.3 The start of Jönköping's journey towards human rights	

5.2 Piteå's and Jönköping's framing of human rights	35
5.2.1 Framing of human rights in Piteå's and Jönköping's policy documents	
5.2.2. The interviewees' framing of human rights	37
5.3 The municipalities units, commitments to human rights and their role as a dut	y
bearer	
5.3.1 Piteå's and Jönköping's written commitment to human rights and units	
5.3.2 The interviewees' understanding of the duty towards human rights	44
5.4 How do the municipalities work and approach human rights?	49
5.4.1 Human rights shall permeate the whole of Piteå and Jönköping	49
5.5 Piteå's and Jönköping's practice of Agenda 2030, participation and inclusion	57
5.5.1 Practice of Agenda 2030	
5.5.2 Jönköping's and Piteå's practice of participation and inclusion	
7. Discussion and conclusion	60
7. Discussion and conclusion	
	61
7.1 Discussion	61 63
7.1 Discussion	6163
7.1 Discussion	616366
7.1 Discussion	61 63 66 72
7.1 Discussion	61 63 66 72 74

1. Introduction

The People's Movement for Human Rights Education (PDHRE) launched the human rights city concept in 1997. PDHRE also established the first human rights city, Rosario, Argentina 1997. The Gwangiu Declaration on the Human Rights City describes that a human rights city is a place where human rights play a core role in guiding principles, decision making, and policy implementation.² To be a human rights city is a commitment to work and implement international human rights treaties on a local level.³ Barcelona initiated the European Charter for the Safeguarding of Human Rights in the City in 1998 and 400 cities have signed the charter, another landmark for human rights cities.⁴ The human rights city concept was developed further during the World Human Rights Cities Forum in Gwangju 2011, making Gwangju an important actor for human rights cities.⁵ Simultaneously, the Committee on Social Inclusion, Participatory Democracy and Human rights established the Global Charter for Human Rights in the City. ⁶ The concept of human rights cities has also gained recognition from the United Nations, in the report A/HRC/30/49 2015 where they state the importance of local authorities working with human rights. The New Urban Agenda, established by the United Habitat, echoes the human rights cities discourse because it focuses on human rights locally.⁸ Taking all of these different push factors into account, more cities such as Vienna, Utrecht, Bogota, New Mexico and Montreal have announced themselves as human rights cities.⁹

¹ People's Movement for Human Rights Learning, PDHRE International office and the three regional PDHRE offices in Latin America, West Africa and Anglo Africa, *Human Rights Learning and Human Rights Cities. Achievement Report*, 2007, P.9

² World Human Rights Cities Forum, Gwangju Deceleration on Human Right City, 16 – 17 May 2011, Gwangju

 ³ K. Gomes da Silva, 'The new urban agenda and human rights cities: Interconnections between the global and the local, 'Netherlands Quarterly of Human Rights, vol 36, Issue 4, 2018, P.299
 ⁴ United Cities and Local Governments on Social Inclusion, Participatory Democracy and Human Rights,

⁴ United Cities and Local Governments on Social Inclusion, Participatory Democracy and Human Rights, European Charter for the Safeguarding of Human Rights in the City, available here (accessed 26 January 2021)

⁵ United Nations, General Assembly, Human Rights Council, *Role of local government in the promotion and protection of human rights – Final report of the Human Rights Council Advisory Committee*, A/HRC/30/49, 7 August 2015, P.3 – 5

⁶ United Cities and Local Governments on Social Inclusion, Participatory Democracy and Human Rights, *Background: Twenty Years of human rights cities municipalism*, <u>available here</u> (accessed 26 January 2021)

⁷ United Nations, A/HRC/30/49, 7 August 2015, P.12,

⁸ K. Gomes da Silva, 2018, P.291

⁹ United Nations, General Assembly, Human Rights Council, A/HRC/30/49, 7 Report 2015

The commitment to work with human rights locally and the concept of human rights cities has grown in Sweden. The Delegation for Human Rights spurred the initiative and in 2010 they stated that Sweden's work with human rights would become more thoroughly if municipalities would start approaching it. Therefore, the government assigned the Swedish Association of Local Authorities and Regions (SALAR) to localise human rights in collaboration with municipalities. Consequentially, many municipalities work more with human right today compared to 2010. To illustrate, Lund announced itself as a human rights city in 2018, and Piteå in 2020. Another example, Gothenburg is famous for its implementation of human rights in budgeting. Klippan is known for its in depth-survey concerning human rights. Mölndal is well-known for its appliance of a human rights-based approach.

Although the concept of human rights cities has grown in Sweden, there is still relatively little research concerning human rights on a local level. Oomen and Baumgartel underline in their article *Frontier cities: The rise of local authorities as an opportunity for international human rights law* that the role of local authorities in international law is unresearched. ¹⁵ Additionally, there are no specific measures of how to localise human rights. Instead, there are several approaches to localising human rights. ¹⁶ Oomen states in *Global Urban Justice: The Rise of Human Rights Cities* that what human rights mean in practice for a city can differ depending on a city's context. Oomen underlines that it is a political process to translate human rights into a local context. But then again, the core point of a human right city is that residents can participate in different city procedures and impact their rights. ¹⁷

.

¹⁰ Regeringen, arbetsmarknadsdepartementet, Bemyndigande att ingå en överenskommelse med Sveriges Regioner och Landsting, 12 June 2014

¹¹ Lunds kommun, *Mänskliga rättigheter*, <u>available here</u> (accessed 01 May 2021) and Piteå kommun, *Utropande av MR-kommun 24 Oktober*, 2020, <u>available here</u> (accessed 26 January 2021)

¹² Göteborgs Stad, *Handlingsplan för arbetet med de mänskliga rättigheterna i Göteborgs Stad*, 2012, (accessed 01 May 2021) <u>available here</u> (accessed 26 January 2021)

¹³ Klippans kommun, rättighetskartläggning, (accessed 26 January 2021) available here

¹⁴ Mölndals kommun, *Mänskliga rättigheter*, (accessed 26 January 2021) <u>available here</u>

¹⁵ B. Oomen and M. Baumgartel 'Frontier cities: The rise of local authorities as an opportunity for international human rights law' *European Journal of International Law*, Vol 29, No.2, May 2018, P. 609 ¹⁶ K. Gomes da Silva, 2018, P.298

¹⁷ B. Oomen, 'The promise and challenges of human rights cities 'B. Oomen, M. Davis and M. Grigolo, (eds) *Global Urban Justice: The Rise of Human Rights Cities*, Cambridge, Cambridge University Press, 2016, P.13 – 15

Despite limited research concerning human rights on a local level, two studies investigate how municipalities work with human rights in Sweden. Emerga Institute published a study for SALAR in 2015, stating that many municipalities experience working with human rights as challenge because they lack a structure of approaching human rights. ¹⁸ The Raoul Wallenberg Institute (RWI) writes in a comparable study for SALAR in 2020 that using a human rights-based approach is rare. ¹⁹ The RWI explains that many municipalities work with human rights by separating different issues such as equality, discrimination, racism, honour-related violence, indigenous people and human rights instead of gathering it under the umbrella of human rights. Effectively, few municipalities have a holistic structure for how to approach human rights. ²⁰ The RWI, therefore, states that there is a need to clarify what a human rights-based approach (HRBA) could imply. Likewise, many municipalities also request more concrete methods to make the human rights work less challenging. ²¹

With the previous paragraphs in mind, one could wonder if it would be eligible for municipalities to apply a framework for its human rights work given the request for concrete measures for approaching human rights and given the experienced difficulties working with human rights. The European Union Agency for Fundamental Rights (FRA) has established a draft to a framework for human rights cities. The framework is currently in progress before it will be finalized. The framework suggests that a municipality shall implement international and European human rights treaties and covenants, including Agenda 2030. The framework suggests that human rights shall permeate all sections of a city. It advises that the city's residents shall be a part of the city's planning, investigations and evaluations and that there shall exist a human rights office.²² In effect, one can question if it would be desirable to apply this sort of framework or if it is less necessary.

⁻

¹⁸ Emerga Institute, Mänskliga Rättigheter i kommuner, regioner och landsting. Kartläggning av arbetet med mänskliga rättigheter samt önskemål om stöd i detta arbete, 2015, P.4

¹⁹ Raoul Wallenberg Institute, A. Bruce, G. Fredriksson, R. Garner, E. Hammarström, M. Kjaerum and A. Lindström *Arbetet med mänskliga rättigheter i Svenska kommuner och regioner, En kartläggning för Sveriges Kommuner och Regioner*, 2020 P.6

²⁰ Ibid, P.16

²¹ Ibid, P.48 and P.56

²² European Union Agency for Fundamental Rights, *Towards a framework of commitments for European human rights cities*, <u>available here</u> 2020 (accessed 30 January 2021)

1.2 Purpose and Statement of issue

The thesis' purpose is to study how the municipalities of Jönköping and Piteå work and approach human rights on a local level. The thesis studies Piteå that has announced themselves as human right city and Jönköping who has not done so yet. The aim of studying how Piteå and Jönköping work and approach human rights are to specify what it implies to work with human rights on a local level. The thesis also aims to investigate which human rights are implicated when Piteå and Jönköping approach human rights. All of this is done because what human rights can imply locally can greatly differ and due to the lack of research about human rights on a local level.²³ The other purpose of studying Piteå and Jönköping is to investigate if it would be eligible to apply a framework. This is done given the request of concrete measures of how to work with human rights and due to the lacking structure of how to work with human rights.²⁴ Interviews with eight different persons from the municipalities are conducted and policy documents are studied to succeed with the thesis' aims. The interviews and the policy documents are studied through a content analysis grounded on a framework that the European Union Agency for Fundamental Rights (FRA) has established for human rights cities. The FRA-framework is the tool to identify how the municipalities work with human rights because there are many different strategies to localise human rights. The FRA-framework is also applied as a theoretical framework to see how the municipalities' human rights work corresponds to the different categories stated in the framework. The theoretical approach, the right to the city and the human rights city narrative, will complement the FRA-framework because they enable the possibility to better frame what the implication of human rights seems to mean for Piteå and Jönköping. A part of the thesis' goal is to study if there are any differences between a human rights city and a city that has not announced itself as a human rights city yet.

To fulfil the purpose of the thesis, the thesis has the goal to answer the following questions:

⁻

²³ B.Oomen, 2016 P.13 – 15. and B.Oomen and M. Baumgartel 2018, 609

²⁴ Emerga Institute 2015 P.4 and Raoul Wallenberg Institute 2020, P.48 and 56.

- How do the municipalities' work and approaches to human rights correspond to the FRA framework?
- How can one frame the municipalities' approaches to human rights with the perspective of the right to the city and the human rights city narrative?

Essential to note is that these questions shall be understood as overreaching questions that are applied continuously in the thesis' analysis to fulfil the thesis' purpose. In other words, these research questions are applied to investigate, frame and discuss the material of the thesis. However, to fulfil the rest of the thesis' goal, the following research questions are also applied, which can be viewed as more empirical research questions:

- How do the municipalities perceive human rights within their local context?
- How do the municipalities state and frame their commitment and duty towards human rights?
- How do the municipalities approach human rights?

2. What do we know about human rights on a local level?

This section aims to describe what we know about human rights on a local level, from anational and international perspectives. The section starts with giving some background to the local human rights work in Sweden. Thereafter, the aspects and challenges of working with human rights locally are highlighted.

2.1 Swedish Background

As mentioned in the introduction, SALAR is an important actor for the local human rights work in Sweden. SALAR has created a platform that aims to spread ideas and tools of how municipalities can strengthen their human rights work. SALAR has a network that consists of officials from different municipalities who work with human rights. The network aims to exchange ideas and methods for how municipalities can develop their human rights work. SALAR has published several reports concerning local human rights work. For instance, the report *Mänskliga rättigheter i praktiken* gives different examples of municipalities' human rights work. The report, *Mänskliga rättigheter på lokal och regional nivå*, underlines that a municipality has different roles when approaching human rights, as a democracy, welfare, social actor, and employer. The report *Mänskliga rättigheter i styrning och ledning* explains how municipalities can apply the rights-based approach to governance.

SALAR has been an important actor to make Swedish municipalities work with human rights on a local level. As described in the introduction, more municipalities work more with human rights today compared to 2010, thanks to SALAR.³⁰ It is also evident that

²⁵ Sveriges kommuner och regioner, *MR-kommuner/region-plattform* <u>available here</u> (accessed 15 April 2021)

²⁶ Sveriges kommuner och regioner, *Nätverk, mänskliga rättigheter*, <u>available here</u> (accessed 15 April 2021)

²⁷ Sveriges kommuner och regioner, Mänskliga rättigheter i praktiken – lärande exempel, 2020

²⁸ Sveriges kommuner och regioner, Mänskliga rättigheter på lokal och regional nivå, 2019

²⁹ Sveriges kommuner och regioner, Mänskliga rättigheter i styrning och ledning, 2019

³⁰ Raoul Wallenberg Institute, 2020, P.55 – 56

SALAR has an important role in pushing Jönköping and Piteå to work more with human rights on a local level, which is explained further at the beginning of the analysis. ³¹

2.2 The implications and aspects of human right cities

Oomen explains in the book Global Urban Justice: The Rise of Human Rights Cities that the primary purpose of human rights cities is to localize and integrate human rights from a global level to a local level.³² Effectively, what distinguishes a human rights city from other cities is that human rights shall permeate all city areas.³³ Gomes da Silva states different requirements that a city should fulfil to announce itself as a human rights city in the article The new urban agenda and human rights cities: Interconnections between the global and the local. Gomes da Silva states that a city must commit to human rights, policies shall reflect human rights, and the residents should be engaged and have the opportunity to participate in different city procedures. There shall also be a system for monitoring and reporting on human rights, and there must exist a local human rights institution.³⁴ These expectations mirror the Gwangju Guiding Principles for a Human Rights City. Essentially, to be a human rights city is to give room for every voice needed to be heard when a city makes new plans, decisions and settings and identifying those voices who are not being listened to. Human rights cities tend to apply a human rightsbased approach. Namely, human rights cities tend to apply the principles of inclusion, participation, non-discrimination, equality, transparency, and accountability, to meet these expectations.³⁵ Additionally, human rights cities tend to cooperate with local authorities, international actors, civil society, private and public firms to ensure human rights are embraced in all city areas.³⁶

_

³¹ See section 5.1 How the initiative to work with human rights started of the thesis

³² B. Oomen 2016, P.15 - 16

³³ M. Grigolo, 'Towards a sociology of the human rights city: Focusing on practice' M. Davis, T. Gammeltoft Hansen, E. Hanna (eds) *Human Rights Cities and Region. Swedish and International Perspectives*, Raoul Wallenberg Institute, Malmö, 2017, P.12

³⁴ K. Gomes da Silva, 2018, P.294

³⁵ World Human Rights Cities Forum, *Gwangju Guiding Principles for a human rights city (Gwangju principles)* 2014

³⁶ S.Phillipp 'Focusing on Human Rights in the Daily Business of Local Governments' M. Davis, T.Gammeltoft Hansen, E.Hanna (eds) *Human Rights Cities and Region. Swedish and International Perspectives*, Raoul Wallenberg Institute, Malmö, 2017

Several scholars imply that human right cities can be a way to strengthen social justice thanks to a city's closeness to the residents and knowledge about the cultural, social and economic structures. Correspondingly, a local government can be an actor that brings together important stakeholders such as NGO:s and businesses to realise human rights better. Consequentially, several scholars imply that a city can be better suited to fulfil human rights compared to the state to further pave the way for justice. Therefore, a human rights city can bear the brunt of realising human rights when the state fails to do so.³⁷ An example of how cities can bring achievements is described by several scholars in the article *Human Rights Cities and the SDGs* from the Raoul Wallenberg Institute. The scholars explain that if human rights cities apply a human rights-based approach, it automatically means an improvement of the SDG:s and the Agenda 2030 because they are based on the principles of RBA.³⁸

Oomen underlines that there are different aspects of human rights cities. Likewise, how a city translates human rights and what human rights will imply for a city is very different.³⁹. For instance, Montreal has an ombudsman for human rights, Vienna has a human rights office, San Francisco has adopted CEDAW, and Berkley has their mechanism for giving shadow reports to the UN.⁴⁰ Some cities in Sweden uses a right-based approach when working with human rights. Others work with human rights through separating different areas, such as human rights, equality, racism, national minorities and children's rights, instead of gathering this work under human rights and other gathers these areas but under the umbrella of Agenda 2030.⁴¹

Although there are several aspects of approaching human rights, some structures of approaching human rights are similar to each other. Oomen explains that there are three similarities of localising human rights. Firstly, the localisation can occur 'horizontally.' Meaning that the local administration, civil society and ombudsmen cooperate to

_

³⁷ B. Oomen, 2016 P.3 – 4, K. Gomes da Silva, 2018, P.291, B. Oomen and M. Baumgartel 2018, P.614

³⁸ M.Kjaerum, M.Davis, F.Fredriksson, G.Startori, I.Reis, *Human Rights Cities and the SDGs*. Raoul Wallenberg Institute of Human Rights, 2018, P.7 – 8

³⁹ B Oomen 2016, P.14 – 16 and K. Gomes da Silva, 2018, P.298 – 299

⁴⁰ B. Oomen, 2016 P.7, M.Davis 'Design Challenges for Human Rights Cities' *Colombia Human Rights Law Review*, Vol 49, Issue 1, 2017, P.38 and 63

⁴¹ Raoul Wallenberg Institute, 2020, P.6, P.11, and P.16

strengthen human rights. The localisation of human rights can also happen 'vertically,' which is similar to horizontal localisation, but it implies that the localisation of human rights is strengthened by international cooperation. Secondly, human rights are translated into political processes and values that are adjusted to the local context. Thirdly, there is a promise to bring social justice on a local level. ⁴² Similarly, Gomes Da Silva argues that a city can localise human rights either through a right-based approach, by commitments, or through driving forces by civil society. ⁴³

Several responsibilities apply to local governments. Oomen and Baumgärtel discuss this in their article *Frontier cities: The rise of local authorities as an opportunity for international human rights law*. For instance, article 3 of the Covenant on the Rights of the Child holds both private and local stakeholders responsible for the child's best interest. Article 2 of the Covenant on Political and Civil Rights state that "all branches of government (executive, legislative and judicial), and other public or governmental authorities, at whatever level – national, regional or local – are in a position to engage the responsibility of the State Party." Similarly, the Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights states in comment nr.9 that those who have are administrative authorities must take on the Covenant in decision-making.⁴⁴

2.3 Challenges for human right cities

It can be challenging for human rights cities to implement human rights because they need to comply with national and international law. M.Davis highlights the challenges for human rights cities in the US to comply with federal, national and international law in her article *Design Challenges for human rights cities*. ⁴⁵ Other challenges for human rights cities can be a lack of resources and the coordination between the local government and the state concerning who has which duties. It is also a known challenge that officials within local governments lack in knowing their duties following human rights. ⁴⁶

⁻

⁴² B. Oomen 2016, P.5

⁴³ K. Gomes da Silva, P.293

⁴⁴ B. Oomen and M. Baumgartel. 2018, P. 620 – 621

⁴⁵ M. Davis, 2017, P.48 – 50

⁴⁶ United Nations, General Assembly, Human Rights Council, A/HRC/30/49, 7 August 2015, P.6 and 9 –

Many of the statements that are underlined in this section are applied continuously in the analysis. The aim is to elaborate on how Piteå's and Jönköping's work with human rights mirror the research field of human rights cities.

2.4 Research gap

The thesis can have an essential role in the current research field because it investigates the implication of human rights within Jönköping and Piteå and their role as local government. Because of this, the thesis may contribute to a better understanding of what human rights can imply on a local level, given that it can be very different depending on a city's context. The thesis contributes to a better understanding of local governments concerning human rights, granted that it is an under-researched area. The thesis also adds to a better understanding of how cities approach human rights since several approaches exist. Although the studies from Emerga Institute and RWI are very thorough, they do not provide specific information about how certain municipalities work with human rights. Consequentially, the thesis fills this research gap because it provides data about how two specific municipalities approach and understand human rights. To summarise, the thesis adds essential data to the research field concerning human rights on a local level because it contributes to a further understanding of human rights on a local level, particularly in Sweden, by studying Piteå and Jönköping.

3. Theoretical framework

The FRA-framework is used as a methodological tool to identify how the municipalities work with human rights. However, in order to answer one of the thesis' research questions, the framework is also applied as a theoretical approach throughout the analysis to investigate how the municipalities' work with human rights corresponds to the FRAframework. Though, the framework does not provide in-depth answers to how the municipalities perceive human rights within their local context. It lacks this ability because it only states different ways a city can work with human rights.⁴⁷ I need an approach that can help me identify which human rights are implicated when the municipalities approach human rights and what it truly entails to work with human rights locally. The aspect of the right to the city and the human rights city narrative is therefore applied. These perspectives are applied to investigate the municipalities' approaches to human rights on a deeper level than what the FRA-framework can do to fulfil the thesis' purpose. Notably, the purpose of these perspectives is to frame, discuss and interpret the municipalities' work and approaches towards human rights. These perspectives are applied continuously in the analysis to discuss and frame the data from the interviews. The sections below describe the FRA-framework, the right to the city and its relation and differences to the human rights city narrative.

3.1 The FRA framework

The thesis' content analysis is based on a draft of a framework for human rights cities, which the European Union Agency for Fundamental (FRA) rights has constructed. The framework is currently named *Framework for human rights cities*. ⁴⁸ However, the thesis refers to it as the *FRA-framework*. The FRA-framework is applied as a methodological tool to detect how the municipalites work with human rights since it suggests several ways in which cities can organise their human rights work. It would have been a challenge to identify this without the FRA-framework, granted the many approaches that exist of

⁴⁷ European Union Agency for Fundamental Rights, *Towards a framework of commitments for European human rights cities*, <u>available here</u> 2020 (accessed 30 January 2021)

⁴⁸ Email contact with European Union Agency for Fundamental Rights, November 2020

working with human rights.⁴⁹ The FRA-framework is also applied continuously in the analysis as a theoretical lens to investigate how the municipalities' work with human rights correspond to the frameworks' different categories stated below. For this reason, the FRA-framework is not only a methodological tool to detect the Piteå's and Jönköping's human rights work. It is also applied as a theoretical lens to investigate and highlight how the municipalities' human rights work relate to the different categories stated in the FRA-framework. Altogether, the FRA-framework is essential because it provides an answer to one of the thesis' research questions.⁵⁰

The FRA-framework cannot be found online because it is not finalised yet, which is a limitation with reliability and validity in mind. ⁵¹ I got access to the framework through my time as an intern at Emerga Institute, an independent research institute with expertise in human rights. ⁵² Elisabeth Abiri is a senior advisor at Emerga Institute. Abiri also acts as an expert in a network at FRA for human rights cities. Abir's position enabled me the chance to use the framework. I have been in contact with the group at FRA who is currently developing the FRA framework. They gave me permission to use the framework as long as I made clear that it currently is a draft.

The FRA-framework is transformed to fit the thesis better. This is done through a coding measure named hypothesis coding, explained in detail in the next chapter. The FRA-framework is re-constructed because some categories are very similar, and others are viewed as unnecessary. For instance, one category states that a city should follow up on different right reviews that the United Nations conduct. This category is very similar to the category that suggests that a city should report yearly on human rights. Therefore, these categories are made into one category, stating that municipalities should report yearly on the situation concerning human rights to the Municipal Council. Another category states that a city should collaborate with authorities, business, universities, civil

-

⁴⁹ K. Gomes da Silva, 2018, P.298

⁵⁰ European Union Agency for Fundamental Rights, *Towards a framework of commitments for European human rights cities*, <u>available here</u> 2020 (accessed 30 January 2021)

⁵¹ J. Morse, M. Barrett, M. Mayan, K. Olson, J. Spiers, 'Verification Strategies for Establishing Reliability and Validity in Qualitative Research' *International Journal of Qualitative Methods*, 2002, P.13

⁵² Emerga Institute, *Om oss*, <u>available here</u> (accessed 06 May 2021)

society, etc, which is comparable to a category that underlines that cities should exchange experiences with other municipalities. Therefore, these categories are made into one category. Yet, another category states that all human rights shall be in focus. This is now incorporated into the category, which states that human rights shall permeate all city areas. There are some categories about transparency and how a city uses the concept of rights-holder and duty-bearer. These are deleted as not within the scope of the thesis.

Changing an already existing concept or data, namely the FRA-framework, reflects the measure of incremental theorizing.⁵³ Isabelle Walsh underlines in her article *Using quantitative data in mixed-design grounded theory studies: an enhanced path to formal grounded theory in information system* that incremental theorizing can help a research field grow. The thesis might therefore impact some changes of the FRA-framework.⁵⁴

The categories stated below are the ones that are used both as a methodological tool and as a theoretical approach. To mention, the FRA-framework has also been applied to create the interview guide. Likewise, the analysis' structure is also based on the categories below. The following categories can be found in the FRA-framework:

1. Established units, commitments and responsibility

- a. International treaties, United States' treaties and covenants, European
 Convention, EU's Charter of Fundamental Rights, Agenda 2030
- b. The City Council and the Municipal Board clarify their commitments and their responsibility for the human rights of the residents through a formal decision and/or a signed declaration.
- c. Clear responsibility, clear division of responsibilities, highlights the responsibility for the human rights of all residents and the effects of different priorities this includes procurement.

⁵³ European Union Agency for Fundamental Rights, *Towards a framework of commitments for European human rights cities*, available here, 2020 (accessed 30 January 2021)

⁵⁴ I. Walsh, 'Using quantitative data in mixed-design grounded theory studies: an enhanced path to formal grounded theory in information system 'European Journal of Information Systems, 2015, P.533

- d. The municipal administration has a human rights office that can help coordinate the work with human rights in all municipal activities and promote a human rights culture
- e. There is an updated action plan on how to strengthen human rights for all different residents.
- f. The municipality's capacity to work on the basis of rights is strengthened by further training of staff (and politicians) on human rights and on the situation of specific target groups

2. Processes - policies, initiatives and activities

- a. All human rights are in focus and permeate all policy areas and processes in the administration which ensures that human rights do not become an issue that is only dealt with/owned by a certain department.
- b. Annual reporting and follow-up on the human rights situation to the Municipal Council (commitments, initiatives, results, etc.)
- c. The impact of various initiatives and measures on human rights is evaluated.
- d. Residents are an active part of the administrations' planning, investigations, evaluations and audits. All this is done on the basis of degraded data and indicators; and b) inclusion and participation through various consultations, civil society and those responsible.
- e. The municipality has established relationships with various residents' councils/advisory groups for cooperation and communication on human rights in general or with a focus on different groups of rights holders, for example people with disabilities/Roma people, or areas of rights such as "the right to the best possible physical and mental health" or "the right to an education that develops the full potential of the individual"
- f. Cooperation and exchange of experience (internationally and nationally) with other municipalities, organizations, representative institutions, gender equality bodies, universities, companies, civil society, the media, etc. to further strengthen the human rights of citizens.

3.2 The right to the city and the human rights city narrative compared

The People's Movement for Human Rights Education (PDHRE) launched, as described earlier, the human rights city concept in 1997.⁵⁵ However, the human rights city concept has its background in the notion of "right to the city," which was declared by Henri Lefebvre in *le Droit à la Ville* 1968. ⁵⁶

Henri Lefebvre's introduced the notion of the right to the city as a reaction towards capitalism. It was a critique towards capitalism because Lefebvre sees the city as a place where the residents are captured, unable to impact their land due to capitalistic production and processes. Consequentially, Lefebvre views the city as a place that marginalises people instead of bringing justice. ⁵⁷ To break away from the capitalistic sphere, Lefebvre suggests a new contract of citizenship. It includes a set of rights such as self-management, self-determination and the right to the city. ⁵⁸ To acquire these rights, individuals need to participate in a political struggle to reclaim power from the state. Lefebvre views rights as a political struggle. In this way, people will realise their autogestion and break away from the capitalistic sphere. Therefore, autogestion and participation are core rights of Lefebvre's contract. Lefebvre underlines that individuals will start to realise their ability to self-management as a consequence of the political struggle. ⁵⁹ Eventually, this will make the state unnecessary because the residents will have reclaimed the power. Lefebvre sees this process as a democratic deepening. ⁶⁰

Lefebvre points out that when the citizens participate in the political struggle, they break away from the city's capitalistic sphere and head towards the "urban." The urban is a

⁵⁵ People's Movement for Human Rights Learning, PDHRE International office and the three regional PDHRE offices in Latin America, West Africa and Anglo Africa, *Human Rights Learning and Human Rights Cities. Achievement Report*, 2007, P.9

⁵⁶ B. Oomen and M. Baumgartel, 2018, P.615

⁵⁷ M. Purcell, 'Possible Worlds: Henri Lefebvre and the right to the city' C. Silver, R. Freestone, C. Demazière (eds) *Dialogues in Urban and Regional Planning – The right to the city,* New York, Routledge, 2018, P.35 – 36

⁵⁸ M. Purcell, 2018 P.36 – 37

⁵⁹ Ibid 39 and P.43

 $^{^{60}}$ Ibid P.38 – 39

sphere, where the residents can claim the space and make it into their own.⁶¹ In summary, the right to the city, according to Lefebvre, is the right to self-autogestion. Effectively it implies taking part in the city's processes and forming the city into what it could become through political awakening.⁶²

The right to the city is debated because it is not clear what kind of rights it constitutes. For instance, David Harvey's idea of the right to the city mirrors Lefebrve's notion to reclaim power from the state and make it ones own.⁶³ In comparison, Kaufi A. Attoh, states in his article *What kind of right is the right to the city* that the right to the city can constitute the right to housing, work and food, and at the same time, the right to state interference.⁶⁴ Attoh understands Lefebvre's notion of the right to the city as a set of rights.⁶⁵ Peter Marcuse states similarly in his article *whose right(s) to what city?* that the right to the city is a legal and political claim to a set of rights to benefit from all the aspects that urban life can offer. Marcuse sees the right to the city as a unitarity right to multiple, complex rights that are incorporated into each other.⁶⁶ These statements reflect the World Charter for the right to the city. It states the right to the city is an interdependent right that includes all political, economic, social, and environmental rights stated in international human rights treaties.⁶⁷

Scholars within the discourse of human rights cities perceive that Lefevbre had an essential impact on human rights cities. ⁶⁸ Taking the previous paragraphs into account, it becomes evident that the human rights cities narrative and the right to the city discourse are similar. Both narratives localise human rights by recognising and focusing on human rights locally. Both narratives aim to focus on all human rights. The core of both narratives is to require that a city's residents can participate in a city's matter. Another

_

⁶¹ Ibid, P.41 – 42

⁶² Ibid, P.43

⁶³ D. Harvey, *Rebel Cities: from the right to the city to the urban revolution*, London, Verso, 2012, P.2, P.13 and P.15

⁶⁴ K. Attoh, 'What kind of rights is the right to the city' *Progress in Human Geography*, Vol 35, Issue 5, 2011, P.674

⁶⁵ Ibid, P.675

⁶⁶ P. Marcuse,' WHOSE RIGHT(S) TO WHAT CITY?' N. Brenner P. Marcuse, M. Mayer, (eds) Cities for People, Not Profit – Critical urban theory and the right to the city, London and New York, Routledge, 2012, P.34 – 35

⁶⁷ World Charter for the Right to the City, Article I, 2005

⁶⁸ M. Davis, 2017, P.42, K. Gomes da Silva 2018, P.294, B. Oomen 2016, P.15

similarity is that both narratives want to ensure justice. In addition, the European Charter for the Safeguarding of Human Rights and the Global Charter-Agenda for Human Rights in the city and Gwangju's Guiding Principles for Human Rights City recognises human rights cities. These documents echo the right to the city because they underline the importance of human rights on a local level.⁶⁹

Eva Garcia Chueca clarifies the differences between the human rights city narrative and the right to the city discourse in her article *Rights in the city and the right to the city: Two different paradigms confronting urbanisation.* Chueca explains that the human rights city narrative has mostly been popular in the Global North. The right to the city discourse has been popular in the Global South. Chueca explains that human rights city is a place where the local administrative rule by involving the inhabitants. Notably, the local administration has the ruling power over the city, while the residents are complementing the administration. Insomuch, it is the local administration that shall provide the residents with human rights. In comparison, the right to the city narrative understands human rights as a battlefield where the citizens should rule the local government. Thus, the right to the city focuses more on how the residents should claim all spheres of the city. In particular, the right to the city should also give voice to those who have been marginalised by the city system. ⁷⁰

The right to the city narrative and the human rights city narrative are suitable approaches for the thesis due to their similarities. The approaches are justifiable to apply because they underline what human rights could imply within a local context since both localise human rights by focusing on human rights within a local context. This makes it possible to use these approaches as tools to identify and interpret how the municipalities frame human rights within their local context. Correspondingly, it becomes possible to identify the implication of human rights in Piteå and Jönköping. Additionally, it is underlined in the analysis when the municipalities' approaches and framings of human rights mirror the human rights city narrative or more the right to the city narrative or both perspectives.

⁶⁹ B. Oomen 2016, P.5, K. Gomes da Silva 2018, P.294, and World Human Rights Cities Forum, Gwangju Deceleration on Human Right City, 16 – 17 May 2011, Gwangju

⁷⁰ E. Chueca, 'Human Rights in the city and the right to the city: Two different paradigms confronting urbanisation' B. Oomen, M. Davis and M. Grigolo, (eds) *Global Urban Justice: The Rise of Human Rights Cities*, Cambridge, Cambridge University Press, 2016, P.119 – 120

Eventually, this creates more nuances to the analysis. Altogether, this makes the approaches significant because it provides for the thesis' purpose.

However, the right to the city narrative is a very ambitious concept because it includes many rights, which can make it hard to grasp. This can further endanger what the perspective constitutes. Attoh points this out in his article, and so does Mark Purcell in his article, *Possible Worlds: Henri Lefebvre and the right to the city*. This is something to be aware of while analysing the data from the interviews. On the other hand, this can be an opportunity to contribute further to the significance of the right to the city narrative, granted that it is not entirely clear what it implies. Such a procedure mirrors the aspects of incremental theorising. Limitations are also included in the human rights city narrative given the many differences and nuances of what a human rights city can look like in practice, which eventually also can make one question what the concept constitutes.

⁷¹ M. Purcell 2018, P.34 – 35 and K. Attoh, 2011, P.669

⁷² I. Walsh, 2015, P.533

⁷³ B. Oomen, 2016 P.7, M. Davis 'Design Challenges for Human Rights Cities' *Colombia Human Rights Law Review*, Vol 49, Issue 1, 2017, P.38 and P.63

4. Material and methodological

This section describes the choice of material and methodological approach. I take part of various documents from the municipalities and conduct interviews to fulfil the thesis' purpose. The different documents' content is described first. The methodological approach of interviews is thereafter explained, followed by the scope of data. Thereupon, the choice of municipalities and interviewees and the processing of the data is explained.

4.1 Documents from the municipalities

The policy documents describe how the municipalities work with human rights. The documents are applied to get as in-depth information as possible about Jönköping and Piteå. The documents are also included because most of the interviewees refer to them. The interviewees referred to the different documents when they described how the municipalities frame human rights and how human rights permeate the municipalities.⁷⁴

Mildred Patten and Michelle Newhart explain the connection between reliability and validity, including a material's relevance for a study in *Understanding Research Methods*. Patten and Newhart underline that it is essential that the material for a study is relevant for a study's purpose. Patten and Newhart explain that a study's material has suitable validity and reliability if it contributes to a study purpose and research questions. It is argued that the documents have a suitable degree of validity and reliability because several of the interviewees refer to the documents. Consequentially, the thesis would be struggling to answer the thesis's research questions in-depth without the documents, which again makes the documents suitable, taking reliability and validity into account. However, the documents do not provide information about how employees within the municipalities perceive human rights or the role as a duty bearer or what challenges they meet when working with human rights. Because of this, interviews are also conducted.

⁷⁴ Please see the analysis section for more information

⁷⁵ L. Patten Mildred, M. Newhart, *Understanding Research Methods*, Tenth Edition, Routledge, New York, 2018, P.123 – 125

⁷⁶ Ibid, P.136 - 137

4.1.1 Common values and governing principles of human rights in Jönköping municipality

This document clarifies the duties that Jönköping has towards its inhabitants by following international human rights treaties and national laws. The document explains that employees of Jönköping shall apply the principles of a rights-based approach (RBA). Notably, the principles of equality, non-discrimination, participation, inclusion, responsibility, transparency and accountability to protect, respect and promote human rights.⁷⁷

4.1.2 Jönköping, Municipal program 2019 – 2022

This program describes the overreaching goals that Jönköping wants to achieve from 2019 to 2021. For example, Jönköping states that it should protect and promote democracy. It states that Jönköping shall combat social injustice. The program states that human rights and social sustainability are prioritized areas.⁷⁸

4.1.3 Jönköping, Methodological tools for social sustainability and

human rights

This document is a tool that describes how different employees can apply the principles of the RBA. For example, it highlights how one can involve residents in different procedures and take groups into account in decision-making. ⁷⁹

4.1.4 Jönköping, mapping of existing human rights competencies of staff and review of key policy documents with regard to human rights

⁷⁹ Jönköping kommun, Metodstöd för social hållbarhet och mänskliga rättigheter

⁷⁷ Jönköping kommun, Gemensam värdegrund och styrande principer för mänskliga rättigheter, 04 October 2018,

⁷⁸ Jönköping kommun, Kommunprogram för mandatperioden 2019 – 2022, 2019

One document maps different case officers' expertise of human rights. The other document maps human rights incorporation to different guiding policy documents. The documents are from 2012.⁸⁰

4.1.5 Piteå, Guidelines for human rights and diversity

These guidelines clarify Piteå's goals for how to approach human rights. The documents also describe Piteå defines human rights. ⁸¹

4.1.6 Piteå, Instructions for following up Guidelines for human rights – diversity

These guidelines clarify how Piteå shall follow up on human rights in its ordinary control and management systems. The document explains that each department within the municipality shall report its results concerning human rights based on its role as a social, democracy, and welfare actor and employer to the Municipal Board.⁸²

4.1.7 Piteå, Action Plan, a Piteå for everyone – with increased diversity

This action plan explains that Piteå establishes its human rights work on the concept of diversity. The goal of working with the concept of diversity started in 2014. Piteå's definition for diversity is a *Piteå for everyone*. ⁸³

4.1.8 Piteå, Budget plan 2021 and Operational Plan 2021 - 2023 City Council decision

This document describes Piteå's main goals and ambitions for 2021 – 2023. For example, Piteå's main goals are to give children a safe environment and create an economically,

82 Piteå kommun, Anvisning för uppföljning av Riktlinjer för mänskliga rättigheter – mångfald, 09 October 2019

⁸⁰ Jönköping kommun, kartläggning av befintlig kompetens hos personal avseende mänskliga rättigheter, 2012, and Jönköping kommun, Översyn av centrala styrdokument med hänsyn till centrala styrdokument, 2012

⁸¹ Piteå kommun, Riktlinjer för mänskliga rättigheter – mångfald 29 April 2019

⁸³ Piteå kommun, Handlingsplan för ett Piteå för all – med ökad mångfald, 06 February 2014

socially and environmentally sustainable and accessible city. The budgets also present how the different departments have prioritized areas concerning human right.⁸⁴

4.1.9 Piteå, guidance for human rights analysis

This document is a tool that describes how the principles of equality, non-discrimination, inclusion, participation, transparency and responsibility can be applied within Piteå's activities and operation. This is to make sure different groups rights are taken into account and to make sure that different groups are involved in different matters. ⁸⁵

4.1.10 Websites from the municipalities

Except for the mentioned documents above, I will also be using some websites to describe the municipalities' human rights work.

4.2 Interviews as a methodological approach

Interviews as a methodological tool are applied in the thesis because it enables the possibility to acquire information that otherwise would have been challenging to find. For instance, interviews can enable the possibility to acquire information about how the employees within the municipalites frame human rights, duties, specific challenges, and how employees specifically approach human rights. Therefore, interviews are justified as a methodological choice to get in-depth and as complex data as possible about Piteå and Jönköping to fulfil the thesis' research questions. ⁸⁶

Semi-structured interviews are applied in the thesis.⁸⁷ Interviews can be more or less structured depending on the questions in the interview guide.⁸⁸ Semi-structured interviews aim to both have control over the interview and simultaneously enable the opportunity for the interviewee to speak freely without the conversation stirring away

⁸⁴ Piteå kommun, Verksamhetsplan 2021 – 2023, Årsbudget 2021, Kommunfullmäktigesbeslut

⁸⁵ Piteå kommun, Vägledning för rättighetsanalys, 10 October 2016

⁸⁶ M. Dalen, Intervju som metod, Oslo, Gleerups, 2004 P.14

⁸⁷ Ibid, P.35

⁸⁸ A. Lantz, *Interviumetodik*, Lund, Studentlitteratur, 1993, P.52 and P.68 – 69

from the main topics of the interview guide. Therefore, a semi-structured interview enables the interviewee to add information that is not necessarily connected to the questions asked. Likewise, a semi-structured interview allows the interviewer to ask follow-up questions. ⁸⁹ Since a semi-structured interview is a bit freer, it might imply that the order of the questions asked and the order of the questions may change depending on what the interviewee chose to talk about. Although this, one should still make sure that the main themes of the interview guide are covered. ⁹⁰ All things considered, semi-structured interviews are argued to be a justifiable methodological. ⁹¹

Questions must be established beforehand to succeed with a semi-structured interview. It is important that the interview guide is established to cover essential parts of a study's purpose. 92 The interview guide is based on the categories of the FRA-framework because it helps to detect how the municipalities work with human rights. It is suitable to base the interview guide on the FRA-framework because it contributes to a part of the thesis' goal thanks to its ability to identify how the municipalities approach human rights. As described earlier, the FRA-framework cannot investigate how human rights are perceived within Piteå and Jönköping and challenges met when approaching human rights. Because of this, these themes are established to complement the FRA-framework. 93

4.3 Scope of data

It is significant that the collected data for a study fit the expected degree of difficulty. 94 Likewise, the number of informants for interviews cannot be too big because it is time-consuming to collect and process interviews. At the same time, the number of interviewees cannot be too few because one needs to have enough data to analyse. I study two municipalities, Piteå and Jönköping, with four interviewees from each municipality. To study more than two municipalities would be possible. However, it would involve fewer representatives from the municipalities to manage the scope of the thesis, taking

 $^{^{89}}$ M. Dalen 2004, P.34 - 35 and A. Lantz P.57 - 58

⁹⁰ M. Dalen 2004, P.35 – 38 and A. Lantz 1993 P.56

⁹¹ A. Lantz, P.68 – 69

⁹² M. Dalen 2004, P.35 – 37

⁹³ European Union Agency for Fundamental Rights, 2020

⁹⁴ L. Patten Mildred, M. Newhart, 2018, P.136 – 137

limitations of words and time into account. Another risk of studying more than two municipalities could be that the data of how the municipalities approach human rights would not be as rich due to fewer interviews. With these statements in mind, the data collected for the thesis is argued to be suitable to fulfil the thesis' purpose and manage the scope of the thesis. ⁹⁵

4.4 Procedure of selecting municipalities

I was explicitly looking for municipalities that are well-known for their human rights work to take part in the thesis. The reason for this selection is that municipalities that are known for their human rights work will probably give more enriching data compared to a municipality that does not express that they approach human rights. I was also looking for one municipality that is a human rights city and one that is not. The reason for this selection is that the I want to study if there are any specific differences between a human rights city and a city that is known for its human rights work. ⁹⁶

Piteå and Jönköping were selected for the thesis because they are known for their human rights work. These cities were also selected because Piteå is a human rights city, and Jönköping is not. Jönköping is known for its work concerning human rights because they were nominated the *Access city price* by the European Commission in 2021 for being the most accessible city for people with disabilities within the EU. ⁹⁷ Furthermore, Jönköping was also nominated by The Raoul Wallenberg Academy for being the most humane municipality in Sweden in 2019. The aim of the prize is to encourage and inspire municipalities to continue with activities characterised by human rights through protection and promotion. Jönköping was nominated because of their appliance of a human rights-based approach within their different activities. ⁹⁸ Piteå is known for its human rights work because they have worked with the concept of diversity since 2014 within the municipality's control and management system, which eventually led them to

-

⁹⁵ M. Dalen 2004, P.58

⁹⁶ A. Ryén, Kvalitativ intervju – från vetenskapsteori till fältstudier, Liber AB, Malmö, 2004, P. 71 and P 73

⁹⁷ Europeiska Kommissionen, *Delaktighet: Jönköping vinner Access City priset 202*, 1 December 2020 available here (acsessed 28 April 2021)

⁹⁸ Jönköpings kommun, *Jönköpingsposten*, 'Jönköping prisas i Raoul Wallenbergs namn' 21 August 2019, available here (acsessed 28 April 2021)

announce itself as a human rights city in October 2020. 99 Invitations were sent through email to Piteå's and Jönköping's contact centres, asking if they would like to participate in this thesis - and they accepted.

4.5 The procedure of selecting interviewees

It is essential to select interviewees that one believes can contribute to one's study. As a result, I targeted to interview a case officer who works with human rights, a department manager responsible for the human rights work, a manager at the "human rights office" and a politician in each municipality. These actors were identified for presumably having the best possessed knowledge to fulfil the thesis' research questions because they know the municipalities' human rights work and have insights into the municipalities' operational level. The aim of interviewing individuals who work with human rights but have different positions is to get different perspectives from different levels concerning the human rights work. The wishes to interview these individuals were stated in the invitations.

After I had sent the invitations to Jönköping and Piteå, the municipalities' contact centres forwarded the invitation to persons suitable for the thesis. ¹⁰¹ I was thereafter contacted by two different case officers, one from Piteå and one from Jönköping, who stated which persons that would like to take part in an interview. The interviewees' job title is described below. ¹⁰² Each interviewee gets a fictitious name to make the analysis easier to read and to deidentify the interviewees.

The following persons from Piteå participate in the thesis:

- Democratisation developer "Pia"
- Manager of the Municipal District Administration "Oscar"
- Politician "Emily"

The following persons from Jönköping participate in the thesis:

• Case officer at the human rights office - "Jessica"

25

⁹⁹ Piteå kommun, Piteå, MR-kommun 2021, available here (accessed 06 May 2021)

¹⁰⁰ A. Ryén, 2004, P.78

¹⁰¹ M. Dalen 2004, P.60 – 61

¹⁰² Ibid

- Manager at the human rights office "Hanna"
- Politician "Olivia"

After I had collected six interviews, I did not receive in-depth information about how a particular department works with human rights but rather answers on how the municipalities work with human rights as a whole. ¹⁰³ I decided to contact the department of culture and leisure in each municipality because I wanted deeper insight into how a specific department of the municipalities approaches human rights. I chose to contact the department of culture and leisure because they meet a great variety of people daily because of their broad activities from libraries, sports and language cafes. Therefore, two additional interviews were collected with two managers from the municipalities' culture and leisure departments, which have the following fictitious names:

- "Sara" from Piteå
- "Peter" from Jönköping

4.6 The collection of interviews and ethical

considerations

The contact with the interviewees has taken place through email. The interviews have taken place digitally through the platform zoom because a physical meeting has been impossible due to the current pandemic. I chose Zoom as a platform because it is an accessible platform that the university offers without any cost. Zoom also makes it possible for video conversation, enabling the opportunity to see body language and face gestures. This can be essential to observe during an interview, in case someone gets uncomfortable, for instance. ¹⁰⁴ Significant to note is that the interviews were carried out in Swedish, but the language of the thesis is English. Because of this, the citations made in the analysis are in English. I have translated the citations and the interview guide myself. In this way, I have managed to deal with the scope of the thesis because it could have been a time-consuming process to send the transcript to translations.

_

¹⁰³ M. Dalen 2004, P.64

¹⁰⁴ M. Dalen, 2004, P.20 – 21

The interview guides were sent to each interviewee a week before the scheduled interview. There are certain ethical research principles that one needs to take into account when one is doing interviews. These principles state that the person who takes part in a study needs to agree to its terms. The principles state that the interviewee shall be informed about the aims of the study. Lastly, the principles also require that the interviewee is informed about how his or her personal data is handled. Because of this, I informed the interviewees about the thesis' purpose upon the scheduled meeting for the interview. Before I started with the interview questions, I consulted with the interviewees whether there were any questions or unclarities. I also informed the interviewees about the de-identification before I started with the interview. Namely, I explained that their profession would be revealed and that they would get fictitious names. ¹⁰⁵ The interviews were recorded after the interviewees gave me their permission. 106 The persons who are interviewed did this in their role as an employee for the municipalities of Jönköping and Piteå. Given this, there was nothing emotional or personal concerning the interviews. For instance, it would have been much more sensitive to interview children or people with experiences of sexual abuse. 107

4.7 Process of organising data

Each of the interviews has been transcribed in the program called *transcribe*. The interviews' data is coded with the methodological tool of content analysis, but with different coding measures applied. Johnny Saldana underlines in his book *The Coding Manual for Qualitative researchers* that one does not need to use one specific coding method. On the contrary, one can use different coding measures as long as one can follow the researchers' proceedings. ¹⁰⁸ I apply both inductive and deductive coding measures. Vicki L.Plano Clack and Nataliya V. Ivankova underline in their article *Mixed Methods Research – A guide to the field* that the advantage of mixing different methodological approaches is that one method might not be enough to address a study's purpose. However, a combination of two methods can facilitate such an opportunity, resulting in a

¹⁰⁵ M. Dalen 2004, P.25 – 27

 $^{^{106}}$ Ibid, P.37 – 38

¹⁰⁷ A. Ryén, P. 156 – 159

¹⁰⁸ J. Saldana, *The Coding Manual for Qualitative Researchers*, Second Edition, Sage Publications Ltd, London, 2013, P.61

better understanding of the research problem. ¹⁰⁹ Therefore, deductive and inductive coding measures are addressed because it would not have been possible to fulfil the thesis' research questions without different coding approaches. Notably, different coding measures are essential to both investigate how the municipalities work with human rights and what human rights imply on a local level for Piteå and Jönköping.

A part of the thesis' content analysis is based on the FRA-framework. The thesis, therefore, has a deductive approach because the interviews and documents are linked to pre-established categories. Namely, the categories stated earlier in the section about the FRA-framework. The procedure of having a pre-determined list of categories before any data has been collected or analysed reflects the essence of *hypothesis coding*. This coding procedure is implied because it enables from a methodological point of view to study how the municipalities' work with human rights. This procedure is also applied because it enables to see how the municipalities human right work corresponds to the categories in the FRA-framework from a theoretical point of view.¹¹⁰

Secondly, I use a coding measure that Saldana calls *structured coding*. In essence, this coding measure implies that the coding is based on an interview guide which in turn is created to fulfil the study's purpose. ¹¹¹ This coding measure is applied since the interview guide is also based on how the municipalities frame human rights within their local context and what challenges met when working with human rights.

I also apply *descriptive coding*, which means that one creates categories based on different patterns found in the data from the interviews. Because of this, the thesis also has an inductive approach because categories are also established after the interviews have been analysed. This coding approach is applied because it enables seeing other patterns, which cannot be connected to the FRA-framework. Specifically, descriptive coding is also applied because it enables the opportunity to analyse the interviews from

 109 V. Planko Clark, N. Ivankova, Mixed Methods Research – A guide to the field, Los Angeles, SAGE Publications, 2016, P.5 – 6

¹¹⁰ The Coding Manual for Qualitative Researchers, third Edition, Sage Publications Ltd, London, 2016, P.62 – 63 and P.76 – 77

¹¹¹ J. Saldana, 2016, P.98 – 100

the aspects of the right to the city and the human rights city narrative. ¹¹² For this reason, the interviews and the documents are not linked to pre-established categories based on the theoretical approaches because that would imply a hypothesis coding. On the contrary, the theoretical approaches are applied to interpret, frame and discuss the data from the documents and the interviews. With this in mind, the measure of descriptive coding has two purposes. One is to enable the possibility to create categories that do not fit the FRA-framework and, secondly interpret and frame the interviews and the documents from the human rights city narrative and the right to the city discourse.

4.8 Critique and limitations

The article *Verification Strategies for Establishing Reliability and Validity in Qualitative Research* by the International Institute for Qualitative Methodology at the University of Alberta state that there are several techniques a researcher can use to check one's reliability and validity. The article highlights that a sufficient way to keep a high standard of validity and reliability in one's study is to go back and forth between design implementation, data, and analysis to ensure that these parts are in sync with each other. This measure is called verification strategies and helps the researcher to note when to stop, go back, or modify the research to achieve a suitable degree of reliability and validity. This strategy is applied continuously throughout as the thesis progresses. With this, I am constantly making sure that the literature, research design, and analysis are in sync with each other. In essence, this should have contributed to limit the critique towards the thesis.

As mentioned, I have identified persons who I believe possess the most knowledge for the thesis' purpose. However, there might have been other individuals who might have possessed more knowledge about the municipalities' human rights work. But then again, the persons who are interviewed are the ones leading and operating the municipalities work concerning human rights. In addition, one could also argue that I should have interviewed 10-16 people to be able to state more in-depth how the municipalities work

¹¹² J. Saldana, 2016 P.102 – 104

¹¹³ J. Morse, M. Barrett, M. Mayan, K. Olson, J. Spiers, 2002, P.13 – 15

¹¹⁴ Ibid. P.17–19

with human rights, which on the one hand, might be true. But then again, I do not believe that more interviews would have made a significant difference because I believe that I have reached a level of theoretical saturation. Meaning that more interviews would not add new data but only confirm the current data. ¹¹⁵ I have noticed this because several of the answers that I got to my questions are similar to each other, which is evident in the analysis.

Another critique is that the invitation to Piteå and Jönköping states that the municipalities' participation is anonymous. However, after the invitation was sent to the municipalities, I soon realised that I would use documents and links that easily could reveal the municipalities' participation. I decided to highlight this dilemma with the interviewees. All of the interviewees did not see any problems with the municipalities' identity being revealed.

To deal with the scope of the thesis, I decided to take away data that initially was supposed to be included in the thesis. The interview guide includes a question concerning how Piteå and Jönköping use and apply the concepts of human rights to spread and communicate their human rights work. Namely, question 12 of the interview guide. I have decided to take data away concerning this question. I decided to delete this particular data because it would not have brought any new nuances to the analysis since there is a limit to how extensive the thesis can be. By all means, it would have been interesting to include the data concerning how the municipalities communicate their human rights work. Yet, since there is a part of the analysis investigating how the municipalities frame human rights, one can argue that this part compensates for the data that is being deleted 116

In addition, the idea to study how municipalities work with human rights developed during my time as an intern at Emerga Institute. Emerga Institute works partly with supporting municipalities in their work with human rights and I also worked with this during my time as an intern. Likewise, it would not have been possible for me to have

¹¹⁵ J. Cresswell, J. Cresswell, *Research Design, Qualitative, Quantitative, and Mixed Methods Approaches*, Thousands Oaks California, SAGE Publications, P.381

¹¹⁶ L. Patten Mildred, M. Newhart, P.136 – 137 and M. Dalen 2004, P.58

been able to use FRA-framework without Elisabeth Abiri's role in the network at FRA for human rights cities.

5. Findings and analysis

This chapter presents and discusses the data from the interviews. The analysis starts with presenting how the initiative to work with human rights began for the municipalities. Thereupon, the analysis presents how the interviewees frame human rights. The next section explains how the municipalities have stated their commitment and responsibilities towards international human rights documents, including how the interviewees perceive the municipalities' role as duty bearers. Thereupon, the analysis explains how human rights permeate the municipalities by the municipalities' different approaches toward human rights. Lastly, the analysis describes briefly how the municipalities approach Agenda 2030 and include residents in different procedures. As described earlier, the aspects of the right to the city, and the human rights city narrative are applied continuously throughout the analysis to interpret and discuss the data from the interviews. The FRA-framework is also continuously applied to comprehend how the municipalities work corresponds to the categories within the framework.

To see the names of the interviewees, please see P.25 - 26

5.1 How the initiative to work with human rights started

This section starts by explaining how the initiative to work with human rights started in Piteå, followed by Jönköping.

5.1.2 The start of Piteå's journey towards human rights

Oscar explains that the initiative to work with human rights started when the Municipal Council concluded that if they wanted to secure the same quality and services for its residents, they needed city growth. To achieve that, the Municipal Council started to work with the concept of diversity in 2014. Insomuch, diversity as a goal became a strategy to

attract more people, especially foreign people, to Piteå. ¹¹⁷ Similar patterns are mentioned in the *Action plan, a Piteå for everyone - with increased diversity* which states that diversity can enable ideas for entrepreneurship, migration and cultural growth. ¹¹⁸ Oscar, Pia, and Emily, describe that there was a political unity to work with the goal of diversity even though not all political parties agreed on the idea. ¹¹⁹ For instance, Pia says:

The political majority has always agreed that we should work with these issues. Not all parties in the Municipal Council have thought that we should prioritise and work with these issues, that's how it is. ¹²⁰

When the Municipal Council decided on the overarchinggoal of diversity, they chose to engage the residents to frame the meaning of diversity. The implication boiled down to the following definition, *A Piteå for every* – *with diversity*. It is stated in *Action plan, a Piteå for everyone* - *with increased diversity* that the definition has its approach in a society where every individual gets their rights fulfilled despite gender, socio-economic conditions, ethnicity, religious or sexual identity, age or disability. Since the definition mirrors the concept of human rights, the goal of diversity became based on the declaration of human rights. ¹²¹ Truly, one might believe that a city's initiative to work with human rights is spurred by the simple fact that it is an important issue to approach. However, interesting to note here is how the goal of diversity partly was initiated to enable growth to secure the city's quality and how it later evolved into focusing on human rights.

Piteå was involved in SALAR's developmental project for human rights in 2016 – 2017. Emily states that Piteå's involvement with SALAR can be viewed as an additional push factor to work more with human rights. Emily highlights that Piteå's involvement with SALAR gave birth to the idea to announce Piteå as a human rights city. Piteå announced itself as a human rights city in October 2020. Oscar, Emily and Pia state that most of the politicians of the Municipal Council were united to make Piteå into a human

121 Piteå kommun, 2014

33

-

¹¹⁷ Oscar, 'Manager of the Municipal District Administration in Piteå', (interviewed by Nanna Malmborg Rasmussen) 23 March 2021, Lund

¹¹⁸ Piteå kommun, Handlingsplan för ett Piteå för all – med ökad mångfald, 06 Febuary 2014

¹¹⁹ Ibid, Pia 'Democratisation developer in Piteå' (interviewed by Nanna Malmborg Rasmussen) 25 March 2021, Lund, Emily, 'Politican in Piteå' (interviewed by Nanna Malmborg Rasmussen) 18 March 2021, Lund, Oscar interview 2021

¹²⁰ Pia, interview, 2021

¹²² Emily, interview, 2021

rights city, but it was also a way to show the rest of the world that Piteå is at the forefront concerning issues of human rights. 123 More explicitly Emily underlines:

It was a political will, of course, to work with these issues. A lot is about what you see in the world. We should have worked with our citizens on what we mean by diversity and what the people of Piteå think about diversity. 124

In essence, the to make Piteå into a human rights city was spurred by a political unity and thanks to Piteå's involvement with SALAR.

5.1.3 The start of Jönköping's journey towards human rights

Jönköping's initiative to work with human rights started in 2012. The Delegation for human rights spurred the initiative because they stated in a government official from 2010 that human rights can be strengthened if they are incorporated into municipalities' guiding policy documents. Therefore, the Municipal Board decided that the Official Office would investigate different officers' knowledge about human rights, the incorporation of human rights in different policy documents, establish a network for human rights. Hanna explains:

Actually we stared the journey already in 2012. So we were given a political mandate to see how we can work more under this human rights umbrella. And we mapped out, for example, who works with human rights." ¹²⁶

Hanna explains that these procedures gave human rights more focus within the municipality. Jönköping was also involved in SALAR's development project for human rights 2016 – 2017. Hanna explains the reasons why Jönköping joined SALAR's project:

-

¹²³ Pia, Oscar, Emily, interview 2021

¹²⁴ Emily, interview 2021

¹²⁵ Jönköping kommun, kartläggning av befintlig kompetens hos personal avseende mänskliga rättigheter, 2012, and Jönköping kommun, Översyn av centrala styrdokument med hänsyn till centrala styrdokument, 2012,

¹²⁶ Hanna 'manager at the Human Rights Office in Jönköping' (interviewed by Nanna Malmborg Rasmussen) 16 March 2021

"Well, there was this big survey on request from the government, where they asked, how municipalities work with human rights. And then there were very poor figures. "And then we also joined the development project. It may have been 2016 - 2017 together with SALAR to find out how we could work with this in governance. How we could incorporate human rights into governance" 127

Insomuch, Jönköping joined SALAR's project to strengthen their work with human rights due to poor results. However, it did not emerge during the interview why Jönköping had poor figures. ¹²⁸ Jessica, Hanna and Olivia view this as an additional push factor for Jönköping to approach human rights further. ¹²⁹ Olivia states that there was also a political will to work more with human rights. ¹³⁰ In 2017 Jönköping held the human rights conference, that takes place yearly in different cities in Sweden. According to Jessica, the conference gave human rights even more attention. ¹³¹ To summarise, the Delegation for human rights together with Jönköping's involvement with SALAR, and Jönköping hosting the yearly human rights conference, resulted in that human rights becoming incorporated within Jönköping's operational and governmental structure. Eventually, this led them to where they are today.

5.2 Piteå's and Jönköping's framing of human rights

This part of the analysis describes how Piteå and Jönköping's policy documents concerning human rights frame human rights. This is followed by how the interviewees frame human rights in a local context. In effect, this part of the analysis answer the third research question concerning how the municipalities frame human rights.

¹²⁷ Hanna interview, 2021

¹²⁸ Ibi

¹²⁹ Ibid, Jessica 'case officer at the Human Rights Office in Jönköping' (interviewed by Nanna Malmborg Rasmussen) 22 March 2021, and Olivia, 'politician in Jönköping' (interviewed by Nanna Malmborg Rasmussen) 24 March 2021

¹³⁰ Olivia interview 2021

¹³¹ Jessica interview 2021

5.2.1 Framing of human rights in Piteå's and Jönköping's policy documents

Piteå states in the policy document *Guidelines for human rights – diversity* that Piteå's work with diversity is based on human rights. The guidelines frame human rights the following way:

Piteå municipality's definition of diversity has an approach to a society where all people have their rights and opportunities regardless of gender, level of education and income, social status, ethnicity, religion or other beliefs, sexual orientation, transgender identity or expression, age and disability. ¹³²

Jönköping's policy document *Common values and governance principles of human rights in Jönköping* describes human rights the following way:

Human rights are legal rules that govern what Jönköping Municipality must fulfil and promote concerning all citizens in the municipality. Human rights also regulate what the municipality may not do to its employees and citizens. This means that Jönköping Municipality must respect and protect every person's ability to use their rights and freedoms. 133

Except for these statements, there are no other descriptions of how the municipalities frame human rights in writing. Taking the statements into account, it is evident that Jönköping and Piteå focus on human rights within their local context, which makes them localise human rights. Effectively, this makes them mirror the essence of the human rights city narrative and the right to the city discourse, which is not to focus on human rights on an international or national level but at a local level lated Marcuse, Attoh and Lefebvre explain that the right to the city is not just a moral claim but a legal claim to the right to all human rights stated in international treaties. This narrative is something that the municipalities seem to reflect. Piteå expresses that everyone should have their rights fulfilled regardless of the circumstances. In addition to, Jönköping's statement above, Jönköping states that the municipality has the responsibility to protect, respect every

1 1

¹³² Piteå kommun, *Riktlinjer för mänskliga rättigheter – mångdald* 29th April 2019

¹³³ Jönköping kommun, *Gemensam värdegrund och styrande principer för mänskliga rättigheter*, 4th October 2018,

¹³⁴ B. Oomen, 2016, P.15 – 16 and World Charter for the Right to the City, Article I, 2005

¹³⁵ K. Attoh, 2011, P.674, P. Marcuse, 2012, P.34 – 35, M. Purcell, 2018 P.34 – P. 36

residents' human rights. Because of this, Jönköping and Piteå appear to contextualise human rights as an encompassing concept since they do not specify any human rights but rather appear to focus on all human rights. Altogether, the municipalities appear to mirror the right to the city discourse because they focus on all human rights locally and because they frame human rights as a claim and as a duty to provide for every human right in international treaties. Correspondingly, this answers a part of the thesis' first research question concerning how the municipalities frame human rights, from a written perspective. Albeit, to answer the third research question fully, we need to take the interviewees' framing of human rights into account, which is presented below.

5.2.2. The interviewees' framing of human rights

Pia, Emily, Jessica, and Olivia refer to the policy documents described above when explaining the municipalities' implication of human rights. Therefore, these interviewees share the perception of human rights stated in the documents, which again resembles the narratives of the right to the city. ¹³⁶ Olivia, Peter and Pia, explain that human rights are harmonized into Swedish laws. Thus, these interviewees highlight that municipalities have an important role in ensuring that all human rights are fulfilled. ¹³⁷ For instance, Pia underlines:

You have these rights. We have rights that we should have catered for. And we as a local government have a very big responsibility to make sure that they are respected. 138

This understanding mirrors the right to the city because these interviewees underline the importance of the municipalities to ensure every human right and not a specific human right. Correspondingly, the interviewees localise human rights since they focus on human rights within their local context, as the policy documents. This again makes the

¹³⁸ Pia interview 2021

¹³⁶ Olivia, Pia, Peter, Emily, Jessica, interview 2021

¹³⁷ Pia, Olivia, interview 2021 and Peter 'Manager at the department for culture and leisure in Jönköping' (interviewed by Nanna Malmborg Rasmussen) 20 April 2021

understanding resemble the core of the right to the city and the human rights city narrative. 139

Olivia, Pia, Peter, Sara, Jessica, and Hanna, frame human rights as something that the municipalities practice daily within their different activities and operations. ¹⁴⁰ For instance, Peter underlines:

I think human rights is a basic input to all the work we do. I think it is a starting point in everything we do. Or at least it should be. Or that I at least do. I think that is how we interpreted and elaborated it from our side. 141

These interviewees seem to understand human rights within their local context as an embedded part of a municipality's mission to provide different services. For instance, a municipality should provide infrastructure, education, elderly care, clean water etc. Insomuch, it seems like these interviewees link human rights to the municipalities' different services that they practice every day and that such service is a fulfilment of human rights. For example, Jessica highlights:

I often try to tell those I educate and meet, to be proud that in your job is actually an upholder of human rights. That you see a professional pride. Whatever you are doing, whether it is changing lights on the streets, to increase safety, to being at the elderly care centre feeding someone or whatever it may be, that's human rights. When we provide school. When we do sanitation, safe streets, it is all about rights."¹⁴²

This understanding of human rights is not as easily connected to the narratives of the right to the city nor the human rights city discourse as the previous statements. Although the services that a municipality provides, such as accessible streets, health care, and clean air, fulfil human rights. The core points of both narratives are to participate and impact a

-

 $^{^{139}}$ K. Attoh ,2011, P.674, P. Marcuse, 2012, P.34 - 35, M. Purcell, 2018 P.35 - 3 and World Charter for the Right to the City, Article I, 2005

Olivia, Pia, Peter, Jessica, Hanna, interview 2021 Sara 'Manger at Manager at the department of culture and leisure in Piteå' (interviewed by Nanna Malmborg Rasmussen) 12 April 2021

¹⁴¹ Peter interview 2021

¹⁴² Jessica, interview 2021

city's settings that might influence one. 143 However, this is not mentioned. Neither is the acknowledgement of all rights which is the essence of the right to the city. Consequentially, this understanding does not explicitly mirror the aspects of the right to the city or the human rights city narrative from one point of view. Yet, one can probably imagine that the different services together hopefully provide a full ensure of all human rights in practice as the perspective of the right to the city requests. 144

In comparison to the previous statements Pia, Oscar, Emily, Jessica, Olivia and Peter refer to human rights as a way to treat and meet people. 145 They underline that human rights equalise the right to be met, and treated with respect, worth and dignity. For instance, Olivia highlights:

But of course, it is also about how we treat our citizens in many ways. Who the municipality meet in many different contexts. To treat everyone in a respectful manner. 146

From one point of view, this understanding of human rights resembles a code of conduct since the interviewees seem to frame human rights as a moral guide of how to act towards other individuals. Interestingly Pia, Olivia and Peter acknowledge human rights for everyone and simultaneously frame human rights as a moral compass. This framing is indeed human rights, but it does not mirror the right to the city narrative or the human rights narrative because there is no focus on all human rights locally or an acknowledgement of all human rights.

All of the interviewees signify human rights with every person's equal worth and not being discriminated against. For instance, Oscar highlights:

The equal value of all people is for me. That is the essence. 147

¹⁴³ M. Purcell, 2018, P.41 – 43 and S. Phillipp 2017;p

¹⁴⁴ World Charter for the Right to the City, Article I, 2005

¹⁴⁵ Pia, Oscar, Emily, Jessica Olivia, Peter interview 2021

¹⁴⁶ Olivia interview 2021

¹⁴⁷ Oscar, interview 2021

This understanding is indeed human rights, but the trades of the right to the city is missing since there is no acknowledgement of all rights, nor acknowledgement to the right to participate and impact ones setting.¹⁴⁸

To summarise and answer the third research question, there seems to be a variation in understanding human rights on a local level. Human rights are both understood as something that everyone should be entitled to, as a part of the municipalities' services and as a code of conduct. The interviewees seem to have different understandings of human rights simultaneously, given that Peter, Pia and Olivia agreed on four implications of human rights. However, all of the interviewees link human rights to everyone's equal worth. Altogether, some of the understandings correspond to the right to the city narrative while others do not, such as the understanding of human rights as a code of conduct.

5.3 The municipalities units, commitments to human rights and their role as a duty bearer

This part of the analysis starts by explaining Piteå's commitments to human rights and established units for human rights. This is followed by how Jönköping states their commitments to human rights and established units for human rights. Thereupon, the interviewees' framing of the municipality's duty towards human rights is discussed. This section is based on the categories 1.A, 1B, 1C, 1D, 1E, 1F of the FRA-framework. Namely, these categories focus on responsibility, commitment, established units, action plan for human rights and education concerning human rights. In effect, this part of the analysis answers the fourth research question concerning how the municipalities state their commitment and responsibilities towards human rights.

5.3.1 Piteå's and Jönköping's written commitment to human rights and units

 $^{^{148}}$ K. Attoh 2011, P.674, P. Marcuse, 2012, P.34 - 35, M. Purcell 2018 P.35 - 36

Piteå's policy document *Guidelines for human rights* – *diversity* states that national and international treaties concerning human rights, including Agenda 2030, are incorporated in the municipality's general control and management systems. ¹⁴⁹ Piteå's *Business plan* 2021–2023 Annual budget 2021 Municipal Council decision states that Piteå has taken on the responsibility to approach human rights by signing, *Guidelines for human rights* – *diversity*. ¹⁵⁰ With this in mind, one can conclude that Piteå fulfils category 1A and 1B of the FRA-framework that requires a stated commitment to international human rights documents by signing a document.

Piteå's *guidelines for human rights* – *diversity* underlines that the municipal board has a particular role in operating and developing Piteå's approaches to human rights. The guidelines emphasise that the Municipal District Administration is responsible for coordinating, developing and following up on all human rights work. Granted this, the Municipal Administration can be seen as Piteå's human rights office. Consequentially, Piteå fulfils category 1D of the FRA-framework, which suggests that municipality should have human rights office. The guidelines add that the committees of the different municipality departments are outmost responsible for ensuring that human rights are implemented within their departments. Yet, it highlights that the head managers within the stirring groups of the municipality's departments are responsible for ensuring that human rights are integrated into the departments' operations. ¹⁵¹

Piteå's *Instructions for monitoring Guidelines for Human Rights – Diversity* explains that Piteå has different roles as a duty bearer. The document states that Piteå can have a role as a societal, welfare, democratic actor, and employer when approaching human rights. Piteå as a societal actor has to ensure all public places are accessible, ensure that everyone feels safe, build for a sustainable future, and ensure that every impacted resident is involved in planning and developing projects. Piteå as a democratic actor has to secure democracy and transparency, ensure that information is accessible, ensure that human rights permeate the municipality's structure and culture and that politicians have knowledge about the impact of human rights. Piteå as a welfare actor has to ensure that

¹⁴⁹ Piteå kommun, 2019

¹⁵⁰ Piteå kommun, Verksamhetsplan 2021 – 2023, Årsbudget 2021, Kommunfullmäktigesbeslut,

¹⁵¹ Piteå kommun, 2019

human rights permeate policies and budget by following up and evaluating and implementing the principle of non-discrimination and equality, and they have to secure everyone's need of services and ensure legal certainty. Piteå as an employer has to prevent discrimination and ensure that all employees know how human rights can impact their daily profession. ¹⁵² Insomuch, each department of Piteå must report on their human rights work based on the different roles to the Municipal Council. Interestingly, this approach is retrieved from SALAR's description of how a municipality can act as a duty bearer. ¹⁵³

Taking the different documents into account, the responsibility may seem very clear. However, the stated responsibility does not correspond to the interviewees' perception about Piteå's division of responsibility. This is elaborated further below how Piteå corresponds to 1C of the FRA-framework, which requires a clear division of responsibility. Nonetheless, all of the documents described earlier explain how Piteå approach, perceive and work with human rights. Therefore, these documents can be viewed as action plans for human rights, which therefore makes Piteå fulfil 1E of the FRA-framework, which suggests that municipalities should have an action plan for strengthening human rights.

Jönköping states their commitment to human rights in the document *Common values and governance principles of human rights in Jönköping municipality*. It underlines that Jönköping has a responsibility to work with human rights due to international covenants and treaties that the Swedish government has signed. The document underlines that Jönköping has a responsibility to apply the principles of rights-based approach, equality, non-discrimination, inclusion, participation, transparency and accountability. Jönköping also states its responsibility towards human rights and Agenda 2030 within its mandate program. ¹⁵⁴ Forthwith, Jönköping fulfils category 1A - 1B of the FRA-framework, which suggests that a municipality shall state its commitments to human rights by signing a document. Furthermore, these documents described can be viewed as Jönköpings' action plans for human rights because they state how Jönköping should work with human rights.

¹⁵² Piteå kommun, Anvisning för uppföljning av Riktlinjer för mänskliga rättigheter – mångfald, 09 October 2019

¹⁵³ Sveriges kommuner och regioner, *Mänskliga rättigheter på lokal och regional nivå*, 2019

¹⁵⁴ Jönköping kommun, kommunprogram för mandatperioden 2019 – 2022, 2015, and Jönköping, Kommunprogram 2015 – 2018, 21 April 2015

This makes Jönköping fulfilling category 1E of the FRA-framework, which suggests an action plan for human rights.

The document *Common values and governance principles of human rights in Jönköping municipalit* adds that both the municipality, and the residents have a shared duty to ensure that Jönköping is a place where everyone feels welcome and can thrive. However, it also states that "*The responsibility to respect, protect, fulfil and promote human rights lies with the municipality of Jönköping (duty bearer) towards the municipality's citizens and employees (right holders).*" It seems like the municipality has a specific duty to fulfil human rights overall but that it is a shared duty for both citizens and employees to meet others with respect and dignity. ¹⁵⁵ The responsibility division is not entirely clear, with category 1C of the FRA-framework in mind, which becomes evident with the interviewees' perceptions, which is elaborated below.

Jönköping's official office has a section with four different employees who work more hands-on with human rights. One is human rights strategist, one integration strategist, and two equality strategists. This section supports, guides and educates employees regarding human rights. This section can be equalised to a human rights office, which makes Jönköping correspond to category 1D of the FRA-framework, suggesting that municipalities should have a human rights office.

To answer a part of the fourth research question, the municipalities state their commitments towards human rights in different policy documents, which further make them fulfil certain categories of the FRA-framework. The framing of the role of duty bearer can further be elaborated with the right to the city. Piteå and Jönköpings' policy documents reflect the aspects of the right to the city, as concluded in the previous section since they describe human rights as a duty to provide all human rights that exist and because they localise human rights by focusing on human rights within their local context. Thanks to the focus of human rights locally, they also mirror the aspects of the human

¹⁵⁵ Jönköping kommun, 2018

rights narrative¹⁵⁶ Thanks to Piteå dividing the municipality's duties based on different roles, it becomes clearer what kind of human rights Piteå's role as a duty bearer corresponds to. For instance, one's role as a democratic actor is to ensure transparency, while the societal actor should provide sustainable environments. Likewise, since Jönköping states that employers shall apply the principles of a rights-based approach, it also becomes a bit clearer what kind of duties that the rights correspond to. For example, the principle of transparency shall ensure accessible information, and participation shall ensure one right to impact. Altogether, both of the municipalities' approaches seem to encompass all human rights in practice since both Jönköping and Piteå have a goal to fulfil all rights, as the right to the city requires. Despite this, to answer the second research in-depth, one needs to take the interviewees' understanding of responsibility towards human rights, into account, which is elaborated next.

5.3.2 The interviewees' understanding of the duty towards human rights

Jessica, Peter, Sara, Pia, Oscar, Emily highlight that all employees have a responsibility to approach human rights relating to what they do in their daily profession. For example, Peter underlines:

"Somehow, I think it's a responsibility that the whole municipality carriers. Both as an employee and as an elected representative, I have to see what this means to me, based on my job and my duties, and break it down as part of my task." ¹⁵⁹

It seems like the duties towards human rights is mirrored in an employee's daily profession. However, it also appears like the duty towards human rights differs depending on an employee's professional tasks within the municipality. Markedly, it appears like a

¹⁵⁶ K. Attoh, 2011, P.674 – 675, Oomen 2016, P.5, K. K. Gomes da Silva 2018, P.294, and World Human Rights Cities Forum, Gwangju Deceleration on Human Right City, 16 – 17 May 2011, Gwangju, P. Marcuse 2012, P.34 - 35

¹⁵⁷ K, Attoh 2011, P.674, M.Purcell 2018 P.35 – 36, and World Charter for the Right to the City, Article I 2005

¹⁵⁸ Jessica, Peter, Sara, Pia, Emily, Oscar, interview, 2021

¹⁵⁹ Peter, interview, 2021

teacher has certain duties, while a lifeguard and a construction worker have very different duties towards human rights. To clarify, it seems like different professions have different duties towards human rights depending on their professional tasks. Because of this, different professional tasks will ultimately result in different duties corresponding to human rights. But then again, all employees still carry the shared duty to fulfil human rights but based on their professional tasks. Insomuch, it appears like an employee fulfils the shared duty of human rights as long as they comply with their professional tasks. For instance, Pia highlights:

But otherwise, I think human rights is a shared responsibility. Everything from making sure that our walking and cycling streets are cleared from snow and sand so that people can get around. To, making sure that people in need of support get what they need. To the fact that our procurement unit tries to work based on setting requirements when we make procurements. ¹⁶⁰

Similarly, Hanna underlines that an employee's duties correspond to different human rights depending on how different laws stir one's professional tasks. Explicitly Hanna states:

I would say that here one would have to look at those operations that are regulated by the law. And then they have a special responsibility because towards human rights because it is the legislation that governs them. ¹⁶¹

To understand the shared duty towards human rights as an integrated part of an employee's professional tasks, reflect the understanding that human rights are embedded in the different services that a municipality provides, such as recreation, safety and a healthy environment. It is challenging to link this understanding to the aspects of the right to the city because it is challenging to state how, for instance, a teacher, an engineer, and a nurse assistants' duties correspond to different rights because none of the interviewees or policy documents explains how specific professions' duties correspond to rights. Chiefly, what is again missing in this understanding is a focus on all rights locally for it to mirror the aspects of the right to the city and the human rights city narrative. However, similar to the previous conclusion. One can state that all of the different professions

-

¹⁶⁰ Pia, interview, 2021

¹⁶¹ Hanna, interview, 2021

within the municipalities probably provide for an encompassing fulfilment of human rights, as the aspects of the right to the city require. 162

Pia, Sara, Emily, Peter, Olivia and Hanna highlight that it is essential that all employees know human rights to know what duties apply in their daily profession. They underline that Jönköping and Piteå educate their employees about human rights regularly. 163 Eventually, this makes them correspond to 1F of the FRA-framework, which suggests training in human rights for employees. For instance, Pia emphasises that the Convention on the Rights of the Child has been in focus because it became law 2020:

And I also think that we have worked in 2020, we also worked a lot on the basis of the Convention on the Rights of the Child becoming law. We worked to educate politicians and some staff have attended training courses. 164

Olivia and Sara highlight that it is a shared duty to approach human rights because every employee should meet and treat the municipalities' residents and employees equally, with respect, dignity and not discriminate against anyone. ¹⁶⁵ Olivia highlights:

So that everyone has this responsibility to treat people, correctly, fairly, based on the values we have. Not to treat men and women differently, not to treat people with disabilities differently. 166

This perception of human rights mirrors the perception concluded earlier, namely that human rights is perceived a code of conduct. Consequentially, it becomes hard to link this understanding to the aspects of the right to the city because there is no acknowledgement or focus on all human rights. Although, the understanding is indeed human rights.

Even though most interviewees share the perception that there is a common duty towards human rights, this is not stated in Piteås' various policies concerning human rights. 167 Insomuch, the stated responsibility in Piteås' documents and the interviewees' perceptions

¹⁶⁷ Piteå kommun 2019 and Piteå kommun 2019

¹⁶² P. Marcuse, P-34-36, 2012

¹⁶³ Pia, Sara, Emily, Olivia, Hanna, interview 2021

¹⁶⁴ Pia interview 2021

¹⁶⁵ Sara and Olivia, interview 2021

¹⁶⁶ Olivia, interview 2021

are not according to each other. In effect, there does not seem to be a clear division of responsibility towards human rights within Piteå according to the FRA-framework category 1C, which requires clear division of responsibility towards human rights. On the other hand, Piteå's division of responsibility is very clear given that they divide the duties depending on different roles, which apply to all employees. ¹⁶⁸ Because of this, one can, in contrast, argue that Piteå fulfils category 1C of the FRA-framework.

In comparison to the previous paragraph, Olivia, Jessica, Peter, Emily, Sara, Oscar, and Pia underline that the duty towards human rights is not only shared. They highlight that managers, the Municipal Board, Municipal District Administration and the Official Office have an essential role in ensuring that the employees of the municipalities work with human rights within their operations. Remarkably, the same interviewees that view human rights as a common duty, also perceive that some actors have a bigger duty towards human rights. The Official Office exists in Jönköping, and the Municipal District Administration exist in Piteå, and they have the same functions but different names. Emily states:

Then, of course, we have a Municipal District Administration in, which has a cohesive responsibility for human rights. To push forward, to ensure that there is knowledge out there. If things happen, we want to get the information out and also have a responsibility to follow up and evaluate. ¹⁷⁰

These interviewees underline that these departments and managers carry a bigger duty towards human rights because their position enables them to impact employees to work more thoroughly with human rights. For instance, Olivia underline:

But if we are to have any chance to succeed with our human rights work, it is through our managers and leaders. ¹⁷¹

Although most interviewees from Jönköping share the perception that managers, the Municipal Boards, and the Official Office, have a more extensive duty towards human

¹⁶⁸ Piteå kommun, 2019

¹⁶⁹ Olivia, Jessica, Peter, Emily, Sara, Oscar, Pia, interview ,2021

¹⁷⁰ Emily interview, 2021

¹⁷¹ Olivia interview, 2021

rights, it is not stated in Jönköping's policy document regarding human rights. It states that the municipality as a whole is responsible for fulfilling all human rights. It does not clarify how different actors can carry a bigger duty towards human rights. In effect, it is not evident that the division of responsibility towards human rights is clear in Jönköping with the interviewees' perceptions and the FRA-framework, category 1C, in mind.¹⁷²

Another point to make here is that Chueca points out that the difference between the right to the city and the human rights city narrative is that the local administration within a city provides the residents with human rights and not the residents themselves. In effect, this makes the municipalities mirror the human rights narrative more than the aspects of the right to the city because it is the local administrations of Piteå and Jönköping that provide the residents with human rights. This given the conclusions in the previous paragraphs and section. But then again, the local administration, namely the Municipal Board and Council are still electively voted by the residents in the municipalities through democratic elections. Therefore, one could argue that the municipalities are still ruled by the residents themselves because the Municipal Council and Board should represent the residents of the municipalities.¹⁷³

To summarise and answer the fourth research questions, the duty towards human rights is understood as common because it is viewed as an embedded part of employees' professions. It appears like all employees' professions together within the municipalities make implications of all human rights, as the right to the city demands. The duty towards human rights is also perceived as common because employees shall meet each other and the residents equally and with respect and dignity. The duty is also perceived as something that different departments and managers carry a bigger duty of because they have the mechanism to control, develop and evaluate the human rights work. Because of this, one can conclude that the duty towards the human rights work is common and simultaneously something that some functions carry a bigger responsibility for.

¹⁷² Jönköping kommun, 2018

¹⁷³ E. Chueca, 2016, P.119 – 121

5.4 How do the municipalities work and approach human rights?

This part of the analysis explains how human rights shall permeate the municipalities, with examples stated by the policy documents and the interviewees. This part of the analysis is based on 2A, 2B, and 2C of the FRA-framework. These categories suggest that human rights should permeate all areas of a municipality, that a municipality should conduct an annual reporting and follow-up on human rights to the Municipal Council and that measures for human rights should be evaluated. Forthwith, this part of the analysis contributes with answers to the fifth research questions concerning how the municipalities work and approach human rights.

5.4.1 Human rights shall permeate the whole of Piteå and Jönköping

Jönköping states in Common values and governance principles of human rights in Jönköping municipality that employees shall apply a rights-based approach (RBA) with the principles of responsibility, accountability, transparency, equality, nondiscrimination, participation and inclusion. This implies that the RBA should be applied within all departments, operations and activities of Jönköping. 174 Piteå's Guidelines for human rights – diversity specify that human rights are an integrated part of Piteå's control and management systems, including that the goal of diversity is one of Piteå's overarching goals for the municipality. Piteå underlines in Instructions for monitoring Guidelines for Human Rights – Diversity that human rights shall be an integrated part of all employees, operations, activities and departments. ¹⁷⁵ Altogether this makes Piteå's and Jönköping's aims at human rights mainstream, which makes them mirror the human rights narrative because the goal of a human rights city is to make human rights embedded in all parts of a city. 176 With all of this, Piteå and Jönköping should fulfil category 2A of the FRAframework, suggesting that human rights should permeate all levels of a municipality. However, it looks a bit different in practice which, is further elaborated below in the following paragraphs.

¹⁷⁴ Piteå kommun, 2019

¹⁷⁵ Jönköping kommun, 2018

¹⁷⁶ M. Grigolo, 2017, P.12

Jessica, Hanna and Olivia highlight that all employees of Jönköping should apply the RBA in their daily profession.¹⁷⁷ Jessica highlights that it can be difficult for employees to see how specific human rights can be linked to professional tasks. However, an appliance of RBA can make it easier for employees to approach human rights. Jessica explains:

Human rights can become too theoretical and abstract. And then those principles are very good because then you can see when I do it this way. When I talk to children and young people and get them involved in the process, it's about human rights, for example. 178

Thus, the RBA can make the human rights work more concrete thanks to the different principles. Hanna explains that Jönköping has a methodological tool that explains how the RBA can be applied on an overreaching level. Hanna explains that the RBA can be a way to control that different groups rights have been taken into account, such as people with a foreign background or LBTQI people and to ensure that residents are involved in different city procedures. The RBA is a measure to ensure that those voices, that do not get heard, are given a chance to speak and impact city procedures. The RBA underlines the importance of involving residents, it mirrors Lefebvre's reasoning that participation is essential if one shall be able to impact the future of ones city. The Jönköping's appliance of RBA reflects the human rights city narrative since it underlines the essence of letting people speak. The An appliance of RBA further mirrors the human rights city narrative because an appliance the of RBA becomes a way for the residents to take on a complementary role to assist the local administrations in decision making and city planning. Eventually, this mirrors Chueca's point about human rights cities, concerning how the residents have a complementary role for the local administrations. The concerning how the residents have a complementary role for the local administrations.

None of the interviewees from Piteå highlight tools for how employees can approach human rights in practice, as Jönköping does through the RBA. However, Pia mentions

¹⁷⁷ Jessica, Hanna, Olivia, interview, 2021

¹⁷⁸ Jessica, interview, 2021

¹⁷⁹ Hanna, interview, 2021

¹⁸⁰ M.Purcell 2018, P.38-39

¹⁸¹ World Human Rights Cities Forum, Gwangju Guiding Principles for a human rights city (Gwangju principles), 2014

¹⁸² E. Chueca, 2016, P.119 – 121

that there are tools such as the *rights analysis*, based on the same principles of Jönköping's RBA. ¹⁸³ Neither Oscar, Emily nor Sara is aware of this tool. ¹⁸⁴ Instead, Emily and Sara describe that the approach towards human rights shall be applied as a mindset within employees of Piteå municipality. ¹⁸⁵ Emily explains:

So now I'm getting a bit vague, but I think it's a mindset in a lot of ways. 186

Another reason why only a few people may know about the tool, rights analysis, can be that procedures seem to take a very long time within municipalities. Olivia, Sara and Jessica underline that it takes enormous time before an idea becomes practice within municipalities due to different procedures that must proceed such as involving residents, evaluating and discussing within the Municipal Council. For this reason, it can be that the tool has ye not managed to spread in Piteå.

Moreover, Oscar, Emily and Sara underline that Piteås' sections and employees must translate what human rights mean for them. ¹⁸⁸ Hanna, Olivia, Peter and Jessica underline that Jönköpings' sections and employees must translate what the principles of RBA imply for them. ¹⁸⁹ For example, Olivia highlights:

Yet somehow we have to know what we mean by human rights. What it means in the activities for which we are responsible. What demands does it have on my colleagues and me, and really translate that into some practical action where you are. ¹⁹⁰

Oscar underlines similar:

Then it is up to each section to interpret human rights to the mission they have, which means depending on what you are working with, you have to think in different ways. ¹⁹¹

¹⁸⁷ Sara Olivia, Jessica, interview, 2021

51

¹⁸³ Piteå kommun, Vägledning för rättighetsanalys, 10 October 2016 and Pia, interview, 2021

¹⁸⁴ Emily, Oscar, Sara, interview, 2021

¹⁸⁵ Emily, Sara, interview, 2021

¹⁸⁶ Emily interview, 2021

¹⁸⁸ Oscar, Emily, Sara, interview, 2021

^{189,} Hanna, Olivia, Peter, Jessica, interview, 2021

¹⁹⁰ Olivia, interview, 2021

¹⁹¹ Oscar, interview, 2021

Oomen explains that human rights are often converted due to a city's cultural, religious and political structures. However, Oomen does not mention that human rights should also be translated within the municipalities' employees. In effect, the municipalities' conversion of human rights is remarkable because it also happens on an employee level, making the translation of human rights miniature. A translation within the municipalities appear to follow because they are big organisations that handle education, health care, infrastructure, and clean water etc. Consequentially, human rights cannot imply the same thing for the education department as it will for the environment section, for instance, because they work with very different things. Correspondingly, it can be very different what human rights might imply for the different municipality sections. This mirrors Oomen's argument what human rights can mean in practice is very different depending on the city's setting. With the different implication of human rights, probably different approaches to human rights follow, which corresponds to Gomes da Silva's point, that there is not only one approach but several of working with human rights on a local level. 193

Olivia, Oscar, Jessica, Sara highlight that it is a challenge to translate human rights and make them a natural part of employees' daily work. ¹⁹⁴ They underline that there is a risk the policy documents for human rights stay at a certain strategic level and is not practiced in reality. For instance, Olivia underlines:

To understand that human rights also is in the everyday, in the encounter with others, that is also important to remember. That is what our job is based on.

. With guidance, to support each other, to have conversations about human rights. This is what practice is all about and not burdening them with too many, what shall I say, vague goals if you know what I mean. 195

Jessica, Hanna and Olivia further point out that it is a challenge to make sure everyone is included and involved in different procedures. ¹⁹⁶ Jessica states that it is a struggle to make

¹⁹² B. Oomen 2016, P.14 – 16

¹⁹³ K. Gomes da Silva, 2018, P.298 – 299

¹⁹⁴ Olivia, Oscar, Jessica, Sara, interview, 2021

¹⁹⁵ Olivia, interview, 2021

¹⁹⁶ Jessica, Hanna, Olivia, interview, 2021

sure that underrepresented groups such as children or people with disabilities are heard. ¹⁹⁷ Likewise, Olivia state that it is difficult to make people understand that their voices are precious in order to make a change and impact conditions on the municipalities. ¹⁹⁸ Pia and Emily highlight that it is challenging to work with human rights because it is a neverending job. ¹⁹⁹ Peter highlights that it is a struggle to impact that those employees who should take on human rights within their profession, but who chose not to do so. ²⁰⁰ Lastly, all of the interviewees except for Peter underlines the challenge of perspective clutter, which implies that the concepts of equality, children's rights, integration, non-discrimination, human rights etc. collide with each other. This instead of seeing all of these different perspectives as a part of the human rights work. ²⁰¹

A condition that could make the stated challenges mentioned above easier could possibly be a spread of the existing tools concerning RBA. Because even though the managers of the department of culture and leisure were interviewed, none of them highlights specific strategies for how their employees approach human rights. Sara sees human rights as something that employees shall carry continuously as a mindset in their daily profession. Peter also sees the application of RBA as a mindset that employees should carry in their profession. Peter describes:

It's more about implementing those ideas in everything we do and taking it with us. And then we have worked more on a municipality-wide level and we have broken down our values into different principles that we should work according to. But it is this non-discrimination, participation, responsibility and transparency towards the citizen and so on. And we try to keep that in mind in everything we do.²⁰⁴

Though the department of culture and leisure in Jönköping does not have a specific strategy for translating the RBA to their operations, it is, on the one hand, better that employees apply the RBA as a mindset. This compared to not having a strategy when single employees work with human rights, which seems to be the case in Piteå. To clarify,

¹⁹⁸ Olivia interview, 2021

53

¹⁹⁷ Jessica, interview, 2021

¹⁹⁹ Pia, Emily, interview, 2021

²⁰⁰ Peter, interview, 2021

²⁰¹ Pia, Oscar, Emily, Sara, Jessica, Hanna, Olivia, Peter, interview, 2021

²⁰² Peter and Sara, interview, 2021

²⁰³ Sara interview, 2021, 2021

²⁰⁴ Peter interview, 2021

Piteå has a strategy that single employees can take on in the form of the rights analysis, but few seem to be aware of it. Chiefly, if single employees do not have a strategy for translating human rights to their profession, it might risk that human rights do not permeate the municipality to the extent that it is possible to do. Instead, there is a risk that human rights stay on a strategic and administrative level instead of being practiced in everyday professions, as several of the interviewees point out. Therefore, Jönköping seems to have more of a structure of helping single employees to translate human rights into practice, which further can make human rights permeate the city more, in comparison to Piteå. Emerga Institute's and RWI's mapping for SALAR concluded that many municipalities lack concrete methods of approaching human rights. ²⁰⁵ These conclusions seem to apply to Piteå, at least on an employee level, given that none of the interviewees from Piteå except Pia referred to the tool of rights analysis.

In contrast to the previous paragraph, RWI's and Emerga Institutes' conclusions that many municipalities lack a structure for approaching human rights do not apply to Piteå's administrative and strategic approach towards human rights. ²⁰⁶ Namely, Piteå requires every municipality department to follow up and evaluate their human rights work to the Municipal Board. The reporting to the Municipal Board should be based on how they approach human rights as a societal, democratic, welfare-actor and employer.²⁰⁷ Indeed, this is probably a great measure to make human rights permeate the municipalities because every department must think about how they protect, promote and fulfil rights based on the roles just mentioned. For this reason, the departments are forced to think in terms of human rights. In effect, one can conclude that Piteå fulfils category 2B and 2C of the framework that suggests that a municipality should evaluate and report on its human rights work and activities towards human rights. In addition, all of the interviewees from Piteå underline the fact that Piteå has become a human rights city, puts pressure on employees to work with human rights.²⁰⁸ Likewise, they also state that the goal to work with human rights is embedded in the municipalities' control and management system and included in one of Piteå's overarching goals to make employees

²⁰⁵ Raoul Wallenberg Institutet, 2020, P.6 and Emerga Institute, 2015, P.4

²⁰⁶ Ibid

²⁰⁷ Piteå kommun, 2019

²⁰⁸ Oscar, Emily, Pia, Sara, interview, 2021

take on human rights.²⁰⁹ With this, one can conclude that Piteå truly has created a strategic and administrative structure for making employees think in terms of human rights but what they are lacking is a structure for how single employees can translate human rights to their daily work.

With the previous paragraph in mind, the spread of the tool, rights analysis, within Piteå could maybe be a huge success in making human rights permeate Piteå more than it is already doing. Chiefly, many employees would probably take on the tool, granted that the interviewees from Piteå seem willing to take on human rights since human rights are embedded on a strategic level. Indeed, the spread of the tool could maybe be a pathway to partly solve the problem of how employees could translate and take on human rights in their daily profession. This could eventually make human right permeate Piteå more than what it is already doing.

Jönköping has a structure for how employees can translate human rights into their profession thanks to the RBA. However, Jönköping does not have the same mechanism as Piteå for approaching human rights on a strategic level. Notably, Jönköping reports on equality, human rights, children's rights and integration to the Municipal Council. This reporting is done by different strategists from the human rights office. Pecause of this, the Municipal Council of Jönköping does not receive a report concerning human rights from each department as Piteå but instead on specific areas. The risk of such reporting is that the potential for developing work might go missed. Another risk is that departments and sections within Jönköping are not forced to think about how their plans, measures, activities etc link to human rights. Eventually, this impacts that human rights do not permeate the municipality to the extent possible because all departments are not impacted to think in terms of human rights to the same extent due to a lacking reporting mechanism. Consequentially, Jönköping accomplishes category 2B and 2C of the FRA-framework, which suggests that a municipality should evaluate its human rights work on the one hand because they report and evaluate some of its human rights work. But then again, one could

²⁰⁹ Piteå kommun, 2019

²¹⁰ Piteå kommun, 2019

also question if Jönköping does fulfil category 2B and 2C to the extent possible, given that it does not evaluate and report on all areas of Jönköpings' departments.

With the previous statement in mind, Jönköping and Piteå could maybe benefit from applying the FRA-framework, on a department or section level, in order to make the human rights work more tangible. This granted the challenges to translate human rights to practice and the challenges to make human rights permeate the municipalities. Markedly, suppose that every department or section within the municipalities adopted the FRA-framework, and thereby stated their commitments, duties toward human rights, ensuring that residents are involved in different procedures, hiring a human rights expert to support their human rights work, reporting and evaluating their human rights work etc. In that case, an appliance of the FRA-framework on department or section level could maybe make human rights permeate the municipalities more than what is it already doing. Notably, this procedure could be a possible solution to influence that human rights are not stuck on an administrative level but are practised in reality. Similarly, the FRA-framework could maybe also help to partly better some of the challenges mentioned by the interviewees, such as involving and including residents in different measures and plans of the municipalities.

Notwithstanding all of the categories above, one can conclude that Piteå and Jönköping more or less fulfil category 2A of the FRA-framework, which suggests that human rights should permeate all areas of the municipalities. This given that employees should apply human rights or the RBA as a mindset and converting human rights into ones section or daily profession. But then again, how specific departments and sections should translate human rights is not evidentially clear. However, what could make the human rights work more tangible for the municipalities' employees is using the tools concerning the RBA. There is also potential to make human rights permeate even more within the municipalities given the lack of approaching human rights on an employee level in Piteå and on a strategic level in Jönköping. Because of this, Piteå could maybe benefit from spreading its tools concerning rights analysis. However, both Jönköping and Piteå could probably benefit from applying the FRA-framework within every section or department of the municipalities to make human rights permeate the municipalities even more, with

this a better realisation of fulfilling category 2A of the FRA-framework would follow. Ultimately, all of this also contributes to an answer to the fifth research question of the thesis concerning how the municipalities approach human rights.

5.5 Piteå's and Jönköping's practice of Agenda 2030, participation and inclusion

This part of the analysis explains how Piteå and Jönköping briefly work with Agenda 2030. This is followed by how the municipalities correspond to the rest of the FRA-framework, criterions 2D, 2E, and 2F. These categories state that residents should be an active part of the administrations planning, investigations and evaluations, that a municipality should have advisory groups concerning human rights and that a municipality should cooperate with various stakeholders to strengthen human rights. Eventually, this section gives the last contributing answer to the fifth research question concerning how Jönköping and Piteå approach human rights.

5.5.1 Practice of Agenda 2030

Since the FRA-framework mentions Agenda 2030 and because many municipalities tend to gather their human rights work under the umbrella of Agenda 2030 and vice versa, I wanted to briefly investigate if that was the case. Significant to note is that I will not go deep on this topic because the purpose of the thesis was not to investigate how the municipalities work with Agenda 2030. On the contrary, the aim is to underline how Agenda 2030 can be an integrated part of a municipality's work with human rights and vice versa.

Interestingly, Piteå and Jönköping partly gather their work with Agenda 2030 under human rights. Jönköping states that they are beginning to formulate a new plan for how human rights can be embedded into an action plan for social sustainability. Essential to note is that the action plan is not finalised yet. Olivia, Jessica and Hanna state that Jönköping is doing this plan in order to prevent parallel work on human rights and the

-

²¹¹ Raoul Wallenberg Institute, 2020, P.6, P.11, and P.16

social aspects of Agenda 2030.²¹² Thus, social suitability and human rights become exchangeable terms with each other in Jönköping. However, Jessica and Olivia highlight that they wished that they would have created one plan that also includes the environmental aspects of Agenda 2030, because they mean that all goals of Agenda 2030 are connected.²¹³ For instance, Jessica describes:

Because we also have two different programmes for Agenda 2030 as it stands now. But we hope in the long term to be able to merge them into one sustainability programme. ²¹⁴

Piteå does not have a separate plan for Agenda 2030. Instead, Piteå's operation plan and budget from 2021, including Piteå's guidelines for human rights underline that the mission to work with Agenda 2030 is an incorporated part of Piteå's overreaching goals for the municipality as a whole. Specifically, Piteå state that all of its overarching goal that applies to the municipality as a whole together make an approach towards Agenda 2030. For instance, diversity is one of Piteå's overreaching goals, where the work with Agenda 2030 also is included.²¹⁵

To summarise, one can see that human rights and Agenda 2030 are very similar to each other and therefore become exchangeable terms and incorporated into each other due to their similarities. Insomuch, human rights can be a way to work and approach Agenda 2030 and vice versa. Eventually, this also gives a contributing answer to the last research question concerning how Piteå and Jönköping approach human rights.

5.5.2 Jönköping's and Piteå's practice of participation and inclusion

Piteå and Jönköping highlight different procedures for involving residents in different municipality procedures, which indeed is a way to ensure that human rights are protected, promoted, and fulfilled.²¹⁶ Markedly, a Swedish legal regulation requires a municipality

²¹⁴ Jessica, interview, 2021

²¹² Hanna, Jessica, Olivia, interview, 2021

²¹³ Olivia, Jessica, interview. 2021

²¹⁵ Piteå kommun 2019 and Piteå kommun, *Verksamhetsplan 2021 – 2023, Årsbudget 2021, Kommunfullmäktigesbeslut*

²¹⁶ Olivia, Hanna, Jessia, Peter, Oscar, Emily, Pia, Sara, interview, 2021

to create a forum where residents can come and make their voice heard when a municipality wants to build something new. However, there is a tendency that only white elderly men and women participate in such events.²¹⁷ To prevent this and create a better variation of voices, both Jönköping and Piteå practice outreach work to ensure that those who are not often heard can get their voice heard.²¹⁸ For instance, Hanna describes the practice of outreaching work:

We have a special area called Södra Munksjön that is being developed. And there is a company that is doing the development. They have been working very much with the citizens in different kinds of dialogues. That is to say that you can submit suggestions, but that you also go out to different groups, for example, a language café in our different areas. However, it can also include going to a riding school, a preschool, a daily activity (daglig verksamhet), etc. To gather, to meet citizens who are often far from decision making.²¹⁹

All of the interviewees state that they practice different levels of inclusion and participation for their residents. ²²⁰ It can be everything from offering meetings, to social media, to outreaching work, making sure different groups of people's voices are heard, and involving residents in different projects, such as serving to spread knowledge about equality and gender norms for example. More concrete examples are that Piteå's residents were able to impact what the concept of diversity should mean for Piteå and the residents in Jönköping have been able to impact the implication of Jönköping's future Agenda 2030 work. ²²¹ Similarly, another way to include people and ensure participation is that both Piteå and Jönköping cooperate with civil society and private companies, including different advisory groups. To mention, Jönköping has an advisory group for people with disability that is very active, and an advisory group for the civil society, amongst others existing advisory group. ²²² Piteå has an advisory group for education and an advisory group for retired people, amongst others existing advisory groups.

-

²¹⁷ Pia, Emily Jessica, Hanna, Olivia, interview 2021

²¹⁸ Pia, Oscar, Emily, Sara, Olivia, Hanna, Jessica, Peter, interview, 2021

²¹⁹ Hanna interview 2021

²²⁰ Pia, Oscar, Emily, Sara, Olivia, Hanna, Jessica, Peter, interview, 2021

²²¹ Piteå 2014, and Hanna interview, 2021

²²² Jönköping kommun, *Kommunala rådet – funktionshinderfrågor*, <u>available here</u> (accessed 06 May 2021), Jönköping kommun, *Samverkan med civilsamhället*, <u>available here</u> (accessed 06 May 2021),

²²³ Piteå kommun, *Piteås utbildningsvetenskapliga råd*, (*PUR*) <u>available here</u> (accessed 06 May 2021), Piteå kommun, *Penisionärrådet*, <u>available here</u> (accessed 06 May 2021)

The different projects and measures to include and involve residents in the municipalities' different procedures and operations are overwhelming, making that I will not go much deeper on this topic. However, what one can conclude is that Piteå and Jönköping, without doubt, practice many of the settings that Lefebvre thinks is important, namely enabling participation so that one can make an impact, which essentially also is the core of the human rights city narrative. 224 Nonetheless, the municipalities mirror more the aspects of the human rights narrative than the right to the city aspects for what concerns the practice of participation and including residents in different measures. This is because, it is up to the local administration to decided when they want to involve and let the residents participate in different measures, except for when the municipalities are planning to build something, because then they must let the residents speak, according to the law.²²⁵ Chiefly, it is not up to the residents to decide when they can impact different measures or plans of the municipalities. On the contrary, it is the local administration that provides such possibilities. Insomuch, this mirrors Chueca's point concerning the human rights narrative - that the residents often have a complementary role to the local administrations' decision makings and plans.

Nonetheless, thanks to the many different strategies of enabling participation and inclusion, it makes Jönköping and Piteå fulfilling category 2D 2E, 2F of the FRA-framework, which states that municipalities should involve and include residents in city plans, projects, measures, and that municipalities should collaborate and exchange experiences with various stakeholders. Eventually, the different measures for participation and inclusion give another contributing answer to the fifth research question for how the municipalities approach and work with human rights.

7. Discussion and conclusion

In this section, I will discuss the results of my analysis. I will also answer the overreaching research questions, concerning how the municipalities human rights work can be framed with the human rights city narrative and the aspects of the right to the citses, This

60

²²⁴ M. Purcell 2018, P.41 – 43 and B. Oomen, 2016, P.13 – 15

²²⁵ E. Chueca, 2016, P.119 – 120

including how the municipalities' human rights work corresponds to the FRA-framework. I will also link the results of my analysis to previous research and suggest how this research area can be developed further. Thereupon, I will summarise the thesis.

7.1 Discussion

Piteå's and Jönköping's understanding of human rights can be framed with the aspects of the right to the city. It mirrors, on the one hand, the core of the right to the city, namely, the claim to acquire all human rights within the city. On the other hand, human rights are perceived as something that is embedded in employees' professions and in the services that the municipalities provide. Human rights are also explained with peoples' equal worth and dignity. The municipalities' approaches to human rights can be framed with the human rights city narrative because human rights should be translated into what human rights imply for a specific section, department, and employees. As described earlier, this mirrors Oomen's argument that what human rights can mean is very different depending on a city's various contexts. However, what is unique with Piteå and Jönköping, making them deviate from Oomen's point, is that some interviewees think that employees should translate what human rights mean for them.²²⁶

Since there occurs a translation of human rights on a department, section and employee level, it has been challenging to investigate what human rights imply for them and how they approach human rights. Markedly, I have not interviewed serval persons from the municipality departments, but rather people who have a strategic position in the municipalities' human rights work.

The municipalities' approaches to human rights can further be framed with the human rights city narrative. Namely with different meanings of human rights follows different approaches to human rights. Again, this reflects Gomes da Silva's statement that there is not only one approach but several approaches to human rights. Altogether, Jönköping's and Piteå's different statements and approaches to human rights make them more or less

-

²²⁶ B. Oomen, 2016, P.13 – 15

²²⁷ K. Gomes da Silva, 2018, P.298

accomplish the different categories stated in the FRA-framework. In effect, one could question if the FRA-framework is eligible to apply for the municipalities since they already fulfil many of the categories. Although this, there is potential to make human rights permeate the municipalities more than it is already doing. This given the lacking structures of making human rights permeate on a strategic level in Jönköping and on an employee level in Piteå. Except for this, there is no big difference between Piteå's, and Jönköping's human rights work even though Piteå is a human rights city. Hence, if the different municipalities' sections and departments commit and apply the various categories in the FRA-framework, it could make human rights permeate the municipalities more and could possibly solve the stated problems. Therefore, the FRA-framework could, on the other hand, be eligible to apply for the municipalities.

With the previous paragraphs as a background, I encourage future studies to investigate on a deeper level how particular departments and sections within one municipality work with human rights and what human rights imply for them. For instance, the study could involve several persons from different municipality departments to investigate further what, for instance, human rights imply for the department of education, the department for social services and department for environment, etc. This given that what human rights can imply, including the approaches to human rights seem to differ within a municipality as well.

Nonetheless, the thesis has interviewed two managers from the culture and leisure departments. However, to enable more in-depth answers to how a specific municipality department approaches human rights, one would probably have to involve more people from that specific department. I, therefore, also encourage future studies to investigate how one municipality department within one specific municipality approaches human rights by interviewing several employees from that specific department. The reason for doing such a specific study is because human rights also seem to be converted on an employee level.

The suggested studies above mirror Emerga Institute's and Raoul Wallenberg's mapping of Swedish municipalities' human rights work, but on a much more specific and deeper

level. Indeed, these studies could contribute to a better understanding of human rights on a local level and what it could imply to work with human rights on a local level further than what this thesis is already doing. ²²⁸ An additional factor that motivates these suggested studies is that Oomen and Baumgartel state in their article *Frontier cities: The rise of local authorities as an opportunity for international human rights law* that the role of local authorities' role within human rights is unresearched. ²²⁹

I also touched upon the relationship between Agenda 2030 and human rights, but I did not go deep on the subject because it was not within the scope of the thesis. However, I encourage future studies to investigate how municipalities work with human rights and Agenda 2030 to study their similarities further and how they can become exchangeable terms. Markedly, the RWI states the great linkage between human rights and Agenda 2030, which further could motivate such study.²³⁰

7.2 Conclusion

I have studied how the municipalities of Piteå and Jönköping approach human rights. I aimed to study what it means to work with human rights on a local level. Simultaneously, I aimed to investigate what human rights imply for Piteå and Jönköping. To succeed with this, I conducted eight interviews with people from the municipalities and studied various documents from the municipalities. I used the FRA-framework as a methodological tool to identify how the municipalities approach human rights. The FRA-framework was also applied as a theoretical lens to detect how the municipalities human rights work corresponds to the different categories within the FRA-framework. The aspects of the right to the city and the human rights city narrative were applied to better frame and elaborate the data from the interviews and the policy document. Likewise, these perspectives were also used to investigate the meaning of human rights for Jönköping and Piteå. To succeed with all of this, the following research questions have been applied.

²²⁸ Emerga Institute, 2015, P.4 and Raoul Wallenberg Institute, 2020 P.6

²²⁹ B. Oomen and M. Baumgartel, 2018, P. 609

²³⁰ Wallenberg Institute of Human Rights, 2018, P.7 – 8

How do the municipalities work, and approaches to human rights correspond to the FRA framework?

The municipalities appear to correspond more or less to all of the stated categories within the FRA-framework. Despite this, the municipalities do not seem to correspond fully to category 1C that suggests a clear division of responsibility concerning human rights. Markedly, the interviewees' perception and the policy documents statement regarding duties do not correspond to each other. Because lacking structures for approaching human rights, as elaborated in the discussion section, there is a potential that the municipalities could fulfil category 2A better. Namely, it suggests that human rights should permeate the municipalities.

How can one frame the municipalities approaches to human rights with the perspective of the right to the city and the human rights city narrative?

In short, and as described in the previous section of the discussion, Piteå's and Jönköping's approaches to human rights mirrors the human rights city narrative on several levels. This is because there occurs a conversion of human rights, which is probably followed by different approaches of working with human rights within the municipalities' departments. The municipalities also practice and involve residents in several city procedures and plans, which again make them mirror the core of both theoretical standpoints. The municipalities' approaches to human rights also reflect the right to the city because some interviewees and documents frame human rights as a claim to all human rights.

• How do the municipalities perceive human rights within their local context? In brief, the municipalities understand human rights as an embedded part of the municipalities' services and employees' professions. Human rights are also perceived as a code of conduct. Notably, that every resident and employee should be met and treated with respect, dignity, worth. Human rights are framed, as

explained earlier, as the duty to fulfil every existing international human rights.

How do the municipalities state and frame their commitment and duty towards human rights?

The duty towards human rights is understood as common. The duty towards human rights is also perceived as bigger for some functions such as the Municipal Boards, the Official Office in Jönköping and the Municipal District Administration in Piteå, including managers. This is because they are perceived to have the mechanism to develop and evaluate the municipalities' human rights work and to have the power to impact other employees to take on human rights. Insomuch, the duty towards the human rights work is common and simultaneously something that some functions carry a bigger responsibility for.

• How do the municipalities approach human rights?

The municipalities approach human rights by stating their commitments in different policy documents. Jönköping and Piteå underline that they approach human rights through the different services that they provide, such as health care, elderly care, education, infrastructure etc. More specifically, Jönköping state that employees should approach human rights by applying a rights-based approach. In contrast, some interviewees from Piteå state that single employees should apply human rights as a mindset in their daily profession. Piteå also approaches human rights by requiring every municipality department to report on their human rights work. In contrast, Jönköping let specific strategist from the human rights office report on the human rights work. The municipalities also approach human rights through Agenda 2030 and vice versa. Both Piteå and Jönköping apply an overwhelming measure of involving residents in different city procedures.

Bibliography

Primary sources

Interviews

Jönköping

- Hanna 'Manager at the Human Rights Office in Jönköping' (interviewed by Nanna Malmborg Rasmussen) 16 March 2021, Lund
- Jessica 'Case officer at the Human Rights Office in Jönköping' (interviewed by Nanna Malmborg Rasmussen) 22 March 2021, Lund
- Olivia, 'Politician in Jönköping' (interviewed by Nanna Malmborg Rasmussen)
 24 March 2021, Lund
- Peter 'Manager at the department of culture and leisure in Jönköping' (interviewed by Nanna Malmborg Rasmussen) 20 April 2021, Lund

Piteå

- Emily, 'Politican in Piteå' (interviewed by Nanna Malmborg Rasmussen) 18
 March 2021, Lund
- Oscar, 'Manager of the Municipal District in Piteå', (interviewed by Nanna Malmborg Rasmussen) 23 March 2021, Lund
- Pia 'Democratisation developer in Piteå' (interviewed by Nanna Malmborg Rasmussen) 25 March 2021, Lund,
- Sara 'Manager at the department of culture and leisure in Piteå' (interviewed by Nanna Malmborg Rasmussen) 12 April 2020, Lund

Documents from Piteå and Jönköping

Jönköping

- Jönköping kommun, Gemensam värdegrund och styrande principer för mänskliga rättigheter, 4th October 2018,
- Jönköping kommun, kartläggning av befintlig kompetens hos personal avseende mänskliga rättigheter, 2012
- Jönköping kommun, Kommunprogram för mandatperioden 2019 2022, 2019
- Jönköping kommun, Metodstöd för social hållbarhet och mänskliga rättigheter
- Jönköping kommun, Översyn av centrala styrdokument med hänsyn till centrala styrdokument, 2012

Piteå

- Piteå kommun, Anvisning för uppföljning av Riktlinjer för mänskliga rättigheter
 mångfald, 09 October 2019
- Piteå kommun, Handlingsplan för ett Piteå för all med ökad mångfald, 06
 February 2014
- Piteå kommun, Riktlinjer för mänskliga rättigheter mångfald 29 April 2019
- Piteå kommun, Verksamhetsplan 2021 2023, Årsbudget 2021, Kommunfullmäktigesbeslut
- Piteå kommun, Vägledning för rättighetsanalys, 10 October 2016

Literature

- A. Lantz, *Intervjumetodik*, Lund, Studentlitteratur, 1993
- A. Ryén, Kvalitativ intervju från vetenskapsteori till fältstudier, Liber AB, Malmö, 2004
- B. Oomen and M. Baumgartel 'Frontier cities: The rise of local authorities as an opportunity for international human rights law' European Journal of International Law, Vol 29, No.2, May 2018
- B. Oomen, 'The promise and challenges of human rights cities 'B. Oomen, M. Davis and M. Grigolo, (eds) *Global Urban Justice: The Rise of Human Rights Cities*, Cambridge, Cambridge University Press, 2016
- E. Chueca, 'Human Rights in the city and the right to the city: Two different paradigms confronting urbanisation.'B. Oomen, M. Davis and M. Grigolo, (eds) *Global Urban Justice: The Rise of Human Rights Cities*, Cambridge, Cambridge University Press, 2016
- Emerga Institute, Mänskliga Rättigheter i kommuner, regioner och landsting. Kartläggning av arbetet med mänskliga rättigheter samt önskemål om stöd i detta arbete, 2015
- D. Harvey, *Rebel Cities: from the right to the city to the urban revolution*, London, Verso, 2012
- I. Walsh, 'Using quantitative data in mixed-design grounded theory studies: an enhanced path to formal grounded theory in information system 'European Journal of Information Systems, 2015
- J. Morse, M. Barrett, M. Mayan, K. Olson, J. Spiers, 'Verification Strategies for Establishing Reliability and Validity in Qualitative Research' *International Journal of Qualitative Methods*, 2002
- J. Saldana, The Coding Manual for Qualitative Researchers, Second Edition,
 Sage Publications Ltd, London, 2013
- J. Saldana, *The Coding Manual for Qualitative Researchers*, Second Edition, Sage Publications Ltd, London, 2016
- J. Cresswell, J. Cresswell, *Research Design, Qualitative, Quantitative, and Mixed Methods Approaches*, Thousands Oaks California, SAGE Publications,

- K. Attoh, 'What kind of rights is the right to the city' *Progress in Human Geography*, Vol 35, Issue 5, 2011
- K. Gomes da Silva, 'The new urban agenda and human rights cities: Interconnections between the global and the local, 'Netherlands Quarterly of Human Rights, vol 36, Issue 4, 2018
- L. Patten Mildred, M. Newhart, *Understanding Research Methods*, Tenth Edition, Routledge, New York, 2018
- M. Dalen, *Intervju som metod*, Oslo, Gleerups, 2004
- M. Davis 'Design Challenges for Human Rights Cities' Colombia Human Rights Law Review, Vol 49, Issue 1, 2017
- M. Grigolo, 'Towards a sociology of the human rights city: Focusing on practice' M. Davis, T.Gammeltoft Hansen, E.Hanna (eds) *Human Rights Cities* and Region. Swedish and International Perspectives, Raoul Wallenberg Institute, Malmö, 2017
- M. Kjaerum, M. Davis, F. Fredriksson, G. Startori, I. Reis, *Human Rights Cities and the SDGs* Raoul Wallenberg Institute of Human Rights, 2018
- M. Purcell, 'Possible Worlds: Henri Lefebvre and the right to the city' C. Silver,
 R. Freestone, C. Demazière (eds) *Dialogues in Urban and Regional Planning* –
 The right to the city, New York, Routledge, 2018
- P. Marcuse,' *WHOSE RIGHT(S) TO WHAT CITY?*' N. Brenner P. Marcuse, M. Mayer, (eds) *Cities for People, Not Profit Critical urban theory and the right to the city,* London and New York, Routledge, 2012, P.34 35
- People's Movement for Human Rights Learning, PDHRE International office and the three regional PDHRE offices in Latin America, West Africa and Anglo Africa, Human Rights Learning and Human Rights Cities. Achievement Report, 2007
- Raoul Wallenberg Institute, A. Bruce, G. Fredriksson, R. Garner,
 E.Hammarström, M. Kjaerum and A. Lindström Arbetet med mänskliga
 rättigheter i Svenska kommuner och regioner, En kartläggning för Sveriges
 Kommuner och Regioner, 2020
- Regeringen, arbetsmarknadsdepartementet, *Bemyndigande att ingå en överenskommelse med Sveriges Regioner och Landsting*, 12 June 2014

- Sveriges kommuner och regioner, Mänskliga rättigheter i praktiken lärande exempel, 2020
- Sveriges kommuner och regioner, Mänskliga rättigheter på lokal och regional nivå, 2019
- Sveriges kommuner och regioner, *Mänskliga rättigheter i styrning och ledning*, 2019
- S. Phillipp 'Focusing on Human Rights in the Daily Business of Local Governments' M. Davis, T. Gammeltoft Hansen, E. Hanna (eds) *Human Rights* Cities and Region. Swedish and International Perspectives, Raoul Wallenberg Institute, Malmö, 2017
- V. Planko Clark, N. Ivankova, Mixed Methods Research A guide to the field,
 Los Angeles, SAGE Publications, 2016
- United Nations, General Assembly, Human Rights Council, Role of local government in the promotion and protection of human rights – Final report of the Human Rights Council Advisory Committee, A/HRC/30/49, 7 August 2015

Internet links

- Europeiska Kommissionen, *Delaktighet: Jönköping vinner Access City priset* 202, 1 December 2020 <u>available here</u> (acsessed 28 April 2021)
- European Union Agency for Fundamental Rights, *Towards a framework of commitments for European human rights cities*, <u>available here</u> 2020 (accessed 30 January 2021)
- Emerga Institute, *Om oss*, <u>available here</u> (accessed 06 May 2021)
- Göteborgs Stad, Handlingsplan för arbetet med de mänskliga rättigheterna i Göteborgs Stad, 2012, (accessed 01 May 2021) available here (accessed 26 January 2021)
- Jönköpings kommun, *Jönköpingsposten*, 'Jönköping prisas i Raoul Wallenbergs namn' 21 August 2019, available here (acsessed 28 April 2021)
- Jönköping kommun, *Kommunala rådet funktionshinderfrågor*, <u>available here</u> (accessed 06 May 2021)

- Jönköping kommun, Samverkan med civilsamhället, available here (accessed 06 May 2021),
- Klippans kommun, *rättighetskartläggning*, (accessed 26 January 2021) <u>available</u> here
- Lunds kommun, *Mänskliga rättigheter*, <u>available here</u> (accessed 01 May 2021) and Piteå kommun, *Utropande av MR-kommun 24 Oktober*, 2020, <u>available here</u> (accessed 26 January 2021)
- Mölndals kommun, Mänskliga rättigheter, (accessed 26 January 2021) <u>available</u> here
- Piteå kommun, *Piteå*, *MR-kommun 2021*, available here (accessed 06 May 2021)
- Piteå kommun, *Penisionärrådet*, <u>available here</u> (accessed 06 May 2021)
- Piteå kommun, *Piteås utbildningsvetenskapliga råd, (PUR)* <u>available here</u> (accessed 06 May 2021)
- Piteå kommun, *Utropande av MR-kommun 24 Oktober*, 2020, <u>available here</u> (accessed 26 January 2021)
- United Cities and Local Governments on Social Inclusion, Participatory
 Democracy and Human Rights, *Background: Twenty Years of human rights* cities municipalism, available here (accessed 26 January 2021)
- United Cities and Local Governments on Social Inclusion, Participatory
 Democracy and Human Rights, European Charter for the Safeguarding of
 Human Rights in the City, available here (accessed 26 January 2021)

International Documents

- World Human Rights Cities Forum, Gwangju Deceleration on Human Right
 City, 16 17 May 2011, Gwangju
- World Human Rights Cities Forum, Gwangju Guiding Principles for a human rights city (Gwangju principles) 2014
- World Charter for the Right to the City, Article I, 2005

List of Appendix

Appendix 1: Invitation to participate in the thesis



Inbjudan att delta i forskningsstudien – Mänskliga rättigheter i praktiken, en studie av två mellanstora kommuners arbete med mänskliga rättigheter

Hej! Mitt namn är Nanna Malmborg Rasmussen och jag studerar på masterprogrammet i mänskliga rättigheter vid Lunds universitet. Jag vill med detta brev bjuda in er kommun att medverka i en forskningsstudie som utgör mitt examensarbete.

Information om studien

Syftet med uppsatsen är att undersöka hur två mellanstora kommuner arbetar med att realisera mänskliga rättigheter (MR) i praktiken. Ett av uppsatsens mål är att studera hur kommunerna förmedlar MR i syfte att mer djupgående förstå hur kommunen arbetar med MR. Det finns många olika sätt för en kommun att uppfylla MR. En del av uppsatsens syfte är att undersöka om det skulle vara önskvärt att applicera ett ramverk för att lättare fullfölja MR, eller om det inte har någon betydelse. Ansvarig för studien är avdelningen för mänskliga rättigheter, vid Humanistiska och Teologiska fakulteten på Lunds universitet.

För att kunna fullfölja ovanstående syfte så är jag intresserad av att intervjua olika personer inom kommunen som arbetar med MR. Jag är intresserad av att intervjua en handläggare/ utvecklingsstrateg som arbetar med

MR/hållbarhetsarbete/jämställdhetsarbete, en förvaltningschef på enheten/avdelningen som är ansvarig för MR-arbetet eller enhetschefen, samt en politiker, men även andra kan bli aktuella. Med detta sagt inbjuder jag er att delta i en intervju i slutet av februari/mars. Intervjun planeras att ta ca 45 minuter. Jag är flexibel och jag rättar mig efter när ni kan. Intervjufrågorna kommer att skickas när de är färdigställda. Intervjun genomförs digitalt, på Zoom eller liknande. Som tack för ert deltagande kommer jag att bjuda in er till en dragning av uppsatsen senare i år. Varken de intervjuade eller kommunen de arbetar inom kommer att identifieras i rapporten.

Det kan vara värt att tillägga att jag har tidigare erfarenhet av kommuners arbete med MR tack vare min tid som praktikant vid Emerga Institute vilket är ett oberoende forskningsinstitut med spetskompetens i mänskliga rättigheter som arbetar med att stötta

kommuner i deras arbete med MR. Jag ser fram emot möligheten att få prata mer med er och hoppas att ni vill delta i studien.

Tveka inte att höra av er om ni har frågor. Tack på förhand.

Ansvariga för studien

Nanna Malmborg Rasmussen Handledare: Lena Halldenius

XXX-XXX XX XX

XXXXX@gmail.com XXX-XXX XX

Appendix 2: Invitation to the departments of culture and leisure



Inbjudan att delta i forskningsstudien – Mänskliga rättigheter i praktiken, en studie av två mellanstora kommuners arbete med mänskliga rättigheter

Hej! Mitt namn är Nanna Malmborg Rasmussen och jag studerar på masterprogrammet i mänskliga rättigheter vid Lunds universitet. Jag vill med detta brev bjuda in er kommun att medverka i en forskningsstudie som utgör mitt examensarbete.

Information om studien

Syftet med uppsatsen är att undersöka hur två mellanstora kommuner arbetar med att realisera mänskliga rättigheter (MR) i praktiken. Ett av uppsatsens mål är att studera hur kommunerna förmedlar MR i syfte att mer djupgående förstå hur kommunen arbetar med MR. Det finns många olika sätt för en kommun att uppfylla MR. En del av uppsatsens syfte är att undersöka om det skulle vara önskvärt att applicera ett ramverk för att lättare fullfölja MR, eller om det inte har någon betydelse. Ansvarig för studien är avdelningen för mänskliga rättigheter, vid Humanistiska och Teologiska fakulteten på Lunds universitet.

Jag har pratat med XX, XX och XX. Jag har fått både övergripande och djupgående svar gällande hur kommunen arbetar med MR. Jag har dock inte fått djupgående information gällande hur någon utav kommunförvaltningarna arbetar med mänskliga rättigheter. Av den anledningen hade det varit givande att få samtala kring hur kultur och fritidsförvaltningen arbetar med MR.

Med ovanstående som bakgrund så undrar jag om ni, eller vice-ordförande, alternativt en förvaltningschef skulle vilja **delta** i studien? Jag är flexibel och rättar mig efter när ni kan. Intervjun tar ca 45 min – 1 timme. Intervjun genomförs digitalt, antigen via zoom eller per telefon. Ert namn kommer att **avidentifieras**. Dock kommer kommunens deltagande **inte att avidentifieras**. Intervjufrågorna **bifogas** nedan. Som tack för ert deltagande kommer jag att bjuda in er till en dragning av uppsatsen senare i år. Jag ser fram emot möjligheten att få prata mer med er och hoppas att ni vill delta i studien.

Tveka inte att höra av er om ni har frågor.

Tack på förhand.

Ansvariga för studien

Nanna Malmborg Rasmussen

XXX-XXX XX XX

XXXXX@gmail.com XXX-XXX XX XX

Handledare: Lena Halldenius

Appendix 3: Interview guide to Piteå and Jönköping



Interview guide – Human rights on a city level, a study of two medium-sized municipalities' work with human rights

- 1. Would you like to start by telling a bit about your professional role and what kind of **professional tasks** you have?
- 2. How did the **initiative** to work with human rights start in your municipality?
- **3.** If you had to explain what human rights **implies**, how would you describe it in that case? In other words, what would you say that human rights **mean** for your municipality?
- **4.** Do all employees, politicians, departments and sections have equal **responsibility** for working and fulfilling human rights for the residents? Or do some employees/departments/politicians have a bigger responsibility than others to fulfil the residents' human rights? If so, why?
- 5. In what ways have the Municipal Council and the Municipal Board clarified their **responsibilities** and **commitments** to fulfil the residents' human rights? And how is the division of responsibility made visible to residents so that they know what they can participate in? (For example, in policy documents, websites, social media, governance documents, action plans, budgets, operational plans, guidelines, etc.)
- 6. How does your municipality work to fulfil human rights? Notably, what are your methods and measures to ensure that your residents' human rights are fulfilled? (For example: actions, activities, projects, budgets, operational plans, service decisions, policy documents, action plans, guidelines, cooperation with other actors, etc.)
- 7. In what ways do human rights/international human rights covenants **permeate** the various departments/section/activities and policies of the municipality? (For example, in policy documents, guiding documents, action plans, budget, operational plans, etc.)

- **8. Agenda 2030** is a broad project, with many sub-goals, from social, economic and ecological perspectives How do you work with Agenda 2030 in practice and how is this linked to human rights? (e.g. in actions, activities, projects, business plans, budget, evaluation, monitoring, etc.)
- 9. In what ways does the municipality work to **involve** and **include** residents in the planning, evaluations, reviews, activities, projects, actions and measures of the municipality? (For example, consultation, citizen dialogue, dialogue with civil society, social media, etc.)
- 10. In what ways is the **concept** of human rights used in the municipality? In other words, is the concept of human rights used to give visibility to the municipality's work on human rights? Or are other concepts such as gender equality, social sustainability, non-discrimination used to describe the municipality's work with human rights?
- 11. What are the **challenges** of working with human rights? (For example: cooperation, lack of perspective, lack of resources, lack of knowledge, lack of time, political priorities, lack of will, etc.) Please describe!
- 12. Is there anything else you would like to add or highlight?

Appendix 4: Interview guide to the departments of culture and leisure



Interview guide – Human rights on a city level, a study of two medium-sized municipalities' work with human rights

- 1. Would you like to start by telling a bit about your professional role and what kind of **professional tasks** you have?
- 2. If you had to explain what human rights **implies**, how would you describe it in that case? In other words, what would you say human rights **mean** for your municipality?
- **3.** Do all employees, sections and operations within the department have equal **responsibility** for working and fulfilling human rights for the residents? Or do some employees or sections have more responsibility than others to fulfil the residents' human rights? If so, why?
- 4. In what ways have the department clarified their **responsibilities** and **commitments** to fulfil the residents' human rights? And how is the division of responsibility made visible to residents so that they know what they can participate in? (For example, in policy documents, websites, social media, governance documents, action plans, budgets, operational plans, guidelines, etc.)
- 5. How does the department **work** to fulfils human rights? That is, what are your methods and measures to ensure that your residents' rights are fulfilled? (For example: actions, activities, projects, budgets, operational plans, service decisions, policy documents, action plans, guidelines, cooperation with other actors, etc.)
- 6. In what ways do human rights/international human rights covenants **permeate** the department's sections, activities and operations? (For example, in policy documents, guiding documents, action plans, budget, operational plans, etc.)

- 7. **Agenda 2030** is a broad project, with many sub-goals, from social, economic and ecological perspectives How do you work with Agenda 2030 in practice and how is this linked to human rights? (For example: actions, activities, projects, business plans, budget, evaluation, monitoring, etc.)
- **8.** In what ways does the department work to **involve** and **include** residents in plantings, evaluations, reviews, activities, projects, actions and measures? (For example, consultation, citizen dialogue, dialogue with civil society, social media, etc.)
- 9. In what ways is the **concept** of human rights used within the department? In other words, is the concept of human rights used to give visibility to the departments' work on human rights? Or are other concepts such as gender equality, social sustainability, non-discrimination used to describe the municipality's work with human rights?
- **10.** What are the **challenges** of working with human rights? (For example: cooperation, lack of perspective, lack of resources, lack of knowledge, lack of time, political priorities, lack of will, etc.) Please describe!
- 11. Is there anything else you would like to add or highlight?